www.cymru.gov.uk

Evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy

A study of the work of the Bilingual Champions in Further Education

Evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy

A study of the work of the Bilingual Champions in Further Education

25 September 2014

Arad

Brett Duggan, Hefin Thomas and Sioned Lewis

The opinions expressed in this report are those of the researchers and do not necessarily reflect the opinion of the Welsh Government.

Contents

Executive summary

1. This report presents the findings of a study of the Bilingual Champions in Further Education project ('the project') undertaken between December 2012 and July 2013 by Arad Research on behalf of the Welsh Government.

2. The study forms part of a wider research programme to evaluate the Welsh-medium Education Strategy ('the Strategy') published by the Welsh Government in 2010. That comprehensive evaluation will consider developments across the whole range of projects and programmes implemented as part of the Strategy.

3. The Welsh Government funds the Bilingual Champions project by means of grants to further education institutions. The project aims to create a support structure within colleges where there has not traditionally been much of an infrastructure to encourage Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. Nine objectives support this aim:

i.	To enable colleges to develop a robust strategy and increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision for learners.
ii.	To increase the number of quality courses and modules available to learners at the colleges to facilitate the development of the Welsh language continuum.
iii.	To increase the number of learners undertaking to follow their courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.
iv.	To maintain and improve the Welsh language skills of learners entering the college from Welsh-medium and bilingual schools, who follow English-medium, Welsh-medium or bilingual courses.
v.	To increase the number of college staff able and qualified to assist with portfolio building, assessment and verifying through the medium of Welsh.
vi.	To develop staff capacity to enable colleges to expand their learner support both in formal classroom and learning situations and in informal social situations to further develop bilingual language skills and language awareness.
vii.	To establish and maintain a college mentoring programme to support

> college staff that attend formal and informal training, or require additional support to teach through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.
>
> viii. To disseminate good practice and provide practical support within the colleges and with other education and training providers in the area, with the aid of Sgiliaith.
>
> ix. Colleges to plan and fund the role of the Bilingual Champion as an inherent part of the college's overall strategies after project funding ceases.

Source: Bilingual Champions Project 2012/2013, Background Information, Welsh Government

4. These objectives are consistent with the priorities set for the sector by the Minister for Education and Skills in his letter to the heads of further education institutions in Wales in May 2013: the letter stated that institutions should continue *'to increase the Welsh-medium/bilingual learning options available and the number of students choosing those options in order to support our Welsh-medium Education Strategy'*.[1]

5. The findings, conclusions and recommendations presented in this report are based upon a combination of desk research and interviews. Institutions' strategic plans were reviewed, as well as the Bilingual Champions project monitoring reports submitted by colleges to the Welsh Government and other documentation relevant to the Bilingual Champions project. Interviews were conducted with 16 Bilingual Champions (13 during college visits and three over the phone), nine college directors or managers, 13 tutors and 33 learners. Interviews were also conducted with representatives from the Welsh Government, CollegesWales and the office of the Welsh Language Commissioner. More information about the methodology can be found in Chapter 2.

6. The Champions' main role is to support strategic planning within the institutions in order to increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. This study underlines some of the challenges associated with assessing and understanding the Champions' influence. On the one hand, there are a number of factors influencing the Champions' work (this report

---

[1] Welsh Government (May 2013), *Further Education Institutions in Wales: Priorities for the further education sector 2014/15,* Minister for Education and Skills. http://wales.gov.uk/statistics-and-research/welsh-language-skills-needs-eight-sectors/?lang=en

refers, for example, to policy developments in further education and the funding mechanism). The Champions could be doing high quality, innovative work, yet other factors could be hindering the establishment of a supportive institutional strategy. On the other hand, other factors could be facilitating the development of Welsh-medium provision that are not directly related to the work of the Champions. We must therefore acknowledge that there are limitations when trying to directly attribute any changes seen in Welsh-medium and bilingual provision in colleges to the influence of the Champions.

7. All further education institutions in Wales have received funding through the Bilingual Champions project in order to incorporate and implement plans to strengthen Welsh-medium provision. The evidence suggests that institutions need to take responsibility for funding and driving developments as part of their core priorities, in accordance with the Welsh Government's directive.

Findings, conclusions and recommendations in relation to the project's objectives

Objective 1: To enable colleges to develop a robust strategy and increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision for learners.

8. The work of the Bilingual Champions has led to an increase in the amount of attention given by colleges to the planning of Welsh-medium provision. However, changing the culture and raising awareness of opportunities to increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision is a long-term process.

9. Further measures are needed to improve strategic planning across the further education sector in order to support Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. It is essential that institutions' heads and senior management teams give their full support and that robust implementation plans are in place in order to drive developments.

10. The evidence demonstrates the value of establishing a steering group to take responsibility for developing Welsh-medium or bilingual provision. Ensuring wide representation on a strategic group of this kind can contribute to the sustainability of the project.

> **Recommendation 1: for the Welsh Government**
>
> The Welsh Government should ensure that all colleges complete action plans to develop Welsh-medium provision and that they are publicly available. In order to support these action plans, colleges should ensure that Champions have direct contact with the relevant senior managers in the institutions and that they are supported by an internal steering group.

Objective 2:   To increase the number of quality courses and modules available to learners at the colleges to facilitate the development of the Welsh language continuum.

Objective 3: To increase the number of learners undertaking to follow their courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.

11. Compared with the 2007/8 benchmark, there has been an increase in Welsh-medium and bilingual provision across the further education sector nationally since the Welsh-medium Education Strategy targets were set. This is encouraging. Nevertheless, the institutional level data on the above objectives are based on varying reporting methods (see Chapter 4).

> **Recommendation 2: for further education institutions**
>
> Colleges should, with the support of CollegesWales, improve the quality of the data collected on the Welsh-medium and bilingual learning options and the number of students who choose those options. This data should be in a consistent form that allows comparisons between institutions and over time.

12. The Welsh Language Commissioner was established in April 2012, with the aim of promoting and facilitating the use of Welsh. This is done through highlighting that the Welsh language has official status in Wales and by the application of standards on institutions. The consultation document 'Standards and the Welsh Language' was published in

January 2014, with the first standards focussing on county borough councils and county councils in Wales, national park authorities and Welsh Ministers.[2] Further standards are expected to be introduced, which will relate to other public bodies and institutions, including further education colleges. Colleges will need to consider the implications of these developments when planning programmes in the future.

13. There are barriers when trying to encourage demand from students for Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. One challenge reported by Champions is the process of collecting and presenting evidence of the advantages of maintaining Welsh language skills. Consideration should be given to the good practice developed in marketing Welsh-medium education in other sectors (e.g. higher education), and key stakeholders should work in partnership to build upon effective methods. Colleges may find the findings of the 'Welsh Language Skills Needs in Eight Sectors' report, published by the Welsh Government, useful in encouraging learners to maintain or improve their Welsh language skills as part of their studies.[3]

> **Recommendation 3: for CollegesWales**
>
> Guidance should be developed for colleges highlighting effective ways of encouraging students to follow part of their courses through the medium of Welsh.

Objective 4: To maintain and improve the Welsh language skills of learners entering the college from Welsh-medium and bilingual schools, who follow English-medium, Welsh-medium or bilingual courses.

14. Colleges have been seen to make efforts to maintain and improve students' linguistic skills. However, it has not been possible to measure the effectiveness of the efforts made in relation to this objective, mainly

---

[2] Welsh Government (January 2014), *Consultation Document: Proposed Welsh Language Standards* http://wales.gov.uk/docs/dcells/publications/140106-consultation-on-standards-relating-to-the-welsh-language-en.pdf
[3] Welsh Government (April 2014), *Welsh Language Skills Needs in Eight Sectors* http://wales.gov.uk/statistics-and-research/welsh-language-skills-needs-eight-sectors/?lang=en

because colleges use various ways of collecting and interpreting information on students' ability.

15. Appropriate support needs to be targeted at learners, recognising opportunities to offer parts of courses or entire courses through the medium of Welsh to learners who have Welsh language skills.

Recommendation 4: for further education institutions

Institutions should ensure that there are opportunities available for learners with Welsh language skills to follow some modules or elements of their courses through the medium of Welsh, as a means of maintaining their skills.

Objective 5: To increase the number of college staff able and qualified to assist with portfolio building, assessment and verifying through the medium of Welsh.

Objective 6: To develop staff capacity to enable colleges to expand their learner support both in formal classroom and learning situations and in informal social situations to further develop bilingual language skills and language awareness.

16. The majority of colleges collect data on their staff's Welsh language skills. Nevertheless, there is an incomplete picture of the number of practitioners across the sector who have the competence to develop, assess and verify portfolios through the medium of Welsh. If the method of collecting data were consistent across all colleges, thus ensuring that data was collected on Welsh-speaking staff's different levels of ability, it would be possible to undertake a more robust analysis of the situation in individual colleges and across the sector.

17. A minority of institutions report that they have staffing strategies that place a particular emphasis on increasing the number of staff who have the necessary language skills to increase Welsh-medium provision. This was done for the first time after the appointment of the Bilingual Champions.

> **Recommendation 5: for further education institutions**
>
> Colleges should ensure that they consider the need for Welsh language skills when advertising new jobs, taking into consideration the linguistic profile of the colleges' faculties and the Welsh Government's priority areas.
>
> **Recommendation 6: for CollegesWales**
>
> CollegesWales should disseminate the good practice seen in some colleges in employing staff with Welsh language skills to enable them to provide new Welsh-medium courses.

18. The Sabbatical Scheme offers opportunities to improve practitioners' Welsh language skills and increase the number of practitioners who are able to teach and train through the medium of Welsh. A recent review of that scheme demonstrated that there had been an increase in the number of participants from the further education sector attending the courses, but that some further education institutions had concerns about releasing members of staff to attend because it is sometimes difficult to find suitable supply staff.[4] The report concludes that there is room to improve the process of planning and recruiting to the Sabbatical Scheme.

19. The Skills Diagnostic Tool was developed by WJEC on behalf of the Welsh Government to help employers understand and interpret their staff's level of Welsh language skills. Colleges contributed to the process of developing this tool and Champions are already using it. It offers the opportunity to facilitate the process of identifying gaps (in language skills) and target the development of further Welsh language skills.

> **Recommendation 7: for further education institutions**
>
> Colleges should ensure that they make use of the tool to identify Welsh language skills, funded by the Welsh Government, in order to help develop the workforce's skills and meet the strategic priority of developing Welsh-medium provision.

---

[4] Welsh Government (January 2014), *Evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy: Review of the Welsh Language Sabbatical Scheme for educational practitioners: the experience of participants 2011-2012*

Objective 7: To establish and maintain a college mentoring programme to support college staff that attend formal and informal training, or require additional support to teach through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.

20. Mentoring programmes ensure that there is effective support in place to help increase the confidence of tutors who have received some training to develop their Welsh language skills. Champions have played an important role in establishing mentoring programmes in the majority of further education institutions. The evidence shows that the mentoring support offered needs to be flexible and tailored in a way that reflects practitioners' needs.

> **Recommendation 8: for further education institutions**
>
> Institutions should, with the support of Sgiliaith, establish and formalise a mentoring programme in order to ensure that there is appropriate support available to enable practitioners to use their Welsh language skills.

Objective 8: To disseminate good practice and provide practical support within the colleges and with other education and training providers in the area, with the aid of Sgiliaith.

21. A lack of resources can be a problem for some tutors. A method of 'mapping' the resources that are available in different subjects would help Champions and practitioners alike, and would create an opportunity for institutions to share resources.

> **Recommendation 9: for CollegesWales**
>
> An exercise should be considered to map the Welsh-medium resources developed and used by colleges, ensuring that there are opportunities to share resources where possible. This mapping process could feed into the process of identifying Welsh-medium resource needs and the Welsh Government's commissioning process.

22. A range of partners have the specialist knowledge necessary to support the development of Welsh-medium education provision. It is important that the Welsh Government encourages collaboration between

CollegesWales, the *Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol* (national institution supporting Welsh-medium higher education) and other institutions and organisations in order to take advantage of opportunities to share good practice in marketing and introducing new Welsh language provision.

> **Recommendation 10: for the Welsh Government**
>
> The Welsh Government should consider what further support could be offered in order to encourage colleges to market and promote Welsh-medium provision in priority subjects or areas of strategic importance.

Objective 9: Colleges to plan and fund the role of the Bilingual Champion as an inherent part of the college's overall strategies after project funding ceases.

23. The wider financial climate, alongside recent reviews of the funding arrangements in the further education sector, has meant that colleges are not able to plan for the future with certainty. The effect of this on the Bilingual Champions project is that no definite commitment has been made to continue the Champions' work in the majority of colleges.

24. Colleges have invested additional resources to fund additional tutors and mentors or develop materials. However, the level of this additional investment varies.

> **Recommendation 11: for further education institutions**
>
> Colleges should confirm their plans to maintain the Champions' role, including stating how the Champions' functions will be incorporated into the institutions' work on a continuous basis.

Conclusions in the context of the full evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy

25. This review concludes that the Champions' work is a valuable contribution to the efforts to *'improve the process of planning Welsh-medium provision in the post-14 phases of education and training'*, one of the relevant strategic aims of the Welsh Government's Welsh-medium Education Strategy. The evidence shows that the role of Champions has

meant that institutions have formalised the process of planning Welsh-medium provision.

26. New partnerships are developing between colleges and Welsh-medium schools through the work of the Champions. There is evidence that colleges are targeting the development of Welsh-medium provision in some key vocational areas.

27. The Champions' ability to foster good relationships with practitioners/tutors has facilitated the process of identifying language-training needs. Nevertheless, there is room to improve the methods of supporting practitioners' language skills by ensuring that the training offered is tailored and part of an action plan.

28. Based on the evidence collected, it is very unlikely that the developments seen across the sector would have happened in the absence of the Bilingual Champions project. In essence, the Champions' main work is to facilitate changes to colleges' planning processes; it is a relatively short-term investment seeking to introduce long-term changes in the way that colleges operate, which demands a strong commitment by institution heads and senior managers.

1 Introduction to the review

1.1 Arad Research was commissioned to conduct a study on the Bilingual Champions project in Further Education, funded by the Welsh Government. This report presents the findings of the research undertaken between December 2012 and July 2013.

Aim of the study

1.2 The aim of the study was to consider the influence of the Bilingual Champions in supporting the formation of a support structure to encourage Welsh-medium provision. This report presents findings in relation to the work of Champions in further education colleges as well as conclusions on the progress against the project's targets (see Section 1.15 below).

Context of the study

1.3 This study forms part of wider research to evaluate the Welsh-medium Education Strategy (the Strategy), published by the Welsh Government in 2010.[5] Arad was commissioned to undertake a programme of research to consider the impacts of the Strategy in its entirety, using the Proposed Evaluation Framework for the Welsh-medium Education Strategy as a basis for the work.[6] The Evaluation Framework provides a basis for addressing the research questions and objectives noted in the research programme Specification.[7] These objectives include considering progress against the Strategy's aims and targets, including considering whether the aims and targets are still appropriate. The evaluation also considers the factors that hinder or support the Strategy's vision, researching the effectiveness of different activities in

---

[5] Welsh Government (2010) *Welsh-medium Education Strategy*
http://wales.gov.uk/docs/dcells/publications/100420welshmediumstrategyen.pdf
[6] Welsh Government (2011) *Proposed Evaluation Framework for the Welsh-medium Education Strategy* http://wales.gov.uk/docs/caecd/research/120330welsheducationcy.pdf
[7] Specification for an independent research programme to evaluate the Welsh-medium Education Strategy. Advertised by the Welsh Government through the sell2wales website in July 2012.

different areas and contexts. The evaluation's outputs will include recommendations for the Welsh Government and other strategic partners, and will suggest ways of adapting or improving their plans in order to support the development of Welsh-medium education.

1.4   The Evaluation Framework was reviewed in early 2013 as part of the current research programme; it built on the theory of change, and developed a logic model for the research programme. The questions identified during this process allow an assessment to be made of the significance of the Bilingual Champions project in the context of the full evaluation of the Strategy. The questions below interpret the questions set out in the Evaluation Framework, and link them specifically to the work of the Bilingual Champions. Sections 7.33-7.48 present conclusions in relation to these questions.

   i.   To what extent does the project support the aims, outcomes and objectives of the Strategy? Specifically:

      o   In what way has the project improved the process of planning provision?

      o   Has the project helped to ensure linguistic continuity from the statutory education phase to post-16 courses?

      o   Has the project contributed to the aim of developing practitioners' Welsh language skills?

   ii.   What are the main factors that facilitate/impede progress against outcomes?

   iii. Does the project interlink with/support other programmes that form part of the Strategy?

   iv.   The counterfactual: would the developments seen in the colleges have taken place in the absence of the project?

1.5   Strategic Aim 2 of the Strategy refers to the need to improve the planning of Welsh-medium provision in the post-14 education phase, and refers specifically to the need to ensure *'an increased contribution*

from the further education sector' in order to support linguistic continuity and Welsh-medium opportunities for learners. The Strategy sets targets for further education providers and work-based learning providers to increase bilingual and Welsh-medium learning activities.

Table 1: Targets for increasing the number of 16-19 year old students studying subjects through the medium of Welsh

Outcome 4						
More learners aged 16-19 studying subjects through the medium of Welsh in schools, colleges and work-based learning						
Indicators			**Targets**			
Learners' learning activities by medium of delivery*	**2007/08**		**2015**		**2020**	
	WM**	B**	WM	B	WM	B
Schools	9.6%	5.3%	12.0%	6.0%	14.0%	6.0%
Further education institutions	0.2%	4.5%	1.0%	6.0%	2.0%	8.0%
Work-based learning	0.2%	1.2%	0.5%	2.0%	1.0%	3.0%

Source: Welsh-medium Education Strategy (Welsh Government, 2010)
* excluding Welsh-language learning (Lifelong Learning Wales Record, LA26)
** WM = Welsh-medium; B = Bilingual

1.6   This report presents the evidence collected in order to understand the impacts of the project in supporting the above outcome.

Establishing the Bilingual Champions project: The Background

The pilot scheme

1.7   The project was originally established in 2005 as a pilot scheme, with three colleges, Coleg Llandrillo (which is now part of Grŵp Llandrillo-Menai), Coleg Llysfasi (which merged with Deeside College, now Coleg Cambria) and Coleg Sir Gâr (Carmarthenshire College), receiving grants to fund the Champions' posts (see Annex C).[8] During the pilot phase, Neath Port Talbot College (now NPTC Group) became part of the project because similar developments had started in the college via

---
[8] Annex C notes which institutions received frants from the Welsh Government to support the project between 2006/07 and 2016/17.

a grant from another source; it was decided that the Champions project would continue to fund these developments.

1.8 The aim of the project is to create a supportive structure in colleges where there has traditionally been little infrastructure in place to encourage Welsh-medium provision. The expected long-term outcomes are increases in both the number and quality of Welsh-medium and bilingual courses.

1.9 An evaluation of the pilot project was completed in October 2008.[9] That evaluation report noted that the Champions had enabled colleges to create a supportive structure to develop Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. By developing staff's language skills, new bilingual and/or Welsh medium provision was introduced for learners. The report also noted the key characteristics that contributed to the success and progress seen during the pilot scheme, namely:

   i. The establishment of a three tier structure (with senior managers, the Bilingual Champion and department/faculty coordinators working together to support Welsh-medium provision).

   ii. A commitment from senior managers to promote bilingualism as one of the college's strengths.

   iii. The appointment of Bilingual Champions at the level of senior lecturer.

   iv. That some bilingual provision was already established in a limited number of faculties.

1.10 Originally, it was agreed that the pilot scheme would be funded until August 2008; the scheme was extended for an additional 12 months (with a reduction in the funding from £49,000 to £40,000 for the pilot colleges). The evaluation of the pilot scheme recommended that the project should be extended to other colleges.

---

[9]Arad Research on behalf of the Welsh Government. *Bilingual Champions in Further Education* (October 2008).

Extending the scheme

1.11 Following the progress made by colleges during the pilot phase, the Welsh Government decided to fund Bilingual Champions in additional colleges. Between April and June 2011, Champions took up posts in Coleg Ceredigion, Yale College (Coleg Cambria), Coleg Gwent and Cardiff and Vale College (Coleg Glan Hafren and Barry College) / WEA South Wales and the YMCA Community College. It was agreed that this second wave would be funded until August 2014, with an annual contribution of £52,000 per college.

1.12 During 2012, the programme was extended further, to include Coleg Menai (Grŵp Llandrillo-Menai), Coleg Powys (NPTC Group), Pembrokeshire College, Bridgend College and Ystrad Mynach College (Coleg y Cymoedd). The Welsh Government committed to invest £50,000 a year until August 2015 in order to establish the Champions in these institutions.

1.13 Then, in January 2013, the project was extended to the final four further education colleges – Glamorgan (Coleg y Cymoedd), Merthyr Tydfil, Gower College Swansea and St David's (part-time officer) – with the Welsh Government providing funding to support the post until August 2016.

1.14 A number of objectives were agreed with each college in order to realise the project's aims, such as increasing the number of modules and courses available through the medium of Welsh, and establishing a mentoring programme for staff that needed additional support in order to teach bilingually or through the medium of Welsh. It remains early days in terms of seeing the impact of the Champions' work in the final four colleges to join the project.

The project's objectives

1.15 The background information on the project presented by the Welsh Government to colleges notes nine specific objectives. Evidence in this report is presented in a way that reflects those objectives. Some objectives have been grouped together and presented thematically, as illustrated in the table below.

Table 2: The objectives of the Bilingual Champions project and the structure of this report

Chapter	Objectives
3. Strategic planning of bilingualism	1. *To enable colleges to develop a robust strategy and increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision for learners.*
4. Increasing provision and creating demand	2. *To increase the number of quality courses and modules available to learners at the colleges to facilitate the development of the Welsh language continuum.*
	3. *To increase the number of learners undertaking to follow their courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.*
	4. *To maintain and improve the Welsh language skills of learners entering the college from Welsh-medium and bilingual schools, who follow English-medium, Welsh-medium or bilingual courses.*
5. The workforce	5. *To increase the number of college staff able and qualified to assist with portfolio building, assessment and verifying through the medium of Welsh.*
	6. *To develop staff capacity to enable colleges to expand their learner support both in formal classroom and learning situations and in informal social situations to further develop bilingual language skills and language awareness.*
	7. *To establish and maintain a college mentoring programme to support college staff that attend formal and informal training, or require additional support to teach through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.*
6. Collaboration and sustainability	8. *To disseminate good practice and provide practical support within the colleges and with other education and training providers in the area, with the aid of Sgiliaith.*
	9. *Colleges to plan and fund the role of the Bilingual Champion as an inherent part of the college's overall strategies after project funding ceases.*

Source: Bilingual Champions Project 2012/2013 Background Information, Welsh Government

1.16 The project's objectives are consistent with the priorities set for the sector by the Minister for Education and Skills in his letter to principals

of further education institutions in Wales in May 2013: the letter noted that institutions should continue *'to increase the Welsh-medium/bilingual learning options available and the number of students choosing those options in order to support our Welsh-medium Education Strategy'*.[10]

Key partners

CollegesWales

1.17 CollegesWales is the national body that represents all further education institutions in Wales. In 2010, CollegesWales drew up a National Strategy on Bilingualism in Further Education.[11] There are three elements to the strategy, namely:

- Element 1: Develop a Welsh language ethos in the college;

- Element 2: Develop bilingual communication skills to add to the English-medium provision;

- Element 3: Develop bilingual or Welsh-medium provision for post-14 learners.

1.18 The work of Bilingual Champions is central to the success and progress of this Strategy. CollegesWales' Bilingualism Director supports colleges by coordinating a Bilingualism Network to support Welsh-medium provision across a range of subject areas. By working with institutions across Wales, CollegesWales is in a position to identify the potential for collaboration, including the sharing of resources in some subjects.

Sgiliaith

1.19 Sgiliaith provides a support service to the further education sector across Wales in order to develop Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. Sgiliaith, which receives funding from the Welsh Government, provides

---

[10] *Welsh Government (May 2013), Further Education Institutions in Wales: Priorities for the further education sector 2014/15, Minister for Education and Skills.*
http://wales.gov.uk/docs/dcells/publications/131024-priorities-further-education-institutions-2014-15-en.pdf
[11] CollegesWales (2010). *National Strategy on Bilingualism in Further Education*

training to lecturers and tutors in order to enable them to teach bilingually or through the medium of Welsh. Sgiliaith developed the MA module in Bilingual Teaching Methodology with the aim of preparing practitioners to work effectively in a professional bilingual setting. The module is led by Sgiliaith tutors and delivered over a period of five days in schools and colleges. Sgiliaith has also developed the Bilingual Tutor Toolkit, suitable for both Welsh-speaking and non-Welsh-speaking tutors.

Welsh-medium 14-19 Forums

1.20 The Forums were established in order to help to develop collaborative courses among schools and between schools and colleges in order to meet the requirements of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009 on the minimum provision of general courses and vocational courses in Key Stage 4 and in post-16 education and training.

Welsh Language Commissioner

1.21 The office of the Welsh Language Commissioner was established in April 2012, in accordance with the provisions of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011. The Commissioner's aim is to promote and facilitate the use of the Welsh language. The Commissioner is also working to extend and strengthen organisations' Welsh-language commitments by monitoring the implementation of statutory Welsh language schemes, including the Welsh language schemes of further education institutions. This arrangement will be replaced by standards in due course. The Welsh Language Commissioner's Annual Report 2012-13 notes a number of priorities identified in the course of monitoring the Welsh language schemes of further education institutions, including:

- strengthening the arrangements for collecting data on the linguistic ability of prospective students and encouraging students to continue their studies in Welsh;

- ensuring Welsh language training for institutions' current staff;

- measuring the demand for bilingual provision among students and prospective students.[12]

The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol

1.22 The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol works to increase, develop and expand opportunities to study through the medium of Welsh in universities in Wales. The Coleg's Strategic Plan places an emphasis on collaboration with schools and further education colleges in order to ensure that prospective students are aware of the advantages of bilingual skills and of available Welsh-medium provision in higher education.[13] The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol also supports partnerships between higher education institutions, further education institutions and other bodies in order to ensure that modules and degree courses are available in Welsh in a variety of locations.

---

[12] Welsh Language Commissioner (2013), *Annual Report 2012-2013*
[13] Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, *Strategic Plan 2011/12-2013/14*

2   Overview of the methodology

2.1   In accordance with the guidance provided in the original invitation to tender and initial discussions with Welsh Government officers, the study methodology was based on a combination of desk research and fieldwork, with an emphasis on qualitative evidence. Some of the quantitative evidence was analysed using the Lifelong Learning Wales Record (LLWR) data and additional data presented by institutions in monitoring reports submitted to the Welsh Government (monitoring reports). All 13 further education colleges in Wales contributed to this study. Further information on the different stages of the study is provided below.

Initial meeting

2.2   A meeting was held with the Welsh Government to confirm the aims and objectives of the review. This provided the opportunity to share background information on the project, along with the contact details of the Champions and college senior managers. Some of the main research questions and study themes were discussed, with the following identified as issues to be considered:

- Has the project met its objectives (noted above in Table 2)? What barriers were encountered?

  o Has there been an increase in the number (and quality) of Welsh-medium/bilingual courses/modules?

  o Sustainability: are colleges considering how to sustain the role of Bilingual Champion when the grant funding comes to an end?

- Is there a higher profile for the Welsh language and Welsh-medium/ bilingual provision in colleges since the publication of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy?

- Do colleges consider linguistic skills when appointing staff as a means of maintaining or expanding Welsh-medium provision?

Desk research

2.3 A sample of the strategic plans of five further education institutions were reviewed in order to consider the emphasis those documents place on measures to develop Welsh-medium and bilingual further education. Consideration was given to whether the strategic plans referred to the role of Bilingual Champions.

2.4 As part of the desk research, 13 colleges' monitoring reports were reviewed in order to identify further questions to ask Champions and institutions' senior managers during the fieldwork. The Welsh Government shared a series of internal documents during the desk research, including the guidance given to colleges who receive grants as part of the project.

2.5 CollegesWales' Bilingualism Strategy was reviewed, as well as the most recent secondary data, including LLWR data.

Fieldwork

2.6 Interviews were held with 13 colleges, with a total of 35 individuals interviewed. These included Bilingual Champions (13), college managers or directors (9) and tutors (13). A topic guide was produced to be used during these semi-structured interviews (see Annex A). The complete list of individuals who contributed to the study can be seen in Annex B. Discussions were held with six groups of learners in five colleges, with contributions from a total of 33 learners.

2.7 Telephone interviews were conducted with three Champions who were new to their posts (since 2013). Additionally, a session was held to discuss the initial results of the study in a meeting with all Bilingual Champions so that they had the opportunity to offer feedback.

2.8   Interviews were conducted with officers of the Welsh in Education Unit, a representative of the office of the Welsh Language Commissioner and three representatives from CollegesWales.

3   Strategic planning of bilingualism

3.1   This chapter presents evidence collected in relation to strategic planning by colleges to support Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. This corresponds with Objective 1 of the Bilingual Champions project:

> ***Objective 1:***
> *To enable colleges to develop a robust strategy and increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision for learners.*

3.2   The structure of this chapter sets the pattern for the chapters that follow. Firstly, it summarises the evidence on progress made by institutions along with any impacts seen; secondly, it considers some of the barriers reported; finally, it notes the broad findings and any lessons for the future.

3.3   The chapter considers differences in the 'status' of Champions across colleges, which raises questions about the effectiveness of different delivery models. How important is the role's position within the college's management structure? How effective is the support given to Champions by strategic managers or steering groups at college-level?

3.4   Methods of measuring progress or impacts in relation to Objective 1 are considered. What developments have been seen in the different colleges since the Champions were appointed that demonstrate that institutional strategies and work plans are in place to increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision?

3.5   There are a number of factors that should be borne in mind when considering the evidence:

- The project has been rolled out gradually across the colleges and therefore in some colleges strategic planning is more developed and mature than in others;

- Every college faces different challenges based on the linguistic profile of its students, the language skills of its staff and existing Welsh-medium and bilingual provision, or lack thereof. As such,

there is no common historic baseline for Welsh-medium provision in colleges;

- It is important to acknowledge the difficulties in attributing directly any changes seen in Welsh-medium and bilingual provision in the colleges to the influence of the Champions. A range of factors and other conditions (such as institutions' strategic plans; practitioners' Welsh language skills; and the impact of training programmes) also influence developments.

Models

Variations in the Champions' position and model

3.6 Bilingual Champions operate in different ways and at different levels. Their contact with and influence on senior management teams varies, depending on the nature of the post and their position in the context of the college's management structure. Although the Welsh Government's guidance ensures that each Champion is appointed at the level of 'senior tutor' (as a minimum), there is significant variation in both their responsibilities and their strategic influence.

3.7 A minority of Champions operate at director-level within their institutions, with responsibility for creating and overseeing plans to support the Welsh language and bilingualism across the college. Other Champions operate on a level equivalent to the role of lecturer or senior lecturer, sometimes more independently, and are answerable to their institutions' senior management teams.

3.8 A close working relationship between Champions, directors responsible for the Welsh language and other heads of department has been an important factor in a number of colleges as they plan to increase provision.

> *'Working directly and more consistently with managers to promote bilingualism and looking at the more strategic developments in the college means that we are a lot more*

26

focussed. It is something that we always wanted to achieve, but this project has driven things forward.' (Senior Manager, Further Education College)

3.9 Some Champions noted that they are members of bilingualism teams or committees that identify opportunities to develop provision and coordinate work across the college's departments. Discussions with colleges highlighted that most Champions operate with a steering group supporting them. In the opinion of those Champions, the support of a wider cohort of individuals is essential and raises both the profile and awareness of their work.

> *'It's important that other people in the college act as "ambassadors" to support our work'. (Bilingual Champion)*

3.10 In a minority of cases, it was reported that Champions operate as individuals within their institutions and work in an 'isolated' way in trying to support Welsh-medium provision.

3.11 In essence, the role of Bilingual Champions is to support and facilitate strategic developments. However, evidence suggests that there is an emphasis on providing more practical services in some cases. A minority of Champions note that they spend a significant part of their time teaching and providing language courses to students, despite the fact that Welsh Government officers noted during interviews that Champions should not have a teaching timetable.

> *'In this college, they [senior managers] said right at the start that they needed someone who could teach as well as write reports and produce resources.' (Bilingual Champion)*

3.12 It appears that the Champions generally have a fair degree of autonomy to operate in the way they think best as they respond to needs or opportunities as they arise. However, the level of independence varies across the different colleges, and reflects the level at which the Champion works, the Champion's relationship with the principal / deputy principal and, to a certain extent, the Champion's previous position before taking on the role.

3.13 Institutions' senior managers appreciate the flexibility, help and support afforded to them by the Welsh Government in establishing the role.

Targets as catalysts for strategic planning

3.14 The Welsh-medium Education Strategy includes targets to increase Welsh language and bilingual education activities for students in further education institutions. In order to support these targets, institutions agree their own targets for increasing the number of Welsh-medium modules provided and report on these in the monitoring reports submitted to the Welsh Government. Targets are also noted for increasing the number of learners following Welsh language or bilingual courses or modules. Institutions report on progress against these targets in their monitoring reports to the Welsh Government. (See Chapter 4 for further discussion on the outcomes.)

3.15 The very existence of the targets was said to be a tool for the Champions to use in encouraging colleges to plan more strategically in order to increase Welsh-medium provision. Although the monitoring data is inconsistent in some cases (see Chapter 4), the targets have driven developments, requiring colleges to measure progress.

> *'Being able to turn to the principal and say "the college has a target to achieve x during the next year" is certainly useful. Without my role, there wouldn't be that pressure or incentive on an institutional level.' (Bilingual Champion)*

Evidence of effect

Examples of progress and actions under Objective 1

3.16 Objective 1 is seen as a key priority but it appears that there is not a common interpretation of what is meant by 'strategic planning'. Nevertheless, the study has found evidence of various developments which reveal that colleges, in a number of cases, are improving their strategic planning to increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision.

This is consistent with the recommendation in the evaluation of the pilot scheme in 2008, which noted that institutions should develop new provision in a strategic and coordinated way, prioritising areas where demand has been identified (Recommendation 3 in the 2008 evaluation report, page 35).[14] In general, however, there is not clear evidence suggesting that this recommendation is being implemented across the sector as a whole. The most common examples are noted below:

- Colleges have established strategic groups to identify opportunities to develop the Welsh language across the curriculum (example below):

> *'As part of the development plan in the college, the Head established a Welsh Team ('y Tîm Cymraeg') with the aim of developing the Welsh language across the curriculum in order to offer educational opportunities to students through the medium of Welsh. This initiative underlines the importance of careful planning. We have identified some subjects where interesting trends have been seen in the number of Welsh speakers who register for courses, with Agriculture being one example. Following this, this year for the first time, we have created a Welsh-medium level 3 Agri course and an additional full-time lecturer was appointed to teach the course. We have done something similar for Sport, appointing new members of staff who are Welsh speakers. The intention is to ensure that staff have language skills that reflect demand and the areas we are prioritising. Over the past year, there has been a 20 per cent increase in the number of college staff who are Welsh-speaking – and this was achieved by deliberately recruiting Welsh speakers.'*
> *(Strategic Director, Further Education College)*

- Working with college human resources departments and ensuring that the wording *'the ability to teach through the medium of Welsh is advantageous'* is included in the specifications of advertised posts;

- Including information or sections on 'Bilingualism'/'Welsh-medium provision' in the institution prospectus and website. There are examples of colleges who have advertised opportunities to study through the medium of Welsh; the advantages of continuing with Welsh-medium education or training; the help available to support bilingual learners; and social opportunities supported by the college;

---

[14] Arad Research on behalf of the Welsh Government. *Bilingual Champions in Further Education* (October 2008).

- Working with schools to ensure linguistic continuity and planning provision that builds on provision in the statutory sector;

- Some colleges include their bilingualism policy as part of their Mission Statement;

- Champions referred to a system of setting internal targets for departments, with faculties reporting on the progress made against these targets; to support the process, internal inspections are conducted on the use of the Welsh language across individual departments.

3.17 The review found evidence of positive developments as a result of the additional investments made by colleges to support developments. This includes strategic leaders investing both time and money. On a strategic level, the project has motivated a number of institutions to create internal committees to support the Welsh language, and seek to ensure that new developments have been planned and coordinated. In another example, one college noted that it had appointed bilingual tutors to provide *Iaith ar Waith* units (customer care units that acknowledge bilingual skills in vocational subjects) with additional funding from the college.[15] On a practical level, Champions reported that colleges had made an effort to ensure that the language was more visible, by translating posters and signs.

3.18 The importance of working with other providers in planning provision was underlined. All colleges noted that there had been progress in establishing partnerships with schools and other institutions in order to collaborate on developments (further detail on this element is available in Chapter 6).

Barriers encountered

3.19 Interviewees were asked about any barriers they encountered in developing robust strategies to increase Welsh-medium provision. A

---

[15] *Iaith ar Waith* is a qualification that focusses on supporting Welsh language skills in offering customer services in the workplace. It can be presented as part of a range of different courses and is available at Entry 3, Level 1, Level 2 and Level 3.

lack of time was the most common observation, with most Champions and managers noting that it was still early days. Some noted that long-term planning was required in order to change the ethos of the college, raise awareness among staff and learners of the potential for new provision and ensure that the workforce was in a position to provide bilingual and Welsh-medium courses. Colleges are at different 'starting points' and the task of developing strategies is especially challenging for those colleges where Welsh-medium provision is very low:

> *'We have to be realistic in our plans and targets. There is quite a lot of work needed to change attitudes here in the college and that is a continual battle with some departments.' (Bilingual Champion)*

3.20 A number of college representatives referred to the additional costs associated with increasing Welsh-medium provision, although it should be acknowledged that colleges are expected to use their core budgets to develop Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. Whilst acknowledging the importance of the Welsh Government grant to support the Champions, it was noted that increasing provision demands a significant financial commitment by the colleges.

> *'Put simply, additional tutors will be needed if we are to introduce new provision. More investment by the college or the Welsh Government will be needed in order to realise this. 14-19 Network funds are a key source for a number of colleges.' (Bilingual Champion)*

3.21 Nevertheless, the project guidance information given to colleges made it clear that there is an expectation that they *'plan and fund the role of Bilingual Champion as an inherent part of the college's general strategy after the grant funding ceases'.* To that end, institutions were aware that long-term additional investment would be necessary to support and maintain the work of the Champions using their core funds to develop and maintain provision.

3.22 Champions suggested that the nature of the role in itself presented challenges – especially where there was a tendency for the Champions to work more independently within their institutions.

> *'Various responsibilities mean that Champions are pulled in a number of different directions. It encompasses work on a number of levels – administrative tasks, supporting tutors and trying to be an expert at almost everything! It sometimes feels that we are trudging along while the college continues to make big decisions without considering the Welsh language.' (Bilingual Champion)*

3.23 Some Champions feel that they are trying to lead on planning provision strategically without sufficient support from key partners or at a national level. In some cases, the competition between colleges and comprehensive schools continues, which can be a barrier to new developments. It was also noted that the Welsh Government and Sector Skills Councils could offer a better overview and strategic leadership in some areas, especially in promoting new provision in priority subjects or areas of strategic significance.

Different models of planning provision

3.24 The different models of Bilingual Champions seen across institutions are dictated by a range of factors: senior managers noted that they are pleased that the project offers flexibility so that colleges can create a structure that is appropriate for them.

3.25 While this flexibility is important to institutions, evidence suggests that Champions' ability to create a *'robust strategy and implement a plan to increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision'* (Objective 1) depends on whether the role is integrated as a part of the college's core work and processes.

3.26 A more integrated way of supporting Welsh-medium and bilingual provision is evident when:

- There is a clear relationship between the Champions and the senior management team, with Champions often directly reporting to the

director with strategic responsibility for the Welsh language or
bilingualism;

- Champions work as part of a team or wider internal committee
  supporting Welsh-medium provision and different faculties are
  represented on these committees;

- Responsibility for promoting bilingualism is accepted by every
  faculty across the college – with individual faculties appointing
  responsibility for developing bilingualism – and an internal system is
  in place for reporting on progress;

- A good relationship has been developed with other key partners,
  e.g. the college governors;

- Staff in all college departments have good awareness of the support
  offered by the Champions.

3.27 Whatever the model introduced by different colleges for implementing
the Bilingual Champions project, the evidence demonstrates how
important the support of institution principals and senior management is
to the work of Champions. One of the recommendations in the 2008
evaluation of the pilot project referred to this, highlighting the need for a
close working relationship between institutions' senior management
teams, the Champions and representatives across the colleges'
faculties. (Recommendation 2 in the 2008 evaluation report, page 35).[16]

3.28 It appears that less progress is made in strategic planning when
Champions are responsible for implementing a wide range of tasks on
their own, without sufficient support and without being able to deputise
responsibilities to colleagues. A minority of Champions spend a
significant amount of their time translating (teaching resources,
marketing materials) and providing language lessons, with a relatively
weak working relationship with college directors.

---

[16] Arad Research on behalf of the Welsh Government. *Bilingual Champions in Further
Education* (Hydref 2008).

4   Increasing provision and creating demand

4.1   This chapter considers the evidence collected relating to colleges' efforts to develop new provision, and increase the number of learners who choose to follow courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually. The evidence is drawn from a number of sources, including: the information presented to the Welsh Government by colleges in the annual monitoring reports; LLWR data; and the information collected during college visits. The chapter begins by considering the quality and content of available data to measure progress against Objectives 2 and 3 and then discusses some of the issues that came to light during interviews with college representatives.

> *Objective 2:*
> *To increase the number of quality courses and modules available to learners at the colleges to facilitate the development of the Welsh language continuum.*
>
> *Objective 3:*
> *To increase the number of learners undertaking to follow their courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.*

4.2   This chapter also introduces and discusses evidence collected in relation to Objective 4:

> *Objective 4:*
>
> *To maintain and improve the Welsh language skills of learners entering the college from Welsh-medium and bilingual schools, who follow English-medium, Welsh-medium or bilingual courses.*

Data sources

4.3   Wales-level data on post-16 teaching in further education is collected through LLWR. Units or modules where over half the teaching resources are provided through the medium of Welsh are counted as Welsh-medium or bilingual provision on LLWR. 'Teaching resources' include notes, PowerPoint presentations, teaching books/leaflets, white board presentations and terminology. The relevant field on LLWR is LA26. The Welsh Government uses the data to help decide on funding

arrangements for Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. Data on the number of Welsh-medium and bilingual units and modules is also collected in the monitoring reports that colleges present to the Welsh Government. This chapter presents data from both sources.

4.4 Provision that meets the threshold of half of all teaching resources in the Welsh language qualifies for additional funding for bilingual education. This means that units or modules where less than half of the resources are available in Welsh are not counted as bilingual or Welsh-medium courses. A number of college representatives noted that this means that the system does not afford a clear and comprehensive reflection of the breadth of Welsh-medium and bilingual provision.

4.5 A review of field LA26 on LLWR was carried out during the course of this study, with the aim of achieving a more accurate reflection of Welsh-medium and bilingual provision in the further education sector. The revised field is operational from September 2014.

Progress against Objective 2: number of courses and modules

4.6 The monitoring reports of nine out of the 13 colleges[17] which have a Bilingual Champion include information on the number of Welsh-medium units or modules available to learners in 2012-13. The 2012-13 monitoring reports noted that a total of 77 modules or units were available in these colleges. However, data presented by institutions on the number of Welsh-medium and bilingual modules and courses is inconsistent and based on different reporting methods. This makes it difficult to identify trends or come to definite conclusions on progress against Objective 2.

4.7 A number of Bilingual Champions noted in their interviews that they faced difficulties in identifying existing Welsh-medium and bilingual modules and courses. There is no recognition of Welsh-medium

---

[17] These 13 colleges refer to the institutions where there were Bilingual Champions in place before 2013. The individual colleges of Grŵp Llandrillo-Menai are counted seperately as the colleges joined the project in different years.

provision on courses where less than fifty per cent of resources are in Welsh (see 4.3 above). There is also confusion in some institutions because they are reluctant to describe courses as bilingual as departments are not confident that they would be able to prove that half of the resources are bilingual.

4.8 A number of Bilingual Champions noted that identifying and recording informal use of Welsh was challenging:

> *'[We are] in the process of creating a system to monitor progress towards developing Welsh-medium and bilingual modules and courses. This will allow us to present a full picture of progress in the Annual Report. It appears that assessing Welsh-medium activities is the stumbling block and that a lot of informal work is going on through the medium of Welsh. We are in the process of mapping this in order to see the full picture.' (Monitoring report.)*

Progress against Objective 3: the number of learners who choose to follow their courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually

4.9 The Welsh Government's Welsh-medium Education Strategy sets a target to increase the percentage of Welsh-medium and bilingual learning activities by 4.7 per cent in 2007/08 to 10 per cent by 2020.[18] 'Learning activities' include each individual course followed by students and this therefore does not correspond to the number of students learning in Welsh/bilingually. However, this is the best available measure to assess progress against this objective on a national level.

4.10 Wales-level data on post-16 teaching in further education[19] shows an increase of 15,765 in the number and percentage of learning activities provided through the medium of Welsh or bilingually (4.8 per cent of all learning activities) in 2007/08 to 21,325 (6.7 per cent of all learning

---

[18] The Strategy includes a target to increase the Welsh-medium education activities in FE from 0.2% (2007/08 baseline) to 1% by 2015 and 2% by 2020. A target was also set to increase bilingual activities from 4.5% (2007/08 baseline) to 6% by 2015 and 8% by 2020. The Strategy's Annual Report reports on progress on the basis of both these targets (i.e. Welsh-medium and bilingual learning activities).

[19] Source: Lifelong Learning Wales Record (LLWR).

activities) in 2011/12. Table 3 below illustrates a number of patterns that emerge within these figures:

- A change in the data between 2007/08 and 2011/12, with the number of Welsh-medium learning activities increasing from 700 in 2007/8 (0.2 per cent of all learning activities) to 2,300 (0.7 per cent) in 2010/11, before falling to 970 (0.3 per cent) in 2011/12.

- A significant increase of 35 per cent in the number of bilingual learning activities from 15,065 (4.6 per cent of all learning activities) in 2007/08 to 20,360 (6.4 per cent) in 2011/12.

- An increase of 2,720 (or 15 per cent) in the number of Welsh-medium or bilingual activities during the last year (i.e. between 2010/11 and 2011/12)

Table 3. Number and percentage of learning activities provided in Welsh and bilingually in further education colleges

	Number and percentage of learning activities provided:						Total
	Welsh only		Bilingually		In Welsh or bilingually		
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.
2007/08	700	0.2%	15,065	4.6%	15,765	4.8%	328,135
2008/09	1,040	0.3%	19,265	5.9%	20,305	6.2%	328,405
2009/10	1,410	0.4%	19,995	5.8%	21,405	6.2%	345,060
2010/11	2,300	0.7%	16,305	5.0%	18,605	5.7%	324,110
2011/12	970	0.3%	20,360	6.4%	21,325	6.7%	316,420

Source: Lifelong Learning Wales Record (LLWR)

4.11 An examination of the data in Table 3 reveals an increase in the percentage of learning activities provided through the medium of Welsh or bilingually between 2010/11 and 2011/12, whereas the total number of activities had fallen. This is due to a general fall in the number of learning activities (in all mediums) across the further education sector over this period.

4.12 Project monitoring reports present information on the number of students assessed through the medium of Welsh in each college. This review found that colleges presented this information in different ways. Nine out of the 13 colleges reported information on the number of learners assessed through the medium of Welsh or bilingually between 2010/11 and 2012/13, whilst four colleges reported on other measures, for example the percentage of registrations on Welsh-medium and bilingual courses and the number of learners following Welsh-medium and bilingual courses. This is an example of inconsistency in the way that colleges collect and present data in their monitoring reports.

4.13 These nine colleges noted that they had assessed a total of 3,154 students through the medium of Welsh in 2012/13. Eight out of the nine colleges provided data between 2010/11 and 2012/13, and this shows an increase of 68 per cent between 2010/11 (1,754 of students across the eight colleges) and 2012/13 (2,951 of students across the eight colleges).

Encouraging students' interest

4.14 In interviews with practitioners, it became apparent that colleges were trialling a number of different ways of increasing provision above and beyond creating new Welsh-medium units or courses. These included:
- Creating Welsh language registration groups;
- Offering *Iaith ar Waith* as part of English-medium courses;
- Offering Welsh-medium modules or project work under the supervision of a Welsh-speaking tutor within a wider English-medium course;
- Offering experiences e.g. fieldwork or work experience in locations that use the Welsh language;
- Working with schools to create part-time provision (e.g. one day a week) for learners aged 14-16;
- Additional Welsh courses;

- Welsh-speaking staff offering learning support;
- Conducting assessments in Welsh.

4.15 Based on data collected during fieldwork and from monitoring forms, it is clear that *Iaith ar Waith* has had a significant impact on the increase in Welsh-medium and bilingual provision in a number of colleges. A significant proportion of Bilingual Champions noted that *Iaith ar Waith* was the main factor driving the increase in many Welsh-medium and bilingual learning activities and modules.

> *'We are focussing on Iaith ar Waith this year – it helps towards the target.' (Bilingual Champion)*

4.16 A senior manager in one institution stated that providing A-Level in Welsh could contribute to meeting some of the scheme's other objectives. This was said to be important despite the fact that it did not contribute towards reaching the scheme's targets.

> *'A-Level is not included in LA26 [the Welsh Government's definition of Welsh-medium provision], but increasing the A-Level provision has a role to play in developing the college's [Welsh language] ethos, attracting more students with Welsh language skills.' (A member of a college's senior management team)*

4.17 Hand in hand with the task of increasing provision, there are efforts to raise awareness of the language among students, and the Champions consider these efforts to be essential first steps on the path to encouraging students' interest in Welsh-medium or bilingual provision. Colleges are asked to note the number of social and language awareness training activities that they arrange, as well as the number of students who take part in these events.

4.18 A wide range of Welsh language activities and support is available to students beyond the formal provision of courses and units. These include Welsh language entrance interviews; leaflets on the support available in transitioning from Welsh-medium schools to further education; vocabularies; clubs; events, trips and activities to celebrate

St David's Day and Santes Dwynwen Day. A number of Champions noted that they refer to the *Good Practice Handbook*.[20]

4.19 A number of Champions referred to the challenges in seeking to present the advantages of following courses in Welsh and maintaining Welsh language skills (students' comments are available in 4.30 below). Many suggested getting Welsh role models to take part in presentations or activities to promote the advantages of bilingualism, similar to what has been done in the context of enterprise education through the 'Dynamo' programme.[21] Comments underlined the importance of efforts to market Welsh-medium provision effectively – on both a local and national level.

4.20 Tutors noted that fostering learners' interest can be difficult at times. In the words of one tutor, it is a matter of *'drawing the language out of the students'*, especially where they lack confidence in using it. Most of the learners who contributed to the study appreciated the fact that colleges offered some Welsh-medium provision. A number of them noted that tutors also encouraged the use of Welsh rather than enforced it. It appears that this drew a positive response from learners:

> *'It's different to school and the 'teachers' are less formal – the tutors encourage us to try things in Welsh first. I was nervous [about Welsh] in the beginning but now I know the scientific terms.' (Level 3 learner, animal care)*

4.21 Practical barriers that influence students' language choice were also noted. One tutor stated that learners (who have come to the college from Welsh-medium schools) are often firmly of the view that they do not want to study through the medium of Welsh in college. Other learners are reluctant to make the decision to study elements of their course through a different medium from the rest of the learners.

---

[20] Aberystwyth University(2012) *Good Practice Handbook*: Examples of Good Practice in Encouraging Further Education Students to Continue with their Education through the Medium of Welsh. Produced by: School of Education and Lifelong Learning, Aberystwyth University, in partnership with Wavehill for *Bwrdd yr Iaith*. Available from http://collegeswales.ac.uk/download.ashx?r=623
[21] Dynamo is a project developed by the Welsh Government to promote enterprise skills; as part of the project, employers and business representatives visit schools and colleges to speak to learners about the advantages of starting a business.

'It's difficult [to turn to Welsh] when you're the only one out of a group of 12 who speaks Welsh.' (Learner, hair and beauty)

Challenges in increasing provision and measuring progress

4.22 A number of Bilingual Champions and practitioners are of the view that a lack of Welsh-medium and bilingual resources for further education, along with a lack of time to translate resources, is a barrier to increasing provision. These practitioners believe that the number of Welsh-medium learning activities (according to the current definition) could be increased by allocating more money and time towards translating resources within their college.

4.23 Examples were given of courses where oral work and tutoring was done in Welsh and where some learners on those courses had a largely Welsh-medium experience despite the course being officially taught through the medium of English.

4.24 One of the challenges in trying to measure progress is the fact that a number of the developments led by Champions fall outside of what is recorded in LA26. Champions report that it is difficult to show the impact of their work to raise awareness, secure goodwill and ensure ownership among the workforce, as these activities – essential as they are to the long-term success of the project – are often carried out informally.

Data collection and management systems

4.25 This study has found that colleges' internal data management systems do not use a common method of recording data relating to registration on Welsh-medium and bilingual courses. As a result, it is difficult to make direct comparisons between colleges. This reflects the findings of the evaluation of the pilot scheme conducted in 2008, and it appears that the need to standardise methods of collecting monitoring data is still an issue to be addressed. Colleges present information in different ways in their annual reports – these differences pose challenges in trying to create an all-Wales profile of the situation across the further education

sector. A minority of Champions noted that they could not easily get hold of current data from data system management officers within their institutions.

4.26 It is important that data collection systems allow institutions to record and acknowledge the contribution made by Champions in introducing new courses or modules. However, in light of the inconsistencies outlined above, comparing and analysing progress in Welsh-medium and bilingual provision across the further education sector is a challenge. This means that trying to measure the impact of the Bilingual Champions project is problematic as there is no way of comparing data on project inputs and outcomes in a robust and consistent way.

Progress against Objective 4: Maintaining and improving the Welsh language skills of students

4.27 It is difficult to measure the effectiveness of colleges' activities to maintain and improve students' language skills. The data available at the time of this study did not afford a full picture of the scheme's effectiveness in maintaining and improving students' Welsh language skills (although we should note that monitoring processes have changed since September 2013 – see 4.29). To understand the progress made against this objective, there is a need to measure learners' language skills when they arrive at the college and then collect later data to measure any changes during their time at the college. Although colleges use different methods of collecting and analysing information on the linguistic ability of enrolling students, the progression of those language skills is not commonly monitored.

- Eight of the colleges noted that they use 'self-assessment' measures including questions on the application or registration forms and surveys of learners' linguistic ability or confidence (e.g. QDP surveys used in a number of colleges to collect students' opinions).[22]

---

[22] QDP Services is a company that provides student surveys in a number of colleges in Wales.

- Seven colleges estimated the linguistic ability of its learners, based on the language of instruction or category of their previous schools, with three using this as their only source of information.
- Two colleges noted that they used learners' first or second language Welsh GCSE results to assess their language ability.

4.28 The data presented to the Welsh Government by colleges in their monitoring reports does not allow an analysis of how effective colleges are in *maintaining and improving* learners' Welsh language skills. A number of Bilingual Champions noted that a delay in receiving data on students' language ability created difficulties for them in trying to target provision and support to those students who have Welsh language skills.

> *'Data on prospective further education students' education background is collected on the basis of their previous schools (Welsh-medium/bilingual). This information is passed on to heads of department so that they can prepare methods of supporting students when they start on their college courses. This is now a key part of the college's reporting process, with the details available to staff on the intranet.' (Monitoring report)*

> *'It's easy to identify Welsh-speakers from Welsh-medium schools, but it is more challenging to get information about the language skills of learners who transition from bilingual schools.' (Monitoring report)*

4.29 Since September 2013, it has been a requirement that colleges, when registering students, record information on each student's highest Welsh language qualification before they start their course – whether first or second language. These recent developments to the LLWR have the potential to strengthen the process of collecting consistent data on students' language skills as well as the ability to measure linguistic continuity.

Challenges in trying to increase the number who choose to study through the medium of Welsh

4.30 Bilingual Champions referred to the barriers faced in trying to increase the number of learners who choose to study through the medium of Welsh. These included a lack of confidence among students in using the language, a tradition of studying in English in further education, a lack of awareness of the advantages of studying in Welsh, the tendency to 'prioritise the course, and not the medium' and a desire to change the medium of their education from Welsh to English after leaving school. This was reiterated by students during discussion groups and interviews with learners receiving some bilingual or Welsh-medium provision. Mixed feelings were expressed, with many referring to what they felt were the advantages and disadvantages of Welsh-medium provision.

> *'I am not confident in Welsh. I speak English with my friends – although we all understand Welsh. The tutor speaks Welsh to us during lessons – just saying 'good morning' … and gives us hand-outs and PowerPoint presentations in Welsh. But the language isn't at the top of the list of important things to be honest'. (Learner, beauty course)*
>
> *'I prefer to have [the course] in English – we know the terms in English and if I went to work in London, I would want to know the words in English.' (Learner, beauty course)*
>
> *'I didn't know it was possible to do things in Welsh – but in September, the tutor came to me and offered help. I'm doing part of the Bac in Welsh – and I'm glad of the opportunity to do that. (Learner, Welsh Baccalaureate course)*
>
> *'I'm keen to carry on with Welsh because I think it will help me in the future' (Learner, psychology course)*
>
> *'Doing things in Welsh is more work – because it's not as easy and it can take longer to do things in Welsh. Maybe other people see it that way as well'. (Learner, media course)*
>
> *'I didn't want to [do a part of the course in Welsh] but [the tutor] said that it would look good on my UCAS form.' (Learner, media course)*

4.31 Comments that support the above points can be seen in the monitoring reports:

> *'Very few choose to study through the medium of Welsh. The research conducted with Welsh-speaking students every term shows a tendency to study further education courses through the*

medium of English, for two main reasons: 1) a lack of learning resources / course books and assessments through the medium of Welsh in specific fields, 2) students' desire to improve their English skills.' (Monitoring report)

4.32 One college compared figures on students' language ability with data on the number of students who registered an interest in studying through the medium of Welsh. It concluded that a high number of students with Welsh language skills were reluctant to study in Welsh, which suggests a need to improve the way in which the advantages of Welsh-medium education are promoted among those moving to colleges from Welsh-medium schools.

> *'A comparison can be made between College x's learners' language skills and their attitude towards the language of learning in the college. A high percentage (70-80 per cent) state that they have Welsh language skills, but a very low percentage state that they have a desire to learn through the medium of Welsh or bilingually (23 per cent). This presents a challenge to the college and to local schools to improve understanding of the value of the language and bilingual skills amongst the cohort of learners who are likely to continue their education in the further education sector.' (Monitoring report)*

4.33 A number of Bilingual Champions noted that Welsh-speaking students are spread across a wide range of courses and this means a lack of critical mass for the provision of Welsh-medium courses. This was outlined in one of the colleges' monitoring reports:

> *'Although the total figure [the number of students from Welsh-medium schools] appears to be significant, we must remember that these students are spread across around 200 different courses. On average therefore, there are only one or two students who have come from Welsh-medium education on each course.' (Monitoring report)*

5   The workforce

5.1   This chapter presents evidence in relation to three of the project's objectives around developing the workforce. Firstly, progress is considered against Objectives 5 and 6, which relate to increasing the number of staff who are able to offer Welsh-medium provision.

> ***Objective 5:***
> *To increase the number of college staff able and qualified to assist with portfolio building, assessment and verifying through the medium of Welsh.*
>
> ***Objective 6:***
> *To develop staff capacity to enable colleges to expand their learner support both in formal classroom and learning situations and in informal social situations to further develop bilingual language skills and language awareness.*

5.2   This chapter also examines Objective 7, which relates to establishing mentoring programmes for staff undertaking training so that they are able to teach bilingually or in Welsh.

> ***Objective 7***
> *To establish and maintain a college mentoring programme to support college staff that attend formal and informal training, or require additional support to teach through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.*

Evidence of progress against Objectives 5 and 6

5.3   The data submitted by colleges in their most recent monitoring reports was reviewed in order to understand the methods used by colleges to record the number of staff who speak and who are able to teach through the medium of Welsh.

5.4   Ten out of the 12 colleges[23] who have a Bilingual Champion presented information on their staff's Welsh language skills and the training planned in order to develop Welsh-medium courses. Of these, nine colleges noted that they had a total of 784 staff (including support staff)

---

[23] Grŵp Llandrillo-Menai presented combined data for this indicator.

that were 'fluent' Welsh speakers or had 'good' or 'medium/higher' level speaking skills. Nevertheless, it should be noted that the data collection methodologies were not consistent across the colleges. One college collected detailed information on the language skills of its staff using the Welsh Government's 'Welsh in the Workplace Management Indicator' system.[24] One college noted that data was not available due to the fact that a review was underway; another college presented no data and no information.

5.5 Although some colleges presented data that showed the percentage of staff with Welsh language skills, there is no way of analysing the data on college staff's language skills as a percentage of all staff across Wales. This would require a common method of collecting data across all colleges that recorded data on the number of Welsh speakers as well as the number of staff working in the colleges. The monitoring data does not distinguish between the number of staff who have some level of Welsh language skills and those who have the competency to '*develop, assess and verify portfolios though the medium of Welsh*' (Objective 5). This illustrates some of the limitations of the current monitoring data.

5.6 During interviews, many Champions and directors noted that the methods of monitoring institutions' Welsh language skills have improved over recent years. In a number of colleges, there is an annual audit of staff's language skills, which allows them to identify gaps in specific faculties and to target training courses accordingly. Champions coordinate these exercises in many colleges.

Training

5.7 Colleges reported (in their 2012/2013 monitoring forms) that they offer – or refer practitioners to – a range of different types of training in response to their needs or requirements. The list below provides examples of the different courses the Champions coordinate or promote, but it is not a complete picture of all training attended by

---

[24] http://www.cymraegygweithle.org.uk/en

practitioners across Wales. It should also be noted that the data below represents the total across all colleges over one academic year.

- Language awareness training was the most common, with 899 of practitioners across 13 colleges having attended such courses during the year 2012/13;

- Welsh language courses (Welsh for Adults courses, internal language courses) were attended by 200 practitioners, according to the monitoring reports submitted by colleges to the Welsh Government;

- Sgiliaith courses (51 practitioners);

- Welsh Language Sabbatical Scheme for practitioners (27 practitioners);

- Welsh-medium or bilingual teaching methodology courses (4 practitioners);

- Other courses (172 practitioners), including 'bilingualism in the classroom' and 'using ICT to promote the Welsh language'.

5.8   Both Bilingual Champions and college directors acknowledge that improving the language skills of current staff is essential to the success of the project.

> *'Much of my time is spent persuading, encouraging and helping staff to improve their Welsh. If we don't have the skills within the workforce, none of the other efforts to increase provision will succeed.' (Bilingual Champion)*

5.9   One Champion noted that the first step is to raise awareness of the need to consider Welsh-medium and bilingual provision across the different departments. A number of Champions noted that it is 'early days' in the development of Welsh-medium provision and that fostering support and goodwill among colleagues is an important part of the work.

> *'The first thing is to put the Welsh language on the agenda for staff. When there are staff development days, we now have bilingualism sessions as part of each day. This is important as it*

keeps bilingualism at the forefront of their minds.' (Bilingual Champion)

5.10 There was consensus amongst interviewees that college staff need to take '*ownership*' of developments relating to Welsh-medium provision. One director noted that changing the ethos of colleges and increasing bilingual teaching opportunities requires *'a change in attitudes and culture for some'.*

5.11 Around half the institutions acknowledged that investment was needed on a number of levels to develop practitioners' Welsh language skills and that this is a long-term process. The examples of courses in 5.7 above demonstrate that courses are available to support practitioners' basic language skills; nevertheless, the data is not sufficiently complete to allow us to understand where there are gaps in training and to what extent the provision reflects demand. Champions report that they have been working with departments to identify appropriate tutors to take part in the Sabbatical Scheme. Further consideration is given to the connection between Champions and the Sabbatical Scheme in another report published as part of the evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy.[25] That report notes the challenges that institutions face when they release staff to attend courses due to difficulties in findings suitable supply staff at times.

5.12 A number of colleges noted that they have contributed to the development of a diagnostic tool funded by the Welsh Government to identify the Welsh language skills of the workforce in businesses and education.[26] Champions see the potential of using this tool in order to help identify needs and then plan appropriate training.

5.13 A range of training opportunities are promoted in a number of colleges, with some attempting to mainstream the development of language skills

---

[25] Welsh Government (January 2014), *Evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy: Evaluation of the Welsh Language Sabbatical Scheme for educational practitioners: the experience of practitioners 2011-2012*

[26] The Skills Diagnostic Tool enables employers to analyse their staff's current Welsh language skills and identify the elements that need to be improved, enabling them to operate through the medium of Welsh in the workplace.

as part of practitioners' professional development, as seen in the example below.

> *'We ensure a variety of opportunities for staff to develop their skills. At the most basic level, there is a short taster course – which is 5 hours long. We also pay for staff to attend Welsh for Adults courses. In addition, we offer specific courses to staff in response to their requirements… Internal arrangements also encourage the development of Welsh language skills – when tutors have their annual review with their line managers, one development point during the year relates to improving their Welsh. Because of this, there is more encouragement for staff to take advantage of the different training opportunities.'* (Bilingual Champion)

5.14 Some colleges work 'from the bottom up', seeking to ensure that everybody has a minimum level of Welsh language skills. One Champion noted that the college has a policy of ensuring that every member of staff receives Welsh language training to level 1.

Recruitment

5.15 CollegesWales' National Strategy on Bilingualism in Further Education encourages methods of proactively recruiting bilingual staff, noting that institutions should 'identify or appoint suitable staff in relation to linguistic development' (page 7). The Strategy also acknowledges the need to establish a process of appointing staff, which 'aims to allow for the continuation of bilingual provision by ensuring that suitable staff replace key staff that are leaving'. It is not clear to what extent CollegesWales is monitoring progress in this field across the sector.

5.16 Institutions' Welsh Language Schemes impose conditions for recruiting staff with Welsh language skills. The schemes note that Welsh language skills are a central consideration in appointing new members of staff in order to increase institutions' ability to offer Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. Institutions note that they assess the linguistic requirements of any new posts. A minority of institutions note that Welsh language skills are desirable for every position.

5.17 Evidence collected during interviews with college representatives indicated that there are opportunities that could be capitalised upon when positions become vacant. Colleges acknowledge the opportunities to appoint staff with Welsh language skills in priority fields and for subjects where demand is growing. A minority of colleges have appointed staff who can deliver provision in Welsh in response to specific demand for courses (see the example in Section 3.16). There were also examples of the processes in place to ensure that the Welsh language is an important consideration when recruiting to vacant posts, including the example below.

> *'One thing that has been a great help is the staffing strategy that's in place – for every vacant post that comes up in the college, there is a section on the form that means that whoever is requesting the post has to discuss it with me and ask 'do we need somebody who can speak for this post or not?'. If we agree that the ability to speak Welsh is essential, that forms part of the job advert. If we decide that the post requires some Welsh language skills but the successful candidate has none, it is a requirement that they go on a Welsh course within a certain timeframe'.* (Bilingual Champion)

5.18 Three of the directors / senior managers interviewed referred to the challenges associated with recruiting staff with Welsh language skills. The most common challenge was finding individuals with the necessary combination of qualities, i.e. the Welsh language skills and the appropriate qualifications. It was noted that colleges had experienced difficulties in certain subjects, with health and social care being an area where a number of institutions have found it difficult to recruit.

Evidence of progress in relation to mentoring programmes

5.19 Eleven of the 13 colleges with Bilingual Champions presented data on the number of staff who mentored others within the college; the other two colleges stated that mentoring did not happen in the college at present. In the 11 colleges that had a mentoring programme, there were a total of 21 active mentors, offering support to 65 mentees. The support

of Sgiliaith in planning and maintaining mentoring programmes was also mentioned.

5.20 Some colleges noted the advantages and outcomes of the mentoring process in their monitoring reports to the Welsh Government.

> *'A group has just been established in Campus x to promote the Welsh language in every department. A representative from each department meets with [name of mentor] once every half term to discuss resources, problems and the next steps to develop courses. The group has noted courses in each school which have the potential to be developed bilingually.' (Monitoring report)*

5.21 One tutor provided an example of how he had benefitted from a mentoring programme in his college. This practitioner, a tutor in Public Services, had attended the Sabbatical Scheme's short course and was keen to *'keep the momentum going'* with the help of a mentor. He explained that the mentor had started by observing lessons, and then discussed specific targets for expanding Welsh-medium provision.

> *'We [the tutor and mentor] worked together to prepare Welsh-language and bilingual sessions. The support with learning methodologies has been very valuable. The important thing is to introduce it bilingually from the beginning so that it's natural for the students to hear it.' (Tutor, Further Education College)*

5.22 During discussions with college representatives, examples were provided of formal and informal mentoring activities. In one instance, a Bilingual Champion succeeded in bringing together the Welsh-speaking staff at a residential course in order to share ideas and good practice in developing Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. This was funded through central college funds (i.e. not through the Bilingual Champion project grant).

5.23 There were other examples of colleges investing in mentoring programmes from central funds. One college explained:

> *'We acknowledge that if we want to support developments in Welsh – to take things to the next level – we must offer support to*

the staff. A role supporting teaching methods is vital.' (Senior Manager, Further Education College)

5.24 A director from one college referred to one of the mentoring programme's important features:

> *'Getting a peer to come in and support practitioners is far better than a manager going in. They are supportive, they are not judgemental, and the focus is on practice and on improving practice. It's very much about that supportive ethos.' (Director, Further Education College)*

5.25 A number of Champions noted that they are trying to use mentors in a flexible way, and in a way that reflects the needs of practitioners. It was reported that mentoring arrangements offer advantages to practitioners in a variety of ways, including:

- Offering support to a tutor in order to help them plan and provide key skills through the medium of Welsh;

- Supporting previous participants of the Sabbatical Scheme to reinforce and implement their new skills;

- Developing tutors' confidence to support the development of new units/modules in Welsh;

- Group language awareness sessions to different curriculum teams.

5.26 It appears that mentoring schemes are implemented in different ways, and that they have developed more slowly than anticipated in a number of institutions. In some colleges, the Champions themselves are the ones doing the mentoring, and that, according to the project's monitoring reports, is because there is no specific budget to fund the work. A Champion in a college in the south east noted:

> *'Here we have a target of having two mentors. However, there is no budget available. A year and a half has passed but there's no mentoring going on.' (Bilingual Champion)*

5.27 Other barriers encountered were also mentioned by interviewees. A minority of Champions said that time pressures and the wide range of other responsibilities have meant that mentoring has not been 'high on the list of priorities until now'. Nevertheless, it was noted that recently attention had been turned towards this element and that there were developments taking place in a number of colleges. It was noted that it was difficult to identify the practitioners who would benefit most from the support of a mentor.

Planning the development of the workforce's Welsh language skills

5.28 College representatives acknowledged that a long-term plan was needed on an institutional level in order to improve the workforce's Welsh language skills. There is a wide range of training courses and support available to support developments across the linguistic continuum. Institution representatives, including Champions and senior managers, agree on the importance of this support. Most Champions believe that the support needs to be rooted in clear plans (on an institutional level and within faculties) and the will (on an individual tutor level) to develop Welsh language skills. There were some examples of targeted strategic planning to develop Welsh-medium provision in specific subjects and to recruit staff with the appropriate skills to deliver provision, but these examples were generally few and far between. Evidence shows that there needs to be a clear commitment by principals and senior management to drive such strategic plans. At the same time, contributors expressed the opinion that the good practice seen in some institutions needs to be disseminated.

5.29 Bilingual Champions have a key role to play in supporting and implementing plans to develop the workforce in their institutions. It appears that Champions have been successful in raising awareness among staff and persuading many of them of the value of investing in their Welsh language skills. As a result, a wide range of new activities and developments were evident across the sector, including language awareness courses, mentoring programmes and tutor participation in

the Sabbatical Scheme and other language courses. Nevertheless, the impacts of this work are not yet obvious with regard to the number of college staff developing and providing modules and courses through the medium of Welsh.

5.30 It must be ensured that the training and support given to tutors is targeted in a way that is consistent with institutional plans to develop or expand Welsh-medium and bilingual provision.

6   Collaboration and sustainability

6.1   This chapter considers the evidence on progress made against the two final objectives that underpin the Bilingual Champions project (Objectives 8 and 9). Firstly, evidence is presented on the work undertaken by colleges in identifying and sharing good practice with different partners – partners within the colleges and external partners. Secondly, we look at the steps taken by institutions to maintain the role of the Champions as a central part of their strategic plans after the grant comes to an end. There is an element of overlap between these objectives, as establishing good practices and effective partnerships are fundamental to the sustainability of the project. These connections are given further consideration below.

> ***Objective 8:***
> *To disseminate good practice and provide practical support within the colleges and with other education and training providers in the area, with the aid of Sgiliaith.*

Progress in offering practical support

6.2   It became clear during interviews with the Champions that they consider sharing good practice and offering support to practitioners and partners as one of the main elements of the role. As noted in previous chapters of this report, Champions work directly with tutors in range of ways. A variety of support methods were offered, including working with staff to plan bilingual lessons, introducing Welsh vocabulary to increase the Welsh language ethos of lessons, and working more strategically with departments to identify demand and opportunities for Welsh-medium and bilingual provision.

> *'I run training sessions for staff here and have developed a 'checklist' for tutors – things related to the Welsh language and bilingualism for the practitioners to follow as they plan lessons.' (Bilingual Champion)*

6.3 Champions themselves offer practical support in order to increase provision in some colleges. In colleges where there is a shortage of staff who can teach in Welsh, there were examples of Champions providing *Iaith ar Waith* units as part of courses.

Evidence of collaboration with schools and other partners

6.4 The monitoring reports submitted by colleges to the Welsh Government include data on the partnerships established by Champions to support their work. The 2012/13 reports list new partnerships established with schools, colleges and other training providers. Most (10 out of 13 colleges) report that they have formed partnerships with local schools; four noted that they have partnerships with other further education colleges. Five of the colleges have connections with universities, in order to develop progression pathways into the higher education sector. Although a number of these are strategic partnerships that have existed for years, the evidence shows that the Champions have strengthened these connections significantly.

6.5 During interviews, the Champions underlined the importance of fostering a good relationship with schools. The general view among directors and senior managers who contributed to the study was that a better relationship had developed between the colleges and Welsh-medium and bilingual schools since the Champions were appointed.

> *'Naturally the element of competition still exists, but the Champion has worked to identify areas with potential for collaboration.' (College Senior Manager)*

6.6 Champions explained that collaborating with local schools afforded opportunities to identify the demand amongst pupils for vocational courses. There were also examples in the monitoring reports of collaboration between colleges and schools, with Champions noting that they had met with principals and attended careers evenings in order to map the courses already available in schools.

'The Bilingual Champion has created a matrix of vocational courses available through the medium of Welsh in our local schools. We now use the matrix to produce a strategic plan for future developments.' (Further Education College Monitoring Report)

6.7 There were examples that demonstrated that the partnerships between colleges and schools had come to fruition, with provision in vocational subjects offered to school pupils in some colleges, as is shown in the example below.

'There is a good link between us and a local Welsh-medium school. We have a tutor who provides Car Mechanics courses to year 10 and 11 children two days a week. There are two different courses – a 10-week taster course during the year, one set after the other. Then, every Friday, there is a group of learners who study a Level 1 IMI qualification through the medium of Welsh.
The school is supportive as it offers different opportunities to children – boys mainly – who are in danger of disengagement from education. It is an opportunity to offer a different strategy to help a group of learners who can prove to be challenging. We are very pleased to have the opportunity to show the Welsh language being used in a vocational context.' (Bilingual Champion)

6.8 It was noted that the level of collaboration varies across Wales. One Champion, who has experience of working in two different areas, explained:

'There is more collaboration here between the Champions across the region. There is far more partnership working here – the Champions are prepared to discuss things, problems, share good practice, resources. The linguistic nature of colleges here are more similar and we work in similar situations.' (Bilingual Champion)

6.9 It was reported by colleges that Welsh-medium 14-19 Forums helped facilitate new partnerships with schools, leading to connections with school head teachers and senior managers.

6.10 Colleges provided a range of examples of partnerships and other links currently being established. Champions have tried to raise awareness of their work by contacting local authority departments, with one offering training sessions to the Equalities Officer and other colleagues in the council.

6.11 Other partners with whom the Champions collaborated were listed in the monitoring reports submitted by colleges:

- Regional language forums (four colleges)

- Local authorities language forums (three colleges)

- *Mentrau Iaith* – Welsh Language Initiatives (four colleges)

- Local regional Welsh-medium Education Forums/14-19 Networks (three colleges)

- *Urdd Gobaith Cymru* – Welsh League of Youth (two colleges)

- Learning in the Workplace Consortium (two colleges)

- *CollegesWales* Bilingualism Network (two colleges)

- Welsh for Adults Centres (two colleges)

- National Museum Wales (one college)

6.12 New contacts established with *Urdd Gobaith Cymru* and the *Mentrau Iaith* afforded numerous examples of social opportunities that had been arranged so that learners could use their Welsh language skills.

6.13 Evidence collected during interviews with college representatives demonstrates that these partnerships have resulted in positive outcomes. Examples of new provision were provided, with colleges welcoming sixth form pupils to study vocational subjects. This closer collaboration between schools and colleges has succeeded in raising the profile of vocational and further education amongst learners, according to the senior managers in three colleges. One Champion noted that school visits by tutors and the Champion had managed to *'persuade Welsh-medium learners that further education is acceptable and can offer valuable learning experiences'*. These developments were largely driven by changes to the 14-19 education policy in recent years,

but college directors acknowledge that the Champions have provided important support during the process.

6.14 Champions reported that Sgiliaith's support has been essential to them. One Champion noted that it was very advantageous to have Sgiliaith on hand to provide external expertise and reinforce the messages and support offered by the Champions.

6.15 Sgiliaith team's willingness to tailor support for practitioners is considered a key factor.

> *'One of the strengths of the Sgiliaith team is the fact that they are willing to adapt and develop new things... they will adapt support to be subject-specific if you're going into a specific area.'*
> *(Bilingual Champion)*

The sustainability of the role of Bilingual Champion

> ***Objective 9:***
> *Colleges to plan and fund the role of the Bilingual Champion as an inherent part of the college's overall strategies after project funding ceases.*

6.16 The Government has funded most of the Bilingual Champions for a period of three years. This initial funding enables each college to establish a post that promotes Welsh-medium provision and coordinates strategic developments. The intention is that following this initial injection of funds by the Government, the colleges maintain the service themselves after the grant period.

6.17 In those institutions that have been part of the project since the pilot scheme the posts have already been continued after the Welsh Government grant funding came to an end. Champions in these institutions are on permanent contracts, which is a clear sign of a long-term commitment to support the project's objectives.

6.18 Despite this, most institutions, especially those institutions that joined the project more recently, were not able to demonstrate definite plans to

maintain the role. Discussions with representatives of those colleges gave rise to mixed evidence. A minority of college directors and senior managers noted that they had made additional financial contributions to support the work of the Champions.

6.19 Although there is goodwill amongst senior managers and directors across the sector, they acknowledge that financial considerations will drive colleges' decisions about continuing the role and functions of Champions in the long-term. One director noted that moving from qualifications to programmes as a basis for planning and funding means that *'the financial picture is uncertain at the moment'.* The changes to the post-16 planning and funding framework mean that further education institutions receive block allocations to reflect the additional costs of Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. Despite this, there is no expectation that institutions use these increases in funding for Welsh-medium/bilingual provision to support the Champions' existing functions once the grant funding comes to an end. Whilst strategic drivers support the developments (institutions' bilingualism strategies, the development of the Welsh Language Commissioner's language standards, the Minister for Education and Skills' priorities letter), there are other pressing strategic priorities as institutions respond to new learning programmes' funding arrangements.

6.20 Further education institution directors acknowledge that long-term support is needed in order to meet the project objectives and ensure that the development of Welsh-medium provision becomes a *'natural part of the institutions' way of thinking'.*

7 Conclusions and recommendations

7.1 This chapter starts by presenting the conclusions that came to light during the study. The conclusions are presented against the objectives of the Bilingual Champions project, along with recommendations for the Welsh Government, further education institutions and CollegesWales. We refer to some of the developments and barriers reported by institutions in relation to developing provision and a competent workforce and ensuring the sustainability of the project.

7.2 The conclusions highlight the obvious correlation between the project and further education institutions' wider strategic plans. As noted in Chapter 1, the Champions' main role is to support strategic planning in their institutions in order to increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. Nevertheless, it is important to acknowledge that wider plans and institutions' priorities influence and limit what Champions can achieve. With this in mind, the conclusions and recommendations in this chapter include comments directed specifically at the project as well as wider issues that relate to Welsh-medium and bilingual provision across the further education sector more generally. This means that we cannot consider the project without raising questions about its context and the challenges facing colleges generally.

7.3 Finally, the evidence is considered in the context of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy. We present the research team's observations and analysis, and consider the contribution of the project to the aims and targets of the Strategy in its entirety.

Objective 1: To enable colleges to develop a robust strategy and increase Welsh-medium and bilingual provision for learners.

7.4 The evidence shows that the work of Champions, through the increasing influence they exert within their institutions, has led to a clear increase in the attention given to the planning of Welsh-medium provision. This increase would not, in all likelihood, have been seen if it were not for the

existence of the Champions. However, it must be acknowledged that all of the results and impacts of the development and planning work undertaken by colleges have yet to reach full fruition, and that changing culture and raising awareness of opportunities to increase provision is a long-term process.

7.5 Different colleges have reached different stages in the strategic planning process. This variation is to be expected, considering the fact that a significant number of the Champions are fairly new to their posts. A historic lack of Welsh language provision in some institutions also means that the attention given to planning Welsh-medium and bilingual provision varies across the sector.

7.6 This study underlines some of the challenges associated with assessing progress against Objective 1. On the one hand, there are a number of factors influencing the Champions' work (this report refers, for example, to policy developments in further education and the funding mechanisms). The Champions could be delivering high-quality, innovative work, yet other factors could be hindering the establishment of a supportive institutional strategy. On the other hand, wider factors could be facilitating the development of Welsh-medium provision, which are not directly related to the work of the Champions.

7.7 The Welsh Government has stated that developing Welsh-medium provision is one of the four priorities for the further education sector for 2014/15. The previous Minister for Education and Skills stated in his letter to the sector, dated 24 May 2013, that he *'expected every institution to draw up a report on the provisional actions to 2015 noting how they will increase the number of post-16 learners who study subjects bilingually or through the medium of Welsh.*[27] This is a sign that further steps are needed in order to improve strategic planning across the further education sector and support Welsh-medium and bilingual provision.

---

[27] Letter from the Minister for Education and Skills to heads of further education institutions in Wales, 24 May 2013, see: http://wales.gov.uk/docs/dcells/publications/131024-priorities-further-education-institutions-2014-15-en.pdf

7.8 All further education institutions in Wales have received funding through the Bilingual Champions project in order to incorporate and implement plans to strengthen Welsh-medium provision. The evidence suggests that institutions need to take responsibility for funding and driving developments as part of their core priorities, in accordance with the Welsh Government's directive.

7.9 The variation in the project's delivery models influences progress in developing strategic planning processes to support Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. In accordance with Welsh Government guidelines, all Champions have been appointed at the level of senior tutor at the minimum. Nevertheless, there are variations in the status and levels of accountability associated with the role. Those Champions working at a higher level within the college's management structure feel that they have an advantage as they have more direct contact with the institutions' directors or senior management teams. Whatever the model and Champion's status, it is important that the college principal is fully supportive of the project's objectives and that there are clear protocols in place for progress reporting to the head and the senior management team. This was identified as an important matter in the evaluation of the pilot project in 2008, with a recommendation emphasising the need for a close working relationship between institutions' senior management teams, the Champions and representatives across the college faculties (page 35).[28]

7.10 There are lessons for Champions who are new to their jobs in relation to delivery models and ensuring wider support for their work. The experience of established Champions demonstrates the value of creating a steering group within the college early in the process. The evidence suggests that the additional support is valuable for a number of reasons:

- it acts as a sounding board to identify priorities and opportunities to develop bilingual or Welsh-medium provision;

---

[28] Arad Research on behalf of the Welsh Government. *Bilingual Champions in Further Education* (October 2008).

- by ensuring wide representation on the group, messages cascade more quickly and widely across institutions;

- it can contribute to the sustainability of the project by ensuring a work plan and more formal and structured arrangements around the role of the Champion.

7.11 Further education institutions could support the work of Champions by ensuring a more strategic and coordinated approach to the process of supporting the development of Welsh-medium provision.

> **Recommendation 1: for the Welsh Government**
>
> The Welsh Government should ensure that all colleges complete action plans to develop Welsh-medium provision and that they are publicly available. In order to support these action plans, colleges should ensure that Champions have direct contact with the relevant senior managers in the institutions and that they are supported by an internal steering group.

Objective 2: To increase the number of quality courses and modules available to learners at the colleges to facilitate the development of the Welsh language continuum.

7.12 The data presented by institutions on the number of Welsh-medium modules and courses in their monitoring reports are inconsistent and based upon varying reporting methods. This makes it difficult to identify trends or come to definite conclusions on progress against Objective 2.

7.13 In a recommendation in the evaluation report on the pilot project in 2008 (page 35), it was noted that colleges need to improve their monitoring data on the number of Welsh-medium and bilingual courses and modules available.[29] Introducing the annual monitoring report was a constructive step that has strengthened the monitoring process, but

---

[29] Arad Research on behalf of Welsh Government. *Bilingual Champions in Further Education* (October 2008).

there is room to improve the consistency of the way in which colleges collect and present this data (see Recommendation 2 below).

Objective 3: To increase the number of learners undertaking to follow their courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.

7.14 Lifelong Learning Wales Record (LLWR) data shows a national increase in Welsh-medium and bilingual provision since Welsh-medium Education Strategy targets were set, based on the 2007/8 benchmark. Progress has been made towards the Welsh Government's target of increasing the percentage of Bilingual and Welsh-medium activities to 7 per cent in 2015 (an increase from 4.8 per cent in 2007/08 to 5.7 per cent in 2010/11).

7.15 The institutional-level data reviewed in this study, based on the monitoring reports of eight colleges, indicates that the number of students choosing to follow Welsh-medium or bilingual courses has increased in recent years. However, there is room to improve the way colleges report on progress against Objective 3 in their monitoring reports in order to compare trends across institutions.

Recommendation 2: for further education institutions

Colleges should, with the support of CollegesWales, improve the quality of the data collected on the Welsh-medium and bilingual learning options and the number of students who choose those options. This data should be in a consistent form that allows comparisons between institutions and over time.

7.16 'Standards and the Welsh Language' were published in a consultation document in January 2014.[30] These standards will take the place of the

---

[30] Welsh Government (January 2014), *Consultation Document: Proposed Standards and the Welsh Language* http://wales.gov.uk/docs/dcells/publications/140106-consultation-on-standards-relating-to-the-welsh-language-en.pdf

current system of Welsh Language Schemes. The Welsh Language Commissioner is expected to introduce further standards, focussing on other public bodies and organisations, including further education colleges. Colleges will need to consider the implications of these developments when planning programmes in the future.

7.17 Champions face barriers when trying to encourage student demand for Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. Some colleges report that the internal surveys to measure demand and interviews with Welsh-speaking learners show a lack of interest amongst those with Welsh language skills in attending courses or completing Welsh modules. Some evidence from fieldwork with learners supports these findings. The challenge for Champions is collecting and presenting evidence of the advantages of maintaining Welsh language skills. A suggestion was made to use role models to take part in presentations or activities to promote bilingualism. Consideration should be given to the relevance of other organisations' marketing activities and strategies (e.g. the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol) in the context of Champions' work in the further education sector.

7.18 The 'Welsh Language Skills Needs in Eight Sectors' report, published by the Welsh Government, offers support to colleges in planning and persuading learners of the advantages of Welsh language skills.[31] The report, which is based on a survey of 4,000 employers, provides detailed information about the Welsh language skills needs of employers in eight sectors, both now and in the future. The findings could be useful to colleges as they encourage learners to maintain or improve their Welsh language skills as part of their studies.

---

[31] Welsh Government (April 2014), *Welsh Language Skills Needs in Eight Sectors*
http://wales.gov.uk/statistics-and-research/welsh-language-skills-needs-eight-sectors/?lang=en

> **Recommendation 3: for CollegesWales**
>
> Guidance should be developed for colleges highlighting effective ways of encouraging students to follow part of their courses through the medium of Welsh.

Objective 4: To maintain and improve the Welsh language skills of learners entering the college from Welsh-medium and bilingual schools, who follow English-medium, Welsh-medium or bilingual courses.

7.19 Colleges have made efforts to maintain and improve students' linguistic skills. However, until now it has not been possible to measure the effectiveness of these efforts in relation to this Objective, mainly because colleges use various methods of collecting and interpreting information on students' linguistic ability. New monitoring processes introduced in 2013 – which mean that colleges must provide information on the highest Welsh language qualification of each student at the end of Year 11, before they start the course – enable institutions to target support towards improving learners' Welsh language skills and measure progress over time.

7.20 The point above regarding targeting appropriate support to learners is an important one. The qualitative evidence collected from learners during this study suggests that they are pleased to have the opportunity to follow part or some of their courses through the medium of Welsh.

> **Recommendation 4: for further education institutions**
>
> Institutions should ensure that there are opportunities available for learners with Welsh language skills to follow some modules or elements of their courses through the medium of Welsh, as a means of maintaining their skills.

Objective 5: To increase the number of college staff able and qualified to assist with portfolio building, assessment and verifying through the medium of Welsh.

Objective 6: To develop staff capacity to enable colleges to expand their learner support both in formal classroom and learning situations and in informal social situations to further develop bilingual language skills and language awareness.

7.21 Objectives 5 and 6 are considered together.

7.22 Some colleges noted that they consider language skills when appointing staff in order to maintain and extend their Welsh-medium provision. This was done for the first time after the appointment of the Bilingual Champions. Institutions are aware that there are opportunities to increase the number of staff who are able to teach courses through the medium of Welsh by recruiting new staff with Welsh language skills in priority areas and subjects where demand is increasing.

7.23 There are varying methods of assessing the need for staff who are able to teach through the medium of Welsh. In some institutions, Welsh language skills form an important part of staffing strategies, which place a particular emphasis on increasing the number of staff with Welsh language skills. Other colleges report that they have been recruiting individual members of staff with Welsh language skills in an *ad hoc* way, in response to specific identified needs. It appears that there is no systematic monitoring of the number of jobs advertised by institutions where the ability to teach in Welsh is essential or desirable.

> **Recommendation 5: for further education institutions**
>
> Colleges should ensure that they consider the need for Welsh language skills when advertising new jobs, taking into consideration the linguistic profile of the colleges' faculties and the Welsh Government's priority areas.

> **Recommendation 6: for CollegesWales**
>
> CollegesWales should disseminate the good practice seen in some colleges in employing staff with Welsh language skills to enable them to provide new Welsh-medium courses.

7.24 The colleges support the tool developed by WJEC on behalf of the Welsh Government, to help practitioners identify their Welsh language skill level; further use of this skills identification tool facilitates the process of identifying gaps (in language skills) and targeting the development of further Welsh language skills.

> **Recommendation 7: for further education institutions**
>
> Colleges should ensure that they make use of the tool to identify Welsh language skills, funded by the Welsh Government, in order to help develop the workforce's skills and meet the strategic priority of developing Welsh-medium provision.

Objective 7: To establish and maintain a college mentoring programme to support college staff that attend formal and informal training, or require additional support to teach through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.

7.25 This review concludes that mentoring programmes can ensure that there is effective support in place in order to help increase the confidence of tutors who have received some training to develop their Welsh language skills. Champions have played an important role in establishing mentoring programmes in the majority of further education institutions. In some cases, the Champions themselves are the ones offering the mentoring support.

7.26 The evidence shows that the mentoring support offered needs to be flexible, and tailored in a way that reflects practitioners' needs. The

mentoring support offered includes helping previous participants of the Sabbatical course to strengthen their new skills and supporting tutors in planning and providing units and modules through the medium of Welsh.

> **Recommendation 8: for further education institutions**
>
> Institutions should, with the support of Sgiliaith, establish and formalise a mentoring programme in order to ensure that there is appropriate support available to enable practitioners to use their Welsh language skills.

Objective 8: To disseminate good practice and provide practical support within the colleges and with other education and training providers in the area, with the aid of Sgiliaith.

7.27 Despite the fact that support for the development of Welsh-medium resources and work plans is available from various sources, it has been reported that a lack of resources can be a problem for some tutors. A method of 'mapping' the resources that are available in different subjects would help Champions and practitioners alike. This process could identify opportunities for institutions to share resources on a national level.

> **Recommendation 9: for CollegesWales**
>
> An exercise should be considered to map the Welsh-medium resources developed and used by colleges, ensuring that there are opportunities to share resources where possible. This mapping process could feed into the process of identifying Welsh-medium resource needs and the Welsh Government's commissioning process.

7.28 Champions and senior managers emphasise the importance of working with other partners who have the specialist knowledge necessary to support the development of Welsh-medium education provision. Some

Champions feel that they are trying to lead on strategic provision planning without sufficient support from local or national key partners. It has been suggested that there could be a role for the Welsh Government, CollegesWales and the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol in ensuring that the further education sector collaborates more effectively with the higher education sector where there are already practitioners with Welsh language skills.

Recommendation 10: for the Welsh Government

The Welsh Government should consider what further support could be offered in order to encourage colleges to market and promote Welsh-medium provision in priority subjects or areas of strategic importance.

Objective 9: Colleges to plan and fund the role of the Bilingual Champion as an inherent part of the college's overall strategies after project funding ceases.

7.29 One of the project's key objectives is that colleges should plan and fund the role of the Bilingual Champion as an integral part of the college's overall strategy once the grant funding comes to an end. The wider financial climate, alongside recent reviews of the funding arrangements in the further education sector, has meant that colleges are not able to plan for the future with certainty. The effect of this on the Bilingual Champions project is that no definite commitment has been made to continue the Champions' work in the majority of colleges. Whilst it is encouraging that the Champions' role has been maintained (and strengthened) in the colleges that took part in the original pilot scheme, the position is uncertain in the colleges who have joined the project more recently. Nevertheless, the fact that college directors and senior managers acknowledge that long-term investment is needed in order to realise the objectives of the project underlines how important it is to support the role.

7.30 Some colleges have invested additional resources to fund additional tutors and mentors or develop materials. However, the level of this additional investment varies, and this means that the support and resources available to Champions vary from one college to the next. This has a direct effect on the Champions' potential to support developments in their colleges.

Recommendation 11: for further education institutions
Colleges should confirm their plans to maintain the Champions' role, including stating how the Champions' functions will be incorporated into the institutions' work on a continuous basis.

The significance of the conclusions in the context of the evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy

7.33 The sections below consider the wider significance of the evidence on the influence of the project in the context of the evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy in its entirety. It addresses the questions presented in Section 1.5 of this report, which links this study with the Evaluation Framework of the wider research programme.

7.34 The following is not an attempt to come to final conclusions about the project's contribution to the aims of the Strategy; the wider research programme will consider this in more detail. Nevertheless, it is appropriate that we put the conclusions of the current study in the context of the research programme and the considerations that will be addressed in the full evaluation of the Strategy.

In what way has the project improved the process of planning provision?

7.35 This review concludes that the Champions' work is a valuable contribution to the efforts to *'improve the process of planning Welsh-medium provision in the post-14 phases of education and training'*, one of the relevant strategic aims of the Welsh Government's Welsh-

medium Education Strategy. The evidence shows that the role of Champions has meant that institutions have formalised the process of planning Welsh-medium provision.

7.36 As the project was rolled out on a college by college basis over eight years, the process of establishing a robust infrastructure for developing Welsh-medium provision is more developed in some colleges than others. There is evidence in the colleges where the Champions have been established since the beginning of the project of their ability to incorporate the work of the Champions as a central part of the colleges' planning processes. Good practice and models have been established through the project, which offer valuable lessons as the Champions' work progresses into the next phase.

Has the project helped to ensure linguistic progression from the statutory education phase into post-16 courses?

7.37 New partnerships are developing between colleges and Welsh-medium schools through the work of the Champions. There is evidence that colleges are targeting the development of Welsh-medium provision in some key vocational areas.

7.38 Despite this, the qualitative evidence collected as part of the review suggests a reticence amongst a cohort of learners who received pre-16 Welsh-medium education to continue with Welsh-medium education in the further education sector. Although some successes have been reported, it does not appear that the project has made a significant difference to the level of demand for Welsh-medium or bilingual further education.

7.39 It is concluded that colleges need to adopt a more strategic approach in order to identify learners with Welsh language skills and improve the way in which Welsh-medium provision, and the advantages of maintaining and developing Welsh language skills, are marketed.

7.40 Champions' ability to develop a good relationship with practitioners/tutors has facilitated the identification of Welsh language training needs. Champions have referred practitioners to Welsh language courses and language awareness courses. In most cases, it appears that this has happened in an *ad hoc* way*,* and not as part of a strategy or based upon clear plans to develop provision in specific subjects or areas. It is perceived that there is room to improve the project's methods of supporting language skills and ensure that the training is purposeful and part of an institutional action plan (see Recommendation 1).

7.41 It was also difficult to draw conclusions on this matter during the review of the Bilingual Champions project's monitoring data. As noted in Section 5.5, a lack of consistency in the data makes it difficult to interpret data on the linguistic ability of further education college practitioners.

What are the main factors that facilitate/impede progress against the outcomes?

7.42 It appears that a clear and strong commitment by senior managers is an important factor behind any progress. The evidence suggests that making the Welsh language and Welsh-medium provision a strategic priority on an institutional level drives forward the development of Welsh-medium provision. Other elements of the research programme will need to consider the importance of strategic leadership in supporting progress towards the Strategy's desired aims and outcomes.

7.43 The main barriers are noted in Section 7.17, including the lack of learner demand for provision, a lack of resources, and uncertainty as regards the funding needed to drive forward developments.

7.44 There are links between the work of the Champions and the Sabbatical Scheme.[32] One of the modules of the Sabbatical Scheme has been developed specifically for the further education sector, and has been planned to meet the needs of practitioners and institutions. It was reported that some Champions identified appropriate tutors to attend the Sabbatical course but it is not clear to what extent the process of encouraging tutors to attend the Sabbatical Scheme is based on strategic planning by the institutions.

7.45 Colleges have contributed towards area partnerships or 14-19 forums that plan provision at a local and regional level. The evidence collected during the course of this study raises further questions about how local authorities and other partners measure the demand for bilingual/Welsh language post-16 education and how they identify gaps in provision. Does the planning process vary across different sectors or education phases? Does the planning across the different sectors respond to demand, or is there an effort being made to plan in a way that encourages demand for Welsh-medium provision? The evidence collected during the course of this study demonstrates that some colleges actively try to encourage greater demand. The assessment of the demand for Welsh-medium education across the different phases of education and training, linguistic continuity and the central support available are essential elements of the full evaluation. Other reports produced as part of this research programme will consider whether the creation of a *'system that responds to public demand'* for Welsh-medium provision is a robust strategic foundation for planning Welsh-medium education across the different phases of education (Welsh-medium Education Strategy, page 4).

---

[32] Welsh Government (January 2014), *Evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy: Review of the Welsh Language Sabatical Scheme for educational practitioners: the experience of practitioners 2011-2012*

7.46 Based on the evidence collected from institution managers and Bilingual Champions, it is very unlikely that the developments seen across the sector would have happened if not for the project. Certainly, the Champions' existence has encouraged developments on a strategic level and in more formal and structured ways.

7.47 In essence, the Champions' main work involves facilitating changes to colleges' planning processes; it is a relatively short-term investment that aims to bring about long-term changes in the way that colleges operate. As seen from the evidence presented in this report, it takes time for progress or impacts to manifest themselves after a new role is created in large institutions such as further education colleges.

7.48 We will return to the observations and questions raised in the sections above in subsequent elements of the research programme.

Annex A: Bilingual Champions study topic guide

> **PURPOSE OF THE INTERVIEW**
> - Understand the nature of the Bilingual Champion's role in the college and the background of bilingual and Welsh-medium provision in the institution
> - Collect any monitoring information or data at an institutional level
> - Get to grips with the scheme and understand how provision is planned; the role of partnerships; the capacity of staff; Welsh ethos and sustainability
> - Arrange further interviews (tutors, senior managers, students) where appropriate.

A. INTRODUCTION

> **PURPOSE**
>
> Introduce the research and allow the respondents to introduce themselves

Arad:
- Thank the respondent for taking part in the research, and introduce Arad
- Explain the purpose of the research:
    Arad has been commissioned by the Welsh Government to evaluate the Bilingual Champions project. The intention of the work is to consider the influence of the Bilingual Champions in relation to increasing Welsh-medium and bilingual provision in Further Education and providing specific recommendations. The project is part of a wider evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy.
- Reassure about confidentiality, share Arad's contact details.

Champion
- Ask about the role of the Champion (how long have they been in post, main responsibilities, position within the college etc.)

B. THE BACKGROUND OF THE SCHEME AND THE BACKGROUND OF BILINGUAL / WELSH-MEDIUM PROVISION IN THE INSTITUTION

1. What is the background of the scheme in the college and how much history does it have of providing Welsh-medium/bilingual provision previously?
2. What are your successes so far?
3. How would you measure the scheme's success in the longer term?
4. What is monitored, how, by whom?

C. DETAILED QUESTIONS, BY THEME

THEME 1: PLANNING PROVISION AND ORGANISATION
5. Comments / conclusions on the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats with regard to:
    - i) Introducing new provision (whether Welsh-medium and bilingual provision and/or developing communication skills)
    - ii) Marketing and raising awareness of opportunities amongst learners and others

       iii)   Developing the ethos

THEME 2: THE ROLE OF PARTNERSHIPS IN PLANNING
6.   Who are your main partners within and outside the College?
7.   Comments / conclusions on the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats with regard to internal and external partnerships / networks (e.g. with the Government; or with other bodies, 14-19 forums, schools, other providers).

THEME 3: DEVELOPING THE WORKFORCE / STAFF CAPACITY
8.   Comments / conclusions on the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats with regard to:
    i)   Understanding and developing staff capacity
    ii)   Training requirements

THEME 4: CREATING A SUPPORTIVE ENVIRONMENT
9.   Comments / conclusions on the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats with regard to:
    i)   Creating a Welsh ethos
    ii)   The confidence of young people and their parents in relation to choosing Welsh-medium provision
    iii)   The use of the language outside the classroom

THEME 5: SUSTAINABILITY
10.   Comments / conclusions on the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats with regard to:
    i)   The sustainability of the capacity developed
    ii)   The sustainability of any changes to the profile of the Welsh language within the institution

D: Closing comments

11.   What contribution has the scheme made towards realising the vision and targets of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy? E.g. with regard to improving post-14 planning; ensuring a variety of opportunities; linguistic progression (from the statutory phase to the post-16 and post-19 phase)
12.   What are the main lessons learned and what should be considered when looking towards the future?
13.   What will you as an institution do next to promote bilingualism?
14.   If not already answered, what are the activities / progress against the Scheme's objectives?

Thanks and end interview

THEME 1: PLANNING PROVISION AND ORGANISATION

Scope of the theme: General comments / conclusions on progress with regard to: (i) introducing new provision, whether Welsh-medium and bilingual provision or communication skills; (ii) marketing and raising awareness of opportunities amongst learners and others; (iii) developing the ethos

STRENGTHS	15.	What is your impression of how successful the Bilingual Champions scheme has been with regard to developing and increasing Welsh-medium and bilingual provision so far?
	16.	How have you prioritised the different elements of the role of Champion (developing staff capacity; marketing; increasing provision; developing a Welsh ethos etc.) For example has your college tried to target the development of provision in specific fields?
	17.	What work has been done / is underway with regard to developing bilingual communication skills?
	18.	What work have you done to market / raise learner awareness of opportunities to follow courses or modules through the medium of Welsh? Has this work been successful?
WEAKNESSES	19.	What barriers have you come across in promoting bilingualism in the college? How have you / do you intend to respond to these barriers?
	20.	What barriers have you faced in trying to respond to demand from students? When working with the management team / working with tutors?
	21.	Are there gaps in specific subject areas that you are keen to fill? If there are, in what subjects areas do they occur?
OPPORTUNITIES	22.	Are you aware of specific subjects / areas where there is learner demand for bilingual provision, but no capacity to meet that demand?
	23.	Have you shared good practice with other colleges?
	24.	Have there been other developments due to your role? (e.g. new methods of working / materials.) If there have, please give examples.
THREATS	25.	Have there been any negative side effects to trying to increase provision? (e.g. recruiting and retaining staff)

THEME 1b: THE ROLE OF PARTNERSHIPS IN PLANNING

Scope of the theme: To include partnerships / internal networks within the college and external partnerships (e.g. with other bodies, schools and providers)

STRENGTHS	26.	(National level) Do the Welsh Government management arrangements support the project effectively? What are the advantages / disadvantages of this for the Scheme? What about the support from CollegesWales / Sgiliaith?
	27.	(Regional and local level) Who are your key partners in your role as Bilingual Champion? (i), within the college and (ii), outside the college – schools, 14-19 Network, the County, consortia etc.) How were these partnerships set up? What was your role?
	28.	Do you have any examples of successful partnerships / collaboration that you have contributed to as Bilingual Champions? Are these new partnerships / have they changed since the role of Champion was established?
	29.	What have these partnerships achieved?
	30.	What is the nature of the collaboration with Sgiliaith?
WEAKNESSES	31.	Are there obvious gaps with regard to possible partnerships?
	32.	Have there been any efforts to establish partnerships that have not (as yet) come to fruition? If there have, what are the reasons for this in your opinion?
	33.	What difficulties have you encountered in trying to collaborate with key individuals, academic departments, schools or external bodies to meet the scheme's objectives?
OPPORTUNITIES	34.	In your opinion, what other bodies / movements / departments within the college should be contributing towards increasing provision? How could this be enabled to happen? (What about the marketing and human resources departments?)
	35.	How have you maintained contact and shared information across the partnerships? Are there opportunities to improve this?
	36.	How much do the providers share good practice / offer support?
THREATS	37.	Are there any factors that are likely to impede the college's ability to work in partnership with other institutions in the future? Are there any ways of solving / overcoming these barriers?

THEME 2: DEVELOPING THE WORKFORCE / STAFF CAPACITY

Scope of the theme: General comments / conclusions on progress with regard to: (i) staff capacity (ii) training requirements

STRENGTHS	38.	How successful has the scheme been with regard to developing capacity amongst college staff to provide Welsh-medium and bilingual courses?
	39.	How have you prioritised efforts to develop staff capacity? Have you / the college tried to target the development of capacity in specific fields?
	40.	What work has been done to market / raise awareness amongst colleagues? e.g. of opportunities to take part in courses such as the Sabbatical Course or other modules through the medium of Welsh? Has this work been successful?
	41.	(RESOURCES) What is the process with regard to buying Welsh-medium / bilingual resources in your institution? What departments / subjects use / purchase Welsh-medium and bilingual resources? Does the college have a process for ordering resources / identifying demand?
		There are more questions about resources for tutors, including – What resources have had a positive reaction from departments/students? Are there specific resources that are not available at the moment?
WEAKNESSES	42.	What barriers have you come across in trying to increase the capacity of college staff to teach bilingually or through the medium of Welsh? How have you / could you respond to these barriers?
	43.	What barriers have you faced in dealing with (i) resources (ii) assessment and verification (iii) examination boards etc.
	44.	Are there gaps in specific subject areas that you are keen to fill? If there are, in what subjects areas do they occur
OPPORTUNITIES	45.	What is your understanding of staff's Welsh language skills? Do you monitor this?
	46.	Is there a mentoring programme to support college staff who are undertaking formal and informal training, or who need additional support in order to teach bilingually or through the medium of Welsh?
	47.	Are you aware of specific subjects / areas where there is learner demand for bilingual provision, but no capacity to meet that demand?
OTHER	48.	Could we speak to tutors / departments?

THEME 3: CREATING A SUPPORTIVE ENVIRONMENT

Scope of the theme: General comments / conclusions about progress with regard to: (i) creating a Welsh ethos (ii) the confidence of young people and parents in choosing Welsh-medium provision (iii) the use of Welsh outside of classroom

STRENGTHS	49.	How have you developed a Welsh ethos? How successful has the scheme been with regard to developing a Welsh ethos?
	50.	How does your work fit in with the college's other strategies / plans more widely?
	51.	Has the scheme so far contributed to improving the quality of Welsh-medium / bilingual provision (where it builds upon some existing provision); how can it do so in the future?

WEAKNESSES	52. What barriers have you come across in trying to (i) create a Welsh ethos (ii) communicate the advantages of bilingual / Welsh-medium provision to students and parents?
OPPORTUNITIES	53. How do your plans meet the requirements made in the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009 to offer viable Welsh-medium learning pathways to young people? 54. Are students offered informal learning opportunities and/or social situations where there are opportunities for them to practice their Welsh? 55. What student recruitment / marketing mechanisms work well at a local level? Have you tried other mechanisms that have not worked as well?
THREATS	56. Are there any other activities that you would like to provide; if so, what are they and why can they not be provided?

THEME 4: SUSTAINABILITY

Scope of the theme: The sustainability of the capacity developed; funding; the colleges' strategic plans and changes to the profile of the Welsh language within the institution.

STRENGTHS	57. How sustainable / embedded are the developments introduced to far / what approaches are intended in order to ensure they remain sustainable and embedded? 58. Has the profile of bilingual / Welsh-medium provision changed over the duration of the Scheme? In what way? Do you have any examples to support this? Has the ethos of the college changed at all? Are there new resources / tools (e.g. marketing materials; web pages; databases; learning resources) 59. Does the project represent value for money in your opinion? 60. Has the college contributed money / resources / staff time in addition to the funds that comes from the Government? Would the college have funded anything more in the absence of Welsh Government funding?
WEAKNESSES	61. Are there any examples where additional capacity or provision has been developed but is not being implemented or is not being continued? 62. Any examples where supply and demand do not correspond?
OPPORTUNITIES	63. How does the Government's funding mechanism influence your role and strategic / long-term planning? 64. Could the college apply to any other funding sources or funds in order to strengthen Welsh language education? 65. Has the college made any such applications? What could enable that to happen? 66. Are there plans afoot to further embed the work of the Champions? If so, what are they?

THREATS	67. Is the level of grant (and therefore the staffing level) sufficient to meet the needs of the scheme? (If not, what else is needed and why is this not already in place, e.g. a lack of funding, a lack of internal recruitment, difficulties in recruiting.) 68. How much of the Bilingual Champions' work is likely to be continued in the absence of specific funds to support the initiative? 69. During the pilot evaluation, we heard that Welsh-medium provision sometimes has to compete with other strategic priorities within colleges. Is this true in your college? 70. Are there tensions between the different priorities and if so, how could this situation be dealt with?

Annex B: List of individuals who contributed to the study

Yale College
Bilingual Champion
Public Services Tutor
Teaching and Learning Manager
Group of 6 Baccalaureate pupils
Group of 6 pupils from Ysgol Morgan Llwyd
Coleg Sir Gâr
Bilingual Champion
Assistant Principal
Group of 3 tutors Music (x2); Sport;
Group of 5 pupils Sport, Development, Training and Fitness
Ystrad Mynach College
Bilingual Champion
Coleg Menai
Bilingual Champion / Bilingualism Director
Senior Director of Academic Services
Group of 7 tutors Engineering and Construction; Music, Sport and Public Services
Group of 8 pupils 4 x Outdoor Adventure L3; 3 x L2 Engineering (there for the day from Ysgol Bodedern) 1 x L2 Music
Coleg Llandrillo
Bilingual Champion
Powys College
Bilingual Champion / Bilingualism Director
Pembrokeshire College
Bilingual Champion
Welsh Language Officer
Quality Director
Deputy Principal
Coleg Llysfasi
Bilingual Champion
Welsh, Bilingual and Community Education Manager
Cardiff and Vale College /WEA/YMCA
Bilingual Champion
Tutor
Group of 2 L1 hair students
Coleg Gwent
Bilingual Champion
Tutor
Bridgend College
Bilingual Champion
NPTC Group
Bilingual Champion
Curriculum Director
Coleg Ceredigion
Bilingual Champion
Director
Group of 6 students

4 x carpentry and 2 x hair and beauty

TELEPHONE CONVERSATION WITH THE LATEST CHAMPIONS

Coleg Morgannwg (Coleg y Cymoedd)
Bilingual Champion
Gower College Swansea
Bilingual Champion
St David's College
Bilingual Champion

INTERVIEWS WITH STAKEHOLDERS

CollegesWales
Bilingualism Director
Office of the Welsh Language Commissioner
Senior Policy and Compliance Officer
Welsh Government
2 x Welsh in Education Unit Officers

Annex C: Grants to Further Education institutions to support the Bilingual Champions project (2006/07 to 2016/17)

	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17
Colleges											
Deeside College (Coleg Cambria)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			
Coleg Llandrillo (Grŵp Llandrillo Menai)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			
Coleg Sir Gâr	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			
Neath Port Talbot College	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			
Coleg Ceredigion						X	X	X	X		
Coleg Glan Hafren / Barry College (Cardiff and Vale College)						X	X	X	X		
Coleg Gwent						X	X	X	X		
Yale College (Coleg Cambria)						X	X	X	X		
Coleg Menai (Grŵp Llandrillo Menai)							X	X	X	X	
Powys College (NPTC Group)							X	X	X	X	
Pembrokeshire College							X	X	X	X	
Bridgend College							X	X	X	X	
Ystrad Mynach College (Coleg y Cymoedd)							X	X	X	X	
Glamorgan College (Coleg y Cymoedd)								X	X	X	X
The College Merthyr Tydfil								X	X	X	X
Gower College Swansea								X	X	X	X
St David's College, Cardiff								X	X	X	X

Source: Welsh Government