



Citizenship in Scotland's Colleges

A REPORT BY HM INSPECTORATE OF EDUCATION FOR THE SCOTTISH
FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION FUNDING COUNCIL

November 2006

Contents

1.	Introduction	1
2.	Methodology	2
3.	Summary of findings	3
4.	Citizenship in context	4
5.	The development of skills for citizenship in colleges	6
5.1	Strategic approaches in colleges	6
5.2	Links to core skills and skills for employability	6
5.3	Planning for skills for citizenship	7
5.4	Embedding activities into mainstream programmes	8
5.5	Examples of curriculum areas embedding skills for citizenship	9
5.6	Programmes with a specific citizenship focus	10
6.	The role of student associations	13
7.	Measuring achievement in skills for citizenship	16
8.	Recommendations	17
Appendix 1	Examples of good practice	18
Appendix 2	Citizenship in post-16 provision in England	21
Appendix 3	Bibliography	23
Appendix 4	Colleges engaged in the fieldwork visits	25

1. Introduction

The development of skills for citizenship in education is not just a Scottish priority. In recent years, there has been a much greater focus across Europe and further afield on the development of these skills in learners, as a direct response from educationalists and policy makers to a series of shared challenges:

- societies facing rapid and sometimes unpredictable change
- issues arising from increasing cultural, religious and social diversity
- dealing with groups of young people who feel excluded from the process of education and from the value systems represented by schools and colleges as agencies of society.

Citizenship involves the development of skills and attributes to enable young people to participate in the making of decisions, within the political, economic, social and cultural contexts of their lives. Other aspects of citizenship education include the development of knowledge and understanding; a focus on values and citizenship issues; and opportunities for engagement in, and reflection on citizenship activities. The process of identifying and highlighting these important skills for citizenship has not happened in a curriculum vacuum. The external dynamic of successive Scottish Executive-driven initiatives, and changing approaches to learning and teaching have both contributed to the process.

Scotland's colleges are important agencies of change and already play a key role in helping individual learners and the wider community to tackle the complex challenges identified above. Overall, they have responded positively to the agenda of preparing learners to take their place as active, responsible citizens. They have set skills for citizenship and employability within a wider suite of learner skills to be developed, including creativity, independence in learning, and critical thinking. Core skills are an important element of this skills mix. Specific skills for citizenship and employability are clearly described in publications such as Learning and Teaching Scotland's *Education for Citizenship in Scotland: a paper for discussion and development*.

This report examines the current position of Scotland's colleges in terms of the contribution they make in developing skills for citizenship in their learners. The colleges visited for fieldwork were chosen because it was anticipated that they would exhibit examples of good practice that could be highlighted and more widely shared across the sector to further raise awareness.

The report complements the publication by HMIE in September 2006 of *Education for Citizenship: A Portrait of Current Practice in Scottish Schools and Pre-school Centres*.

2. Methodology

The report draws on evidence from 20 HMIE reviews carried out during 2003-2005 and other HMIE contacts with colleges. Important evidence was also gained from fieldwork visits to four colleges, to explore specifically issues relating to skills for citizenship. During these visits HMI held meetings with senior staff to investigate the strategic approaches that colleges were taking to citizenship. Additionally, HMI met curriculum managers who had a direct responsibility for planning programmes in terms of content and delivery. Meetings with learners provided important information about their perspective on the skills developed through participation in classroom and other activities. Finally, meetings with student presidents and other learners involved in student associations provided further information on the impact of their activities on developing skills for citizenship.

3. Summary of findings

Scotland's colleges had responded well overall to the Scottish Executive's strategy for lifelong learning and the specific goal of developing citizens who would be active participants in all aspects of Scottish life. At a strategic level the majority of colleges gave consideration to the place of citizenship within their curriculum but this was not fully reflected in planning for skills for citizenship within strategic and operational planning cycles.

Most colleges had taken a holistic approach to developing a range of important skills in learners within programmes. These included core skills, skills for employability, skills in creativity, and independent and critical thinking. Most colleges had integrated the development of skills for citizenship into this wider suite of skills. The emphasis on assisting learners to develop the necessary set of skills for employment had led many colleges to integrate skills for citizenship alongside those for employability. Most colleges used their annual review and planning cycle to review and plan skills for citizenship within their programmes. However, many colleges did not have in place systematic and effective self-evaluation and planning processes to ensure learners had opportunities to develop skills for citizenship within all programmes. A few colleges had planned and delivered direct staff development to engage staff with the concept of citizenship.

Overall, learning and teaching approaches provided meaningful opportunities for learners to develop and demonstrate civic responsibilities in a variety of settings. Learners enjoyed these approaches to active learning. Many programmes had successfully embedded skills for citizenship within relevant aspects of the curriculum, with good examples in visual arts, performing arts and sport-related programmes. Other programmes, for specific groups of learners, often used citizenship as a meaningful context to develop a range of vocational and broader skills.

In a few colleges that tracked learners' development of skills for citizenship, this was often in the form of a personal learning log that recorded achievement against previously set goals. However, there was a need to develop a wider, more innovative, range of approaches to recognise achievement in this area. Many colleges promoted and celebrated the success of their learners to highlight their wider achievement.

Student associations played an important role in developing learners' skills for citizenship by offering opportunities through their representative and advocacy roles. Programme committees were key structures in contributing to this activity and these were often well supported by student associations and Student Participation in Quality Scotland (SPARQS). Associations organised and promoted a range of events that highlighted citizenship issues within a cultural and lifestyle context. They also played an active role in promoting many informal opportunities for learners to make a valuable contribution to local communities.

4. Citizenship in context

Citizenship education equips people with the knowledge, skills and attributes to play an active and effective part in society as informed, critical citizens who take their responsibilities seriously. The current literature emphasises that citizenship education is relevant to everyone, regardless of their legal or residential status, and is a continual and lifelong process.

The recent HMIE publication, *Improving Scottish Education* commented on the quality of education across all sectors in Scotland and made some important points about the place of citizenship within the curriculum. The introduction to the section on colleges reads:

“The Scottish Executive’s five-year strategy for lifelong learning, Life through Learning: Learning through Life (Scottish Executive, 2003), recognises the important role that Scotland’s colleges play in driving change in Scotland’s society and the Scottish economy, in developing the range of skills they require to participate fully as citizens in society, and in preparing learners for their role in supporting economic development in Scotland.”

The report also noted under the section on leadership in colleges:

“Appropriate mission, vision and value statements, often placing the learner at the centre, are usually well understood by staff. In most colleges, productive partnerships are in place between staff and employers, community organisations and other educational institutions such as universities and schools. Other partnerships with employers and community groups support the learning process and help develop learners’ skills for employability and citizenship.”

The revised SFEFC/HMIE quality framework (May, 2004) gives greater emphasis to the place of skills for citizenship. For example, there are references to the development of skills for citizenship under the quality indicators within *programme design, the learning and teaching process, and learner progress and outcomes*. In addition, the cross-college element *educational leadership, direction and management* prompts consideration of vision and direction of the curriculum, and whether the college’s curricular response adequately reflects the importance of the development of skills for citizenship.

More than half of college learners enter as adults and for them college may be the first opportunity to engage with citizenship issues as part of formal education. Many other college learners arrive fresh from their experiences in school. Developments in the school sector inevitably impact on how learners respond to college programmes.

A Curriculum for Excellence (ACfE) sets out the vision of the Scottish Executive’s curriculum policy for 3-18 year olds in the years ahead and

recognises the importance of skills for citizenship within the curriculum. The curriculum review group stated:

'Our aspiration is to enable all children to develop their capacities as successful learners, confident individuals, responsible citizens and effective contributors to society.'

ACfE makes it clear that in realising the capacity of 'responsible citizens', young people should develop:

- respect for others; and
- commitment to participate responsibly in political, economic, social and cultural life.

They should also be able to:

- develop knowledge and understanding of the world and Scotland's place in it;
- understand different beliefs and cultures;
- make informed choices and decisions;
- evaluate environmental, scientific and technological issues; and
- develop informed, ethical views of complex issues.

One of the National Priorities in Education identified by the Scottish Executive is National Priority 4: Values and Citizenship:

"To work with parents to teach pupils respect for self and one another and their interdependence with other members of their neighbourhood and society and teach them the duties and responsibilities of citizenship in a democratic society."

The Scottish Executive's lifelong learning strategy reinforces the focus on education for citizenship. The strategy is viewed as an opportunity to promote social and economic justice and provide a vision of Scotland where:

"... people have the confidence, enterprise, knowledge, creativity and skills they need to participate in economic, social and civic life."

Therefore, developing skills for citizenship involves initially raising learners' awareness of their rights and responsibilities as members of their community and then supporting them to take an active interest in the democratic process. It is not narrowly based on political literacy or the introduction of a new subject area, but rather on a broad, cross-curricular approach. It should not be static and conformist but be responsive and dynamic, both to technological and social change and to the various roles that learners have to play as citizens – in their family, local community, country, in Europe and globally.

5. The development of skills for citizenship in colleges

5.1 Strategic approaches in colleges

Most colleges had acknowledged the importance of citizenship and the need to encourage and equip learners to be active participants in local and wider communities. More than a few had taken a range of strategic approaches to promote and develop skills for citizenship in their learners.

Generally, colleges had not yet ensured that planning for citizenship activities was fully embedded within strategic and operational planning cycles. However, more than a few colleges made specific reference to citizenship in their strategic plans, usually with an associated target or milestone within a strategic aim. This target or milestone was then translated into specific measurable targets within the operational plan. In some cases, references to citizenship were embedded within strategic aims referring to inclusiveness, with an emphasis on respect and understanding of different cultures.

One college produced a comprehensive citizenship strategy. This was a key document that outlined the college's approach to developing skills for citizenship in its learners and contained a statement of responsibility from the college as to how it would promote good citizenship for learners. It also proposed a range of approaches to be considered by programme teams during their planning process.

Some colleges made good use of learning agreements or student contracts to promote the ethos of shared respect and responsibility within the college culture. Teaching staff made good use of opportunities during the programme induction process to explore both sides of this commitment with learners.

One college had taken a very proactive role in promoting citizenship issues by means of an innovative series of information points located through the institution. (*See good practice example 1.*)

5.2 Links to core skills and skills for employability

Most colleges had taken a holistic approach to developing a range of key skills for learners within programmes. They had not viewed skills for citizenship as a bolt-on to the curriculum but had worked to embed these specific skills into the broader skill mix, including core skills and skills for employability.

Most colleges had developed effective strategies and methods for core skills development and delivery. Each of the core skills – *communication, numeracy, information technology, working with others* and *problem solving*, lent themselves particularly well to integration with skills for citizenship.

Most colleges had responded well to developing opportunities and activities to support skills that would further enhance employment. The vocational nature

of many college programmes provided appropriate platforms on which to develop additional skills pertinent to industry.

HMIE reviews in 2004/05 confirmed many aspects of these developments under learning and teaching processes and reported that in many colleges staff:

- set suitably challenging standards for learners that were clearly linked to industry expectations;
- encouraged learners to develop reflective thinking and creative skills and be independent in their approach to learning.

In the same period, reviews of learner progress and outcomes confirmed two key themes.

- Learners generally made good progress from their prior achievements and were developing appropriate knowledge and skills
- Wider achievement, particularly in industry-recognised awards, helped learners improve their employability skills.

Given this emphasis on assisting learners to develop the necessary skills for employment, many colleges had integrated skills for citizenship alongside those for employability. There was a general view that to be effective, skills for citizenship needed to be presented to learners in the context of core skills and skills for employability. Learners were more likely to be active participants in many aspects of society if they had the range of skills necessary to enter employment and engage in community, cultural and democratic processes.

5.3 Planning for skills for citizenship

The majority of colleges used their annual course review and planning cycle to examine the content of programmes and determine where citizenship activities could suitably be incorporated. However, not all colleges had ensured that these self-evaluation processes were applied consistently to all of their programmes. Some colleges had given clear direction to curriculum teams to support the identification and development of suitable activities. Other colleges allowed individual curriculum teams to determine for themselves what was appropriate for their own learners. More generally, colleges had not yet evaluated how well learners were developing skills for citizenship and what impact, if any, these additional skills might have on their local communities.

In one college, staff in the business and management area used a helpful template to examine systematically each programme and identify where each core skill and skills for citizenship and employability could be developed. (See *good practice example 2.*)

A few colleges had planned and delivered specific staff development opportunities to engage staff with the concept of citizenship. Workshop activities allowed staff to look at programme design and lesson activity in their

particular areas and identify strategies and opportunities for developing skills for citizenship.

5.4 Embedding activities into mainstream programmes

Colleges had succeeded in embedding skills for citizenship into many of their programmes. A range of learning and teaching approaches, enhanced by additional learner activities, provided learners with interesting and stimulating opportunities to develop skills for citizenship. Learners benefited from experiences including the following.

Visits to external civic bodies

Many programmes made good use of class visits to external agencies engaged in a wide range of civic activities. For example, learners on HN programmes in business and management and National Qualification (NQ) social science programmes gained a better understanding of the roles and responsibilities of the Scottish Parliament by organised visits and discussions with elected representatives. Learners on a range of programmes took part in trips to the European Parliament and benefited from opportunities to discuss its workings with local MEPs. Colleges organised visits to local sheriff and high courts for learners on programmes that contained law units and these visits supported theoretical work in the classroom.

Work placements

Work placements were widely used in a range of programmes to provide learners with real-life experience and the chance to develop skills for employability. Learners also reported the value of the placements in exposing them to situations and experiences that were outwith their usual experience. For example, learners on a HNC Health Care programme described how their work with adults with severe physical disabilities had challenged some of the assumptions and prejudices they had held prior to commencing the programme. This had given them the confidence to challenge the same prejudices with friends and family. Similarly, learners working with asylum seeker families described the greater understanding they now had of the circumstances surrounding requests for asylum and the challenges faced by the families.

Buddying

Buddying was used both formally and informally in many colleges to provide support to new learners beginning on programmes. Often learners from the previous year's intake acted as the buddies and ensured that new learners were familiar with various aspects of college life and aspects of the programme. New learners benefited from the knowledge and experience gained from their buddy, and buddies developed a range of affective skills, including dependability, reliability, self-discipline and confidence, within the context of social responsibility.

Formal debating

Some college programmes made effective use of formal debating to encourage learners to develop clearer reasoning and communication skills. On one NQ social science programme, this approach was used imaginatively in a simulated parliamentary-style debate that was also recorded by fellow learners on a video production programme. Topical issues such as “the introduction of identity cards” and “attitudes to racism in the UK, post 9/11” were first researched by learners and then formally debated. Learners received coaching in debating skills to further develop their oral communication skills. Learners were very positive about this innovative approach to learning.

Volunteering

Volunteering was widely recognised as a valuable vehicle through which learners could develop skills for citizenship and contribute effectively to their local communities in a practical and meaningful way. For example, in one college, learners on a HND Administration and Information Management programme acted as community tutors and provided valuable support to people over the age of 50 years who were learning to use computers. (See *good practice example 3.*)

Working with other age groups

College programmes provided good opportunities for learners of different age groups to work together and gain a better understanding of specific issues that impact on them. In one college, a group of young business and management students produced a list of common texting words and their meanings. They presented this information to a group of “silver surfers” and the resulting discussion between the two groups of learners provided good opportunities for sharing and learning about age-related cultural differences.

5.5 Examples of curriculum areas embedding skills for citizenship

Examples of curriculum areas where mainstream learning and teaching activities leant themselves particularly well to promoting opportunities for developing skills for citizenship included the following.

Visual arts programmes

Visual arts programmes provided many good opportunities for learners to express their art through relevant and current themes with a direct impact on citizenship issues. For example, learners on photography programmes in one college made effective use of photojournalism to produce a series of photo-essays on topics such as “litter in Edinburgh”; “the Scottish Parliament” and “what makes us the best small country in the world?” Learners were often encouraged to present their work in college-wide exhibitions and on

corridor walls, and this raised awareness and stimulated discussion with other learners and staff.

In another college, learners on HND Multimedia and Television Operations and Production programmes produced a series of short films on a variety of topics, including alcohol and drug awareness, Fair Trade and fire safety. (See *good practice example 4.*)

Performing arts programmes

Performing arts programmes also provided good opportunities for learners to engage in citizenship issues through their chosen medium. In one college, learners on *Dance in the Community* programmes gained valuable practical vocational experience and developed skills for citizenship through their involvement with local groups in a range of different dance activities.

In another college, learners on music programmes had formal contact with agencies such as the Scottish Arts Council and the Musicians' Union, and these provided opportunities for learners to gain a fuller understanding of the roles and remits of these organisations. Learners also ran a number of "Masterclass" workshops with local community groups on themes such as African music.

Sport-related programmes

Sport-related programmes were used to good effect by colleges to provide a suitable context for learners to participate in a range of citizenship activities. This contributed to supporting **sportscotland** strategies and initiatives and their emphasis on the importance of encouraging sporting activities to enhance communities and Scottish society.

In one college, learners on HNC/D Sport and Recreation Management programmes used key units of work in the development of sport and events management to organise a series of weekly coaching events for P6 and P7 pupils in local primary schools. Sports included rugby and basketball and the primary pupils found the activities enjoyable and informative. Organising the events provided learners with a number of opportunities to discuss and work through practical aspects of citizenship. For example, the issues surrounding disclosure for persons working with children and vulnerable adults were discussed not only within the classroom but also with primary teachers and pupils' parents. These discussions provided valuable learning opportunities for the development of skills for citizenship.

5.6 Programmes with a specific citizenship focus

A number of colleges had embraced the citizenship theme and designed specific programmes for groups of learners that emphasised the development of these skills. Often these programmes were directed at groups of learners that were particularly difficult to reach or had a range of particular needs that

would benefit from a practical skills programme. Examples included the following.

Disengaged learners

Colleges made effective use of the citizenship agenda to re-engage young people who had not responded to traditional school approaches, many of whom were or might fall into the NEET (Not in Employment, Education or Training) category. In one college, a full-time course preparing 15-18 year olds for employment or further training strongly promoted the theme of citizenship and also emphasised the development of core and employability skills. Active approaches to learning, including much group work, ensured that learners were fully engaged in the learning process. External visits to local cultural and artistic venues, exhibitions and events added value to their programmes. A major group project on relevant issues, such as football hooliganism, sectarianism and prison life, provided good learning opportunities for research and creativity skills to be developed. Students enhanced their communication skills through an end of topic presentation.

In another college, learners on a NQ level 1 Business and IT programme used the running of a college stationery shop as a practical vehicle for developing skills for citizenship and employability. Roles and responsibilities were negotiated within the class, which developed strong planning and interpersonal skills. The class also held fundraising events for charities such as McMillan Cancer and Guide Dogs for the Blind. These practical activities provided real benefits for the charities and also created a platform on which to discuss issues related to the charities' scope and objectives.

School programmes

All colleges had good links with local schools and provided productive learning activities for school pupils. School learners participated in a range of programmes ranging from single taster days to full-time provision. Vocational activities that schools could not deliver were popular and school learners demonstrably benefited from the chance to develop specific vocational skills. Part-time schools programmes also provided good progression opportunities to full-time college courses, acting as a transitional bridge from school to college. One head teacher spoke positively of the significance of school-college links for his pupils in exposing them to different cultures and age groups not present in the school, and helping them broaden and further develop skills for citizenship.

Often schools promoted college courses particularly to disaffected pupils, and the college provided a different learning environment in which many of them were better able to participate in learning activities that they focused upon meaningfully.

ESOL programmes

Over successive years Scotland has been a destination for asylum seekers and refugees, with a number of cities acting as receiving centres, and more recently it has received economic migrants from eastern Europe.

Programmes of English for speakers of other languages (ESOL) were delivered in the majority of Scotland's colleges. These programmes helped many learners develop English language skills to allow them to participate fully in Scottish society. Learners came from a variety of backgrounds. Some had migrated to be with family in this country and others had chosen to learn English in Scotland before returning to their home countries.

ESOL programmes were focused on language acquisition to support learners in home and work situations. This language acquisition also encouraged learners to take part more actively in local community life. Aspects of citizenship were routinely embedded within programmes, such as language to support encounters with officials on housing, education (particularly important for dealing with children's schools), health issues and benefits.

In 2002, the UK government announced the intention to make becoming a British citizen a more meaningful event. An advisory group, chaired by Sir Bernard Crick, made a number of important recommendations in "The New and the Old" report in 2003. The Advisory Board for Naturalisation and Integration (ABNI) grew out of the Crick advisory group and advised the Home Office on implementing the citizenship agenda.

Immigrants could apply for British citizenship after passing an online citizenship test. An alternative to this was to gain an appropriate ESOL qualification supported by a letter from the institution confirming that the qualification had been gained in a citizenship context.

Specific learning and teaching materials were developed nationally within the UK, and a number of Scottish colleges were currently piloting these materials with groups of ESOL learners. Some colleges had adapted the materials to give a Scottish perspective to the citizenship theme.

Special programmes

Skills for citizenship were systematically incorporated into special programmes within colleges. Most of these programmes placed much emphasis on personal development and achievement. This focus engaged individual learners by developing their self-esteem and confidence, and recognised and celebrated their achievements. Programmes designed around the theme of citizenship provided learners the opportunity to explore issues about their rights and responsibilities within the local community, Scotland and the international community. *(See good practice example 5.)*

6. The role of student associations

Student associations played an important role in promoting the citizenship agenda within colleges. They provided an important forum for learners to participate actively in a range of events that developed key skills and often resulted in tangible positive outcomes for the college and local communities. Some of these benefits included the following.

Developing skills for class representation

A major function of student associations is to provide a structure for consultation and representation between learners and colleges. The recent HMIE report *Student Representation in Scottish Further Education Colleges* highlighted the extent to which learners contributed effectively to quality improvement in colleges in a number of important ways. One of the most significant contributions was through representation on programme committees, course committees or course teams. Some colleges had other key cross-college committees that included learner representation.

Learners described this representative function of the student association as providing an effective voice for them. In some instances, learner representatives also acted as mediators and advocates for fellow learners, and assisted in the resolution of issues between learners and colleges, and between learners.

The Scottish Higher Education Funding Council (SHEFC), the Scottish Further Education Funding Council (SFEFC) [latterly, the Scottish Funding Council (SFC)] has provided funding for an organisation called Student Participation in Quality Scotland (SPARQS) to assist learners and institutions to improve the engagement of learners in quality processes. Most college student associations had now participated in SPARQS training and this was starting to have a positive impact on the extent and effectiveness of learner participation.

In one college, the local community council had invited a learner representative to attend meetings and this had led to a better understanding of concerns between the local community and the student body.

Fundraising/charity activities

All student associations encouraged charity fundraising events to support a range of local and national charities. One college nominated a new charity on an annual basis. National charities, such as *Red Nose Day* and *Children in Need*, were popular and provided good opportunities for learners to participate in high-profile events that impacted on the local community. Learners participated in a variety of activities, including sponsored sport tournaments, and this involvement by learners from different curriculum areas of the college promoted wider team building experiences.

Student associations had responded very positively to charity appeals in response to international disasters, such as earthquakes and the tsunami, and promoted global responsibility in a context that allowed learners to understand many of the surrounding issues. A few associations had a dedicated charities officer.

Events

Student associations were particularly effective at promoting events that provided information on cultural and lifestyle matters. Such events allowed learners the opportunities to consider wider issues with peers, supported by factual information from outside agencies. Most college student associations held an annual Freshers' event for new learners, and outside agencies provided valuable information on a range of relevant subjects, such as finance, health and promotion of the *Young Scot* scheme. Standalone health awareness events were organised throughout the year and were often co-ordinated with national events such as World AIDS Day, the annual pre-Christmas responsible drinking campaign and cancer awareness.

One student association had arranged for the local citizens' advice bureau to attend the college one day each week to provide learners with information and advice on a range of topics including housing and financial matters. The service was well used and bureau volunteers commented that a location within the college was ideal because "students lead busy lives and this was an ideal way for them to access these services".

Some associations played an active role in promoting cultural awareness and Fair Trade within colleges. In one college, the association had been instrumental in negotiating with the catering staff to provide Fair Trade options in tea and coffee in the refectory. In another college, the association had organised a "One World" event, to promote cultural awareness amongst learners and staff. (See *good practice example 6.*)

Another student association ran a "volunteer agency" and invited a number of local organisations that were looking for volunteers to promote their causes within the college. (See *good practice example 7.*)

Recycling activities

Student associations were also proactive in highlighting environmental issues and in particular practical sustainability projects. In one college, the association promoted its "greening of the college" policy and set about encouraging both learners and staff in a number of recycling activities. This included negotiating with catering staff to discontinue use of plastic cups and cutlery in the refectory and the promotion of aluminium can, plastic bottle and paper recycling across the college.

Student association role in buddying

A number of college student associations played an important role in supporting new learners through formal befriending or buddying schemes. Sometimes this was developed in partnership with the college and other times independently. In one college, this was particularly effective in supporting the large number of asylum seeker and international learners that attended. The buddies were local learners who were able to pass on useful information about the college as well as local knowledge about the surrounding community. Often buddies invited their new colleagues into their own homes and involved them in local cultural and sporting activities. Close and productive friendships were formed through these relationships and this contributed positively to a better understanding of cultural issues between local and international learners.

7. Measuring achievement in skills for citizenship

Measuring the distance travelled in the development of skills for citizenship is a particularly difficult task. It provides a challenge for colleges to design and use performance indicators that measure the results from a range of activities in developing skills for citizenship. However, if learners are to be credited with the attainment of skills for citizenship then robust arrangements and procedures must be developed to provide reliable assessment and recording of these skills, against which a learner's progress can be determined.

A number of colleges had developed techniques to register a learner's progress in the attainment of skills for citizenship. Some of these approaches relied upon reflective consideration by learners on their achievement of a variety of skills, including skills for citizenship, against targets set in earlier discussion with tutors. Learners recorded results in their personal log as evidence for tutors to make judgements on how well a learner had progressed. Other assessment activities in the early stages of development included peer review judgments where learners reflected on each other's contributions within an activity and provided feedback at the end of the lesson. However, many learners were not encouraged to carry out these types of reflective practice.

In developing these approaches to measuring learner achievement, colleges had also considered the wider range of evidence necessary to measure a learner's success in the attainment of skills for citizenship. They posed themselves questions including the following.

- What range of assessment approaches is required to adequately monitor progress and attainment?
- What evidence is necessary to make appropriate judgements on learner progress?
- How often should assessment take place and should it be formal or informal?

A range of assessment materials was being used to recognise achievement in citizenship. Some colleges considered the most appropriate and manageable way of recognising the attainment of learners in citizenship was through a summative statement in a progress file, an informal award or a college certificate.

Many colleges celebrated the success of their learners and viewed this as an important public recognition of their achievement during their studies. Colleges used award ceremonies, promotion of success in local and national competition, newsletters and college websites as effective approaches to celebrating their learners' success. In one college, an annual yearbook containing high-quality photographs was used to good effect to celebrate learner success.

8. Recommendations

Colleges should:

- ensure there is consistency in the planning for delivery of skills for citizenship at both strategic and operational levels in all their curriculum areas;
- within self-evaluation procedures, include a focus on evaluating the effectiveness of their development of skills for citizenship and its impact on their local communities;
- use learning and teaching approaches, in all programmes, that encourage full participation of learners in activities to promote and develop citizenship;
- provide opportunities for learners to reflect on the progress they have made in developing skills for citizenship throughout their curriculum programmes;
- review arrangements for recording achievement of skills for citizenship with a view to developing a range of methods of assessment, including non-traditional approaches; and
- further encourage student association and learner representation activities to support responsibilities for the life of the college and society more generally.

To support developments nationally, SFC should consider:

- engaging with colleges to design appropriate performance indicators that record and assess learner achievement and distance travelled in the range of key skills, including skills for citizenship; and
- promoting and disseminating good practice in skills for citizenship across the wider college sector.

Appendix 1 Examples of good practice

1. College information points

Aberdeen College had taken a very proactive role in promoting citizenship issues by means of an innovative series of information points located through the institution. These allowed learners unmediated and free access to online information on a variety of topics such as sexual health and sensible drinking. In addition, a series of plasma screen televisions, strategically located across the college, played a series of information slides on topical issues such as civil rights, disability awareness, multicultural matters and health issues. These unobtrusive messages were played in the background and were changed every few weeks. Learners were aware of the citizenship messages that were being displayed and teaching staff took appropriate opportunities in classroom activities to raise the current messages with learners. A further set of plasma screen televisions played BBC News 24 in the background. Learners were able to easily access current news headlines on national and international issues.

2. Programme planning tool for skills for citizenship

Anniesland College staff in the business and management area used a helpful template to examine systematically each course programme and identify where each core skill and skills for citizenship and employability could be developed. This exercise signposted named units within the programme, additional activities within these units and some of the learning and teaching approaches taken to support skills development. These templates were converted into learner induction booklets that were used effectively with learners to make them aware of the importance of skills development from the start of their programmes.

3. Volunteer community-based computing tutors

Angus College learners were encouraged to work in the community as IT tutors for people of more than 50 years of age, as part of the *Angus Gold* project, promoted by Angus Council. Initially, six HND Administration and Information Management learners acted as trainers in day-care centres, sheltered accommodation and nursing homes in a number of local towns. The learner volunteers undertook training in health and safety, dealing with confidentiality and volunteering more generally. The volunteers helped to support more than 100 learners to develop their IT skills in the community every week.

4. Citizenship activities within visual arts programmes

Aberdeen College learners on HND Multimedia and Television Operations and Production programmes produced a series of short films on a variety of topics, including alcohol and drug awareness, Fair Trade and fire safety. Some learners had also taken the opportunity of overseas travel to present images of different cultures and global concerns, such as the AIDS pandemic and its impact in a South African children's orphanage. Learners' work was showcased annually in a local independent cinema and learners benefited not only from peer review but also from wider community comment.

5. Citizenship in special programmes

Motherwell College's support for learning programmes were designed around the theme of citizenship and provided learners with the opportunity to explore issues about their rights and responsibilities within the local community, Scotland and the international community. Learning strategies and the material to support learning and teaching were differentiated, to take account of the specific needs of individuals and groups of learners. The progression of knowledge and skills from previous work in secondary school was factored into the programme design and also reflected those in the current *A Curriculum for Excellence* review. Staff had developed an extremely useful tool, using mind-mapping software, to support planning and delivery of the curriculum. The various linkages between elements of the citizenship curriculum had been presented in a format to allow staff and learners to have an overview of the whole curriculum at a glance. Hyperlinks to a range of shared learning and teaching resources facilitated staff choice of appropriate material for learners. The software was well used by staff to support learners and further encouraged a team approach to curriculum planning and development.

6. Multicultural awareness events

Langside College's student association played an active role in promoting cultural awareness and Fair Trade. The association organised a "One World" event, to promote cultural awareness and awareness of different faiths amongst learners and staff. This event included stalls run by the Scottish Refugee Council, local racial alliance groups, and other organisations, providing literature on the issues of culture and faiths. The event also addressed the issue of Fair Trade and promoted a range of Fair Trade products provided by local retailers.

7. Student association organised volunteering

Stevenson College Edinburgh's student guild was particularly active in promoting a wide range of citizenship activities that learners were able to participate in. In particular, the guild ran a "volunteer agency" and each

month invited a number of local organisations that were looking for volunteers to promote their causes within the college. This monthly event now attracted learners to volunteer for activities such as beach cleaning and befriending. The guild was currently investigating accreditation for the Scottish Volunteer Gold Scheme whereby class representatives, association officers and other student volunteers can be accredited with the hours they have contributed as a volunteer.

Appendix 2 Citizenship in post-16 provision in England

In England the introduction of citizenship as a compulsory component of the national curriculum in September 2002 signaled the intentions of the UK government to have citizenship education at the heart of a young person's educational experience.

The Crick Report, (Education for Citizenship and the Teaching of Democracy in Schools), suggested a model for citizenship education composed of three strands:

- social and moral responsibility – learning from an early age to behave with self-confidence and in a socially and morally responsible way within and beyond the classroom, both to those in authority and towards each other;
- community involvement – learning about becoming involved in the life and concerns of communities, including learning through community involvement and service to the community; and
- political literacy – learning how to take part in and influence, public life through knowledge, skills and values.

The Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (QCA) in England recommends that post-16 learners should have the opportunity to:

- identify, investigate and think critically about citizenship issues, problems or events of concern to them;
- decide on and take part in follow-up action, where appropriate; and
- reflect on, recognise and review their citizenship learning.

An evaluation exercise of citizenship programmes for post-16 learners completed by Ofsted in 2005 emphasised that the most successful programmes benefited from careful planning and implementation and were closely linked to the QCA's learning objectives for citizenship.

The National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER) also evaluated citizenship education for post-16 learners and found the most effective programmes:

- had a clear definition of the aims and objectives
- tailored citizenship education to the needs, skills, interests and experiences of young people
- developed a flexible, yet rigorous, framework which recognises the diversity of programmes from taught to more active approaches
- provided a focus upon critically active forms of learning, including discussion, debate, dialogue and reflection.

In England, the QCA had developed assessment procedures to assist centres make informed judgements on a candidate's progress in the attainment of skills for citizenship:

“Assessment of citizenship helps young people to recognise and value what they have learnt. It helps to identify the purpose and intended outcomes of citizenship learning and shows that such learning is important and rigorous.”

Appendix 3 Bibliography

1. *Education for Citizenship in Scotland: a paper for discussion and development*, Learning and Teaching Scotland, 2002
http://www.ltscotland.org.uk/citizenship/images/ecsp_tcm4-122094.pdf
2. *Improving Scottish Education*, a report by HMIE on inspection and review 2002-2005, February 2006
<http://www.hmie.gov.uk/ise/default.asp>
3. *Standards and Quality in Scottish Further Education: Quality Framework for Scottish FE Colleges*, a framework developed by HMIE for SFEFC, May 2004.
http://www.hmie.gov.uk/about_us/inspections/documents/sfetc_framework.doc
4. *Promoting Citizenship and Employability*, by Ken Muir and John Bowditch, Broadcast 68, Autumn 2005.
<http://www.sfeu.ac.uk/uploads/documents/promotingcitizenshipandemployability.pdf>
5. *Education for Citizenship: A Portrait of Current Practice in Scottish Schools and Pre-school Centres*, HMIE, September 2006
<http://www.hmie.gov.uk/documents/publication/efccpcp1.pdf>
6. *A Curriculum for Excellence: the Curriculum Review Group*, Scottish Executive, November 2004.
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/26800/0023690.pdf>
7. *National Priorities in Education*, Scottish Executive, 2002.
<http://www.nationalpriorities.org.uk/schools/priority4.html>
8. *Life Through Learning: Learning Through Life, The Lifelong Learning Strategy for Scotland*, Scottish Executive, February 2003.
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/lifelong/lism.pdf>
9. *The New and the Old: the Report of the Life in the United Kingdom Advisory Group*, Home Office, 2003.
http://www.ind.homeoffice.gov.uk/ind/en/home/about_us/reports/life_in_the_uk.MainContent.0002.file.tmp/life_in_the_uk.pdf
10. *Student Representation in Scottish Further Education Colleges*, a report by HMIE for the Scottish Funding Council, January 2006.
<http://www.hmie.gov.uk/documents/publication/Student%20Representation%20in%20Scottish%20FECs.pdf>
11. *Education for Citizenship and the Teaching of Democracy in Schools*, a report by Advisory Group on Citizenship, Department of Enterprise and Education, 1998.
http://www.qca.org.uk/downloads/6123_crick_report_1998.pdf

11. *An evaluation of the post-16 citizenship pilot 2004/05*, a report from Ofsted and the Adult Learning Inspectorate, October 2005.
<http://www.ofsted.gov.uk/publications/index.cfm?fuseaction=pubs.displayfile&id=4052&type=pdf>
12. *Assessing and recognising achievement: Post-16 citizenship*, a staff development package by the Qualifications and Curriculum Authority, 2005.
http://www.qca.org.uk/downloads/QCA-05-1508_post-16_citizenship.pdf

Appendix 4 Colleges engaged in the fieldwork visits

Learners and staff from the following colleges participated in the fieldwork visits.

Aberdeen College
Anniesland College
Langside College
Stevenson College Edinburgh