Recruitment and retention of teachers with industrial or professional experience

Marie Strebler, Fiona Neathey and Nii Djan Tackey

research report

Contents

Introduction

This is the report of the project on recruitment and retention of teachers with industrial experience and from other parts of the sector conducted on behalf of the LSDA by the Institute for Employment Studies (IES). The project aimed to investigate the strategies and practices used by colleges to attract, retain and develop teachers with current industrial experience or from other parts of the sector.

The objectives of the project are to establish good practice benchmarks for recruiting and retaining teachers with industrial experience and/or form other parts of the sector. It explored:

- the areas of learning requiring teachers with industrial experience or professional experience
- the strategies to attract and recruit these teachers
- practices introduced by colleges to integrate new recruits into the college
- initiatives taken by colleges to develop staff and address retention issues.

The project had a number of elements: a literature review, surveys of senior curriculum managers and human resources (HR) professionals, and six case studies of good practice in general further education colleges (GFECs). Each of these elements is reported separately following a summary bringing together the main themes from the study as a whole.

1.1 Executive summary

This report provides a range of data and qualitative findings to explore college needs for teachers with industrial experience and/or from other parts of the sector and their use and retention of such staff. This summary brings together the findings of a literature review, surveys of HR directors and curriculum leaders in colleges and case studies of relatively successful colleges as defined by their gaining Centre of Vocational Excellence (CoVE) status in some shortage learning areas.

1.2 Areas of learning requiring industrial experience

The literature review highlighted the continuous efforts that have been made in the sector to improve the quality and relevance of vocational learning to the needs of businesses. There is an increasing emphasis on teachers with experience outside education as the best means of providing competency-based skills. The IES/LSDA survey confirmed the growth in the requirement for industrial experience. It suggested that, although over half of the curriculum leaders said they had the correct proportion of staff with industrial experience, almost all of the remainder believed there was a growing need for teachers with industrial experience. The trend emerging from the case studies showed that having industrial or professional experience has become the norm in most colleges for at least 10 of the 14 learning areas, apart from humanities, English, languages and communications and mathematics. Curriculum leaders in these areas believed they had a great need for industrial experience, but were not able to match that when filling all their vacancies. Increased demand for certain vocational subjects and, perhaps more importantly, the need to recruit, retain and satisfy students were the key drivers behind this growing need for industrial experience.

Recent surveys by the Association of Colleges (AoC) have shown that areas of recruitment difficulties were found for basic skills, technology, engineering, construction, ESOL, visual

arts, science and the teaching of students with learning difficulties. Respondents in the IES/LSDA survey also highlighted shortages in health and social care, land-based provision, hairdressing and English language. Curriculum leaders interviewed in construction, engineering, and hospitality and care reported shortages, with construction being a particularly difficult area into which to recruit and retain teachers with industrial experience. On the whole, it is also more difficult to recruit teachers for advanced (A-levels/NVQ3) and higher level courses (NVQ 4 and above) compared with lower level courses or qualifications.

1.3 Attracting and recruiting industrial or professional experience

There is little research evidence about what attracts people to the sector. The survey of HR directors cited low pay in comparison with other parts of the education sector, or private industry as a barrier to recruitment. Attracting teaching staff from business or industry, where pay is much higher, was also perceived to be very difficult by the colleges visited. It was compounded by the lack of an existing and well-defined pool of applicants. While recruiting from other FE colleges was an option, the survey shows that only around a half of recent recruits had come from this source. More than a quarter of new recruits had come from outside the education sector and only a small proportion – seven per cent – were from other learning and skills backgrounds.

In addition to the more traditional means of attracting applicants such as advertising vacancies, colleges had introduced various initiatives including:

- converting part-time posts into fractional posts
- recruiting existing part-time staff onto full time posts
- 'growing their own'
- spotting potential recruits from their teacher training courses
- running open days
- e-mailing past students
- contacting relevant networks
- word of mouth
- recommendations.

But who are the teachers with industrial or professional experience? Until fairly recently, there had been little regulation, either of the qualifications required of teachers in further education or of the level and type of experience required for specific learning areas, subjects and courses. Although the need for a teaching qualification has now been addressed, the requirement for industrial or professional experience still lacks definition. However, as shown by the case studies, colleges had to be pragmatic in their choice of industrial experience, and the past experience of the staff interviewed reflected this. It varied from work placements to owning a business and from small building firms or hairdressing salons to large employers in the public and private sectors. On the whole, staff with industrial experience, therefore, entered colleges with expertise and experience in their subjects. However, they felt their industrial experience was not always valued or their business skills recognised by their employers. By contrast, it was evident from discussions with staff with industrial experience that some had a rather misinformed view of teaching in FE. They were expecting an easier job with regular and shorter hours and less stress, and were rather disillusioned by the reality.

Colleges used fairly traditional methods for their recruitment and selection process, such as an application form and an interview. Most colleges would also ask candidates to do a short presentation of a lesson plan or similar – this is known as 'micro teaching'. In some colleges, the process for recruiting part-time teachers was rather less formal, featuring a short interview at most. This informality, combined with the fact that teachers with industrial experience, who are initially recruited on a part-time basis, may subsequently be used to fill a full-time post, and the risk that candidates have unrealistic expectations of the job, can all contribute to colleges recruiting their own turnover. Recruits from industry with a particular expertise and previous experience of training in their own organisations seemed to offer the best match between college need and candidate expectations.

1.4 Gaining a teaching qualification

A significant proportion of the academic FE workforce are often recruited from craft or occupational bases - well recognised professions in themselves. Such people may adhere to their expertise and may be reluctant to embark on teacher training programmes (see literature review). The survey indicated a mismatch between the need for new staff to have particular credentials – particularly teaching qualifications, skills and experience – and the availability of those attributes among new recruits. All colleges said they were providing assistance to enable staff to obtain a teaching qualification. This took the form of the payment of tuition fees, which was almost universal, and, in most colleges, remission from learner contact hours of three hours on average for full-time staff and two hours for part-time. Some of the colleges visited had adopted the additional approach of replacing some classroom teaching duties with tutoring, in order to reduce the preparation and marking burden on new recruits. Others had reviewed the delivery of their teachers' training to facilitate trade professionals to acquire the qualification. The revised training was more 'hands on' and designed to reflect previous experience.

1.5 What makes for good integration of new starters?

A recent Ofsted report raised concerns about few opportunities being provided to trainees to learn how to teach their specialist subjects and the lack of systematic mentoring and support in the workplace. The IES/LSDA survey shows that the majority of colleges were providing some kind of support to assist the transition of new recruits from other kind of employment, slightly more so to support the gaining of teaching qualifications as mentioned above. However, the college visits painted a somewhat different picture where induction support was left to individual departments. Those that had staff shortages may have found it difficult to deliver remission of contact hours, therefore putting pressure on new recruits and/or increasing their turnover. Others recognised the stress resulting from:

- getting used to the college culture and policies

- learning about the FE system and structure

- preparing all materials for a course

- relating to students

- studying for a teacher training qualification.

It was generally acknowledged that the first two years were the most difficult. Staff feedback described this as a shock and complained about the excessive paperwork and long hours. Some had had a mentor and a structured induction; others had been left to struggle. Some departments were recognised as providing better support and a friendly environment more conducive to a good start and ultimately improved retention.

1.6 Retention issues

According to the survey, about eight per cent of curriculum leaders indicated that they regularly had problems retaining staff, rather fewer than had reported recruitment difficulties. The pay gap with schools and the private sector was seen as a major factors in leading teachers to leave, as were high stress and long hours. A similar picture emerged from the case studies, with most reporting average turnover rates. But some pockets of high turnover were identified, with construction potentially the highest. Colleges had put in place measures to assist retention, which included enhancing pay and staff development. For example, one college visited had introduced premium rates for newly qualified teachers they wished to retain. Another college had fewer contracted hours than most colleges and offered other types of teaching contact, such as tutoring and course development, as well as flexible working. While pay was an issue, some colleges had concentrated on aspects that they had control over, such as initial integration and staff development, including the allocation of a mentoring budget to departments. This is exemplified by an HR director in a college who had developed a detailed support model aligned to the needs of new recruits for the first year. It included substantial time with no teaching for shadowing and preparation and increasing the amount of teaching with the support of the line manager and advanced practitioners. The costs attached to his model were high, however (£100,000 per year), and the college was in the process of prioritising the option.

2. Report of the literature review

This chapter brings together the findings of the first stage of the project - the review of literature. This review is designed to set in context our research on the recruitment and retention of further education lecturers with industrial experience and those recruited from other parts of the education sector or elsewhere. In conducting this part of the project, the intention was to inform the development of the subsequent stages of the study and to provide a context for the eventual findings from these stages. The review was based primarily on sources identified in searches conducted on behalf of the IES by the LSDA. Due to the shortage of literature relating directly to these subjects, the review focuses in particular on issues relating to staff involved in the delivery of vocational education, as well as on recruitment and retention of teaching staff in the FE sector more generally.

2.1 Summary of main findings

Some of the main findings from this review were as follows:

- There is a lack of existing evidence on the level of demand for teachers with industrial experience in the FE sector and the issues relating to the recruitment of staff with this kind of background.

- However changes in the sector, in particular greater evidence in provision of applied vocational skills, is likely to see the demand for such staff increase.

- Evidence on recruitment difficulties and skills shortages in FE suggests a range of causal factors of which status, pay and conditions of service are probably the most significant.

- The requirement that FE teachers should have or should work towards a teaching qualification is generally seen as a welcome step to increasing the professionalisation of the sector, but it raises a range of challenges, particularly in respect of the provision of high quality and appropriate training.

- Maintaining and updating the industrial/professional experience of teachers once they have entered the profession is a further issue, and one which the literature would suggest only a minority of colleges have addressed.

2.2 Introduction

The last 15 years have seen a movement in most developed economies to consider workforce competency and skills as central to their competitiveness. A great deal of attention has been paid to work-related learning and the provision of initial vocational training for young people, as part of a coherent approach to competency-based training. This, in turn, has led to the reform of the vocational and education and training systems, with more emphasis on the development of people with appropriate knowledge, skills and capabilities required in the new economic times. More particularly, since the early 1990s, efforts have been made to improve the quality and relevance of vocational learning to the needs of businesses; and hence the involvement of industries and businesses in the development and implementation of vocational education and training.[1]

While these changes have resulted in the rapid spread of learning throughout society, the further education sector is still the principal provider of vocational education and training

---

[1] Clive Chappell and Robyn Johnston, *Changing Work: changing roles for vocational education and training teachers and trainers*, NCVER, 2003.

in the UK. However, the divide between vocational (school) teachers and trainers in industry has narrowed considerably in recent years. Increasingly, the further education sector has placed emphasis on people with experience outside of education as the best means of providing competency-based skills. This has meant appointing people on the basis of their occupational experience and expertise. Indeed, change in emphasis from formal knowledge to applied skills and knowledge means that teachers and trainers have to know themselves how to 'do the job' in a time of rapidly changing technologies and patterns of work organisation.[2] It might be expected that this would add to the issues and challenges relating to (teaching) staff in the further education sector.

2.3 Teaching in further education: issues and context

It is almost intuitive to suggest that the standards achieved by students in further education are in part determined by the experience and expertise of their teachers. It might, therefore, be expected that the (high) quality of teaching would also reflect the (high) qualification levels of teachers. However, an Inspectorate report in 1997 noted the distinct absence of 'regulations to determine either the qualifications required of teachers in further education or the experience they should have had in relation to the courses and subjects they teach.'[3] This issue began to be addressed in 2001 when the government introduced the Further Education Teachers' Qualifications (England) Regulations 2001.[4]

Vocational education and training in the UK has traditionally been regarded as only a 'second best' option in academic education; and for those unable to aspire to higher academic attainment.[5] It could be argued that this would also determine or influence the type of teachers attracted into the FE sector. In the academic (school) system the issue is much easier, with some form of national regulation of curriculum and teacher training. Vocational education and training is more complicated due to the number of stakeholders involved. In all European countries (in contrast to Japan or the USA) the state and public sector are the major source of funding for education and training. Nevertheless, trade unions, employers, sectoral bodies and training organisations *etc.* all have a legitimate interest, and want a say in the organisation of vocational education and training. [6]

2.3.1 Recruitment difficulties and skill shortages

One of the difficulties for research in further education is that at national level there is not a great deal of good quality information available about the workforce responsible for teaching and learning in FE.[7] Anecdotal and other evidence have suggested, however, that colleges have real problems in recruiting teaching staff, and that many experienced lecturers are leaving the FE sector.[8] The Skills Foresight report for 2002, for example,

---

[2] Graham Attwell and Alan Brown, 'The education of teachers and trainers in Europe – issues and policies', Paper presented at the Fourth International Conference 'Vocational Education and Training Research, University of Wolverhampton, 16-18 July 2001.

[3] Further Education Funding Council, *Standards and their Assurance in Vocational Qualifications*, Coventry 1997

[4] http://www.legislation.hmso.gov.uk/si/si2001/20011209.htm

[5] Attwell and Brown, op. cit.

[6] Ibid.

[7] *Research on the FE Workforce*, unpublished DfES paper, 2004

[8] Dick Evans, 'Skills shortages', 't' Magazine, 2001

found that between one in 12 (7.5 per cent) and over a quarter (25.9 per cent) of the vacancies in English colleges for teaching staff across a wide range of subject areas, could not recruit, or were filled by a person with a significant weakness.[9] The 2002 survey by the AoC found particular recruitment difficulties in key subjects areas. These were basic skills, technology, engineering, construction, ESOL, visual arts, science and the teaching of students with learning difficulties. There is further confirmation of the difficulties colleges have in retaining teaching staff from the same survey. The 2002 survey gave a rate of turnover for colleges of 11 per cent per annum. Department for Education and Skills (DfES) internal analysis using Labour Force Survey data has suggested that the wastage rate from the college sector is even higher, with one in five (20 per cent) of teachers leaving each year.[10]

The reasons for recruitment and retention difficulties are only partially understood. There is little evidence about what attracts people to the sector in the first place. From the available literature, it would seem they relate principally to pay and conditions of service, but also to practice and competency, the changing roles of teachers, as well as the opportunities for the professional development of people who enter the sector.

2.3.2   Status, pay and conditions of service

Vocational education has been described as the 'poor cousin' of the academic education world, a condition also reflected in the relatively low prestige and esteem in which vocational teachers and trainers are held, compared with those who teach in the school and higher education sectors. It has been suggested that vocational teachers are paid less than their academic equivalents and that their working conditions are also less secure; a reflection of their 'poor relative' syndrome.[11] Indeed, money is cited as one of the principal reasons why teachers leave the FE sector. According to the AoC (2001), the pay gap with both schools and the private sector is a major factor in the decision of teachers to leave.[12] NATFHE have pointed out the implications of the disparity between the FE sector and other parts of the education system. They attribute the poor quality of outcomes from further education to the difficulties colleges have in recruiting high quality staff on the salary levels found in the sector.[13] Colleges themselves have acknowledged that problems in offering attractive remuneration is the most important reason for their recruitment difficulties.[14]

Salary is also a major issue in the retention of teaching staff. In particular, the comparison with the salaries of those teaching in schools brings the issue into even sharper focus. According to Owen and Davies, teaching staff are aware that they could earn more money by teaching similar subjects in school sixth forms.[15] Their survey of college staff satisfaction in 2002 concluded that a respectable wage would do a lot for staff morale. There appeared to be a feeling among staff in many of the colleges participating in the survey that they were not valued. This was not only because of the

---

[9] FENTO, *Skills Foresight for Further Education 2002*, March 2002

[10] Figures reported in *Research on the FE Workforce,* op cit.

[11] Attwell and Brown, 'The education of teachers and trainers', op cit.

[12] *Research on the FE Workforce*, op cit.

[13] NATFHE response to 'Success for All: Reforming Further Education and Training', DfES Discussion Document, June 2002

[14] *Skills Foresight for Further Education 2002*, op cit.

[15] Jane Owen and Peter Davies, *Listening to Staff*, LSDA 2003

lack of financial reward, but also because they did not think their good work was recognised regularly.

The recruitment difficulties described appear not to be restricted to the further education sector alone. Recent research evidence suggests that the higher education sector is experiencing similar problems in recruitment and retention of staff, especially those requiring industrial or professional experience. An annual survey in 2001 pointed to serious problems in recruiting and retaining both academic and support staff in UK higher education institutions.[16] The findings of the survey indicated that the situation had worsened year-on-year since 1998 for most institutions in subjects such as computing/IT, accountancy and finance, management, law and economics, engineering, biological sciences, and education. A small minority, though, were experiencing difficulties across all categories of staff.

As in the FE sector, pay levels were cited as the main reason for the recruitment and retention of staff. In particular, the higher education (HE) sector is failing to attract academic staff in IT, law and engineering because of intense competition from the private sector. The low starting salaries in the sector are believed to severely restrict the recruitment of good, young academic staff. However, the case studies pointed to other factors, such as administrative workload. Higher education institutions are using a range of strategies to address their academic recruitment difficulties. For example, the case studies found that some HE institutions have adopted flexible starting pay arrangements. But others have, in addition, focused on non-pay benefits such as giving lecturers more time for research, as well as study leave.

2.3.3 Professional development

The central focus for improving the quality of teaching, training and learning in further education remains to increase the professionalisation of teachers and trainers. Ros Clow has, in the past, pointed out the paradox that, although the further education sector had more students than the higher education sector, there had been no attempt by either the government or college authorities to have a fully qualified teaching workforce.[17]

There is still no blanket requirement that an FE teacher has any theoretical knowledge about teaching; this is changing, however. In implementing the Further Education Teachers' Qualifications (England) Regulations 2001[18] the DfES provided, as of September 2001, that, within a time limit, new FE teachers must gain a teaching qualification appropriate to their role. This requirement does not apply to those who have previously worked either as an FE teacher, a teacher in a maintained school or an equivalent elsewhere in the UK or EEA. Nonetheless, the government has made it clear, on its Success for All website, that the long-term expectation is that all FE lecturers will have a teaching qualification:

'We believe it is important to establish and reinforce the principle that all teachers and trainers should be qualified to teach and train. By 2010, we would expect that only new entrants to FE teaching would not be qualified and they would be expected to achieve appropriate qualifications within two years of entry for full-time staff and four years for part-time staff. The Learning and Skills Council is now consulting on how to achieve an

---

[16] *Recruitment and Retention of Staff in UK Higher Education: A survey and case studies*, UCEA, 2002

[17]Ros Clow, 'Further Education Teachers' Constructions of Professionalism', *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, Volume 53, Number 3, 2001

[18] http://www.legislation.hmso.gov.uk/si/si2001/20011209.htm

interim target for 2005-6 of 90% of full-time and 60% of part-time FE college teachers qualified to teach or be enrolled on appropriate courses. We will discuss further with partners before finalising this target.[19]

The government has attempted to further encourage the development of professionalism among FE teachers partly through bursaries for people attending a course leading to an FE teaching qualification. At the same time, the Standards Unit, which is part of the DfES, is developing a leadership strategy for vocational education and training, with the emphasis on the continuous professional development of individuals in the learning and skills sector as a whole.[20]

A DfES study in 2003 found that about four out of five FE teachers (84 per cent) have a degree, professional or post-graduate qualification. However, teachers of more vocational subjects tended to be less well qualified than those teaching academic subjects. It is believed that new entrants also tend to be less qualified than the existing workforce. This has particular implication for long-term quality of teaching, since it is estimated that new entrants may have replaced about a quarter (26 per cent) of the FE workforce who are expected to retire by 2010.[21] However, it is to be expected that the requirement for new teachers to hold or obtain a teaching qualification will at least maintain the level of teaching skills.

It is known that a significant section of the academic workforce in further education colleges are often recruited from craft or occupational bases, some of which are well recognised professions in themselves. Ros Clow has suggested that such people tend to adhere to their expertise, and are often reluctant to embark on teacher training programmes. Clow points out that there is a danger their skills, derived from experience, may be inadequate, and may restrict their professional development in FE as a result.[22] NATFHE has suggested there is a need to properly recognise the professionalism of FE teachers. They argue for parity of professional esteem to FE teachers with that of school teachers and HE lecturers.[23] The diversity of professions of FE teachers makes it difficult to move towards consensus about exactly what kind of professionals FE teachers are.

In the UK, responsibility for training at institutional level is through part-time provision, often organised by university education facilities. According to the DfES, around 50 higher education institutions and 300 colleges provide teacher training for the learning and skills sector.[24] Attwell and Brown[25] have expressed their doubts that universities are able to provide practice-based programmes of learning – especially given the increasing emphasis on applied skills and knowledge in vocational education and training. A recent Ofsted report suggested that these concerns were justified. It concluded:

'The current system of FE teacher training does not provide a satisfactory foundation of professional development for FE teachers at the start of their careers. While the tuition

---

[19]

http://www.successforall.gov.uk/contentList.cfm?contSectionId=5&funcSectionId=0&contSubSectionId=16

[20] DfES, *Developing the Leaders of the Future: A Leadership Strategy for the Learning and Skills Sector*, Consultation document, 2003

[21] *Research on the FE Workforce*, op cit.

[22] Ros Clow, 'Further Education Teachers' Constructions of Professionalism', op cit.

[23] NATFHE response to 'Success for All', op cit.

[24] DfES *The future of Initial Teacher Education for the Learning and Skills Sector*, 2003

[25] Attwell and Brown, 'The education of teachers and trainers', op cit.

that trainees receive on the taught elements of their courses is generally good, few opportunities are provided for trainees to learn how to teach their specialist subjects, and there is a lack of systematic mentoring and support in the workplace. The needs of this diverse group of trainees are not adequately assessed at the start of the courses, and training programmes are insufficiently differentiated. As a consequence, many trainees make insufficient progress.'[26]

In response to the Ofsted findings, the DfES has issued a consultation paper on the *Future of Initial Teacher Training for the Learning and Skills Sector.* This proposes an entitlement for trainee teachers in the sector, to include:

- professional formation, including initial training and workplace development

- initial assessment, leading to an Individual Learning Plan and to training

- development that is differentiated according to individual need

- observation of trainees' teaching and constructive feedback at appropriate intervals

- mentoring support and a reduced teaching load during workplace development

- course leaders and teacher educators who are suitably experienced and qualified

- the opportunity to gain the status of Qualified Teacher of Further Education.[27]

2.3.4 Changing role of teachers

The focus of much of FE provision is on applied vocational skills and knowledge, rather than formal learning. This means there is increasing emphasis on practice for vocational teachers and trainers. However, this also raises issues about teachers' lack of expertise; in particular the extent to which they are equipped with the skills they need to deliver the new competency-based curriculum. A possible solution to this problem is seen to lie in the employment of industry trainers or recruiting people with experience of industry. However, recruiting teaching staff from business and industry is very difficult, particularly in subjects such as IT and engineering, where the pay gap with the private sector is enormous. The alternative is to encourage existing teachers to keep up to date with developments in industry through personal reading or research. A more effective way is to provide teachers with opportunities for placements or secondments to the workplace. However, a study for the LSDA in 2001 found that such opportunity was seldom available to FE teachers. Although such staff saw the value of a period back in industry, many did not have the opportunity to experience it.[28]

Indeed, finding time for development within the increasingly time-restricted environment of further education has become a big problem for teachers trying to update their skills.

2.3.5 Incentives for the recruitment, retention and professional development of teachers in further education

Various government initiatives have attempted to address issues of skills shortages in FE colleges, by providing funding aimed at ameliorating the relatively low pay levels of key groups of staff. Although often welcomed in the sector, the impact of these initiatives on

---

[26] Ofsted *The initial training of further education teachers: A Survey,*

[27] DfES op cit

[28] Dave Brookes and Maria Hughes, *Developing Leading-Edge Staff in Vocational Education and Training*, LSDA, 2001

the problem is less clear. FE institutions are able to access funds to pay 'Golden Hellos'. These are aimed at new entrants to teaching, with payments of up to £4000 to encourage people in particular shortage subjects to stay in the sector and to influence their behaviour, with regard to continuing professional development. An evaluation of this initiative has found that although take-up has exceeded expectations, the impact on recruitment and retention of teachers in shortage subjects is unclear.[29]

In 2001 the Teaching Pay Initiative (TPI) was introduced for FE colleges (a similar system of Professional Standards Payments in sixth form colleges was also introduced). These initiatives, the details of which were developed at a local level, were designed to provide incentives and rewards to those FE staff who make a significant contribution to raising standards They were also designed to facilitate the recruitment, retention and reward of high quality staff.

TPI ended as a discrete payment in July 2003, when it was consolidated into colleges' core funding. Some of the main findings of an evaluation of the TPI scheme included that while it had ameliorated recruitment and retention problems in some institutions, in others the scheme had exacerbated the problems by making staff more likely to move for pay reasons. The TPI was generally felt to have had a positive effect on the level of staff development, but this had yet to impact on teacher behaviour or student outcomes.[30]

2.4 Conclusions

A range of sources indicate that FE colleges face ongoing problems in the recruitment and retention of staff in particular subjects. These are exacerbated by low pay and status compared with that of teachers in other parts of the education sector. In addition, growing pressures on the one hand for increased professionalisation of FE teaching and on the other for more vocationally-focused delivery serve to further highlight skills shortage issues in the sector. Colleges are likely to have an increasing need to recruit staff from elsewhere in the learning and skills sector and beyond. They are also likely to see an increase rather than a decrease in the demand for staff with relevant industrial experience and skills. It is on these issues that the remainder of this project will focus.

---

[29] Vicky Hopwood, *Evaluation of the Golden Hello Initiative,* DfES RR544,

[30] Melanie Gray, Peter Lawson, Chris Legge and Tom Marks, *Evaluation of the Teaching Pay Initiative in Further Education Sector Colleges,* DfES RR468

3. Surveys of curriculum leaders and HR professionals

3.1 Summary of main survey findings

- Two-fifths of curriculum leaders were facing problems in recruiting staff to most or all posts in their area of responsibility. Under one-fifth said that they had no recruitment problems.

- Low pay in comparison to other parts of the education sector or private industry were the main reasons cited for recruitment difficulties.

- Under one-tenth had widespread problems with the retention of staff in their area; however, two-thirds face some problems with the retention of staff. Pay, workload and stress were the main reasons given for these problems.

- An analysis of the source of recent recruits to FE colleges found that over a third came from the same kind of institution as the one that they moved to; however, over 40 per cent came from outside the FE sector – either from higher education, other parts of the learning and skills sector or from outside of education entirely.

- The majority of colleges were providing some kind of support to assist the transition of new recruits from other kinds of employment.

- Almost all were providing assistance to enable new staff to obtain a teaching qualification.

- The survey indicates a mismatch between the need for new staff to have particular credentials – particularly teaching qualifications, skills and experience - and the availability of those attributes among new recruits.

- Although over half of the curriculum leaders said that they had the correct proportion of staff with industrial experience, almost all of the remainder said that there was a need for a greater number of staff with these skills in their workforce.

- A variety of measures were in place in colleges to recruit and retain staff with industrial experience. These included measures to increase the remuneration of such staff, including via national initiatives such as the 'Golden Hello' and TPI, targeted recruitment campaigns and providing a range of Continuing Professional development (CPD) opportunities.

3.2 Introduction

The survey instruments were jointly designed by IES and the LSDA. The LSDA distributed the questionnaires and conducted the inputting of survey data. Survey analysis was undertaken by IES.

In April 2004 the LSDA distributed a survey pack to 394 colleges. In this pack was a set of questionnaires for curriculum leaders and one for the senior HR professional in the institution. The survey covered college experience of the recruitment, retention and development of staff requiring industrial experience and those who are recruited from other kinds of FE institution or from other parts of the sector. A total of 118 colleges had responded to the survey by the cut-off date for responses, a participation rate of 30 per cent. Of these colleges a total of 83 returned a questionnaire for the HR director or equivalent and 113 returned at least one curriculum leader questionnaire. The largest number of curriculum leader responses from any single institution was 11, and the average number of returns per college was four.

3.2.1 Institution type

Over three-quarters (77 per cent) of the institutions that took part in either or both surveys were general FE colleges, a further 19 per cent of institutions were sixth form colleges and three per cent were agricultural colleges (table 2). This indicates that our response rate for GFECs was somewhat higher than for any of the other kinds of institution.

	Number invited to participate	% of those invited to participate	Number participating	% of those participating
General FE college	267	68	91	77
Sixth Form college	101	26	23	19
Art college	6	1	0	0
Agriculture college	20	5	4	3
Total	394	100	118	100

Table 3.1: Institution type

3.2.2 Curriculum areas

A total of 455 curriculum leaders took part in the survey. They were asked to specify which single area of learning covered their main sphere of responsibility. A broad spread of curriculum areas was represented in their responses, ranging from science and maths (10 per cent) to work-based learning (less than one per cent) (table 3.2). Eleven per cent of respondents did not specify a single curriculum area as their main sphere of responsibility. In addition, the large number of categories and small number of responses in most of the categories mean that it has not been possible to undertake a statistically-valid analysis of differences in survey response by curriculum area.

	Number	Percent
science and maths	47	10
land-based provision	19	4
construction	17	4
engineering, technology & manufacturing	35	8
business administration, management	46	10
information and communications technology	33	7
hospitality, sport and leisure	15	3
hairdressing and beauty	19	4
health and social care	41	9
visual and performing arts	43	9
humanities	33	7
English, languages and communications	19	4
foundation programmes	36	8
work-based learning	3	<1
no learning area specified	49	11
Total	*455*	*100*

Table 3.2: Main area of responsibility for curriculum leader

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

3.2.3   Difficulties in recruitment

Curriculum leaders were asked whether, in the academic year 2003/04, they had experienced difficulties in recruitment to all, most, some, a few or none of their posts. Two-fifths (41 percent) reported difficulties with regards to either all or most of their posts, while the same proportion suggested that they had had difficulties with some or a few of their posts. Less than a fifth (18 per cent) reported not having any difficulty.

N= 437	
Respondents having difficulties with:	**%**
All posts	21
Most	20
Some / few	41
None	18
Total	100

Table 3.3: Extent to which respondent had difficulties in recruitment

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

When asked about the reasons for recruitment difficulties, the responses were varied. The majority reported that low pay or better alternative employment prospects were the main reasons for difficulties in recruitment, with 68 per cent quoting 'lower pay than schools' and 64 per cent quoting 'better employment prospects elsewhere' (table 3.4). Skills-related and experience-related reasons were less pronounced but still relatively important. 'Lack of required skills locally' was mentioned by 37 per cent of respondents, the 'requirement to have teaching qualifications' was raised by 20 per cent of respondents and 13 per cent quoted the 'need for staff to have industrial experience'.

	Respondents citing this reason %
Lower pay than schools	68
Lower pay than private sector	50
Competitive job market	31
Requirement to have teaching qualification	20
Lack of required skills locally	37
High cost of living	22
Need for staff to have industrial experience	13
Perception of stress	47
Better employment elsewhere	64

Table 3.4: Reasons for recruitment difficulties

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

3.2.4　Areas of recruitment difficulty

Curriculum leaders were asked to specify the particular subject areas and qualification levels to which they had found it particularly difficult to recruit staff. Subject areas were categorised into areas of learning for analysis purposes. Clearly, the areas found to be problematic were strongly influenced by the areas of responsibility of the curriculum leader concerned, and findings should therefore be treated with caution. Nonetheless, table 3.5 suggests that there are particular hot spots of recruitment difficulty. Areas where over half of the relevant curriculum leaders cited recruitment problems were: construction, foundation programmes, health and social care, land-based provision, information and communications technology, hairdressing and beauty and English, languages and communications.

	Number of respondents from this area of learning	% of respondents for who this was main area of responsibility citing recruitment problems in this area N= 406	% all of respondents citing recruitment problems in this area N=455
construction	17	82	7
foundation programmes	36	78	10
health and social care	41	73	11
land-based provision	19	63	4
information and communications technology	33	55	8
hairdressing and beauty	19	53	3
English, languages and communications	19	53	5
business administration, management	46	43	6
hospitality, sport and leisure	15	40	3
science and maths	47	38	6
visual and performing arts	43	35	4
engineering, technology & manufacturing	35	29	4
humanities	33	18	2
work-based learning	3	0	<1

Table 3.5: Areas of recruitment difficulty

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

Curriculum leaders also specified those kinds of qualification level where recruitment difficulties were found. Table 3.6 shows that colleges were more likely to find it hard to recruit teachers to teach advanced (A-level/AVCE/NVQ Level 3) and higher (NVQ Level 4 and above) level qualifications than qualifications at a lower level (Level 2 and below).

Respondents citing difficulties with: N= 455	%
Entry level	2
Foundation level	8
Intermediate level	18
Advanced level	38
Higher level	26

Table 3.6: Levels of learning for which it is difficult to recruit

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

3.2.5 Difficulties in retaining staff

Curriculum leaders were, in addition, asked whether they faced difficulties in retaining staff. These problems were somewhat less extensive than recruitment difficulties. Just eight per cent suggested that they had difficulties in retaining all or most of their staff. However, approximately two-thirds reported some difficulty in retention.

N= 436 Respondents having difficulties with:	%
All posts	5
Most	3
Some / few	59
None	34
Total	100

Table 3.7: Difficulties in retention

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

As in the case of recruitment, lower pay than schools was the main reason cited for having staff retention difficulties, mentioned by 68 per cent of respondents who had staff retention difficulties. High stress levels and long working hours were also regarded as factors that had a negative impact on retention, and were referred to by 56 per cent of respondents (table 3.8). Several respondents believed that difficulty in adjusting to their college was a reason for retention problems among some staff. This was more widely cited for those coming from outside education (38 per cent) than people coming from non-FE backgrounds in the learning and skills sector (18 per cent) or other FE backgrounds (11 percent).

	%
Lower pay than schools	68
Lower pay than private sector	51
Required to have a teaching qualification	15
Other FE people find it hard to adjust	11
Non-FE people find it hard to adjust	18
Outside education people find it hard to adjust	38
High level of stress	56
Long working hours	56
Other	10

Table 3.8: Reasons for difficulties in retention

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

3.3 Sources of recruitment to FE colleges

Curriculum leaders were asked to provide information on the number of teachers recently recruited to their area, and where they originated. The greatest number of new staff recruited came from the same type of FE institution as the ones that they moved to (35 per cent). However a substantial proportion of recent recruits (26 per cent) came from outside the learning and skills sector, originating from other public services, industry or commerce. Other types of FE colleges were the other major source of recruits, accounting for 17 per cent of the total.

In contrast, fewer than one in ten staff came from higher education institutions (eight per cent), and fewer than one in 20 had work-based learning, adult education or Jobcentre Plus backgrounds. The remaining categories accounted for less than one per cent of new staff employed (table 3.9).

	% of staff recruited from this source
Other types of FE college	17
Same types of FE college	35
Adult education	3
WBL	4
HEI	8
Ufi	0
Jobcentre plus (education and training)	1
Prison services	0
Other public service, industry or commerce	26
Don't know	5

Table 3.9: Origins of recently recruited staff

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

3.3.1 Support for staff recruited from other kinds of institution/employment

As the analysis above indicates, the majority of recent recruits to FE colleges did not originate from the same kind of institution as the one in which they were now employed, and over 40 per cent did not come from any kind of FE college. Curriculum leaders were asked about the support provided to new teaching employees coming from other types of employers to assist their transition into FE and, where appropriate, support their professional development towards teacher qualifications. The vast majority reported that support was provided to assist in transition (85 per cent) and to support development towards teaching qualifications (95 per cent).

N=439	Yes %	No %	Don't know %
Assist with transition	85	10	5
Support development teaching	95	1	3

Table 3.10: Whether support is provided to new employees – curriculum leaders' survey

Source: Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

The survey of HR directors also considered whether new members of staff, not previously employed by a similar FE college, were offered any support in their transition and their professional development towards teaching qualifications (table 3.11) An even higher proportion of HR directors, than of curriculum leaders, said that such arrangements were in place, with nine out of ten suggesting that support was provided to assist in transition, while the support for development towards teaching qualifications was almost universally reported (99 per cent).

N= 81	Yes %	No %
Assist with transition	90	10
Support teaching qualifications	99	1

Table 3.11: Whether support is provided to new employees – HR survey

Source: IES/LSDA HR directors' survey

HR directors were also asked about the specific support that they provided to new members of staff who were not previously employed in similar FE institutions. The survey suggests the following:

- Payment of tuition fees was almost universal, and applied to nearly all teacher contract groups. In most cases the full cost burden was carried by the college.

- Payment for study in teachers' own time, however, was less common, and applied slightly more to full/part time teachers than fractional teachers (14 per cent compared to 11 per cent).

- Remission from learner contact hours applied to full-time teachers (68 per cent) in approximately two-thirds of colleges, fractional teachers in three-fifths of cases (59 per cent) and of part-time teachers in half of the institutions responding to the survey (49 per cent). The average remission time was three hours per week for full-time teachers and two hours per week for other teachers.

- Less than a half of the colleges permitted teaching staff to take time off to study outside learner contact time. Part-time teachers were the least likely to receive this form of support.

- A contribution to other study costs was provided by just over half of all colleges, irrespective of teaching contract.

	Payment of tuition fees % providing to:			Payment for study in own time % providing to:		
	Full-time teachers	Part-time teachers	Fractional teachers	Full-time teachers	Part-time teachers	Fractional teachers
Yes	99	97	95	14	14	11
No	1	3	5	86	86	89
	Remission from learner contact hours % providing to:			Time off to study outside learner contact time % providing to:		
	Full-time teachers	Part-time teachers	Fractional teachers	Full-time teachers	Part-time teachers	Fractional teachers
Yes	68	49	59	44	34	42
No	32	51	41	56	66	58
	A contribution to other study costs % providing to:					
	Full-time teachers	Part-time teachers	Fractional teachers	.		
Yes	53	53	55			
No	47	47	45			

Table 3.12: Type of support offered to new staff by contract type

Source: IES/LSDA HR directors' survey

	Average value of tuition fees			Average study that can be claimed (hours)			Average remission from learner contact (hours)		
	% of fees covered full time teaching staff	% of fees covered part time staff	% of fees covered fractional staff	Hours per week full time staff	Hours per week part time staff	Hours per week fractional	Hours remission full time staff	Hours remission part time staff	Hours remission fractional staff
Mean	97	99	98	9	1	1	3	2	2
Median	100	100	100	1	0	0	3	2	2
N	*60*	*54*	*52*	*8*	*6*	*5*	*40*	*24*	*28*

Table 3.13: Value of support

Source: IES/LSDA HR directors' survey

3.4 Skills and experience

3.4.1 Skills and experiences needed and held

The survey considered the types of skills or experiences that were needed by teachers (table 3.14), and the extent which these skills and experiences were held by new recruits (table 3.15). Over 80 per cent of respondents suggested that teaching qualifications and subject qualifications were needed on all or most occasions, 83 and 84 per cent respectively. However, while 92 per cent of respondents said that all or most of the new recruits held subject qualifications, only 71 per cent said that they held teaching qualifications. Similarly, even though 72 per cent of respondents felt that staff needed experience of teaching, only 60 per cent felt that they had such experience.

In the case of teaching key skills, the findings also suggest a potential gap in the experiences of new recruits. While 37 per cent felt that there was a need for key skills teaching experience among all or most of their staff, only 17 per cent actually reported that all or most of their new recruits held these skills.

The only case in which skills and experience needs seemed to be matched by the experience and skills held relates to industrial experience. Here slightly more recruits were reported to have industrial experience compared with respondents' perception of the needs for such experience to do the job.

	All/most	Some/ a few	None	*N*
Subject qualifications	84	9	6	*431*
Experience of teaching	72	26	2	*424*
Industrial experience	48	33	19	*423*
Teaching key skills	37	52	10	*433*
Teaching qualifications	83	16	2	*442*

Table 3.14: Skills and experiences needed

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

	All/most	Some/ a few	None	*N*
Subject qualifications	92	5	2	*441*
Experience of teaching	60	37	3	*413*
Industrial experience	49	40	11	*415*
Teaching key skills	17	64	18	*421*
Teaching qualifications	71	26	3	*435*

Table 3.15: Skills and experiences held by new recruits

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

3.4.2 Industrial experience

Even though in most cases where industrial experience was said to be needed, recruits seemed to have that experience, the survey suggests that some curriculum leaders would like to see a higher proportion of their staff having relevant industrial experience. The survey considered whether the mix of teaching staff with and without industrial experience was optimal for the delivery of the curriculum. Over half of the respondents (56 per cent) felt that the mix was ideal, but three in ten (28 per cent) felt that it was not appropriate, and 16 percent were unsure (table 3.16).

N=427	%
Yes	56
No	28
Don't know	16
Total	100

Table 3.16: Whether the mix of industrial experience is appropriate

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

When those who felt the mix was not ideal were asked about what changes to the mix would improve delivery, almost all (92 per cent) suggested that a higher proportion of staff with industrial experience was needed (table 3.17).

N= 129	%
Higher proportion industrial experience needed	92
Lower proportion industrial experience needed	8
Total	100

Table 3.17: What is the need for industrial experience?

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

3.4.3 Turnover of staff with industrial experience

Respondents were asked to compare the turnover of staff with industrial experience against those who did not have such experience. Of those who were able to answer this question and for whom it was relevant, over four in ten (44 per cent) thought turnover was higher for this group, compared to just over one in ten (12 per cent) who thought it was lower. The remainder (44 per cent) did not think that there was any difference between the labour turnover of teachers with industrial experience and other staff.

N= 224	%
Turnover compared to staff without industrial experience:	
Lower	12
Same	44
Higher	44
Total	100

Table 3.18: Turnover of staff with industrial experience

Source: IES/LSDA curriculum leaders' survey

3.4.4   Recruiting and retaining staff with industrial experience

Respondents to the HR survey were asked whether their college had taken any measures to recruit or retain staff with industrial experience (Table 3.19). Three out of five colleges (58 per cent) had taken some measures to recruit staff with industrial experience, while 38 per cent had taken measures to retain staff with such experience.

N = 83	%
Measures to recruit staff with industrial experience	58
Measures to retain staff with industrial experience	38

Table 3.19: Recruitment and retention of staff with industrial experience

Source: IES/LSDA HR directors' survey

Where measures were in place to assist the recruitment and retention of staff with industrial experience, HR directors were asked to specify the nature of these initiatives. A summary of the main kinds of measure cited is given in table 3.20 below. As the table shows, half of the respondents to this question (and 25 per cent of all colleges) said that financial incentives of some kind were used to attract or keep staff with industrial experience; these included the use of national schemes such as 'Golden Hellos' or the Teaching Pay Initiative (TPI), and a range of measures aimed at enhancing pay levels in hard to recruit areas. Nearly four in ten (19 per cent of all survey respondents) had special recruitment measures aimed at groups of staff who require industrial experience. These included advertising in the trade press and campaigns aimed at specific groups – for example, one college was targeting engineers looking for a change in their career direction, as a pool of potential recruits.

Staff development provisions were in most cases seen as a retention measure, with the most common cited being assistance with gaining a teaching qualification. In addition, some colleges specified that staff were given the chance to regularly update their industrial experience. For example, in one case, five days per year were set aside for professional development.

N = 42	%
All those using any recruitment measure	38
Advertising in specialist press	12
Campaigns targeted as specific groups	14
Other recruitment measures	14
All those using any financial incentive	50
Golden Hellos	19
Us of TPI	10
Bonuses/performance related pay	7
Other measures to enhance pay	36
All those using any professional development measure	38
Support to undertake teacher training	21
Opportunities of updating industrial skills	12
Other professional development opportunities	17

Table 3.20: Measures to recruit or retain staff with industrial experience

Source: IES/LSDA HR directors' survey

4. Case studies

An important part of this project was a series of case studies of GFECs selected on the basis that they were a Centre of Vocational Excellence in at least two areas of skill shortage.

4.1 Summary

- Having industrial or professional experience has become the norm in most colleges and for most areas, apart from humanities, English, languages & communications and mathematics.

- Areas with the most recruitment difficulties and the highest need for industrial experience included land-based provision, construction, engineering, ICT, hospitality, social care and visual arts.

- There was less of a pattern with regard to recruiting teachers from other parts of the sector (apart from assessors from WBL providers). Some colleges did not recruit them; others did not target them formally.

- Colleges had developed internal strategies to address staff shortages: eg increasing fractional contracts, spotting potential candidates among their own students, and 'growing your own'.

- Some new recruits had a misinformed view of what teaching is like in FE, which could lead to turnover problems if not dealt with via a realistic job preview.

- The lack of teaching qualification and some holes in key skills were the most often reported gaps. Other aspects, such as frustration with paperwork, coping with teaching and relating to students were also mentioned.

- Colleges were providing financial support for teacher training and expected new recruits to qualify within two years. Remission of teaching contact hours of approximately two hours was available, sometimes with switch to tutorial and course development. However, departments with staff shortages found it difficult to deliver this remission in practice.

- All colleges visited provided mentoring and structured induction to facilitate integration. However, some staff felt it had been patchy in its execution, since their experience was that they were 'thrown in at the deep end'.

- Retention was not a major issue across the colleges, but pockets of high turnover existed in all – in particular among staff with industrial experience in high demand elsewhere, and who could command a much higher salary in industry.

- Some colleges had identified that improving early integration and support and providing staff development had the potential to reduce turnover. Various initiatives were considered – including a model of early shadowing, no teaching followed by a gradual increase in teaching hours with support by line managers and advanced practitioners – for the best way to induct new staff in their first year. However, the cost implications were felt somewhat prohibitive.

4.2 Introduction

In each college, interviews were conducted with the head of HR (or equivalent), a number of curriculum leaders, and small groups of teaching staff with either industrial or professional experience or from other parts of the sector. In total, 37 people were interviewed, including six HR staff, 12 curriculum leaders and 19 staff (see Appendix for list of case studies).

The aim of the research was to determine which areas of learning required industrial experience; how colleges attract and retain staff with industrial experience; and, where appropriate, to draw out examples of good practice.

4.3 Areas requiring industrial experience

A grid was prepared for checking on areas of learning that required teachers with industrial experience or professional experience. This was also used to ascertain the need for teachers from other parts of the sector.

Table 4.1 shows the areas that were cited by colleges as requiring teachers with industrial experience, grouped according to whether colleges thought they were essential or desirable, or that some other experience was necessary. Areas where interviewees mentioned recruitment difficulties have also been added.

Areas/subjects	Essential	Desirable	Other experience
Sciences & mathematics	Some applied sciences.	Pure & applied science; more professional experience is required for the applied subjects, such as ophthalmic dispensing.	Maths; professional rather than industrial experience relevant. Sometimes difficult to fill vacancies and competing with schools for pay.
Land-based provision	Requires industrial experience.		
Construction	For NVQ2&3; shortage in plumbing, carpentry, joinery and brickwork, gas fitting, difficult to fill because of increased demand of changing building regulations. High turnover.	In construction, everyone needs some industrial experience; desirable for construction, HND, management.	
Engineering, technology & manufacturing	Engineering, technology & manufacturing is a vocational division requiring staff with industrial experience. Difficult to recruit area – in particular for mechanical or refrigeration or electrical engineer. Recruits need vocational competence at Level 3 and five years' experience in the industry.		
Business administration, management & professional	Industrial experience required for teaching degrees, HNDs or professional courses. Secretarial recruits have industrial experience but no qualifications.	A mix of essential and desirable.	
Information & communications technology	Information & communications technology: requires current industrial experience. Difficult to compete with industry, recruit at HNC level.		Also recruit some people with academic background for HNC or HNDs.
Retailing, customer service & transportation	Retailing, customer service & transportation: requires industrial experience.		
Hospitality, leisure & travel	In hospitality, industrial experience important but difficult to recruit. Managerial level in catering difficult to recruit too.	In leisure and travel, where courses are more generic.	

Areas/subjects	Essential	Desirable	Other experience
Hairdressing & beauty therapy	Industrial experience. Staff usually still have or are working in salons.		
Health, social care & public services	Needs practitioners who have worked in the care sector. Difficult to recruit in social care, animal care.		
Visual & performing arts & media	Definitely requires industrial experience People might have their own studios or work in other organisations. Compete with secondary education for recruits.		
Humanities			Industrial experience is less relevant. Compete with secondary education for recruits.
English, languages & communications			Industrial experience is less relevant.
Foundation programmes include literacy, numeracy, ESOL, key skills & SLDD			Key skills & basic skills requires teaching experience to post 6 learner and SLDD requires experience of working with people with learning difficulties. Shortage of key skills & ESOL tutors.
Work-based learning			Work-based learning is a separate unit in some colleges. It requires vocational experience; recruits assessors from other WBL providers. WBL trainers have experience in industry and upgrade regularly; they can be upgraded to teachers.

Table 4.9: Areas and subjects with experience required and recruitment difficulties[1]

Table 4.1 shows that having industrial or professional experience had become normal in most colleges and for most areas, apart from humanities, English, languages & communications, and mathematics. Comparing this table with the survey results (section 3.4 skills and experience) reinforces the view that colleges believe they have a considerable need for industrial experience which is not matched by the available pool of applicants.

4.4 Other parts of the sector

There was less of a pattern emerging from the colleges with regard to recruiting teachers from other parts of the sector. Some did not recruit them; others recruited them by default rather than targeting them formally. Other parts of the sector were mentioned when:

- Some college work-based learning units were recruiting assessors from other WBL providers.

- Individuals from other parts of the sector applied independently, for instance when they wanted to relocate.

As shown below, college B recruits from other parts of the learning and skills sector because they think the college is seen as a comparatively stable organisation which pays well:

'We advertised for a replacement officer and had about half a dozen applicants. Four of them were from private training providers in the area. So obviously they see the college as a more secure public sector job with more job security and better terms and conditions, which means that it is a logical move for them.'

In college E a curriculum leader in business studies and law commented that ideally they would require staff with industrial experience to teach the degree work, the HNDs, and the professional courses. It is less important for GCSEs and A-levels. It is not compulsory – even for the higher level courses, in part because they often have difficulty attracting applicants. To this end, the job description says 'qualifications or experience'. In this way, more applicants are coming from other learning sectors, and other institutions.

College D recruits people who have taught in schools, including primary school teachers, women returners, volunteers and part-timers. The staff interviewed thought that it was quite common for teachers to switch between colleges.

4.5 Drivers for recruiting

Interviewees were asked what they thought drives their college to recruit experience. The drivers emerging included to:

- satisfy increased demand

- recruit, retain and satisfy students

- fill vacancies

- deliver different levels of qualifications.

4.5.1 Satisfy increased demand

Increased demand may result from:

- changes in policy requirements (Success for All, award bodies, regulations, *etc*)

- a growing portfolio of courses or subjects

- expansion due to the changing attractions of careers (eg plumbing).

College E, for example, cited the changes in policy for skill requirements which had resulted in increased demand for learning provision especially in vocational subjects which require industrial professionals. This was illustrated by a curriculum leader in pure and applied sciences who commented that pharmacy technicians and assistants are now required to upgrade to Level 3 in order to work in industry: '*This has created demand for pharmacy provision.*'

College A is a large college with a growing portfolio in HE which has grown 40 per cent over the last year: '*We're an organisation definitely going places and are seen to be going places.*'

For a curriculum leader in construction in College E, the plumbing industry has expanded greatly over a short period. '*Six or seven years ago it was not a very popular career, now we can't satisfy demand.*' Gas fitting is also difficult to staff because of an increased demand as a result of changes in building regulations.

4.5.2 Recruit, retain and satisfy students

One of the main drivers for recruiting industrial experience is obviously the need to satisfy students. This generated many comments from the interviewees.

The HR director in college E thought that it made the curriculum more current, interesting and lively. It was important to have a balance between teaching professionals and newer staff who have more recent professional experience. He would expect all teaching staff to have professional experience but said: '*It's not always easy to convince them.*'

College B recruited those with industrial experience because '*we need to have the up-to-date skills in the relevant industry to pass onto students who expect tutors to have real life experience.*' Certain subjects like land-based provision could not be taught without having worked in the industry.

'*You might get away with some courses but for other courses you have to have this experience. We have some excellent staff who came from the industry in our performing arts division. Same with catering as well, you need to have the experience.*'

For college A, it was pretty rare for someone to come into FE straight out of a degree/school. Almost all their staff had 'life experience', which was valued. However, they felt that there was a balance to be achieved because staff needed to have up-to-date industrial skills as well. The college tried to ensure that this was the case.

'*If you are teaching a course in engineering, you must be aware of all the up-to-date things in the area... They have the confidence and take a practical approach to things rather than a textbook approach.*'

They also ensured that staff had their industrial experience updated once they start working.

'Students want someone they can talk to about what it is really like to do that job in real life. However, if you're ten years out of date the validity of what you are saying is questionable.'

For college D:

'Industrial experience gives a rich experience to learners but teachers have a major credibility gap with learners if they can't offer recent experience.'

The college also built links and networks to enrich the curriculum. A curriculum leader in construction and engineering thought that credibility with employers was the key to maintaining their market position.

4.5.3   Vacancies

One obvious driver for the recruitment of staff with industrial experience is having a vacancy that requires such experience. For College E:

'If there were enough applicants, we would like to expand the provision but this isn't even nearly possible given staff shortages and lack of suitably qualified applicants.'

In College B:

'We have some hard-to-fill vacancies. Plumbing is the hardest one. We can't even 'grow our own' staff without having the relevant teaching staff to begin with. Brickwork is becoming difficult, and joinery, too. Managerial level in the catering industry is becoming harder to recruit into. Salaries outside have gone up so much that the type of people we want is becoming harder to get. We have an unfilled middle manager position, advertised two or three times but no success.'

4.5.4   Types and levels of qualification

A final factor prompting the recruitment of these staff was the requirement of particular qualification types. Most NVQ and GNVQ levels require staff with industrial experience. Humanities, sciences and maths with applied GCSE, AS and A2 may not necessarily require staff with industrial experience, but they have to have professional experience. Similarly, areas with higher degrees may require staff with an academic background.

College E thought candidates from industry would be able to teach up to Level 2 without teaching qualifications but they would probably need a subject-related qualification.

4.6 Recruitment and selection

4.5.5   Strategies to address staff shortages

Various strategies were in evidence which attempted to deal with recruitment difficulties. These included:

- moving part-time staff to fractional contracts
- spotting potential candidates among their own students (eg a student doing a catering degree could be a candidate for hospitality)

- identifying suitable candidates in colleges with teacher training, since they also have experience in industry

- 'growing your own': most colleges had developed people returning to teaching through a part-time route, eventually leading to full-time teaching when a suitable vacancy arose

- encouraging technicians and support staff to get involved in teaching if they showed an aptitude

- positive action, eg training and encouraging those from minority ethnic groups to go for promotion.

The advantages of these strategies were that potential staff already knew the college and that their suitability and commitment was also known to the college.

College A for example commented that:

'Starting people on the casual/bank seems to give them the experience of what teaching is really going to be like so that they know where they stand before they commit themselves. We have been doing that a lot lately. Then we have them as permanent. This seems to work out well. We also run continuous (three times a year) advertising for casual/bank staff. We are constantly on the lookout. We look out to see if we can recruit from our teacher training unit as well. Teachers training also require industrial experience. If we spot anyone with the right qualities we approach them.'

In College E, a curriculum leader in construction thought that the best way to attract staff is through developing part-time staff:

'The best way we've attracted staff (as FT lecturers), is through developing and encouraging a positive work environment: for part-time staff, who then go on to fill FT posts because they've had a positive experience in the department and the college. There is a very supportive and friendly atmosphere, which encourages people to stay, and to take on more responsibility.'

4.5.6   Attracting external applicants

Ways that colleges attracted external applicants included:

- using the national press eg Times Education Supplement

- using the regional/local press

- adverts placed on the college website

- open days or evenings

- speculative applications and 'word of mouth'

- networking with other colleagues in other colleges and institutions

- using links with external examiners to sometimes provide contacts with eligible candidates.

College A organised job fairs and career fairs college-wide, although they found that these created more work as '*anyone and everyone comes to these events.' 'You don't want to destroy people's dreams but you have to be careful,*' said one curriculum leader. Another curriculum

leader in the same college thought that open days worked really well. They would take recommendations as well.

'If you're looking for someone with industrial experience and FE experience, you would go for national advertising but for technician facilitators, local and regional press work very well to get the dedicated local members of staff.'

College B also had open evenings where they encouraged working people to come along.

'As a result of that, we had a few staff for the construction department. We agreed to put them on CertEd and give them their teaching hours to go with. Mostly, people won't give up their jobs to do something until it is more secure.'

College E sometimes gained applicants who were coming towards the end of their careers in industry. A curriculum leader in construction thought they should look at how they advertised for new staff. *'Those at the end of their careers in industry would be very useful, and have a lot knowledge and skill.'* One of their plumbing lecturers came in ten years previously, after a career in plumbing. *'Rather than being a plumber, on his knees, and stuck under sinks, he'd rather be teaching, he's good at it, and he enjoys it.'*

4.5.7 Barriers to recruitment

Aside from the recruitment difficulties already mentioned in table 2.1, interviewees felt there were a number of potential barriers or hurdles to tackle. These could be:

- lack of teaching qualifications (see also section 4.5.4)

- a pay package which is better in industry and in other parts of the education sector, *eg* schools

- negative perceptions of the FE sector

- unrealistic expectations from people with industrial experience about their teaching ability.

College E thought that candidates from industry would be able to teach up to Level 2 without a teaching qualification, but they would probably need a qualification for a higher level.

4.6 Selection

4.6.1 Job and person specifications

The formality of the process for deciding the vacancies and preparing the job and person specifications seemed to vary across colleges.

In college F, the HR director *'approves all recruitment, is necessary as part of their vacancy control system. New FT staff must be approved by the principal. They also keep an eye on the ratio between FT and PT staff, which ideally should be about 70/30, but this depends on the subject area, and the variety of specialisms therein, as well as the type of provision (off-site, short-course, ACL etc).'*

In general, colleges said they were looking for:

- two to three years industrial experience and in some cases (eg engineering) five years

- teaching experience or the ability to be trained

- subject knowledge to Level 3 or 4

- an attraction to a career in FE

- core skills (subject knowledge, presentation, communication and motivation skills).

However, colleges needed to be pragmatic. The curriculum leader in business studies and law in college E illustrated this point:

'We have difficulty in recruiting staff at the level we want, and so we might recruit, or advertise for a business studies HE lecturer, and if they come along with teaching experience, and industrial experience, that's wonderful. We will put them on our degrees, or possibly, if they're qualified, they'll be put on one of our post-graduate courses, or professional qualifications. They might equally be asked to teach A-levels or a Level 3 course. We would negotiate with them as to what was most suitable. But if I had to make a distinction between them, we would want industrial experience for our HE, and not so necessary for FE, although we feel that industrial experience adds to A-level teaching as well.'

4.6.2 Selection process

On the whole, colleges used traditional methods of selection. HR were the custodians of good practice, and monitored policies as well as administered the selection process. This included:

- an application form for full-time applicants

- shortlisting if required

- a formal panel interview (always)

- frequently some kind of exercise eg presentation, observation of group discussion, written exercise

- psychometric tests or assessment centre (occasionally).

College D, for example, gave mainstream lecturing applicants a written exercise seeking ideas about an impending inspection. Other curriculum areas in the same college used a presentation by tutors of a lesson plan. Sometimes these presentations were done with a group of students.

Part-time recruitment seemed to be far less formal, involving a short interview. A fairly similar process would be followed for teachers from other parts of the sector.

For College E, there was no difference between groups of staff. All applicants had to go through the same formal process. The expectation might vary slightly, in that those coming from an FE background would be expected to have a good understanding of the qualifications and curriculum structures. An applicant coming straight from industry would not be expected to know this, but if they had the other requisite skills, then they could pick up the specific knowledge relatively easily.

4.6.3 Quality of recruits

Colleges appeared generally satisfied about the quality of new recruits with industrial experience. Some thought, however, that the quality of the applicants at interviews was poor, and that the calibre of candidates was going down. The following issues emerged which could impact on the quality of new recruits and their early integration in the college:

- frustration about dealing with paperwork

- coping with teaching

- lack of commitment and engagement

- difficulty in relating to students.

A curriculum leader in college A remarked that sometimes new staff with industrial experience struggled with the administrative and paperwork side. They may be slow sometimes to pick the concept up, but given time they sort that out. However, it was a different story with the teaching side.

'My theory is this, you would really know whether teaching is for you or not after you walk out of a class that you taught for the first time. I've seen a guy once after an hour and a half in the class he said "no, thanks, this is definitely not for me," as he walked out.'

4.7 Integrating new staff

The number and background of staff recruited with industrial experience created different needs and pressures to integrate new starters among the colleges visited as shown in appendix table 1.1. The numbers recruited in the past year ranged from five to 80 and previous levels of experience were varied. For example, the 59 new lecturers recruited by College B in 2003 included:

- 18 without any teaching experience or teaching qualification

- 9 newly qualified Cert Ed or PGCE, but without teaching experience

- 23 qualified/finishing Cert Ed or PGCE with part-time experience.

Appendix table 1.2 shows that the background of staff with industrial experience was also quite varied. However, there were some common means by which new recruits were integrated into the college life:

- induction process

- mentoring

- discussions with line managers to identify development needs.

4.7.1   Induction

Some colleges had revamped their induction process to specifically address the needs of new recruits from industry.

College B had introduced a proper induction process where new recruits shadowed people in their first few weeks and they had a considerable amount of time off teaching. They also had advanced practitioners to work with them, providing observation and feedback time, *etc.* By the time they were working full-time (towards the end of 10 weeks) they had acquired the basics and should feel prepared for the task in hand. (See section 4.6 for an example of the model used.)

The engineering department of college A always checked on new staff to see how they were settling in. They tried to find out as much as they could about the recruit's initial needs. New staff all went through the college's induction session. Their development manager should also keep an eye on their integration as well as their qualification needs, etc. They were provided with

support to get their qualifications. They all undertook the City & Guilds 740 programme. On completion of that, they moved onto a Certificate in Education.

'In the interview, we offer that in the next two years they go through these qualification programmes as part of the development and no-one has ever refused.'

4.7.2   Mentoring

A curriculum leader in engineering, technology and manufacturing at college A described their induction process. They had had a big drive on staff development recently, and each member of staff had a mentor. Mentoring was felt to work particularly well in the first six months. Staff also had their line manager to go to for various issues. Everyone had a staff development appraisal on a yearly basis. The system seemed to work fairly well, however *'our biggest problem is getting people to attend these, but we are working on that really hard.'*

In college E, mentorship included informal arrangements with other staff. There was not always just one mentor. A few different staff could contribute. New staff did not have full teaching schedules. This allowed them space to grow into the job, seen as important, *'as it is very easy for new staff to become overwhelmed.'* There was close supervision, and immediate action on development needs. Initial teacher training was also seen as very important, along with the appropriate remission of teaching hours.

'Probably the most damaging thing you could do, would be to schedule new staff up to hours, and let them get on with it.'

A curriculum leader in applied sciences felt that he was very good at noticing when staff were not happy, or were feeling overwhelmed, and good too at initiating change to address causes of stress. He believed firmly that staff need to be happy about their jobs. *'Welfare is a pre-requisite to good teaching.'*

Some colleges were allocating mentoring budget of approximately £5000 to departments to help to free up time for mentoring.

4.7.3   Identifying development needs

The HR director in college F described how development needs of new starters were identified. A new teacher's details were sent to the teacher development team and the teacher was told to make contact with this team within their first few weeks and to enrol in appropriate training. Literacy and numeracy assessment was also conducted when new staff joined (some professionals who had worked in industry for a long time had had different entry/training, and sometimes needed support in these areas); these assessments were used to decide on follow-up actions, if necessary. There were also annual appraisals, which set targets for performance, and provided comments on issues in management and performance.

4.7.4   Gaining a teaching qualification

As set out in the literature review, new full-time recruits to FE teaching are expected to acquire a teaching qualification in the first two years. In return, colleges typically offered:

- two hours' remission from teaching a week

- four hours' remitted teaching time and two hours from non-teaching duties if the qualification worked for was a Certificate in Education

- more tutorial time and so less preparation and marking.

Colleges running teacher training courses were training new recruits internally. Some colleges delivered their own programme in conjunction with other colleges.

In college F all full-time teachers were funded to gain the necessary qualification. Depending on the amount of teaching hours they did, they would be advised on the type of teaching qualification they should aim to obtain. All full-timers received remission from teaching hours while training, and both part-time and full-time staff got support from the teaching assistance team. Changes in teacher training delivery were felt to have improved the facility for trade professionals to obtain their teaching qualifications. Training had been made '*more hands-on, and more innovative*'.

4.7.5   Staff feedback on joining the college

Staff with industrial experience were also interviewed to gauge their views about joining the college.

Many thought that the demands of assessors' awards and teaching qualifications created a large workload, as illustrated by the experience of a training session coordinator in construction:

'*One of the reasons I took this job was for a career/lifestyle change to be able to spend more time with my family and I took a pay cut to come here then to find out that when I started my two year Cert Ed, I'm going to spend most of my weekends to work on my certificate. I am not getting any extra time to spend with family and plus am getting paid much less.*'

A lecturer in food preparation said that when he first started he was really surprised about the pressure and workload. He was a senior manager in the hospitality industry so he was used to looking after people, but in the college he was in a new environment which was very different:

'*In one meeting I heard 20 different abbreviations and I had to ask what these meant after the meeting. I had a mentor who was great but I felt the pressure and as a new lecturer I had to do so much on my own initiative. I also took a huge salary cut to come here and I also commute. So much work involved. I am also doing my Cert Ed and assumed that I would have some resources for the subject I was teaching but when I was given my timetable, I had to produce all this work. I spent a lot of weekends and evenings preparing for courses. I was really surprised about the lack of resources. I am not pointing the finger at colleagues as they are under pressure and very busy as well.*'

4.8 Retention

On the whole, colleges did not experience significant turnover problems, except in a few areas.

4.8.1   Reasons for leaving

Colleges cited the following as the pressure points and reasons for leaving:

- retaining part-time lecturers who want to work full-time

- shortage areas, such as plumbing where higher salaries are paid in industry

- resentment of the extra hours

- health reasons.

4.8.2 Where do they go?

There did not seem to be much analysis of turnover in the establishments visited, although some colleges were starting to collect more data on destinations. However, people interviewed thought that leavers:

- went back to self-employment or
- went to other colleges for a full-time job.

The working atmosphere and support from colleagues were felt to have the most impact in helping to retain staff. For example, in one college, the health and social department seemed to retain staff. '*They work very hard to keep them. It is a very supportive environment. They give the new recruits someone to shadow and work with.*' The college planned to extend this across the departments.

'Caring is a small, close-knit team. When someone new comes in, they look after them very well and provide them with personal support.'

The HR director of college B thought that if people liked the work, they would stay for a long time because the culture is '*nice and really friendly*' but the real issue was the pay and the amount of paperwork.

'When we interview them after six months of them being here, they all say it is a very nice place to work and much better than where they were before so that is not an issue. I guess if we support and train better, it may get better.'

4.8.3 Staff feedback on working for the college

Staff with industrial experience were interviewed in order to gauge their views about working for the college. Table 4.2 shows the aspects of the work that the teachers interviewed considered the most satisfying and the most dissatisfying.

A teacher in hairdressing at college E thought that the most satisfying aspect is teaching the students, and interacting with them.

'Seeing some young new kid arrive, not knowing anything, and then watching them leave bravely in to a whole new world. If you take away the students, there isn't any point'.

He found it very rewarding and had always enjoyed the teaching aspect of his career in industry (with his own salon).

Another teacher in college B also said that teaching is very rewarding.

'It is like going on stage. When I walk away from my evening class, I feel great. You don't realise it but you are an entertainer. Sometimes you grab their attention, sometimes you don't. Passing on your experience to students feels great. The feedback and questions you get from them can give you the most amazing feeling.'

Most satisfying	Most dissatisfying
Helping students to get through	Paperwork/bureaucracy
Teaching adult learners	Staff shortages
Able to help with student problems	Long hours
Students seeking advice	Pressure to pass students if they are failing
Students appreciating efforts	Lack of time
Support from line manager	Not enough value put on industrial experience
Available training	Pay scale: need to give so much for so little
Supportive environment	Lack of recognition for hard work

Table 4.2 Teachers' perceptions of working at the college

Source: IES, 2004

In college B, a training session co-ordinator in the construction department had been working in the college for one year. He thought that people did not appreciate '*just how many hoops you need to jump through to get here*'.

During a discussion group of staff with industrial experience in college A, interviewees felt that the college was putting pressure on to pass students whether tutors think they should or not.

'*Some really don't deserve to pass, they might just about scrape but are not really ready, but the pressure is always on because of achievement figures.*'

Similarly, an assessor in broadcasting found that the college was pushing to 'achieve' people who are not even competent.

'*Since I have taken on this role, it started to get to me to the point that I am thinking of giving up teaching and going back to the industry. I am really disheartened with what is happening and what you are expected to have to go through in that role.*'

Another had a very similar experience. They all agreed that the college worried too much about achievement and retention figures and that the quality was suffering as a result. Management was putting pressure on teaching staff, yet did not seem to worry about the number of extra hours staff needed to put in to achieve college objectives.

'*At the end of the day, all they seem to worry about is bums on seats, no worries about how it is going to reflect on us. The thing is that we cannot make the students stick around. If they change their minds half way through the course, you can't do anything about it.*'

A lecturer in media in college A did not get much support when she first started.

'I had heard about lesson plans but didn't know what they were about. I had a rough kind of plan in my hand about what I was going to teach and that was it. The person who came to observe asked me if anyone had told me about lesson plans. Nobody had told me about the type of paper-work I needed to produce. After that incident someone took time out to sit with me and show me how to do these things. Then I got to do my PGCE and learnt it all.'

Most of the staff interviewed complained about working long hours.

'When you are off sick or not available, nobody is there to step in to cover for you. In that respect, it gets really stressful. You work at the weekend and do very long hours during the weekdays as well. They do not get flexi time or time off in lieu. However, all the support staff have these arrangements. They find this very unfair. In the industry, you work long hours but you get the time back or get paid for overtime, nothing like that here. Long hours is another thing that causes stress.'

4.8.4   What had the most impact on retention?

The HR director in college E indicated that there were very good wages for FE lecturers on offer, and good working conditions. He thought that these issues impacted most on retention (as the college has fewer contracted hours from full-time posts than most other FE providers: 777 hours compared to 850 at other colleges). It was also flexible, in that part of the 777 teaching hours could be completed through other types of teaching contact, such as tutoring and course development.

The college also offered flexible work patterns for both full-time and part-time teaching staff. All of the teachers' preferences for teaching hours were taken into consideration when making the timetables and the department tried best to meet everyone's needs. Also, because many of the courses in the construction department did not run according to the academic calendar (in fact there are only a few weeks a year when there were no students attending courses), it enabled the teaching staff to take leave during off-peak seasons (and to benefit from cheap holidays).

College B was losing new staff who had never taught. '*It is such a shock to them when they come into education.*' They were looking at their individual needs as well so that they get the appropriate support they need.

In college F, the main initiative had been the introduction of premium rates for newly qualified teachers that the college wished to retain, (and who were being offered more to do the same job elsewhere).

4.8.5   What would they ideally like?

Interviewees were asked what they would like to do to address recruitment and retention issues. All interviewees, including staff, thought that pay was the most important factor. A curriculum leader in business studies felt that it was necessary to be able to offer more money to those coming from the professions (especially law), who were earning much more in industry. The department also wanted to make the working hours more flexible, and to provide increased opportunities to conduct research.

A curriculum leader in construction wanted pay to be increased for everyone, not just new recruits, but particularly in construction where there are serious staff shortages, and a huge demand for provision. He compared it to IT ten years ago. He would have liked to have more

flexibility to adjust pay in line with the market. He felt that there was some hierarchy/judgement involved in the restriction of salaries in construction.

The HR director in college F also said that they would like to be able to pay higher wages: *'People work to earn and maintain their socio-economic status, and have to negotiate to avoid inequality. As an FE institution, they need to exploit people's desire to work in the sector. It isn't, however just about money – it's also about how it's used.'*

Another curriculum leader in pure and applied science would have liked to have more flexibility to reward his staff, partly in terms of remuneration. He would also like greater flexibility with pay scales, in order to recruit staff in areas with small supplies of labour.

The staff interviewed thought that more encouragement could be given to working at home to develop materials and teaching resources. They would also have liked to have better resources (eg staff room, IT, car parking). Some staff would have liked to be more involved in vetting the students that joined their courses so that those they teach are genuinely dedicated to the subject.

4.9 Innovative practices

Colleges were asked to cite any innovative practices used in the recruitment of staff with industrial experience.

4.9.1 Attracting candidates

The ophthalmic dispensing department at college E had advertised for industrially–experienced staff to no avail: the number of potential recruits in this field was small, and it was even more difficult to find professionals who had teaching experience, or who were interested in teaching. In response to these difficulties, they were currently undertaking a targeted mailout to try and recruit the staff needed. To do this, they bought names and addresses from a marketing firm. They would be sending out information about the college, together with job descriptions to this list. The mailout was being designed at the time of the research, with an aim of being low-word count, and very 'punchy'. The college expected this area to expand considerably over the next few years (because of a drive from government to upgrade skills to Level 2 in this field), and they needed to find ophthalmic dispensers who are qualified to assess in the workplace. They would be offering a premium, in order to attract these individuals.

In college E, recruitment in the pharmacy area had worked mostly through networking by the current pharmacist, who was well known in the rest of the NHS Trust where she worked. The college had also tried approaching employers, with the argument that they should be sharing responsibility for qualifying professionals in the field. They had also suggested job-sharing between the pharmacies and the college to help staff training provision.

In college F, a curriculum leader in construction and engineering was trying a new approach. The HR department had written to all past students asking them about what they are doing at the time, and how the qualifications gained have served them (which is also a requirement as a CoVE department). In addition to this, they had included a flyer asking if they had ever been interested in passing their skills and knowledge on to others, in the hope that this might encourage them to consider coming back to their own college to teach.

9.4.2   Professionalising recruitment

College A stated that it is important to get the messages right about the organisation, the area and the job opportunities. They had done innovative work that year by putting a lot of information onto CD-ROMs, to give candidates a better idea about the college. It was a two-way process. People were selected and they selected themselves.

'If you don't give a good impression, they don't come. We give the managers the message that recruitment is an investment. They have to do their best to identify the best and also make sure that they are supported properly and looked after when they come.'

4.9.3   Monitoring selection for fairness

In College F, personal data was removed from all applications, and numbers were assigned to applicants. Short-listing was by pro forma to assess against the job specification. HR vetted all short-listing. These procedures had been tested in an employment tribunal and deemed 'very sophisticated'. All managers were trained in recruitment and selection.

4.9.4   Support for newly appointed lecturers

In college B the HR director had put forward proposals to her SMT about the different levels of support that ideally would be needed (costs permitting) for new starters, according to their level of experience, as shown below in table 4.3. This was done in order to address concerns about retention of new staff and the need to achieve and manage the quality of delivery. A team of 35 school-based advanced practitioners/mentors was proposed to provide the required level of support. A retainer was envisaged for these, as well as remission. Costs also needed to include cover of classes.

'I have been making a budget for costs to support new staff properly, it would cost just under £100,000 a year to support them properly. This does not include all aspects either, we will have to prioritise from the list.'

Time span	New to teaching in FE/unqualified	New to college but recently taught elsewhere, fully or partly qualified	Newly qualified Cert Ed or 730/740 at college or worked at college as PT lecturer	Newly qualified elsewhere
Week 1	Up to 10 days no teaching, shadowing classes, prepare materials, talk to LM and AP*	No teaching	No timetable	Up to 10 days no teaching, shadowing classes, prepare materials; talk to LM & AP
Week 2		Team teaching for 11.5 hrs with AP support	20 hrs/wk teaching with lesson observation by LM	
Week 3	Teaching for 10 hrs/wk supported by AP	Into new role for 20 hrs/wk	Full timetable	Teaching load 15 hrs/wk with support from AP for 10 hrs
Week 4				20 hrs/wk teaching with observation by LM & AP
Week 5	Workload 11.5hrs/wk			
Week 6		Initial review & observation & action plan		Action plan
Week 7		Full hours		
Week 8	Formal observation by LM & AP; action plan for support		Termly review	Up to 23 hrs/wk teaching with support and termly reviews as before
Remainder of term	20 hrs/wk increasing to full load except when doing teaching qualification	Termly review	Termly review	
End of year	working to College standards or capability policy	Termly review	Termly review	

*LM=line manager; AP=advanced practitioner

Table 4.3 Support of newly appointed lecturers according to previous experience

Source: Adapted from college B, 2004

College F was introducing advanced skills teachers who would be available at set times, to allow for all teaching staff to drop-in for advice. This would be available for new staff, and anyone else who desires it. The aim was providing support to the teacher training process.

4.9.5 Staff development

College E had introduced online CVs which were live, along with staff development action plans. These were meant to be updated regularly to keep staff's focus on development.

The college was looking at creating a new role for one of the teachers, who had a particular interest in learning techniques, as a 'teaching and learning champion' who would tie in to the

staff development within the department. The college thinks it is important to innovate, and adapt and to develop roles to suit individuals in the department.

In college F, the professional development week at the end of term was a chance for all staff to choose from a wide range of development training courses. They were encouraged to enrol on the basis of feedback from appraisals.

Appendix: List of case studies

Case Study	Approx number of teachers	Proportion industrial experience	Industrial experience recruited last year	Turnover rate overall	Approx number of learners	CoVE
A	304 FT; 224 PT	90 %	30	14 – 15 %	12,000 (2900 full-time)	digital & media interactive; plumbing & gas installation
B	400 FT; 600 PT (incl those going through teachers' training)	*	20	*	12,800 (incl 2800 full-time)	engineering; developing a centre for gas fitting & plumbing
C	100 FT; 50 PT	90 %	40	comparable to others in sector	4,000 (full-time)	print & media; computer technology
D	150 FT; 200 PT	*	5	average for sector; stable ageing workforce	8135 (incl 726 Full-time)	computer technology
E	455 FT; 1124 PT	Almost all faculties	60-70 % of new recruits	14 %	25,000 (incl 5000 FT)	applied science; beauty & complementary therapies
F	500 PT; 260 PT	Most faculties except 2	80 (70 straight from industry)	18 % (PT 26 %; FT 8 %)	37,000 (incl 4,000 pT)	care; construction

Appendix Table 1.1: Description of case study colleges

*Source: Data provided by colleges and OFSTED inspection reports when available, 2004 * data not available*

Curriculum area	Staff industrial experience
Business studies	Teacher in marketing was employed by a manufacturer of car components as a sales and marketing co-ordinator for six years.
Construction/ engineering	A specialist in plumbing who works as a training and session co-ordinator in the construction department. He had his own business for five years before joining the college. A technician facilitator has 25 years of motor vehicle experience in the industry working as a mechanic. A technical facilitator in engineering has 17 years' experience working as a electrical contracts manager for two main companies. Teacher in plumbing and gas was supervisor for local council for 2 years. A teacher in the brickwork section had worked as a supervisor/foreman for several building firms.
Hairdressing	Has been hairdressing for 39 years and owns his own salon. Previously worked in training schools of large hairdressing chains. Worked her way up from junior stylist to senior manager over seven years in industry. Joined the college 9 years ago as a technician; started PT lecturing and is now the course team leader.
Hospitality	A lecturer in food preparation has worked in the hospitality and catering industry for 20 years in a variety of establishments.
IT	Basic skills co-ordinator and teacher trainer was 8 years training officer for the local council and a private training organisation. Worked for large employers in secretarial posts including ICL and Safeway.
Media	Worked for the BBC, other stations and local newspapers.
Sports & leisure	A lecturer on BTEC national diplomas who worked as a manager in the fitness industry for five years.

Appendix Table 1.2: Experiences of some of the staff interviewed

Source: Data collected during group discussions, 2004

References

Attwell G and Brown A, 'The education of teachers and trainers in Europe – issues and policies', Paper presented at *the Fourth International Conference* 'Vocational Education and Training Research, University of Wolverhampton, 16-18 July 2001

Brookes D and Hughes M, *Developing Leading-Edge Staff in Vocational Education and Training*, LSDA, 2001

Chappell C and Johnston R, *Changing Work: changing roles for vocational education and training teachers and trainers*, NCVER, 2003

Clow R, 'Further Education Teachers' Constructions of Professionalism', *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, Volume 53, Number 3, 2001

Department for Education and Skills, *Research on the FE Workforce*, unpublished DfES paper, 2004

DfES, *Developing the Leaders of the Future: A Leadership Strategy for the Learning and Skills Sector*, Consultation document, 2003

DfES, *The Future of Initial Teacher Education for the Learning and Skills Sector: An Agenda for Reform 2003. A Consultative Paper*, 2003

Evans E, 'Skills shortages', 't' Magazine, 2001

FENTO, *Skills Foresight for Further Education 2002*, March 2002

Further Education Funding Council, *Standards and their Assurance in Vocational Qualifications*, Coventry 1997

Gray M, Lawson P, Legge C, Marks T, *Evaluation of the Teaching Pay Initiative in Further Education Sector Colleges,* DfES Research Report 468, 2003

Hopwood V, *Evaluation of the Golden Hello Initiative,* DfES Research Report 544, 2004

Hurstfield J, Neathey F, Thewlis M *Recruitment and Retention of Staff in UK Higher Education: A survey and case studies*, UCEA, 2002

HMSO *Statutory Instrument 2001 No. 1209 The Further Education Teachers' Qualifications (England) Regulations 2001*

National Association of Teachers in Further and Higher Education, NATFHE response to 'Success for All: Reforming Further Education and Training', DfES Discussion Document, June 2002

Ofsted, *The initial training of further education teachers: s survey,* HMI 1762, 2003

Owen J and Davies P, *Listening to Staff*, LSDA 2003