



House of Commons
Education Committee

Appointment of HM Chief Inspector, Ofsted

Seventh Report of Session 2010–12

Volume I

Report, together with formal minutes

*Ordered by the House of Commons
to be printed 1 November 2011*

The Education Committee

The Education Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration and policy of the Department for Education and its associated public bodies.

Membership at time Report agreed:

Mr Graham Stuart MP (*Conservative, Beverley & Holderness*) (Chair)
Neil Carmichael MP (*Conservative, Stroud*)
Nic Dakin MP (*Labour, Scunthorpe*)
Bill Esterson MP, (*Labour, Sefton Central*)
Pat Glass MP (*Labour, North West Durham*)
Damian Hinds MP (*Conservative, East Hampshire*)
Charlotte Leslie MP (*Conservative, Bristol North West*)
Ian Mearns MP (*Labour, Gateshead*)
Tessa Munt MP (*Liberal Democrat, Wells*)
Lisa Nandy MP (*Labour, Wigan*)
Craig Whittaker MP (*Conservative, Calder Valley*)

Powers

The Committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No 152. These are available on the Internet via www.parliament.uk

Publications

The Reports and evidence of the Committee are published by The Stationery Office by Order of the House. All publications of the Committee (including press notices) are on the Internet at www.parliament.uk/education-committee

Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are Dr Lynn Gardner (Clerk), Elisabeth Bates (Second Clerk), Penny Crouzet (Committee Specialist), Benjamin Nicholls (Committee Specialist), Ameet Chudasama (Senior Committee Assistant), Caroline McElwee (Committee Assistant), and Paul Hampson (Committee Support Assistant)

Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Education Committee, House of Commons, 7 Millbank, London SW1P 3JA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 6181; the Committee's e-mail address is educom@parliament.uk

Contents

	<i>Page</i>
Report	
1 Background to the pre-appointment hearing	3
2 The requirements of the post	5
3 The preferred candidate	7
The candidate's background	7
The questioning	7
The Committee's view on the suitability of the candidate	8
Appendix 1	9
Letter to the Chair from the Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State, Department for Education	9
Appendix 2	10
Memorandum from the Department for Education	10
Appendix 3	13
Curriculum Vitae: Sir Michael Norman Wilshaw	13
Formal Minutes	15
Witnesses	16
List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament	17

1 Background to the pre-appointment hearing

1. The *Governance of Britain* Green Paper, published in July 2007, included a proposal that the Government nominee for key positions [...] should be subject to a pre-appointment hearing with the relevant select committee [...] The hearings would cover issues such as the candidate's suitability for the role, his or her key priorities, and the process used in selection.¹

2. The Government's proposal was welcomed by the Liaison Committee, which entered into discussions with the Cabinet Office on the framework for pre-appointment hearings and, in particular, which appointments should be subject to them. A final list of such posts was agreed between the Liaison Committee and the Government in May 2008.² Four posts were deemed suitable for pre-appointment hearings before the then Children, Schools and Families Committee. These are:

- Chair of the Qualifications and Curriculum Development Agency
- Chair of Ofqual³
- Children's Commissioner for England
- HM Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills

3. The Government made it clear that it would not regard any views expressed by committees on the suitability of any such appointment to be binding; but it undertook to take those views into consideration in deciding whether or not to proceed with the appointment.

4. The Liaison Committee has subsequently published two further reports on pre-appointment hearings. In March 2010 it recommended that the Government support continuation of the hearings on a permanent basis, that a list of criteria governing the posts subject to pre-appointment hearings be established and a revised list of posts agreed between the Government and Liaison Committee, that departments consult the relevant select committee on the job specification of any post that is to be subject to a pre-appointment hearing prior to the start of the recruitment process, and that provision be made for a private meeting between a Minister and a committee at the committee's discretion, in cases where a committee is inclined to make a negative report.⁴ The Government accepted the Committee's recommendations to make the pre-appointment

1 Cm 7170, page 29

2 The full list is set out in the First Special Report of the Liaison Committee, Session 2007–08, HC 594, *Pre-appointment hearings by select committees: Government response to the Committee's First Report of Session 2007–08*

3 Subject to passage of the Education Bill, currently in the Lords, a newly-created post of Chief Executive/Chief Regulator of Ofqual will also become subject to a pre-appointment hearing.

4 Liaison Committee, Second Report of Session 2009–10, *The Work of Committees in Session 2008–09*, HC 426, paragraphs 60–73

hearings permanent and to draw up a revised list of posts. However, it was concerned that consulting committees on job specifications prior to the recruitment process could risk additional delays to making public appointments, or deter good candidates, and wished to “examine further” the need for new procedures in cases where committees declined to endorse the preferred candidate.⁵

5. The Liaison Committee published a further report in September 2011, which recommended that the pre-appointment hearing process be amended to become a three-tier process, in which select committees and Parliament more widely would be involved in the selection and appointment process to different degrees. It proposed that posts subject to pre-appointment hearings be assigned to three categories. Category A posts would become effectively joint appointments between Parliament and the Executive, confirmed by a vote on the floor of the House. Category B posts would be subject to an effective veto by select committees, whereby the onus would be placed on the Minister to show why an appointment which a select committee had recommended against should go ahead, and with an option for either the committee or the Minister to seek a resolution on the floor of the House if agreement could not be reached. For Category C posts, the appropriate select committee would be asked at the outset of the recruitment process whether or not they wished to hold a pre-appointment hearing. The Liaison Committee proposed that the Chief Inspector, Ofsted, should be a Category B post.⁶ The Government has not yet responded to the Committee’s report.

6. The Secretary of State for Education wrote to the Education Committee Chair on 14 October 2011, to say that Sir Michael Wilshaw, Principal of Mossbourne Community Academy in Hackney, had been identified as the Government’s preferred candidate to take up the post of HM Chief Inspector, Ofsted. The Secretary of State’s letter, the candidate’s *curriculum vitae* and a memorandum by the Government setting out the requirements of the post and details of the recruitment process, are all printed with this Report.

7. We accordingly invited Sir Michael Wilshaw to attend a pre-appointment hearing on 1 November 2011.

5 Liaison Committee, Second Special Report of Session 2010–11, *Pre-appointment hearings: Further Government Response to the Committee’s Second Report of Session 2009–10 (The Work of Committees in 2008–09)*, HC 564

6 Liaison Committee, *Select Committees and Public Appointments*, 14 July 2011

2 The requirements of the post

8. The post of Chief Inspector is a Crown appointment, made by the Queen in Council on the recommendation of the Secretary of State for Education. The Chief Inspector holds the position of Accounting Officer for Ofsted and is responsible for the effective conduct of Ofsted's functions and for the public funds which it administers. The Chief Inspector is accountable to Parliament principally through the Education Committee. The Chief Inspector can also be called to appear before the Committee of Public Accounts. The Chair of Ofsted and the Ofsted Board have responsibility for determining the strategic priorities for HM Chief Inspector and ensuring the Chief Inspector's functions are delivered efficiently and effectively. The Chair of Ofsted provides advice on the performance of the Chief Inspector to the Secretary of State on behalf of the Board.

9. The recruitment pack drawn up by the Department for Education set out the key areas of responsibility of the post of Chief Inspector, as follows:

- Leading and managing a Non-Ministerial Government Department in accordance with sound managerial practice and general Government policy.
- Leading the inspectorate through the transition to new accountability and inspection arrangements that meet the government's priorities for accountability of local authorities and services.
- Working effectively with the Chair of Ofsted to develop Ofsted's strategic priorities and in delivering its statutory functions, and with the wider Ofsted Board in line with corporate governance arrangements.
- Delivering an effective programme of inspection and regulation across Ofsted's current and future remits.
- Winning and maintaining the confidence of Ministers while giving professionally independent advice and judgements about the performance of services within Ofsted's current and future remits.
- Gaining the respect and confidence of HMIs and Ofsted's wider inspection workforce by demonstrating highly effective leadership and understanding of their work.
- Contributing, as the leading source of informed judgements about standards and quality, to continuing public debate on education, lifelong learning, childcare and children's social care.
- Answering on any matters relating to Ofsted raised by Members of Parliament through Select Committees, Parliamentary Questions, correspondence, and in debates.
- Acting as Accounting Officer responsible to Parliament for the public funds administered by Ofsted.
- Engaging where necessary with the Secretary of State and the Chief Secretary to the Treasury about the amount of vote monies to be granted each year to Ofsted.
- Maintaining and, where appropriate, further developing Ofsted's systems for financial management, personnel management and information and communications technology.

- Ensuring that Ofsted's inspection, regulation and research activities contribute effectively to the improvement of outcomes for those who use services inspected or regulated by Ofsted.

10. Candidates for appointment were required to demonstrate:

- Leadership: a strong track record of building high performing teams that deliver (often through others) in a complex environment and of leading and managing change;
- Vision: ability to deliver and promote a clear understanding of Ofsted's role and strategy as well as a commitment and enthusiasm for the sectors within Ofsted's remit;
- Credibility: ability to gain the confidence of HMIs and the wider inspection workforce; policy makers; providers and users of services, and others, by demonstrating understanding of inspection, regulation and the sectors within Ofsted's remit;
- Financial judgement and probity: to operate effectively as Accounting Officer for Ofsted's budget and to manage that budget in a way which maximises the benefit to the tax payer;
- Excellence in the leadership skills required of public leaders, comprising integrity, direction, capability and results;
- Communication: the ability to define and communicate clear messages to managers, staff and outside stakeholders;
- Political awareness: the skill, experience and influencing skills to operate effectively in and on behalf of an organisation operating in a complex political environment at national, regional and local level;
- Determination and personal resilience: in particular, the capacity to find a way through difficulties and persevere in the face of criticism;
- Personal effectiveness: including an insistence on integrity, high standards and a track record of delivery with respect to equality and diversity.⁷

11. The appointment is for a five-year term, with potential for renewal subject to agreement. Remuneration is in the form of an annual salary of up to £180,000.

3 The preferred candidate

The candidate's background

12. Sir Michael Wilshaw is currently Principal of Mossbourne Community Academy in Hackney, a 1,300 pupil, 11-18 mixed comprehensive school. He is also Director of Education for ARK Schools, a network of eight academies across the primary and secondary phases.

13. Prior to taking up the post at Mossbourne, Sir Michael spent 13 years in middle management and senior posts in the Inner London Education Authority and 4 years as Deputy Head of Trinity High School, Redbridge. He also holds a number of other appointments, including as a Member of the National Curriculum Advisory Committee and Trustee of the Prince's Teaching Institute.

The questioning

14. In line with the guidance drawn up by the Liaison Committee on the conduct of pre-appointment hearings, our questioning sought to test the professional competence and personal independence of the candidate. The Liaison Committee also observes that a candidate will need to be able to withstand parliamentary and public scrutiny should they take up the post, and that questioning may therefore be robust.⁸

15. During the course of our questioning, we explored the following areas with Sir Michael:

- The recruitment process;
- His vision for education and for children's development, and his ambitions in the post;
- How his schools-based experience equips him to head a body also responsible for children's services;
- His management and leadership experience;
- His financial skills;
- His view on the Committee's recent report, *The Role and Performance of Ofsted*;
- Whether inspection should be a measurement or part of a process of improvement;
- Remuneration, and how long he intends to remain in the post; and
- Possible conflicts of interest.

⁸ Liaison Committee, First Report of Session 2007–08, *Pre-appointment hearings by select committees*, HC 384, paragraph 13

The Committee's view on the suitability of the candidate

16. The Committee held a pre-appointment hearing with the Government's preferred candidate for HM Chief Inspector, Ofsted, on 1 November 2011.⁹ We are pleased to endorse Sir Michael Wilshaw's candidacy for the post.

⁹ A transcript of the oral evidence will be published as Volume II.

Appendix 1

Letter to the Chair from the Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State, Department for Education

Recruitment of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector

I am writing to inform you that the preferred candidate for the position of Chief Inspector of Schools is Michael Wilshaw.

I will ask my Parliamentary Clerk to liaise with the Clerk of the Education Committee to arrange a suitable date for the pre-appointment hearing.

October 2011

Appendix 2

Memorandum from the Department for Education

Selection of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector (HMCI)

Background

1. Following the decision of the then HMCI, Christine Gilbert, not to seek an extension of her term of office, arrangements were made to recruit a successor. Ms Gilbert's term of appointment expired in October 2011, however, she subsequently decided to leave her post in July this year.
2. Appointment to the post of HMCI is by Crown Appointment on the recommendation of the Secretary of State for Education. The post is subject to parliamentary scrutiny through a pre appointment hearing before the Education Select Committee.
3. The recruitment campaign was planned to comply with the:
 - guidelines for public appointments issued by the Office for the Commissioner of Public Appointments;
 - spending controls and other measures that the Government has taken to reduce and manage public spending;
4. The Appointments Commission—a non departmental public body specialising in public appointments—was engaged to manage the exercise to ensure the most cost effective recruitment approach.
5. The Secretary of State was consulted, on the details of the post, candidate specification and the proposed recruitment process.

Recruitment Campaign (Phase One)

6. The recruitment pack and details of the selection exercise were passed to the Education Selection Committee, shortly before the post was publicly advertised on 20 March 2011 in the Sunday Times and the Economist (on line), with a closing date of 18 April. In addition the Appointments Commission engaged Gatenby Sanderson to assist with promoting the vacancy and securing suitably qualified applicants.

Selection Process (Phase One)

7. A selection panel chaired by Sir David Bell, Permanent Secretary at the Department of Education, was set up to oversee the selection process. Other members were:

- Baroness Morgan of Huyton, Chair of Ofsted
- Dame Sue John, Head teacher of Lampton School and a non-executive member of the DfE Board
- Martin Donnelly, Permanent Secretary, Department of Business, Innovation and Skills
- Gill Pitt, Independent Assessor for Public Appointments

8. Fifteen candidates applied for the post. The Appointments Commission conducted a pre-assessment of all applications to support the panel's short listing on 6 May. Four candidates were short listed (although two withdrew). In advance of the final interviews on 23 May and 6 June, both remaining candidates underwent psychometric assessments and were offered an opportunity to meet separately with Sir David Bell and Baroness Morgan.

9. Having reached the end of the interview process, the panel was very concerned that it only had one candidate for the Secretary of State to consider. The panel was mindful of advice from the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments (OCPA) that it is preferable for Ministers to be given a choice of candidates.

10. Following consultation with the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments, the panel concluded that a further search and selection exercise should be undertaken. OCPA agreed that the candidate deemed appointable from the first exercise would be kept under consideration - provided the criteria for the role did not change. The Secretary of State was informed of the need to run a second campaign in order to meet the OCPA requirement of giving Ministers a choice of candidates.

Recruitment Campaign (Phase Two)

11. In line with OCPA guidance the post was re-advertised through the Appointments Commission website on 1 July, with a closing date of 1 August. The Appointments Commission engaged Saxton Bampfylde to lead the recruitment search. The original selection panel was retained. The Education Select Committee was informed of the new recruitment arrangements through a letter from the Permanent Secretary.

Selection Process (Phase Two)

12. Sixteen new candidates applied for the post. A pre-assessment of all applications was undertaken by the Appointments Commission and presented to the selection panel at its short listing meeting on 30 August. Two candidates were short listed and underwent psychometric assessments and were offered an opportunity to meet separately with Sir David Bell and Baroness Morgan, prior to the interviews on 15 September.

13. The selection panel considered that one of the two candidates was appointable. The panel then reviewed the two applicants judged appointable from the two recruitment exercises, and agreed on a preferred candidate. The Secretary of State was informed of the outcome of selection process, and given a choice of the two appointable candidates, with a recommendation from the panel of a preferred candidate. The Secretary of State accepted the panel's recommendation.

14. The Secretary of State announced, through a press notice on 14 October, that Sir Michael Wilshaw was his preferred candidate for the post and that the next stage in the appointment process was a pre appointment hearing by the Education Select Committee.

October 2011

Appendix 3

Curriculum Vitae: Sir Michael Norman Wilshaw

Qualifications/Accreditations/Honours

1972	BA Hons History and Politics, Birkbeck College, London University
1968	Teachers' Certificate, St Mary's College, Strawberry Hill, Twickenham
1990–1995	Ofsted Inspector
1995–2000	Additional Inspector for HMI
2000	Knighted for services to education
2003	Appointed by NCSL as a National Leader of Education
2004	Freeman of the City of London
2008	Honorary Doctorate of Education conferred by University of East London

Present Positions

- Principal of Mossbourne Community Academy, Hackney (1,300, 11-18 mixed comprehensive)
- Director of Education, ARK Schools (a network of eight academies across the primary and secondary phases)

Previous Positions

- 13 years (1968-81) in middle management and senior posts, Inner-London Education Authority
- 4 years (1981-85) Deputy Head of Trinity High School, Redbridge (1,600, mixed, V.A. comprehensive)

Headship Details:

1985–2003 St Bonaventure's School, London Borough of Newham (1,300, 11–18 Boys' V.A. comprehensive)

- On my appointment as headteacher in 1985, St Bonaventure's was a failing, undersubscribed school with very low attainment levels (8% 5 A* –C grades). On my departure, in 2003, St Bonaventure's was heavily oversubscribed and graded by Ofsted as 'outstanding' with over 80% of students achieving 5 A* –C grades, including English and maths. Indeed, in 2003, the school was top of Newham's GCSE league table, out-performing the three single-sex girls' schools in the LEA.
- One of the first schools to receive Specialist Schools Status in September 1994.
- In three successive years (1995-1998) the school appeared in the top ten of the most improved schools in the country.
- 2001 St Bonaventure's School achieved 'Beacon Status.'
- 2002 St Bonaventure's School identified as a model of good practice in the Ofsted report "Achievement of black Caribbean pupils: Good practice in secondary schools."

2003–Present: Principal of Mossbourne Community Academy, Hackney (1,300, 11–18 Mixed Comprehensive)

- On the site of the failed Hackney Downs School which closed in 1995.

14 Appointment of HM Chief Inspector, Ofsted

- Two outstanding judgements from Ofsted. One of only 4% of secondary schools in the country to receive an outstanding judgement for teaching in the last HMCI report.
- Over 80% of students achieve 5 A* - C grades, including English and maths (2009 - 86%; 2010 - 83%).
- 100% University entrance, 60% to Russell Group of Universities, 8 acceptances at Oxbridge.
- 1,500 applications for 180 places in Year 7.
- Awarded Teaching School Status from September 2011 (one of only 3 secondary schools in London).

Secondments and Executive Headships:

- 1998–1999 seconded to Eastlea mixed comprehensive in Newham after the school was placed in ‘Special Measures’.
- 2008 Executive Principal of Globe Academy, Southwark (previously Geoffrey Chaucer School).
- 2009 Executive Principal of Haggerston School, Hackney.

All three schools improved under my leadership.

Significant Lectures, Presentations, Consultancies

1995–2003:

- A number of visits to No. 10 Downing Street, along with other headteachers, to advise Prime Minister Blair and successive Secretaries of State for Education on a range of educational issues.
- Asked by HMI to speak to 50 headteachers of the most improved schools on school improvement strategies.
- Asked by CEA to work with Islington headteachers on raising attainment at KS4.
- Invited by the British Council and HMI to speak in Brazil to state education officials on school improvement strategies in the UK.
- Invited by New Zealand Education Department to speak to officials on school improvement issues.
- Presentation to SSAT Conference on raising attainment in inner-city schools.

2003– Present

- Presentations to National Audit Office, London Challenge, GCHQ, Pearson Group, National Strategies, Headteacher Groups (particularly those considering Academy status).
- Leadership of Professional Development Programmes for headteachers and deputies in the ARK Network and the Future Leaders’ Programme.

Appointments (other than headship)

- 2001 –2007: Education Committee Member of the Goldsmith’s Company to advise on secondments and bursaries.
- 2003: Appointed by Westminster Archdiocese as Chair of an Interim Executive Board, replacing a governing board of a failing school in Islington.
- 2008: Member of the National Advisory Group for the Children’s Plan.
- 2008: Member of the National Challenge Experts Group.
- 2009: Trustee of the Prince’s Teaching Institute.
- 2011: Member of the National Curriculum Advisory Committee.

Formal Minutes

Tuesday 1 November 2011

Members present:

Mr Graham Stuart, in the Chair

Neil Carmichael
Pat Glass

Damian Hinds
Ian Mearns

Draft Report (*Appointment of HM Chief Inspector, Ofsted*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

Ordered, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

Paragraphs 1 to 16 read and agreed to.

Papers were appended to the Report.

Resolved, That the Report be the Seventh Report of the Committee to the House.

Ordered, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

Ordered, That embargoed copies of the Report be made available, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order No. 134.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 2 November at 9.15 am

Witnesses

Tuesday 1 November 2011

Page

Sir Michael Wilshaw, preferred candidate for HM Inspector, Ofsted

Ev 1

List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

The reference number of the Government's response to each Report is printed in brackets after the HC printing number.

Session 2010-12

First Special Report	Young people not in education, employment or training: Government Response to the Children, Schools and Families Committee's Eighth Report of Session 2009-10	HC 416
Second Special Report	The Early Years Single Funding Formula: Government Response to the Seventh Report from the Children, Schools and Families Committee, Session 2009-10	HC 524
Third Special Report	Transforming Education Outside the Classroom: Responses from the Government and Ofsted to the Sixth Report of the Children, Schools and Families Committee, Session 2009-10	HC 525
Fourth Special Report	Sure Start Children's Centres: Government Response to the Fifth Report from the Children, Schools and Families Committee, Session 2009-10	HC 768
First Report	Behaviour and Discipline in Schools	HC 516-I and -II (HC 1316)
Second Report	The role and performance of Ofsted	HC 570-I and II (HC 1317)
Fifth Special Report	Looked-after Children: Further Government Response to the Third Report from the Children, Schools and Families Committee, Session 2008-9	HC 924
Third Report	Services for young people	HC 744-I and -II
Fourth Report	Participation by 16-19 year olds in education and training	HC 850-I and -II
Fifth Report	The English Baccalaureate	HC 851
Sixth Report	Services for young people: Government response to the Committee's Third Report of Session 2010-12	HC 1501
Eighth Special Report	Participation by 16-19 year olds in education and training: Government Response to the Committee's Fourth Report	HC 1572
Ninth Special Report	The English Baccalaureate: Government Response to the Committee's Fifth Report	HC 1577
Seventh Report	Appointment of HM Chief Inspector, Ofsted	HC 1607-I
