Estimation of the labour market returns to qualifications gained in English Further Education: Technical Annex

Contents

List of Tables

1. Creation of ILR-WPLS dataset

In the accompanying BIS Research Paper No. XX, we update the findings from Buscha and Urwin (2013), estimating separately the (i) earnings, (ii) employment probability and (iii) probability of being on active benefits, for those who achieve their highest learning aim whilst studying at an English Further Education Institution (FEI), relative to those who have the same highest learning aim, but do not achieve. This approach to estimation is made possible by the construction of a database linking administrative FE learner information, with benefit and PAYE employment histories. In this first section of the Technical Annex we describe, in more detail, construction of the ILR-WPLS dataset (also see Bibby et al., 2012) and some limitations of the data. In the main body of the report we have already mentioned two key data issues that limit our ability to identify full-time workers and those transitioning to HE. The issues discussed here are considered less problematic for estimation, but are worthy of consideration.

The first step in compiling the data for analysis is the creation of a unique identifier linking an individual's records across the constituent databases and data files. Each constituent data source has its own unique individual identifier which may not be internally unique, and which (before transfer to the project team) may incorrectly ascribe records to the same individual; and conversely not match records correctly to the same individual. We use the 3 identifiers from the ILR, National Benefits Database (CCORCID) and the HMRC person-instance-ID (PID) to construct an over-arching Person-key to link records in the data sources reliably to the same individual.

The identification of distinct ILR learners starts to take place where there is at least one other referencing identifier – here CCORCID and PID (noting that not all individuals have both of these records). We use the three identifiers in a process of 'record chaining' to show the relationships between them, accepting that we have insufficient information to indubitably decide which linkages are correct and which are not. As a consequence, we develop a set of procedures to arbitrate between competing matching possibilities according to circumstances, but without rejecting the possibility of the same individual having more than one CCORCID or PID. These procedures lead to the creation of our Person-Key, which identifies the same individual in the various data sources within our database.

This results in just over 25 million Person-Keys, which reduce to almost 22 million once individuals found only in European Social Fund (ESF) and Adult and Community Learning (ACL) ILR files are disregarded for analysis. Of this latter total, some 0.5 million Person-Keys (2.5%) are associated with more than one PID (and a few with more than one CCORCID). A majority of Person-Keys do not have a CCORCID and although this will be associated with younger FE learners not having been in receipt of benefits when first matched (and never being matched subsequently), some of the absent matches will be related to under-matching as a result of the fields used in the matching routines.

We have confidence that the majority of matches in our database are secure, but there remain undoubted questions over a small minority. For example, just over 30% of Person-Keys do not have either a CCORCID or PID between 2002 and 2012. The vast majority of these will be (predominantly younger) individuals who have an ILR learning spell, but no earnings or benefit records as yet. However, there is no way of distinguish learners under-

matched to WPLS from those who are genuinely not contained within it, and in addition we have no information which would tell us how many duplicate sets of ILR identifiers still remain amongst this group. Omission of unmatched learners from our analysis would happen anyway, as they have no earnings or employment observations. However, if a minority of this group are essentially 'missing' earnings observations, this could bring in an element of sample selection bias. However, the extent to which this impacts any estimates depends on the (unobservable) distribution of missing observations across treated and control groups. We would argue that the use of an achiever V non-achiever framework makes this less of a problem, as both our treatment and control groups select into treatment and, if anything, we would expect a higher proportion of these missing (likely lower) earners to be amongst the non-achievers. If anything their exclusion implies a downward bias in our estimates. A similar argument applies when we consider the fact that our data do not include all workers with income below the tax threshold (the fact that we do not capture returns of the self-employed is a limitation of most studies in this area of academic study).

The construction of Person-Keys within the database allows us to group overlapping and adjacent learning aims, and to do the same for periods of employment and benefit spells. This makes possible an analysis of any of the 3 activities individually and collectively between any two dates or for any specified time period. From the ILR component, we identify the highest level of study within a learner's aims (if there was more than one) undertaken within a single learning spell (of which there could be more than one), together with its characteristics (such as length of the aim and whether the aim was completed or achieved); creating almost 29 million learning spells (55% at NQF Level 2 or above) for nearly 22 million Person-Keys. From the WPLS component, we create analogous spells for benefit periods, primarily to identify continuous periods (spans) when individuals are in receipt of 'Active' benefits. Partially overlapping periods of JSA, JTA and ESA could extend a continuous Active Benefit span but, unlike learning spells, breaks of more than one day in a continuous spell are treated as a separate benefit span.

Benefit start and end dates are not measured to the day: regular scans of the databases are taken so the accuracy of these dates depends on the frequency of the scans. JSA scans, for example, are taken every 14 days. The employment spells we have created (from P45 data) should be accurate to the day – since employers should in principle know when an employee begins and finishes a period of PAYE employment. However, 34% of spells appear to have start or end dates that are missing or have been assigned an HMRC default.

The data and information available for the project are not sufficient to permit unambiguous procedures to replace missing or default data so that we can calculate the length of employment spells. The volume of default data is such that we necessarily create an extensive decision rule process to, firstly, establish the possible range of start and end dates and, secondly, develop a structure to assign specific dates within the ranges. The proportion of learners with imputed start or end dates varies over the 8 years for which we have P45 data, and between the two illustrative dates in the year we choose to interpret what our imputation processes has achieved. The rate for all but the latest three years (tax years 2010, 2011 and 2012) is generally between 3.5% and 5%, and higher in April at the start of the tax year. We observe that rates are higher in April 2008 (9.5%) and January 2009 (7%) following an HMRC reconciliation of P45 and P14 systems during 2008/9.

Clearly there are likely problems that arise from this process of imputation when considering employment spell length, but again the question is whether this is likely to differentially impact treated and control, in ways that we cannot accommodate. The omission of start or end dates in P45 returns is a result of employer behaviour, not the individual. It is quite possible that such employer behaviours are correlated with job characteristics (firm size and sector subject area for example), but it would seem reasonable to suggest that our controls for sector subject area, prior sustained employment and a number of other characteristics should counter this. If we still believe that the distribution of imputed employment spells is not spread evenly across treated and control, then our controlling for prior earnings and employment trends in the diff-in-diff framework should further accommodate this. Readers should refer to Bibby et. al. (2012) for more detail of the process of data matching and manipulation and also see the Appendix of the main report for a Table of descriptive statistics.

Finally, our categories of qualification are as follows:

- In the *Full level 2* category we include all highest aims that are equivalent to 5 GCSEs at grade A* to C (including apprenticeship qualifications)
- In the *Full level 3* category we include all highest aims that are equivalent to two A levels (including apprenticeship qualifications)
- *Level 2* and *Level 3* include learners with highest aims at these levels of study, but which fall below the equivalence required to be considered 'Full'.
- *Level 4+* and *Below Level 2* are self-explanatory.

These '*Level of study'* categories are based on <u>all</u> aims undertaken by a learner within a spell (not just their single highest aim). For instance, an individual undertaking 5 GCSEs (and nothing else) will be categorised as '*Full Level 2*' even though the single highest aim would only be worth 20% of the Level 2 threshold. NVQs will always figure in our Full categories, as will the majority of BTECs, whereas RSA and City & Guilds qualifications could fit into either *Full* or *Other* depending on the level of commitment required of the learner.

2. Tables with Standard Errors

This second section of the Technical Annex sets out all Tables from the main report, with all Tables of regression results presented with Standard Errors.

Table 1: Example of treatment (achievers) and control (non-achievers)

Highest Aim	Highest level of Achievement						
	Null	Below L2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2							
Level 2							
Full Level 2		X				Z	
Level 3							
Full Level 3							
Level 4+							

Table 2: Impact of enhancements to basic regression approach: the example of employment probability and earnings premiums for FL2 achievers V non-achievers

	Column A: Old estimate (basic controls)	Column B: New estimate (basic controls)	New estimate (basic controls +IMD)	New estimate (basic controls +IMD+SSA)	New estimate (basic controls +IMD+SSA +Benefit Hist.)	Column C: New estimate (basic controls+IMD +SSA+Benefit and Employment Hist.)
Employment after 3 months	0.087	0.052	0.052	0.052	0.049	0.023
Earnings after one year	0.185	0.174	0.173	0.166	0.149	0.143

Table 3: Daily earnings premium of achievers relative to non-achievers

	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.021***	0.020***	0.016***	0.020***	0.019
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 2	0.004*	0.007**	0.013***	0.020***	0.013
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Full Level 2	0.143***	0.118***	0.114***	0.107***	0.113
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 3	-0.005*	0.005	0.038***	0.057***	0.033
	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Full Level 3	0.063***	0.052***	0.086***	0.118***	0.085
	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.002)	
Level 4+	0.089***	0.088***	0.086***	0.077***	0.084
	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.004)	

Table 4: Raw average daily earnings in year after the end of learning spell

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement						
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2	40.56	44.18					
Level 2	44.39	37.34	42.76				
Full Level 2	33.52	27.66	29.11	39.78			
Level 3	43.37	34.88	37.45	29.53	45.33		
Full Level 3	32.76	28.52	27.81	28.53	26.16	31.43	
Level 4+	50.10	45.43	44.01	42.44	43.43	35.39	52.27

Table 5: Estimated employment probability premium for achievers over non-achievers

	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					
Achievement	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.0007*	0.003***	0.003***	0.003***	0.002***	0.003
	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0004)	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	
Level 2	0.006***	0.009***	0.010***	0.009***	0.009***	0.009
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Full Level 2	0.023***	0.018***	0.015***	0.017***	0.014***	0.015
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Level 3	0.011***	0.010***	0.011***	0.016***	0.015***	0.014
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Full Level 3	0.048***	0.043***	0.038***	0.043***	0.033***	0.038

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					3-5 year average
	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Level 4+	0.012***	0.011***	0.012***	0.011***	0.011***	0.011
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	

*** significant at the 0.1% level; ** 1% and * 5%

Table 6: Raw employment probabilities one year after spell end date

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement						
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2	0.37	0.41					
Level 2	0.50	0.44	0.54				
Full Level 2	0.59	0.51	0.54	0.68			
Level 3	0.57	0.53	0.56	0.64	0.63		
Full Level 3	0.61	0.59	0.59	0.67	0.57	0.69	
Level 4+	0.71	0.72	0.75	0.78	0.74	0.77	0.76

Table 7: Estimated probability of Achievers being on *Active Benefits*, compared to non-achievers

Achievement	Percentage Point Probability of Achievers V Non-achievers being on Active Benefits					3-5 year average
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	
Below Level 2	0.009***	0.0003	-0.003***	-0.002***	-0.003***	-0.003
	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0004)	
Level 2	0.005***	-0.003***	-0.005***	-0.006***	-0.006***	-0.006
	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0005)	
Full Level 2	-0.025***	-0.027***	-0.022***	-0.022***	-0.020***	-0.021
	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0005)	(0.0006)	(0.0008)	
Level 3	-0.003***	-0.010***	-0.010***	-0.008***	-0.008***	-0.009
	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	(0.0006)	
Full Level 3	-0.026***	-0.032***	-0.021***	-0.016***	-0.016***	-0.018
	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	(0.0006)	(0.0007)	(0.0008)	
Level 4+	-0.005***	-0.010***	-0.008***	-0.008***	-0.009***	-0.008
	(0.0007)	(0.0007)	(0.0008)	(0.0009)	(0.0009)	

*** significant at the 0.1% level; ** 1% and * 5%

Table 8: Raw proportions on *Active Benefits* one year after the end of learning spell

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement						
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement						
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2	0.07	0.05					
Level 2	0.06	0.09	0.05				
Full Level 2	0.10	0.17	0.13	0.05			
Level 3	0.04	0.08	0.06	0.12	0.03		
Full Level 3	0.06	0.08	0.08	0.11	0.07	0.03	
Level 4+	0.04	0.05	0.04	0.05	0.04	0.05	0.02

Table 9: Daily earnings premium of female achievers relative to non-achievers

Achievement	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	-0.0002	0.0008	-0.005	0.002	-0.001
	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Level 2	-0.004	-0.006*	0.003	0.010**	-0.004
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Full Level 2	0.120***	0.097***	0.097***	0.087***	0.094
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)	
Level 3	-0.033***	-0.015***	0.025***	0.048***	0.019
	(0.003)	(0.04)	(0.004)	(0.004)	
Full Level 3	0.045***	0.040***	0.090***	0.122***	0.084
	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.004)	
Level 4+	0.084***	0.079***	0.075***	0.063***	0.072
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	

Table 10: Daily earnings premium of male achievers relative to non-achievers

Achievement	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.048***	0.046***	0.046***	0.046***	0.046
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Level 2	0.022***	0.028***	0.030***	0.038***	0.032
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	
Full Level 2	0.161***	0.135***	0.129***	0.125***	0.130
	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.004)	
Level 3	0.028***	0.026***	0.050***	0.063***	0.046
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.004)	
Full Level 3	0.088***	0.068***	0.080***	0.113***	0.087
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.005)	
Level 4+	0.092***	0.098***	0.100***	0.095***	0.098
	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.007)	

Table 11: Raw average daily earnings one year after the end of learning spell for women

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement						
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2	35.60	36.33					
Level 2	38.40	33.58	36.84				
Full Level 2	27.83	24.19	25.69	30.60			
Level 3	37.69	31.82	33.97	25.36	37.87		
Full Level 3	29.49	26.75	26.20	25.85	24.54	27.26	
Level 4+	46.04	41.87	40.93	39.23	40.16	34.95	47.74

Table 12: Raw average daily earnings one year after the end of learning spell for men

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement						
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2	46.69	53.17					
Level 2	52.53	42.86	52.21				
Full Level 2	38.85	30.39	32.70	47.21			
Level 3	50.42	39.64	42.81	32.82	54.86		
Full Level 3	37.08	31.01	29.91	31.64	28.03	37.72	
Level 4+	55.00	50.93	49.44	46.60	48.45	36.01	59.53

Table 13: Estimated employment probability premium for female achievers over non-achievers

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.001** (0.0004)	0.003*** (0.0005)	0.004*** (0.0006)	0.004*** (0.0006)	0.003*** (0.0006)	0.004
Level 2	0.007*** (0.001)	0.009*** (0.001)	0.011*** (0.001)	0.010*** (0.001)	0.010*** (0.001)	0.010
Full Level 2	0.027*** (0.001)	0.025*** (0.001)	0.026*** (0.001)	0.026*** (0.001)	0.025*** (0.001)	0.026
Level 3	0.010*** (0.001)	0.009*** (0.001)	0.012*** (0.001)	0.018*** (0.001)	0.017*** (0.001)	0.016
Full Level 3	0.048*** (0.001)	0.046*** (0.001)	0.041*** (0.001)	0.049*** (0.001)	0.040*** (0.001)	0.043
Level 4+	0.011*** (0.001)	0.012*** (0.001)	0.013*** (0.002)	0.011*** (0.002)	0.011*** (0.002)	0.012

*** significant at the 0.1% level; ** 1% and * 5%

Table 14: Estimated employment probability premium for male achievers over non-achievers

| Achievement | Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End | | | | | |
	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.0003	0.003***	0.002**	0.001	0.0002	0.001
	(0.0004)	(0.0005)	(0.0006)	(0.0007)	(0.0008)	
Level 2	0.006***	0.009***	0.008***	0.007***	0.008***	0.008
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Full Level 2	0.020***	0.011***	0.005***	0.007***	0.002*	0.005
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Level 3	0.013***	0.011***	0.009***	0.011***	0.010***	0.010
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Full Level 3	0.050***	0.042***	0.035***	0.036***	0.025***	0.032
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Level 4+	0.015***	0.011***	0.011***	0.012***	0.011***	0.011
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	

Table 15: Raw employment probabilities one year after spell end date for women

| Spell Participation | Spell Achievement | | | | | | |
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2	0.38	0.40					
Level 2	0.51	0.47	0.55				
Full Level 2	0.59	0.50	0.55	0.70			
Level 3	0.56	0.55	0.57	0.65	0.62		
Full Level 3	0.62	0.59	0.61	0.68	0.59	0.71	
Level 4+	0.71	0.73	0.76	0.79	0.74	0.78	0.77

Table 16: Raw employment probabilities one year after spell end date for men

| Spell Participation | Spell Achievement | | | | | | |
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2	0.36	0.42					
Level 2	0.49	0.41	0.51				
Full Level 2	0.59	0.52	0.53	0.66			
Level 3	0.58	0.51	0.54	0.63	0.64		
Full Level 3	0.60	0.58	0.57	0.67	0.56	0.67	
Level 4+	0.70	0.72	0.75	0.78	0.74	0.76	0.75

Table 17: Daily earnings premium of 19-24 year old achievers relative to non-achievers

	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.042***	0.053***	0.047***	0.056***	0.052
	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.007)	
Level 2	0.026***	0.043***	0.049***	0.064***	0.052
	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.006)	
Full Level 2	0.161***	0.126***	0.098***	0.088***	0.104
	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.006)	
Level 3	-0.035***	0.010	0.071***	0.099***	0.060
	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.007)	
Full Level 3	0.068***	0.083***	0.100***	0.122***	0.102
	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.007)	
Level 4+	0.100***	0.113***	0.124***	0.106***	0.114
	(0.007)	(0.008)	(0.009)	(0.009)	

Table 18: Daily earnings premium of 25+ year old achievers relative to non-achievers

	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.017***	0.017***	0.012***	0.014***	0.014
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 2	0.005*	0.005*	0.008***	0.011***	0.008
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	
Full Level 2	0.107***	0.085***	0.083***	0.076***	0.081
	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)	
Level 3	0.007***	0.016***	0.032***	0.040***	0.029
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Full Level 3	0.085***	0.087***	0.098***	0.102***	0.096
	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.006)	
Level 4+	0.075***	0.071***	0.066***	0.060***	0.066
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.005)	

Table 19: Estimated employment probability premium of 19-24 year old achievers relative to non-achievers

	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					
Achievement	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.0002	0.003**	0.003**	0.003**	0.003	0.003
	(0.0009)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	
Level 2	0.012***	0.014***	0.017***	0.016***	0.016***	0.016
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	

16

| Achievement | Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End | | | | | |
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Full Level 2	0.016***	0.005***	0.0003	0.002	0.004*	0.002
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 3	0.008***	0.005**	0.015***	0.021***	0.025***	0.020
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Full Level 3	0.027***	0.011***	0.009***	0.013***	0.017***	0.013
	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 4+	0.010***	0.006*	0.008**	0.010**	0.012***	0.010
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	

Table 20: Estimated employment probability premium of 25+ year old achievers relative to non-achievers

| Achievement | Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End | | | | | |
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	-0.0003	0.002***	0.003***	0.004***	0.003***	0.003
	(0.0003)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	
Level 2	0.005***	0.009***	0.010***	0.010***	0.010***	0.010
	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	(0.0006)	(0.0007)	(0.0007)	
Full Level 2	0.014***	0.010***	0.010***	0.014***	0.019***	0.018
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Level 3	0.002**	0.003***	0.005***	0.010***	0.012***	0.009
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Full Level 3	0.017***	0.009***	0.011***	0.020***	0.022***	0.018
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 4+	0.008***	0.009***	0.010***	0.009***	0.008***	0.009
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	

Table 21: Estimated probability of 19-24 year old Achievers being on *Active Benefits*, compared to non-achievers

| Achievement | Percentage Point Probability of Achievers V Non-achievers being on Active Benefits | | | | | |
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.008***	-0.003**	-0.002*	-0.001	0.0001	-0.001
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Level 2	0.003**	-0.003**	-0.006***	-0.004***	-0.007***	-0.006
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Full Level 2	-0.041***	-0.035***	-0.023***	-0.022***	-0.017***	-0.021
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Level 3	-0.013***	-0.017***	-0.011***	-0.008***	-0.008***	-0.009
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Full Level 3	-0.039***	-0.037***	-0.018***	-0.013***	-0.015***	-0.015

Achievement	Percentage Point Probability of Achievers V Non-achievers being on Active Benefits					3-5 year average
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Level 4+	-0.005**	-0.011***	-0.011***	-0.009***	-0.011***	-0.010
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	

*** significant at the 0.1% level; ** 1% and * 5%

Table 22: Estimated probability of 25+ year old Achievers being on *Active Benefits*, compared to non-achievers

Achievement	Percentage Point Probability of Achievers V Non-achievers being on Active Benefits					3-5 year average
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	
Below Level 2	0.009***	0.002***	-0.0008**	-0.0008**	-0.002***	-0.001
	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	
Level 2	0.006***	-0.001**	-0.003***	-0.004***	-0.004***	-0.004
	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	
Full Level 2	-0.021***	-0.021***	-0.014***	-0.012***	-0.009***	-0.012
	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	(0.0006)	(0.0007)	(0.0009)	
Level 3	-0.002***	-0.006***	-0.007***	-0.005***	-0.006***	-0.006
	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	
Full Level 3	-0.020***	-0.020***	-0.011***	-0.009***	-0.009***	-0.010
	(0.0006)	(0.0006)	(0.0007)	(0.0009)	(0.001)	
Level 4+	-0.005***	-0.009***	-0.007***	-0.007***	-0.008***	-0.007
	(0.0007)	(0.0007)	(0.0007)	(0.0007)	(0.0008)	

*** significant at the 0.1% level; ** 1% and * 5%

Table 23: Daily earnings premium for Achievers v Non-achievers in the *Academic* category of learners

Achievement	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				3-5 year average
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	
Level 2	-0.009	-0.005	0.027	0.035*	0.019
	(0.013)	(0.014)	(0.15)	(0.014)	
Full Level 2	0.113***	0.083***	0.154***	0.112***	0.116
	(0.018)	(0.024)	(0.025)	(0.025)	
Level 3	-0.097***	-0.046***	0.063***	0.119***	0.045
	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.061)	(0.006)	
Full Level 3	-0.296***	-0.147***	0.023*	0.135***	0.003
	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.010)	(0.010)	

Table 24: Daily earnings premium for achievers v non-achievers engaged in *Vocational Class-room Based Learning*

	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.017***	0.016***	0.013***	0.017***	0.015
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 2	0.004*	0.006**	0.009***	0.015***	0.010
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	
Full Level 2	0.109***	0.099***	0.114***	0.097***	0.103
	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.007)	
Level 3	0.020***	0.022***	0.030***	0.036***	0.029
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Full Level 3	0.019***	0.020***	0.063***	0.091***	0.058
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	
Level 4+	0.084***	0.086***	0.086***	0.075***	0.082
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.005)	

Table 25: Daily earnings premium for achievers v non-achievers engaged in *Vocational Workplace Based Learning* (excluding apprenticeships)

	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.058***	0.079***	0.080***	0.062***	0.074
	(0.009)	(0.010)	(0.011)	(0.012)	
Level 2	0.030	0.056*	0.042	0.037	0.045
	(0.017)	(0.022)	(0.030)	(0.033)	
Full Level 2	0.130***	0.103***	0.094***	0.092***	0.096
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)	
Full Level 3	0.114***	0.097***	0.085***	0.089***	0.090
	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	
Level 4+	0.094***	0.093***	0.087***	0.082***	0.087
	(0.009)	(0.010)	(0.011)	(0.012)	

Table 26: Estimated employment probability premium for Achievers v Non-achievers in the *Academic* category of learners

	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					
Achievement	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Level 2	0.010***	0.006*	0.008*	0.010**	0.011**	0.010
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.004)	
Full Level 2	-0.012**	-0.015***	-0.025***	-0.021**	-0.026***	-0.024
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.007)	(0.008)	(0.008)	
Level 3	0.005**	0.006**	0.013***	0.027***	0.030***	0.023
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Full Level 3	0.037***	0.032***	0.026***	0.049***	0.048***	0.041
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	

Table 27: Estimated employment probability premium for achievers v non-achievers engaged in *Vocational Class-room Based Learning*

	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					
Achievement	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.0003	0.002***	0.003***	0.003***	0.002***	0.003
	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0004)	(0.0005)	(0.0005)	
Level 2	0.005***	0.008***	0.009***	0.009***	0.008***	0.009
	(0.0004)	(0.0005)	(0.0006)	(0.0006)	(0.0007)	
Full Level 2	0.013***	0.016***	0.016***	0.020***	0.020***	0.019
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 3	0.009***	0.009***	0.008***	0.010***	0.009***	0.009
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Full Level 3	0.052***	0.050***	0.038***	0.040***	0.022***	0.033
	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 4+	0.012***	0.011***	0.012***	0.012***	0.011***	0.012
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	

Table 28: Estimated employment probability premium for achievers v non-achievers engaged in *Vocational Class-room Based Learning* (excluding apprenticeships)

	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					
Achievement	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	3-5 year average
Below Level 2	0.010***	0.017***	0.022***	0.014***	0.015***	0.017
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Level 2	0.024***	0.031***	0.041***	0.011	0.013	0.022
	(0.003)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.009)	(0.011)	
Full Level 2	0.016***	0.007***	0.005***	0.009***	0.011***	0.008
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Level 3	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	
Full Level 3	0.021***	0.015***	0.017***	0.020***	0.021***	0.019
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Level 4+	0.007*	0.004	0.007*	0.008*	0.006	0.007
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.004)	

Table 29: Raw employment probabilities one year after spell end date for '*Academic'* qualification category

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement					
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3
Level 2	0.51	0.49	0.56			
Full Level 2	0.35	0.38	0.38	0.33		
Level 3	0.51	0.49	0.50	0.61	0.59	
Full Level 3	0.49	0.49	0.53	0.63	0.53	0.60

Table 30: Raw employment probabilities one year after spell end date for '*Vocational & Provider'* qualification category

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement						
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2	0.37	0.40					
Level 2	0.50	0.44	0.53				
Full Level 2	0.47	0.45	0.49	0.52			
Level 3	0.60	0.55	0.59	0.64	0.64		
Full Level 3	0.53	0.55	0.57	0.63	0.62	0.66	
Level 4+	0.70	0.72	0.74	0.78	0.74	0.77	0.76

Table 31: Raw employment probabilities one year after spell end date for '*Vocational & WBL'* qualification category (excluding apprenticeships)

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement						
	No achieve	Below Level 2	Level 2	Full Level 2	Level 3	Full Level 3	Level 4+
Below Level 2	0.46	0.52					
Level 2	0.52	0.49	0.61				
Full Level 2	0.70	0.71	0.75	0.74			
Level 3	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a		
Full Level 3	0.75	0.78	0.83	0.77	0.78	0.81	
Level 4+	0.75	0.81	0.85	0.81	0.82	0.81	0.80

Table 32: Estimated daily earnings premium for apprenticeship achievers v non-achievers

Achievement	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Full Level 2 apprent.	0.145***	0.120***	0.109***	0.104***	0.111
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.007)	
Full Level 3 apprent.	0.171***	0.162***	0.147***	0.159***	0.156
	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.008)	

Table 33: Raw average daily earnings in year after the end of apprenticeship learning spell

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement		
	No achieve	Level 2	Level 3
FL 2 apprentice	28.90	34.16	
FL 3 apprentice	34.95	34.97	45.54

Table 34: Estimated employment probability premium for achievers v non-achievers: apprenticeships

	Return to employment probability in time period after spell end					
Achievement	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
FL 2 apprentice	0.027***	0.019***	0.011***	0.008***	-0.001	0.006
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
FL 3 apprentice	0.028***	0.011***	0.005*	0.001	0.001	0.002
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	

Table 35: Raw employment probabilities one year after spell end date for apprenticeships

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement		
	No achieve	Level 2	Level 3
FL 2 apprentice	0.60	0.73	
FL 3 apprentice	0.75	0.81	0.83

Table 36: Estimated probability of achievers being on *Active Benefits* (job-seeking), compared to non-achievers: apprenticeships

	Percentage Point Probability of Achievers V Non-achievers being on Active Benefits					
Achievement	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
FL 2 apprentice	-0.032***	-0.031***	-0.026***	-0.025***	-0.023***	-0.025
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
FL 3 apprentice	-0.026***	-0.022***	-0.017***	-0.020***	-0.019***	-0.019
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	

Table 37: Proportion of apprentices on *Active Benefits* (job-seeking) one year after learning spell ends

Spell Participation	Spell Achievement		
	No achieve	Level 2	Level 3
FL 2 apprentice	0.11	0.06	
FL 3 apprentice	0.05	0.07	0.03

Table 38: All those with Higher Apprenticeship aim, raw average daily earnings in each year after the end of learning (population size in brackets)

Tax year after learning	Spell Achievement		
	No achieve	Full Level 3	Level 4+
1st Year	£43.67	£38.18	£45.01
	(82)	(93)	(716)
2nd Year	£46.07	£38.71	£53.09

Tax year after learning	Spell Achievement		
	No achieve	Full Level 3	Level 4+
3rd Year	(32) £43.73 (8)	(14) £67.75 (2)	(112) £58.76 (12)

Table 39: Returns to daily earnings for L1 and L2 English and Maths achievers [for population of FL 2 and/or FL3 achievers]

	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
FL2 Achievers	0.060*** (0.004)	0.035*** (0.006)	0.048*** (0.007)	0.042*** (0.008)	0.042
FL3 Achievers	-0.002 (0.003)	0.001 (0.004)	0.018*** (0.004)	0.017*** (0.005)	0.012
FL2 or FL3 Achievers	0.021*** (0.003)	0.015*** (0.003)	0.031*** (0.004)	0.027*** (0.004)	0.024

Table 40: Returns to daily earnings for subgroups of L1 and L2 English and Maths achievers [for population of FL 2 achievers]

	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Only Literacy Key Skills	0.029*** (0.007)	0.027** (0.008)	0.040*** (0.009)	0.039*** (0.010)	0.035
Only Numeracy Key Skills	0.018 (0.010)	0.016 (0.014)	0.016 (0.016)	0.018 (0.019)	0.017
Literacy and Numeracy Key Skills	0.060*** (0.008)	0.047*** (0.011)	0.066*** (0.013)	0.066*** (0.015)	0.060
Only Literacy Certificate	0.035*** (0.010)	0.021 (0.016)	0.039 (0.025)	0.001 (0.037)	0.020
Only Numeracy Certificate	0.030* (0.013)	0.024 (0.022)	0.027 (0.033)	0.004 (0.048)	0.018
Literacy and Numeracy Certificate	0.023 (0.017)	0.068* (0.032)	0.094* (0.047)	0.090 (0.070)	0.084

Table 41: Returns to daily earnings for subgroups of L1 and L2 English and Maths achievers [for population of FL 3 achievers]

	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average

| Achievement | Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End | | | | |
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Only Literacy Key Skills	-0.010*	0.012*	0.020**	0.014*	0.015
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	
Only Numeracy Key Skills	-0.006	0.009	0.026***	0.011	0.015
	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.008)	
Literacy and Numeracy Key Skills	0.037***	0.033***	0.044***	0.033***	0.037
	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.008)	
Only Literacy Certificate	-0.011	-0.007	0.015	0.022	0.010
	(0.012)	(0.018)	(0.022)	(0.028)	
Only Numeracy Certificate	-0.049***	0.007	0.055**	0.073**	0.045
	(0.012)	(0.017)	(0.021)	(0.027)	
Literacy and Numeracy Certificate	-0.051*	-0.004	-0.005	0.035	0.009
	(0.022)	(0.033)	(0.043)	(0.057)	

Table 42: Concentrations of Men and Women across Sector Subject Areas, for Full Level 2 (FL2) and Full Level 3 (FL3) qualifications

Sector (derived from SSA)	Proportion of Women FL2	Proportion of Women FL3
Adult Social Care	86%	86%
Construction	1.50%	3.60%
Engineer. & manufacturing	14.40%	4.80%
Inf. & Comm. Technology	48%	19%
Child devel. & wellbeing	97%	96%
Customer Service	62%	70%
Hair & beauty	94%	97%
Hospitality and Catering	58%	62%
Transportation	7%	4%
Business studies	34%	45%

Table 43: Estimated daily earnings premiums for female-dominated Sector Subject Areas

Adult social care

| Achievement | Log Daily Earnings in Tax Year after Spell End | | | | |
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	Average 3-5
Full Level 2	0.185***	0.132***	0.117***	0.099***	0.116
	(0.006)	(0.008)	(0.009)	(0.011)	
Full Level 3	0.130***	0.101***	0.142***	0.173***	0.139
	(0.007)	(0.009)	(0.010)	(0.012)	

Child development and wellbeing

| Achievement | Log Daily Earnings in Tax Year after Spell End | | | | |
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	Average 3-5
Full Level 2	0.059***	0.060***	0.069***	0.058**	0.062

	(0.013)	(0.016)	(0.018)	(0.019)	
Full Level 3	0.135***	0.097***	0.109***	0.115***	0.107
	(0.008)	(0.010)	(0.011)	(0.012)	

Hair and beauty

	Log Daily Earnings in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	Average 3-5
Full Level 2	0.096***	0.098***	0.076***	0.058***	0.077
	(0.011)	(0.012)	(0.014)	(0.015)	
Full Level 3	0.099***	0.087***	0.068**	0.056*	0.070
	(0.017)	(0.019)	(0.023)	(0.024)	

Table 44: Estimated daily earnings premiums for male-dominated Sector Subject Areas

Construction

	Log Daily Earnings in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	Average 3-5
Full Level 2	0.212***	0.178***	0.160***	0.131***	0.156
	(0.007)	(0.009)	(0.011)	(0.013)	
Full Level 3	0.224***	0.165***	0.155***	0.121***	0.147
	(0.014)	(0.017)	(0.020)	(0.023)	

Engineering and manufacturing

	Log Daily Earnings in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	Average 3-5
Full Level 2	0.194***	0.127***	0.117***	0.107***	0.117
	(0.006)	(0.008)	(0.009)	(0.010)	
Full Level 3	0.229***	0.196***	0.148***	0.136***	0.160
	(0.010)	(0.012)	(0.014)	(0.015)	

Transportation

	Log Daily Earnings in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	Average 3-5
Full Level 2	0.150***	0.166***	0.163***	0.169***	0.163
	(0.009)	(0.011)	(0.013)	(0.015)	
Full Level 3	0.239***	0.203***	0.172***	0.202***	0.192
	(0.014)	(0.015)	(0.017)	(0.019)	

Table 45: Estimated daily earnings premiums for Sector Subject Areas that are neither male nor female dominated

Information & Communication Technology

	Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End				
Achievement	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Full Level 2	0.077***	0.116***	0.124***	0.125***	0.122
	(0.006)	(0.009)	(0.012)	(0.017)	
Full Level 3	0.056***	-0.037**	-0.013	0.069***	0.006

| | (0.012) | (0.014) | (0.015) | (0.017) | |

Customer service

| Achievement | Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End | | | | |
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Full Level 2	0.110***	0.093***	0.090***	0.096***	0.093
	(0.005)	(0.007)	(0.008)	(0.010)	
Full Level 3	0.088***	0.085***	0.083***	0.081***	0.083
	(0.009)	(0.011)	(0.013)	(0.015)	

Hospitality and Catering

| Achievement | Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End | | | | |
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Full Level 2	0.121***	0.098***	0.120***	0.108***	0.109
	(0.007)	(0.009)	(0.011)	(0.012)	
Full Level 3	0.093***	0.061***	0.078***	0.069***	0.069
	(0.011)	(0.013)	(0.014)	(0.016)	

Business studies

| Achievement | Percentage Log Daily Earnings Premium in Tax Year after Spell End | | | | |
	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Full Level 2	0.114***	0.086***	0.079***	0.061**	0.075
	(0.008)	(0.011)	(0.015)	(0.022)	
Full Level 3	0.012	-0.015	0.104***	0.199***	0.096
	(0.014)	(0.017)	(0.020)	(0.021)	

Table 46: Estimated employment probability premiums for Sectors Subject Areas dominated by women

Adult social care

| Achievement | Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End | | | | | |
	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	Average 3-5
Full Level 2	0.045***	0.037***	0.034***	0.035***	0.032***	0.033
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Full Level 3	0.046***	0.038***	0.038***	0.048***	0.040***	0.042
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	

Child development and wellbeing

| Achievement | Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End | | | | | |
	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	Average 3-5
Full Level 2	0.026***	0.026***	0.026***	0.027***	0.037***	0.030
	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.006)	
Full Level 3	0.078***	0.073***	0.063***	0.061***	0.053***	0.059
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.004)	

Hair and beauty

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					Average 3-5
	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	
Full Level 2	0.020***	0.021***	0.027***	0.029***	0.020***	0.025
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.005)	
Full Level 3	0.021***	0.024***	0.021**	0.020*	0.012	0.018
	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.008)	(0.009)	

Table 47: Estimated employment probability premiums for male-dominated Sector Subject Areas

Construction

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					Average 3-5
	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	
Full Level 2	0.032***	0.027***	0.022***	0.017***	0.008*	0.016
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.004)	
Full Level 3	0.026***	0.006	-0.007	-0.014*	-0.016*	-0.012
	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.007)	

Engineering and manufacturing

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					Average 3-5
	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	
Full Level 2	0.030***	0.015***	-0.001	-0.004	-0.012***	-0.006
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Full Level 3	0.062***	0.046***	0.032***	0.030***	0.021***	0.028
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.006)	

Transportation

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					Average 3-5
	3mths	1yr	3yr	4yr	5yr	
Full Level 2	0.018***	0.010***	0.019***	0.039***	0.029***	0.029
	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)	
Full Level 3	0.029***	-0.001	-0.005	-0.003	-0.016*	-0.008
	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.008)	

Table 48: Estimated employment probability premiums for Sector Subject Areas that are neither male nor female dominated

Information & Communication Technology

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					3-5 year average
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	
Full Level 2	0.003	0.010***	-0.011**	-0.023***	-0.029***	-0.021
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)	
Full Level 3	0.052***	0.053***	0.031***	0.033***	0.023***	0.029
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	

Customer service

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Full Level 2	0.003**	-0.005**	-0.007**	-0.002	-0.001	-0.003
	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Full Level 3	0.0002	-0.008**	-0.011**	-0.008	-0.005	-0.008
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.005)	

Hospitality and Catering

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Full Level 2	0.033***	0.026***	0.024***	0.025***	0.027***	0.025
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	
Full Level 3	0.038***	0.028***	0.025***	0.023***	0.007	0.018
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.006)	

Business studies

Achievement	Percentage Point Employment probability Premium in Time Period after Spell End					
	3mths	1st Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year	3-5 year average
Full Level 2	0.023***	0.012***	-0.005	-0.010*	-0.017*	-0.011
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.007)	
Full Level 3	0.057***	0.056***	0.053***	0.064***	0.055***	0.057
	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.008)	

Table 49: Subjecting our Regression Estimates to Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)
	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	DiD (PT)	DiD (PGR)	CEM (no earnings)	CEM-DiD PT (no earnings)	CEM-DiD PGR (no earnings)	CEM (earnings)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)	CEM-DiD PGR (earnings)
NVQ2 Men	22.00	14.86	9.31	6.99	14.81	9.43	7.69	10.93	11.59	11.33
N	349309	349309	349309	349309	349309	349309	349309	349309	349309	349309
r2_a	0.014	0.121	0.041	0.008	0.107	0.040	0.007	0.107	0.042	0.008
NVQ2 Women	11.97	11.73	8.85	7.51	12.44	9.18	7.89	9.84	11.36	11.89
N	274114	274114	274114	274114	274114	274114	274114	274114	274114	274114
r2_a	0.005	0.109	0.028	0.009	0.106	0.025	0.006	0.106	0.027	0.007
NVQ3 Men	20.97	14.67	8.23	6.83	16.83	9.34	8.46	13.87	11.32	11.04
N	87035	87035	87035	87035	87035	87035	87035	87035	87035	87035
r2_a	0.016	0.156	0.138	0.031	0.144	0.135	0.027	0.147	0.138	0.029
NVQ3 Women	11.98	13.29	10.39	9.38	13.30	10.69	9.44	12.4	11.68	12.48
N	172305	172305	172305	172305	172305	172305	172305	172305	172305	172305
r2_a	0.005	0.008	0.045	0.012	0.093	0.043	0.009	0.096	0.043	0.010

Table 50: Estimated Earnings Premiums Returns for various Achiever (A) and Non-achiever (NA) comparisons

	NVQ1 NA	NVQ1 A	NVQ2 NA	NVQ2 A	NVQ3 NA	NVQ3 A	NVQ4+ NA	NVQ4+ A
NVQ1 NA	/	/	/	/	/	/	/	/
NVQ1 A	Basic: +12.28% All contr +9.01%	/	/	/	/	/	/	/
NVQ2 NA	Basic: +15.63% All contr +11.13%	Basic: +3.35% All contr +2.51%	/	/	/	/	/	/
NVQ2 A	/	Basic: +28.08% All contr +18.09%	Basic: +24.73% All contr +15.97%	/	/	/	/	/
NVQ3 NA	/	/	Basic: +15.77% All contr +17.23%	Basic: -8.96% All contr +2.40%	/	/	/	/
NVQ3 A	/	/	/	Basic: +4.42% All contr +18.79%	Basic: +13.38% All contr +14.65%	/	/	/
NVQ4+ NA	/	/	/	/	Basic: +40.75% All contr +27.69%	Basic: +27.37% All contr +17.23%	/	/
NVQ4+ A	/	/	/	/	Basic: +34.40% All contr +29.19%	Basic: +7.04% All contr +9.27%	/	/

Table 51: Estimated daily earnings premiums for different cohorts of learners whose highest learning aim is Full Level 2 in the relevant year

	1 year	2 year	3 year	4 year	5 year	6 year		
FL2 (cohort 2005)	15.23	13.7	11.86	11.44	11.69	11.04	Non-Ach.	63310
N obs	88719	85498	80723	80914	81935	84076	Achievers	93334
FL2 (cohort 2006)	16.84	14.4	12.62	13.68	12.51	11.62	Non-Ach.	57852
N obs	100690	94617	94194	95109	97497	95633	Achievers	118240
FL2 (cohort 2007)	16.77	13.4	12.9	11.79	10.39	/	Non-Ach.	58074
N obs	102638	101393	101165	103441	100908	/	Achievers	136253
FL2 (cohort 2008)	15.09	12.67	12.36	11.79	/	/	Non-Ach.	80649
N obs	155688	153376	155516	150949	/	/	Achievers	209731
FL2 (cohort 2009)	16.34	14.53	12.68	/	/	/	Non-Ach.	103371
N obs	235092	237628	229170	/	/	/	Achievers	319300
FL2 (cohort 2010)	13.9	11.16	/	/	/	/	Non-Ach.	107870
N obs	337672	323569	/	/	/	/	Achievers	437347
FL2 (cohort 2011)	11.72	/	/	/	/	/	Non-Ach.	108496
N obs	355474	/	/	/	/	/	Achievers	486706

Table 52: Estimated daily earnings premiums for different cohorts of learners whose highest learning aim is Full Level 3 in the relevant year

	1 year	2 year	3 year	4 year	5 year	6 year		
FL3 (cohort 2005)	1.13	-2.9	3.11	6.66	11.48	12.25	Non-Ach.	46032
N obs	102636	100410	101503	104880	109317	113268	Achievers	126245
FL3 (cohort 2006)	3.71	0.35	3.23	8.84	12.97	12.8	Non-Ach.	45737

	1 year	2 year	3 year	4 year	5 year	6 year		
N obs	125506	121852	127612	135186	140430	138589	Achievers	165950
FL3 (cohort 2007)	2.8	-1.31	4.7	10.94	13.72	/	Non-Ach.	42503
N obs	141437	142321	152473	161197	159407	/	Achievers	206804
FL3 (cohort 2008)	4.17	2.27	7.09	11.8	/	/	Non-Ach.	43956
N obs	148366	149392	158950	157117	/	/	Achievers	231700
FL3 (cohort 2009)	14.12	9.64	12.97	/	/	/	Non-Ach.	50781
N obs	190403	195797	192290	/	/	/	Achievers	271825
FL3 (cohort 2010)	11.79	7.99	/	/	/	/	Non-Ach.	57804
N obs	251856	240828	/	/	/	/	Achievers	342865
FL3 (cohort 2011)	6.25	/	/	/	/	/	Non-Ach.	65186
N obs	261912	/	/	/	/	/	Achievers	379744

Table 53: Estimated daily earnings premiums for different cohorts of learners whose highest learning aim is Level 3 Apprenticeship in the relevant year

	1 year	2 year	3 year	4 year	5 year	6 year		
FL3 Appr. (cohort 2005)	14.78	10.34	14.86	13.94	15.59	16.13	Non-Ach.	46032
N obs	12833	12319	11798	11881	12218	12664	Achievers	126245
FL3 Appr. (cohort 2006)	17.35	14.3	15.62	14.73	15.42	15.89	Non-Ach.	45737
N obs	19596	18679	18658	19324	20005	19823	Achievers	165950
FL3 Appr. (cohort 2007)	16.45	16.97	16.98	17.99	15.05	/	Non-Ach.	42503
N obs	24623	24444	25043	26033	25608	/	Achievers	206804
FL3 Appr. (cohort 2008)	13.24	16.45	14.42	12.91	/	/	Non-Ach.	43956
N obs	29716	29910	31046	30487	/	/	Achievers	231700
FL3 Appr. (cohort 2009)	19.74	15.89	17.76	/	/	/	Non-Ach.	50781
N obs	35559	36639	35735	/	/	/	Achievers	271825
FL3 Appr. (cohort 2010)	16.13	12.59	/	/	/	/	Non-Ach.	57804
N obs	50501	48604	/	/	/	/	Achievers	342865
FL3 Appr. (cohort 2011)	13.74	/	/	/	/	/	Non-Ach.	65186
N obs	57934	/	/	/	/	/	Achievers	379744

Table 54: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ2 Men with an expected learning spell duration of less than 6 months

	Year 1				Year 3			Year 5		
	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Men (<1 month contr)	-2.02	28.96	18.30	18.94	22.56	12.23	12.07	15.32	6.53	13.74
N	79056	44719	44719	44719	6692	6692	6692	491	491	491
r2_a	0.613	0.007	0.152	0.052	0.009	0.130	0.085	0.007	0.252	0.251
NVQ2 Men (<6 months contr)	-0.81	30.41	21.22	19.12	27.57	17.78	15.69	14.22	4.15	15.25
N	102084	60039	60039	60039	9249	9249	9249	766	766	766
r2_a	0.006	0.022	0.149	0.045	0.029	0.132	0.071	0.011	0.152	0.109
NVQ2 Men (>6 months contr)	0.21	21.68	13.77	9.59	18.87	11.80	7.56	0.43	-3.36	10.86
N	87602	50168	50168	50168	7245	7245	7245	3226	3226	543
r2_a	0.596	0.005	0.138	0.045	0.006	0.125	0.081	0.001	0.194	0.095
NVQ2 Men (all contr)	-0.33	27.97	19.52	16.26	25.62	16.66	13.22	11.14	1.54	7.64
N	108219	63561	63561	63561	9901	9901	9901	9872	9872	867
r2_a	0.573	0.023	0.146	0.043	0.028	0.132	0.069	0.006	0.149	0.108

Table 55: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ2 Women with an expected learning spell duration of less than 6 months

	Year 1				Year 3			Year 5		
	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Women (<1 month contr)	-3.48	18.86	23.65	20.15	6.01	9.23	14.72	N/A	N/A	N/A
N	18384	9630	9630	9630	1548	1548	1548	N/A	N/A	N/A
r2_a	0.631	0.004	0.180	0.036	0.001	0.182	0.072	N/A	N/A	N/A
NVQ2 Women (<6 months contr)	-1.12	10.79	14.23	12.32	6.30	8.44	9.41	0.47	12.02	7.13
N	30754	17693	17693	17693	3073	3073	3073	435	435	435
r2_a	0.607	0.003	0.181	0.032	0.002	0.159	0.038	0.001	0.206	0.125
NVQ2 Women (>6 months contr)	3.10	-4.49	3.82	0.91	-3.70	1.58	3.30	N/A	N/A	N/A
N	23548	12761	12761	12761	2120	2120	2120	N/A	N/A	N/A
r2_a	0.622	0.001	0.183	0.028	0.001	0.178	0.049	N/A	N/A	N/A
NVQ2 Women (all contr)	-0.25	8.19	11.03	10.11	5.88	7.01	8.13	5.19	14.88	14.35
N	33835	19691	19691	19691	3472	3472	3472	497	497	497
r2_a	0.593	0.002	0.173	0.026	0.002	0.157	0.044	0.001	0.191	0.108

Table 56: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ2 Men with an expected learning spell duration between 6 months and 1 year

		Year 1			Year 3			Year 5		
	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Men (<1 month contr)	-0.01	29.79	17.30	16.34	25.35	15.48	14.78	21.23	15.46	14.25
N	640812	227284	227284	227284	92304	92304	92304	22632	22632	22632
r2_a	0.567	0.006	0.181	0.094	0.005	0.127	0.130	0.005	0.113	0.168
NVQ2 Men (<6 months contr)	0.81	29.16	17.21	14.81	24.97	15.42	13.67	21.19	14.29	11.95
N	810322	316944	316944	316944	135497	135497	135497	35036	35036	35036
r2_a	0.561	0.019	0.175	0.077	0.016	0.132	0.109	0.016	0.119	0.147
NVQ2 Men (>6 months contr)	1.15	17.97	10.65	8.44	14.53	8.81	7.73	16.83	11.88	9.09
N	777003	301756	301756	301756	129469	129469	129469	31958	31958	31958
r2_a	0.553	0.006	0.164	0.080	0.005	0.119	0.115	0.007	0.111	0.157
NVQ2 Men (all contr)	1.11	24.36	14.48	11.81	20.41	12.50	10.79	19.63	13.42	10.43
N	903959	354886	354886	354886	154744	154744	154744	39966	39966	39966
r2_a	0.546	0.018	0.173	0.072	0.015	0.131	0.106	0.016	0.116	0.144

Table 57: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ2 Women with an expected duration between 6 months and 1 year

	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	CEM-DiD PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Women (<1 month contr)	0.97	15.95	14.38	14.97	10.30	13.57	15.56	9.33	13.17	15.10
N	477969	211502	211502	211502	88393	88393	88393	25144	25144	25144
r2_a	0.511	0.002	0.128	0.046	0.001	0.095	0.064	0.001	0.078	0.084
NVQ2 Women (<6 months contr)	1.49	16.42	14.78	16.50	10.53	12.44	14.31	8.50	12.10	16.99
N	625676	290537	290537	290537	126349	126349	126349	37818	37818	37818
r2_a	0.511	0.007	0.121	0.044	0.004	0.093	0.061	0.003	0.077	0.086
NVQ2 Women (>6 months contr)	2.63	12.01	11.74	11.95	5.61	8.81	9.51	6.90	9.37	7.63
N	581593	266911	266911	266911	115914	115914	115914	33421	33421	33421
r2_a	0.498	0.003	0.122	0.041	0.001	0.093	0.059	0.001	0.078	0.078
NVQ2 Women (all contr)	1.97	14.88	13.46	14.35	8.82	10.79	12.22	8.24	10.98	13.10
N	706851	327359	327359	327359	146156	146156	146156	43653	43653	43653
r2_a	0.499	0.008	0.121	0.041	0.003	0.009	0.058	0.003	0.078	0.079

Table 58: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ2 Men with an expected duration of over 1 year

		Year 1			Year 3			Year 5		
	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
				CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Men (<1 month contr)	12.72	28.55	21.79	39.18	9.17	6.52	29.86	N/A	N/A	N/A
N	34143	2446	2446	2446	1963	1963	1963	N/A	N/A	N/A
r2_a	0.567	0.007	0.216	0.119	0.001	0.140	0.173	N/A	N/A	N/A
NVQ2 Men (<6 months contr)	7.00	37.78	23.29	18.67	34.36	22.70	19.37	27.82	16.26	17.10
N	70156	16742	16742	16742	14494	14494	14494	5502	5502	5502
r2_a	0.382	0.029	0.197	0.122	0.026	0.133	0.162	0.022	0.138	0.189
NVQ2 Men (>6 months contr)	3.85	21.40	15.11	14.19	16.91	12.46	12.87	14.81	7.83	2.01
N	80094	21415	21415	21415	18364	18364	18364	6776	6776	6776
r2_a	0.367	0.012	0.200	0.128	0.135	0.135	0.170	0.006	0.157	0.203
NVQ2 Men (all contr)	4.91	29.04	18.01	14.68	24.86	16.50	14.33	22.17	11.95	4.86
N	90945	25289	25289	25289	21735	21735	21735	8343	8343	8343
r2_a	0.376	0.028	0.204	0.116	0.021	0.141	0.155	0.019	0.153	0.187

Table 59: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ2 Women with an expected duration of over 1 year

	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
				CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Women (<1 month contr)	13.29	26.52	21.25	33.68	17.80	11.13	28.66	19.83	12.24	23.73
N	108293	11243	11243	11243	7161	7161	7161	2708	2708	2708
r2_a	0.231	0.005	0.103	0.140	0.003	0.104	0.157	0.004	0.117	0.166
NVQ2 Women (<6 months contr)	10.49	22.59	14.63	20.77	17.94	10.70	18.86	19.53	9.88	16.70
N	152005	24815	24815	24815	18387	18387	18387	7780	7780	7780
r2_a	0.285	0.012	0.133	0.114	0.009	0.122	0.129	0.013	0.128	0.129
NVQ2 Women (>6 months contr)	5.22	8.77	6.06	9.33	7.84	5.37	8.81	8.87	5.36	7.78
N	150967	25225	25225	25225	18645	18645	18645	7486	7486	7486
r2_a	0.264	0.002	0.141	0.116	0.002	0.132	0.130	0.003	0.123	0.120
NVQ2 Women (all contr)	7.96	16.53	9.94	14.76	13.45	7.66	12.89	15.28	7.60	13.30
N	183415	31701	31701	31701	23881	23881	23881	10160	10160	10160
r2_a	0.289	0.009	0.136	0.106	0.007	0.127	0.119	0.010	0.122	0.117

Table 60: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ3 Men with an expected duration of less than 1 year

	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
			Year 1			Year 3			Year 5	
				CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Men (<1 month contr)	-2.35	23.83	16.62	13.13	29.33	24.23	21.05	N/A	N/A	N/A
N	31055	12196	12196	12196	1963	1963	1569	N/A	N/A	N/A
r2_a	0.501	0.008	0.218	0.142	0.029	0.196	0.179	N/A	N/A	N/A
NVQ2 Men (<6 months contr)	0.44	22.57	15.23	13.58	27.25	19.02	15.35	N/A	N/A	N/A
N	53199	25849	25849	25849	3553	3553	3553	N/A	N/A	N/A
r2_a	0.518	0.016	0.176	0.123	0.038	0.162	0.176	N/A	N/A	N/A
NVQ2 Men (>6 months contr)	1.97	13.05	10.40	9.10	21.89	11.51	4.79	N/A	N/A	N/A
N	48374	22373	22373	22373	2697	2697	2697	N/A	N/A	N/A
r2_a	0.502	0.004	0.166	0.120	0.013	0.158	0.145	N/A	N/A	N/A
NVQ2 Men (all contr)	0.94	18.66	13.29	11.73	26.34	17.44	15.57	N/A	N/A	N/A
N	62476	31113	31113	31113	4360	4360	4360	N/A	N/A	N/A
r2_a	0.505	0.014	0.164	0.113	0.037	0.154	0.169	N/A	N/A	N/A

Table 61: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ3 Women with an expected duration of less than 1 year

	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
				CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Women (<1 month contr)	2.73	6.62	11.20	13.42	18.71	11.00	15.49	N/A	N/A	N/A
N	72340	27877	27877	27877	2732	2732	2732	N/A	N/A	N/A
r2_a	0.367	0.001	0.285	0.137	0.014	0.184	0.152	N/A	N/A	N/A
NVQ2 Women (<6 months contr)	1.73	6.55	11.69	14.54	15.68	11.08	18.91	17.74	10.85	13.81
N	104103	48052	48052	48052	5919	5919	5919	1172	1172	1172
r2_a	0.390	0.001	0.216	0.106	0.014	0.135	0.111	0.017	0.112	0.076
NVQ2 Women (>6 months contr)	1.88	1.42	7.72	7.48	11.58	9.60	7.73	N/A	N/A	N/A
N	99177	45087	45087	45087	4204	4204	4204	N/A	N/A	N/A
r2_a	0.383	0.001	0.226	0.109	0.002	0.150	0.113	N/A	N/A	N/A
NVQ2 Women (all contr)	1.81	4.08	9.41	11.95	14.22	9.85	15.06	14.70	10.24	9.39
N	118075	55793	55793	55793	7075	7075	7075	1497	1497	1497
r2_a	0.393	0.001	0.199	0.094	0.012	0.125	0.101	0.011	0.102	0.087

Table 62: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ3 Men with an expected duration of over 1 year

		Year 1			Year 3			Year 5		
	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
				CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Men (<1 month contr)	10.31	32.57	22.39	19.42	29.93	21.15	21.30	25.94	16.88	20.46
N	146204	30030	30030	30030	12076	12076	12076	2814	2814	2814
r2_a	0.218	0.008	0.182	0.259	0.011	0.151	0.253	0.014	0.160	0.189
NVQ2 Men (<6 months contr)	6.70	29.84	21.73	24.19	28.96	21.82	24.34	24.52	18.04	15.45
N	213696	64182	64182	64182	28902	28902	28902	8249	8249	8249
r2_a	0.255	0.022	0.177	0.216	0.028	0.150	0.220	0.030	0.141	0.175
NVQ2 Men (>6 months contr)	4.34	19.33	16.39	18.58	19.93	16.59	16.67	17.16	14.07	8.21
N	234811	72163	72163	72163	33187	33187	33187	9658	9658	9658
r2_a	0.250	0.011	0.164	0.203	0.016	0.132	0.210	0.017	0.123	0.189
NVQ2 Men (all contr)	5.06	24.06	18.81	20.92	24.05	18.97	19.73	21.08	15.88	11.10
N	259648	82295	82295	82295	38870	38870	38870	12112	12112	12112
r2_a	0.261	0.023	0.167	0.192	0.028	0.141	0.197	0.028	0.128	0.167

Table 63: Coarsened Exact Matching and Difference-in-differences for a population of NVQ3 Women with an expected duration of over 1 year

	(0)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)	(1)	(2)	(9)
				CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD			CEM-DiD
	empl. prob.	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)	OLS (basic)	OLS (fully specified)	PT (earnings)
NVQ2 Women (<1 month contr)	4.02	14.89	19.81	23.23	12.15	17.40	18.07	9.25	16.86	26.63
N	285920	95089	95089	95089	41344	41344	41344	12556	12556	12556
r2_a	0.368	0.001	0.068	0.069	0.001	0.065	0.088	0.001	0.073	0.086
NVQ2 Women (<6 months contr)	2.88	17.84	19.42	22.64	14.61	16.00	16.66	12.98	14.93	14.48
N	377003	144399	144399	144399	72871	72871	72871	24102	24102	24102
r2_a	0.384	0.006	0.089	0.073	0.005	0.082	0.091	0.005	0.071	0.085
NVQ2 Women (>6 months contr)	3.20	10.25	13.22	15.65	8.71	11.24	12.82	11.26	13.71	11.15
N	403133	155835	155835	155835	80698	80698	80698	26689	26689	26689
r2_a	0.378	0.003	0.088	0.068	0.002	0.079	0.086	0.004	0.072	0.076
NVQ2 Women (all contr)	3.04	14.04	15.50	18.43	11.66	12.88	14.17	12.31	13.66	12.10
N	442674	173509	173509	173509	91326	91326	91326	31121	31121	31121
r2_a	0.388	0.007	0.091	0.070	0.005	0.081	0.084	0.007	0.072	0.075