

Number: WG16982



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

www.cymru.gov.uk

Welsh Government

Consultation – summary of responses

Review of Qualifications for 14 to 19-year-olds in Wales – quantitative summary

Date of issue: November 2012

Review of Qualifications for 14 to 19-year-olds in Wales – quantitative summary

Audience	Anyone with an interest in the Review of Qualifications for 14 to 19-year-olds in Wales.
Overview	A quantitative summary of consultation responses from the Review of Qualifications for 14 to 19-year-olds in Wales.
Action required	None – for information only.
Further information	Enquiries about this document should be directed to: Review of Qualifications 14–19 Qualifications and Learning Division Department for Education and Skills Welsh Government Tŷ'r Afon Bedwas Road Bedwas Caerphilly CF83 8WT Tel: 01443 663725 e-mail: reviewofquals@wales.gsi.gov.uk
Additional copies	This document can be accessed from the Welsh Government's website at www.wales.gov.uk/educationandskills
Related documents	<i>Review of Qualifications for 14 to 19-year-olds in Wales</i> consultation paper (2012)

This summary was produced for the Review of Qualifications for 14 to 19-year-olds in Wales by Arad Research Ltd.

Contents

1 Summary of responses	2
2 The results	3
Results from Part A: For all respondents	3
Part B: Technical and specialist issues	11

1 Summary of responses

187 separate submissions were received. Five individuals / organisations provided two sets of evidence, one in response to the consultation document and one as a response for the evidence day. Furthermore, the team received more than one submission from a handful of organisations (e.g. a couple of schools) while other responses were a collation of several views or, in some cases, a coordinated organisational response involving consultations with a range of stakeholders.

In summary the submissions included,

- 33 responses from schools or teachers,
- 27 from employers or employer representatives,
- 18 responses from parents,
- 18 responses from awarding organisations,
- 13 FE colleges
- 11 HE institutions,
- 2 learners,
- Other stakeholders including trade unions, local authorities, training organisations and charities.

Just over two thirds responded using the consultation form, although not every respondent answered every question. In the tables that follow the number of responses is provided for each question.

2 The results

Results from Part A: For all respondents

Question A2.1

i) Do you agree with the vision and principles set out at A2.1?

Yes	127	94.1%
No	2	1.5%
Not sure	6	4.4%
n=135		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>
	<i>n=24</i>
<i>Yes</i>	<i>20 (83%)</i>
<i>No</i>	<i>0</i>
<i>Not sure</i>	<i>4</i>

Question A2.3

i) Should we retain existing brands such as GCSE, A level and vocational qualifications (such as BTECs, OCR Nationals or City and Guilds) in Wales, in the short to medium term?

Yes	116	86.6%
No	5	3.7%
Not sure	13	9.7%
n=134		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>
	<i>n=23</i>
<i>No</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>Not sure</i>	<i>2</i>
<i>Yes</i>	<i>20 (87%)</i>

Question A2.4

i) To what extent does the current suite of qualifications at 14–19 sufficiently encourage the development of literacy and numeracy?

Very much	7	5.3%
To some extent	75	57.3%
Not very much	33	25.2%
Not at all	4	3.1%
No opinion	12	9.2%
n=131		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>	<i>Employer or employer rep (inc CBI, SSCs)</i>	<i>LA's (14-19 networks and ed'n depts)</i>	<i>Parents (just parent and parents and other category)</i>	<i>Awarding organisations</i>	<i>HE</i>
	<i>n=25)</i>	<i>n= 19</i>	<i>n=16</i>	<i>n = 17</i>	<i>n=15</i>	<i>n = 5</i>
<i>Very much</i>	2	2	0	2	1	0
<i>To some</i>	16	15 (75%)	10 (62%)	8 (47%)	8 (53%)	4
<i>Not very</i>	7	2	5	3	2	0
<i>Not at all</i>	0	0	1	1	0	0
<i>No opinion</i>	0	0	0	3	4	1

ii) To what extent does the current suite of qualifications at 14–19 provide clear information about an individual's literacy and numeracy?

Very much	4	3.1%
To some extent	51	39.5%
Not very much	50	38.8%
Not at all	12	9.3%
No opinion	12	9.3%
n=129		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>	<i>Employer or employer rep (inc CBI, SSCs)</i>	<i>Parents (just parent and parents and other category)</i>
	<i>n=25</i>	<i>n=19</i>	<i>n = 17</i>
<i>Very much</i>	1	1	1
<i>To some</i>	9	7	9 (53%)
<i>Not very</i>	14 (56%)	10 (53%)	2
<i>Not at all</i>	1	1	1
<i>No opinion</i>	0		4

Question A2.5

i) Should there be a stronger external element in the assessment and/or quality assurance of all qualifications (through one or more of the methods suggested at A2.5)?

Yes	69	55.2%
No	26	20.8%
Not sure	30	24.0%
n=125		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>
	<i>n =24</i>
<i>Yes</i>	11
<i>No</i>	6
<i>Not sure</i>	7

iii) Should the volume of assessment at 14–19 be reduced?

Yes	70	59.3%
No	19	16.1%
Not sure	29	24.6%
n=118		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>
	<i>n =24</i>
<i>Yes</i>	14
<i>No</i>	5
<i>Not sure</i>	5

Question A2.9

i) To what extent should young people be able to take qualifications when they are ready rather than at an expected age?

Very much	38	29.2%
To some extent	72	55.4%
Not very much	12	9.2%
Not at all	5	3.8%
No opinion	3	2.3%
n=130		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>
	<i>n=24)</i>
<i>Very much</i>	6
<i>To some</i>	13
<i>Not very</i>	3
<i>Not at all</i>	2
<i>No opinion</i>	0

iii) Should we retain external qualifications (such as GCSEs) at 16 in Wales at least in the short to medium term?

Yes	129	94.9%
No	1	0.7%
Not sure	6	4.4%
n=136		

Question A2.10

ii) To what extent do you think that qualifications at 14–19 should be allowed to diverge from those in England, in order to better meet the needs of Wales?

<i>Very much</i>	12	9.8%
To some extent	57	46.7%
<i>Not very much</i>	38	31.1%
<i>Not at all</i>	14	11.5%
<i>No opinion</i>	1	0.8%
n=122		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>	<i>Employer or employer rep (inc CBI, SSCs)</i>	<i>LA's (14-19 networks and ed'n depts)</i>	<i>Parents (just parent and parents and other category)</i>	<i>Awarding organisations</i>
	<i>n=24)</i>	<i>n=20</i>	<i>n=16</i>	<i>n=16</i>	<i>n=16</i>
<i>Very much</i>	2 (8%)	2 (10%)	1 (6%)	0	2 (13%)
<i>To some</i>	12 (50%)	10 (50%)	11 (69%)	5 (31%)	4 (25%)
<i>Not very</i>	7 (29%)	7 (35%)	3 (19%)	5 (31%)	7 (44%)
<i>Not at all</i>	3 (12%)	1 (5%)	1 (6%)	5 (31%)	2 (13%)
<i>No opinion</i>	0	0	0	1 (6%)	1 (6%)

Question A3.1

iv) To what extent should the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification be universally adopted by learners in Wales?

<i>Very much</i>	42	34.7%
<i>To some extent</i>	36	29.8%
<i>Not very much</i>	10	8.3%
<i>Not at all</i>	19	15.7%
<i>No opinion</i>	14	11.6%
<i>n=121</i>		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>	<i>Employer or employer rep (inc CBI, SSCs)</i>	<i>LA's (14-19 networks and ed'n depts)</i>	<i>Parents (just parent and parents and other category)</i>	<i>Awarding organisations</i>
	<i>n=25</i>	<i>n=18</i>	<i>n=18</i>	<i>n=17</i>	<i>n=14</i>
<i>Very much</i>	9 (56%)	5 (28%)	10 (56%)	5	3
<i>To some</i>	7	7 (39%)	6 (33%)	4	2
<i>Not very</i>	4	3	0	1	1
<i>Not at all</i>	5	0	2	6 (35%)	5 (36%)
<i>No opinion</i>	0	3	0	1	3

Question A3.2

i) Which of these three options for qualifications at 14–16 do you feel would best meet the needs of learners in Wales? (Please delete as appropriate.)

a) Completely new, high-quality and rigorous qualifications (Not called GCSEs) for 14 to 16-year-olds that reflect the curriculum in Wales.

or

b) For Wales to retain the brand name of GCSE, but to develop Wales-only, high-quality and rigorous GCSEs to reflect the curriculum in Wales.

or

c) For Wales to adopt GCSE developments as and when they emerge in England.

a) 19 19.2%
b) 47 47.5%
c) 33 33.3%
n=99

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>	<i>Employer or employer rep (inc CBI, SSCs)</i>	<i>Parents (just parent and parents and other category)</i>	<i>Awarding organisations</i>
	<i>n=21</i>	<i>n=15</i>	<i>n=14</i>	<i>n=8</i>
<i>a</i>	3	0	2	1
<i>b</i>	11 (52%)	10 (67%)	2	2
<i>c</i>	6 (29%)	4	10 (71%)	5 (63%)
<i>mix</i>	1 (combo a&b)	1 (combo a&b)		

Question A3.3

i) Are A levels fit for purpose for young people in Wales at 16–19?

Yes 87 70.7%
No 8 6.5%
Not sure 28 22.8%
n=123

Question A3.5

i) To what extent are Essential Skills Wales qualifications relevant and valued?

Very much	24	19.2%
To some extent	51	40.8%
Not very much	29	23.2%
Not at all	4	3.2%
Don't know	17	13.6%
n=125		

Disaggregation

	School or individual teacher	Employer or employer rep (inc CBI, SSCs)	Parents (just parent and parents and other category)
	n=24	n=19	n=16
Very much	8 (35)	8 (42%)	1
To some	6	4 (21%)	5 (31%)
Not very	10 (42%)	5 (26%)	4
Not at all	0	0	2
Don't Know	0	2	4

iii) To what extent are Wider Key Skills qualifications relevant and valued?

Very much	20	17.2%
To some extent	45	38.8%
Not very much	25	21.6%
Not at all	9	7.8%
Don't know	17	14.7%
n=116		

Disaggregation

	School or individual teacher	Employer or employer rep (inc CBI, SSCs)	Parents (just parent and parents and other category)
	n=21	n=18	n=15
Very much	6 (29%)	2	1
To some	7 (33%)	11	4 (27%)
Not very	4	3	4 (27%)
Not at all	4	0	3
Don't Know	0	2	3

Question A3.6

i) Should more emphasis be placed on STEM subjects in the 14–19 phase?

Yes	75	62.0%
No	16	13.2%
Not sure	30	24.8%

n=121

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>
	<i>n=22</i>
<i>Yes</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>No</i>	<i>8</i>
<i>Not sure</i>	<i>5</i>

Question A3.7

i) Do you think that the Welsh Government should launch a major communication campaign in relation to qualifications in Wales, once its new policy is established?

Yes	125	95.4%
No	1	0.8%
Not sure	5	3.8%

n=131

Part B: Technical and specialist issues

Please feel free to answer some questions and Not others.

For discussion of each issue please refer to the consultation paper.

Question numbers correspond to section numbers in the consultation paper.

Question B2.2

i) Do you think that qualifications should be funded and delivered through coherent programmes of learning at 16–19, rather than as individual qualifications?

Yes	53	55.2%
No	17	17.7%
Not sure	26	27.1%
n=96		

Disaggregation

Type	School or individual teacher
	n=19
Yes	8 (42%)
No	7
Not sure	4

Question B3

i) Should the number of qualifications approved for public funding at ages 14–19 be reduced?

Yes	71	68.3%
No	19	18.3%
Not sure	14	13.5%
n=104		

Disaggregation

	School or individual teacher
	n=19
Yes	11 (58%)
n	1
Not sure	7

Question B3.2

i) To what extent should employers play a role in the development of qualifications for 14 to 16-year-olds?

To a great extent	19	17.4%
To some extent	71	65.1%
Not very much	16	14.7%
Not at all	1	0.9%
No opinion	2	1.8%
n=109		

ii) To what extent should employers play a role in the development of qualifications for 16 to 19-year-olds?

To a great extent	41	36.3%
To some extent	67	59.3%
Not very much	3	2.7%
Not at all	0	0.0%
No opinion	2	1.8%
n=113		

iii) Should Sector Skills Councils be the main mechanism for this?

Yes	43	40.6%
No	28	26.4%
Not sure	35	33.0%
n=106		

v) To what extent should universities play a greater role in the development of A levels?

To a great extent	27	25.7%
To some extent	70	66.7%
Not very much	5	4.8%
Not at all	0	0.0%
No opinion	3	2.9%
n=105		

Question B4.1

- ii) Which of the options listed do you prefer? (Please delete as appropriate.)
- a) Commissioning new specifications for GCSE English Language, GCSE Welsh First Language and GCSE Mathematics qualifications for Wales which build directly on the literacy element of the NLNF framework and encourage the development of those skills throughout Key Stage 4 and beyond if needed.
 - b) Developing or commissioning new, externally assessed, national literacy and numeracy tests for Key Stage 4 and incorporating these into the core of the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification at Intermediate level instead of Essential Skills Wales qualifications.
 - c) Increasing the level of demand in the assessment of literacy and numeracy skills within Essential Skills Wales, perhaps in externally marked tests.
 - d) Commissioning new GCSEs in Literacy and Numeracy to run alongside, or as a precursor to English Language, Welsh First Language and Mathematics GCSEs.
 - e) Integrating subject-specific expectations for literacy and numeracy skills into the subject criteria for each of the next generation of GCSEs.
 - f) Introducing teacher-assessed literacy and numeracy tests at 16.

Respondents have suggested combinations of the above options and so it is difficult to analyse in the same way as other questions.

Option a) appears to be the most popular selection, either on its own (18 responses) or in combination with other options (= 20 responses choose a) and other options. Options b) and e) are next most popular single options with 5 and 6 respectively. Most answers include multiple choices.

Question B4.2

- i) Should post-16 full-time learners who have Not achieved Level 2 in literacy or numeracy be supported to reach this standard?

Yes	100	95.2%
No	2	1.9%
Not sure	3	2.9%
n=105		

Question B5.1

i) Should the Welsh Baccalaureate be graded at Foundation level in due course?

Yes	43	45.3%
No	28	29.5%
Not sure	24	25.3%
n=95		

Disaggregation

Type	School or individual teacher	Parents	Employers
	n 19	n=10	n=18
Yes	12 (63%)	4	12
No	7	3	1
Not sure	0	3	5

ii) Should the Welsh Baccalaureate be graded at Intermediate level in due course?

Yes	52	54.7%
No	19	20.0%
Not sure	24	25.3%
n=95		

Disaggregation

Type	School or individual teacher	parents	Employers
	n=18	n10	n18
Yes	14	6	12
No	4	1	2
Not sure	0	3	4

Question B5.2

i) Should GCSEs continue to be available to learners on a unitised basis?

Yes	60	64.5%
No	9	9.7%
Not sure	24	25.8%
n=93		

v) Should controlled assessment be retained as a feature in the next generation of GCSEs in Wales?

Yes	45	50.0%
No	15	16.7%
Not sure	30	33.3%
n=90		

vi) If Yes, should controlled assessment be retained for most GCSEs or only for some?

Most	27	47.4%
Some	30	52.6%
n = 57		

Questions B5.4

i) Should there Normally be a maximum number of GCSEs pursued at school?

Yes	41	44.6%
No	31	33.7%
Not sure	20	21.7%
n=92		

Question B5.5

i) Assuming the continuation of A levels in Wales, should AS levels be retained as a stepping stone to A levels?

Yes	68	73.1%
No	9	9.7%
Not sure	16	17.2%
n=93		

ii) Should A level learners be able to take modules before the end of the course (AS and/or A2)?

Yes	55	59.8%
No	29	31.5%
Not sure	8	8.7%
n=92		

iii) Should learners be able to retake A level modules to improve their grade, without having to resit the whole qualification?

Yes	65	70.7%
No	13	14.1%
Not sure	14	15.2%
n=92		

iv) If Yes, should the best mark or the most recent mark count?

Best mark	55	73.3%
Most recent mark	20	26.7%
n = 75		

v) Should retakes of modules be limited to one per module?

Yes	62	68.9%
No	17	18.9%
Not sure	11	12.2%
n=90		

Question B5.6

Should Wales adopt the IVETs and CVETs definitions for vocational qualifications?

Yes	64	71.9%
No	5	5.6%
Not sure	20	22.5%
n=89		

Question B5.7

i) Do you agree with the proposed recommendations for limiting vocational qualifications at 14–16 to 40 per cent of learning time?

Yes	56	57.7%
No	29	29.9%
Not sure	12	12.4%
n=97		

ii) Do you agree that at 14–16 vocational qualifications should be broad-based and Not attest to occupational competency?

Yes	77	79.4%
No	13	13.4%
Not sure	7	7.2%
n=97		

iii) Do you agree that only IVETs are appropriate at 14–16?

Yes	50	55.6%
No	18	20.0%
Not sure	22	24.4%
n=90	90	

Question B5.8

i) Do you agree that both IVETs and CVETs could be appropriate for 16 to 19-year-olds?

Yes	68	81.9%
No	2	2.4%
Not sure	13	15.7%
n=83		

Question B5.9

i) Do you think there should be a greater external element in the assessment of Essential Skills Wales?

Yes	36	40.0%
No	25	27.8%
Not sure	29	32.2%
n=90		

iii) Do you think that Essential Skills Wales should be graded?

Yes	38	41.3%
No	35	38.0%
Not sure	19	20.7%
n=92		

Question B5.10

i) Do you think the Wider Key Skills need a clearer title?

Yes	58	61.7%
No	17	18.1%
Not sure	19	20.2%
n=94		

Question B5.11

i) Are entry level qualifications currently meeting the needs of less-able or less-engaged students?

Yes	24	30.0%
No	28	35.0%
Not sure	28	35.0%
n=80		

ii) Are any changes needed?

Yes	38	50.0%
No	6	7.9%
Not sure	32	42.1%
n=76		

iii) Could any of the proposals in this consultation paper impact adversely the provision of appropriate qualifications for less-able or less-engaged students?

Yes	30	41.1%
No	13	17.8%
Not sure	30	41.1%
n=73		

Question B5.12

Do you see a role for the delivery and funding of QALL units within programmes of learning for 16 to 19-year-olds?

Yes	42	54.5%
No	8	10.4%
Not sure	27	35.1%
n=77		

Question B6.1

i) Do you agree with the proposal to reaffirm the importance of the Level 2 Inclusive and Average capped points score at Key Stage 4?

Yes	46	59.7%
No	5	6.5%
Not sure	26	33.8%
n=77		

iii) Do you think there should be any changes to the post-16 measures?

Yes	24	32.4%
No	28	37.8%
Not sure	22	29.7%
n=74		

v) Should we remove any measures, or are there any additional measures we should include?

Yes	25	42.4%
No	11	18.6%
Not sure	23	39.0%
n=59		

Question B6.2

i) Do you agree with our proposal to introduce a limit of two GCSEs 'equivalence' for vocational qualifications in performance terms?

Yes	52	55.9%
No	27	29.0%
Not sure	14	15.1%
n=93		

Disaggregation

	<i>School or individual teacher</i>	<i>parents</i>	<i>Aw orgs</i>
	<i>n =20</i>	<i>n=7</i>	<i>n=14</i>
Yes	12 (60%)	4	5
No	7	2	8 (57%)
Not sure	1	1	1

iii) Do you agree with our proposal to continue to count qualifications that are smaller than a GCSE (for example, GCSE short course or vocational qualifications of similar size) in performance measures?

Yes	68	77.3%
No	8	9.1%
Not sure	12	13.6%
n=88		

Question B6.3

i) Do you agree with our proposal to place a limit of 40 per cent on the contribution of vocational qualifications to the Level 1 and Level 2 performance measures?

Yes	43	48.3%
No	32	36.0%
Not sure	14	15.7%
n=89		

iii) Do you agree with our proposal to maintain our current approach to discounting for identical or very similar qualifications?

Yes	65	76.5%
No	2	2.4%
Not sure	18	21.2%
n=85	85	

Question B6.4

i) How important is it to maintain the ability to make direct comparisons of school performance with England?

Very important	47	48.0%
To some extent	27	27.6%
Not very important	16	16.3%
Not at all important	6	6.1%
No opinion	2	2.0%
n=98		

Questions B7.2

To what extent do you think that the current market structure for the provision of qualifications:

i) is 'fit for purpose'?

To a great extent	5	5.7%
To some extent	59	67.8%
Not much	11	12.6%
Not at all	8	9.2%
No opinion	4	4.6%
n=87		

ii) influences the behaviour of centres in terms of the specific qualifications they choose for their learners?

To a great extent	20	22.5%
To some extent	55	61.8%
Not much	11	12.4%
Not at all	0	0.0%
No opinion	3	3.4%
n=89		

iii) impacts on grades, standards or outcomes?

<i>To a great extent</i>	12	14.3%
<i>To some extent</i>	38	45.2%
<i>Not much</i>	23	27.4%
<i>Not at all</i>	4	4.8%
<i>No opinion</i>	7	8.3%
n=84		

iv) impacts on the provision of Welsh-medium qualifications?

<i>To a great extent</i>	19	24.4%
<i>To some extent</i>	14	17.9%
<i>Not much</i>	10	12.8%
<i>Not at all</i>	9	11.5%
<i>No opinion</i>	26	33.3%
n=78		

Questions B7.3

ii) Should awarding organisations be allowed to deliver seminars to teachers in Wales?

Yes	74	86.0%
No	4	4.7%
Not sure	8	9.3%
n=86		