



House of Commons  
Education Committee

---

# **Appointment of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills**

---

**Second Report of Session 2016–17**





House of Commons  
Education Committee

---

# Appointment of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills

---

**Second Report of Session 2016–17**

*Report, together with formal minutes relating  
to the report*

*Ordered by the House of Commons  
to be printed 5 July 2016*

## The Education Committee

The Education Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration, and policy of the Department for Education and its associated public bodies.

### Current membership

[Neil Carmichael MP](#) (*Conservative, Stroud*) (Chair)

[Lucy Allan MP](#) (*Conservative, Telford*)

[Ian Austin MP](#) (*Labour, Dudley North*)

[Michelle Donelan MP](#) (*Conservative, Chippenham*)

[Marion Fellows MP](#) (*Scottish National Party, Motherwell and Wishaw*)

[Suella Fernandes MP](#) (*Conservative, Fareham*)

[Lucy Frazer MP](#) (*Conservative, South East Cambridgeshire*)

[Catherine McKinnell MP](#) (*Labour, Newcastle upon Tyne North*)

[Ian Mearns MP](#) (*Labour, Gateshead*)

[Stephen Timms MP](#) (*Labour, East Ham*)

[William Wragg MP](#) (*Conservative, Hazel Grove*)

### Powers

The Committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No 152. These are available on the Internet via [www.parliament.uk](http://www.parliament.uk).

### Publications

Committee reports are published on the Committee's website at [www.parliament.uk/education-committee](http://www.parliament.uk/education-committee) and in print by Order of the House.

Evidence relating to this report is published on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

### Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are Richard Ward (Clerk), Kevin Maddison (Second Clerk), Anna Connell-Smith (Committee Specialist), Jack Dent (Inquiry Manager), Jonathan Arkless (Senior Committee Assistant), Simon Armitage (Committee Assistant), and Gary Calder (Senior Media Officer).

### Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Education Committee, House of Commons, London, SW1A 0AA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 1376; the Committee's email address is [educom@parliament.uk](mailto:educom@parliament.uk).

# Contents

---

|          |   |           |
|----------|---|-----------|
| <b>1</b> | <b>The recruitment process</b>  | <b>3</b>  |
|          | Background  | 3         |
| <b>2</b> | <b>The post of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector</b>  | <b>4</b>  |
|          | Amanda Spielman, the Government's preferred candidate   | 6         |
|          | Ms Spielman's evidence  | 7         |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Conclusions</b>  | <b>9</b>  |
|          | Conclusion about the candidate  | 9         |
|          | Wider reflections on the role   | 9         |
|          | <b>Appendix 1: Posts which are subject to pre-appointment hearings before the Education Committee</b> | <b>10</b> |
|          | <b>Appendix 2: Correspondence in advance of the hearing</b>   | <b>11</b> |
|          | <b>Appendix 3: Correspondence following the hearing</b>   | <b>12</b> |
|          | <b>Appendix 4: Details of the role and recruitment process</b>  | <b>16</b> |
|          | <b>Appendix 5: Details of the preferred candidate</b>   | <b>20</b> |
|          | <b>Formal Minutes</b>   | <b>24</b> |
|          | <b>Witness</b>  | <b>25</b> |
|          | <b>List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament</b>                               | <b>26</b> |



# 1 The recruitment process

## Background

1. Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills (HMCI) is responsible for the leadership and management of Ofsted, the Office for Standards in Education, Children's Services and Skills. As Ofsted's Accounting Officer, HMCI is also responsible to Parliament for Ofsted's use of public funds.<sup>1</sup> Ofsted inspects and regulates services that care for children and young people, and services providing education and skills for learners of all ages. It is a non-ministerial department. It has around 1,500 employees working across eight regions and also directly contracts with more than 1,500 Ofsted Inspectors to carry out inspections of schools and further education and skills provision.<sup>2</sup>
2. The appointment of HMCI is subject to a pre-appointment hearing. The appointment is based on a fixed term of five years, commencing on 1 January 2017, after the term of the current Chief Inspector, Sir Michael Wilshaw, ends.<sup>3</sup> The post was advertised between 22 February and 21 March 2016 on the websites of the Centre for Public Appointments, the Guardian and the Times, and appeared in print in the Guardian Social Care supplement and the Sunday Times. The recruitment company Saxton Bampfylde was procured to assist with promoting the vacancy and securing suitably qualified applications. The recruitment panel was chaired by Sara Nathan OBE, the Public Appointments Assessor assigned to the campaign. The members of the panel were Chris Wormald, then Permanent Secretary of the Department for Education, David Hoare, Chair of Ofsted, and Ruth Hunt, Chief Executive of Stonewall.<sup>4</sup>
3. 32 applications were received. 15 of the candidates were male and 17 female. Five candidates declared themselves to be from a BAME background and one declared themselves as LGBT. The candidates were shortlisted and longlisted in accordance with guidance from the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments. The panel met on 31 March and longlisted 11 candidates (six male and five female). At a further meeting of the panel on 11 April, six candidates were shortlisted, the panel having considered further information on each candidate gathered by Saxton Bampfylde through informal interviews. Subsequently, one shortlisted candidate withdrew ahead of interview. The five remaining shortlisted candidates were interviewed by the panel on 21 April. The panel recommended three appointable candidates (two male and one female). The Secretary of State for Education, Rt Hon Nicky Morgan MP, met each of the appointable candidates before making her choice of preferred candidate.<sup>5</sup> On 10 June, the Secretary of State wrote to the Chair, putting forward Amanda Spielman as her preferred candidate for our consideration.<sup>6</sup>

1 Appendix 4

2 Ofsted, "[About us](#)", 23 June 2016

3 Department for Education, Ofsted and The Commissioner for Public Appointments, [Appointment of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills: Applicant Information Pack](#), accessed 23 June 2016. See also Appendix 2.

4 Appendix 4

5 Appendix 4

6 Appendix 2

## 2 The post of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector

4. The job advertisement for the post of HMCI stated that the Government was seeking:
- an individual with senior experience in education and children’s services, and significant organisational leadership and management skills, who can demonstrate their commitment to the highest standards across Ofsted’s remit and their aptitude for such a high profile and public-facing role.

Table 1: Role profile and person specification

|  |
|--|
| <p><b>Role profile</b></p> <p>The Chief Inspector is responsible for the leadership and management of Ofsted, and as its Accounting Officer, is responsible to Parliament for the use of public funds. The role of Chief Inspector also includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Driving Ofsted to be an ever more focused and effective inspectorate—one where the quality and credibility of inspection continues to improve while value for money increases</li><li>• Providing outstanding leadership to Ofsted as an organisation, including building and maintaining a high-performing workforce, managing change effectively, and demonstrating commitment to equality and diversity</li><li>• Leading and inspiring Her Majesty’s Inspectors and Regulatory Inspectors across the country so that Ofsted builds and maintains a committed and high-performing workforce of Inspectors who have credibility with the sectors they inspect</li><li>• Ensuring that Ofsted continues to drive improvement and raise standards in an increasingly autonomous school system, making fair and rounded judgements of school performance to promote educational excellence everywhere</li><li>• Ensuring that Ofsted continues to improve the quality of Early Years provision through a strong inspection regime</li><li>• Ensuring that Ofsted continues to drive quality in apprenticeships and the FE sector</li><li>• Ensuring that Ofsted continues to drive quality and raise standards in children’s social care</li><li>• Ensuring that Ofsted is able to respond to challenges in an appropriate and proportionate way—including, for example, dealing with issues around extremism in schools, colleges and training providers, child sexual exploitation, and increasing efficiency</li></ul> |
|--|



- Ensuring that Ofsted is able to respond pro-actively to the direction of government policy and strategy, for example the development of more autonomous school and further education systems, innovative delivery models in social care, and the target to grow apprenticeships
- Ensuring that Ofsted continues to meaningfully engage parents, carers, pupils and students, professionals, and employers, and safeguards Ofsted's reputation
- Representing Ofsted to the public, ministers and Parliament
- Working in a highly effective way with key contacts, including ministers, professionals and service users—for example:
  - Schools, children's service and early years' settings, professional and sector bodies and parents and others who draw on Ofsted reports
  - The Secretary of State for Education, ministers, and MPs across government
  - The Chair and Board of Ofsted, and Ofsted's senior management team
  - Chair and members of the Education Select Committee
  - The Permanent Secretary and senior officials of the Department for Education (DfE), Business, Innovation and Skills (BIS), and other departments
  - Regional schools commissioners (RSCs)
- Leading public conversation in relation to the implementation of regulation and standards in education, children's services and early years

### **Person Specification**

Applicants must be able to evidence the following skills and experience:

- Strong personal commitment to the highest standards in education and children's services
- Experience at the highest level in education or children's services, including substantial organisational leadership skills and proven experience in leading and managing change in a complex environment
- Strong communication skills, excellent judgement under pressure and a high degree of personal integrity

- Understanding of and ability to utilise Ofsted's role in using regulation and inspection to drive up standards and improve the lives of children and young people right across England
- Understanding of the current political landscape, and the direction of government policy, including on education, early years and children's services policies and the Better Regulation agenda
- Sound financial judgement, in order to operate effectively as Accounting Officer, managing the Ofsted budget in a way which maximises benefit to the taxpayer.

Source: Department for Education

### **Amanda Spielman, the Government's preferred candidate**

5. Ms Spielman has worked in the education sector for over 10 years. Since 2011, she has been Chair of Ofqual, the Office of Qualifications and Examinations Regulation. She acted as the interim Chief Regulator, Ofqual, earlier this year. Ms Spielman has also served as the Director of Research and Policy at ARK schools, a multi-academy trust, and currently works one day a week for the charity ARK (Absolute Return for Kids) as Education Adviser. She also carries out consultancy work and serves as a council and audit committee member at Brunel University, a Director at Floreat Education, a multi-academy trust, and a trustee at the charity, STEMNET.<sup>7</sup> Her curriculum vitae is appended to this report.<sup>8</sup>

6. During the application process, Ms Spielman declared that she had no conflicts of interest, but recognised potential conflicts of interest presented by her non-executive roles at Ofqual, Floreat Education, Brunel University and STEMNET, her consultancy work, and her adviser role with ARK. She said that if confirmed as HMCI she would step down from these positions.<sup>9</sup> During the pre-appointment hearing, she confirmed that she had resigned from ARK and Floreat and would shortly be stepping down from STEMNET.<sup>10</sup>

7. In line with the guidance drawn up by the Liaison Committee on the conduct of pre-appointment hearings, our questioning sought to test Ms Spielman's professional competence and personal independence. We explored the following areas with Ms Spielman:

- The application process;
- Her independence;
- Her knowledge and understanding of current issues in education, skills and children's services;
- Her future plans for Ofsted;
- How she intends to prepare for taking up the post.

---

7 Appendix 5

8 As above

9 As above

10 Q97

## Ms Spielman's evidence

8. Ms Spielman's CV shows that she has a broad range of experience in a number of different fields. We also heard during the session about the significant contributions she had made to the education sector, particularly through her roles at ARK and Ofqual.<sup>11</sup> Nevertheless, we were left with significant concerns about her suitability for the post of HMCI. In particular:

- **Ms Spielman did not demonstrate the passion for the role that we would have hoped for.** We were concerned that, when asked why she wanted the job, she did not refer to the Chief Inspector's role in raising standards and improving the lives of children and young people.<sup>12</sup> We consider these to be the fundamental purposes of the job but in the session Ms Spielman offered little evidence that she saw them as her primary motivations.
- While Ms Spielman, through her work at ARK and Ofqual, has gained experience of secondary education, **she did not convince us that she had a clear understanding of the other aspects of this complex role**, such as:
  - early years;
  - primary education;
  - children's services;
  - child protection;
  - looked-after children;
  - special educational needs;
  - further education; and
  - the educational support role for which local authorities are inspected.

We did not leave the session feeling that she was prepared for the vast scope and complexity of this important role.

- **Ms Spielman did not appear to recognise the importance of building bridges with the professions inspected by Ofsted.** In contrast to her predecessor, Ms Spielman would join Ofsted without any direct experience of teaching or children's social care. She told us that she did not see this as a problem.<sup>13</sup> Whilst we accept that frontline experience is not necessarily a requirement for the role, it is vital that the Chief Inspector can carry the confidence of all those working in education, children's services and skills.
- Ofsted plays a critical role in providing assurance that children's services are operating effectively. We would have expected Ms Spielman to acknowledge that Ofsted should be held to account when it fails to spot systemic failure. **We were therefore deeply troubled by Ms Spielman's statement that "you cannot say that the buck stops with**

---

<sup>11</sup> Qq 5–7

<sup>12</sup> Q1

<sup>13</sup> Q18

**Ofsted" on child protection.**<sup>14</sup> Whilst we agree that those delivering children's services should be held responsible when they fail, the very purpose of inspecting children's social care is to prevent children being placed at risk through service failure.

- Finally, we were concerned by the answer Ms Spielman gave when we asked about her vision for Ofsted. She told us that the "mission that appears on the Ofsted letterhead—'raising standards, improving lives'—seems to me as valid as ever"<sup>15</sup>. **We did not leave the session with a clear sense of how Ms Spielman would go beyond Ofsted's mission statement to translate it into practice or of the direction she saw Ofsted taking under her leadership.**

9. The normal procedure following a pre-appointment hearing is to report immediately to the House. However, our concerns about Ms Spielman's evidence led us to write to the Secretary of State inviting her to reconsider her nomination. We sent a copy of this letter to Ms Spielman. We received a reply from the Secretary of State on 4 July. We also received a letter from Ms Spielman. We held a further private meeting on 5 July at which we considered the contents of these letters. Copies of all correspondence relating to this hearing are published as Appendices to this Report.

---

14 Q84

15 Q95

## 3 Conclusions

---

### Conclusion about the candidate

10. Ms Spielman's evidence raised for us a number of significant concerns about her suitability for the post. Regrettably, on the basis of these concerns, we are unable to give our support to her appointment.

### Wider reflections on the role

11. Notwithstanding our views on the candidate, we have been concerned for some time about the lack of expertise on children's services amongst Ofsted's senior management, particularly as Ofsted does not currently have a permanent director of children's social care. Ofsted's social care work is currently overshadowed by that on education. In context of recent high profile failures in children's services over recent years, it deserves a higher profile and is an issue on which strong leadership from Ofsted is needed.

12. Our predecessor Committee called for Ofsted to be split into an Inspectorate for Education and an Inspectorate for Social Care.<sup>16</sup> We have reflected upon Ms Spielman's evidence and that which we have taken so far in this Parliament about the role of Ofsted. In our view, the remit of Ofsted was too large at the time of our predecessors' report and remains so today. At a time of almost permanent change in education, and increasing reform of children's social care, we are moving towards a point at which the job of HMCI will be too great for one person. Placing Ofsted's social care work into a separate inspectorate would help it to gain a greater profile.

13. *We reiterate our predecessors' proposals about the future of Ofsted and call on the Department to make the following changes:*

- *That a permanent Deputy Chief Inspector be appointed to oversee the inspection of children's services from the point at which the new Chief Inspector takes up post.*
- *That the new Chief Inspector be appointed with a specific remit to develop plans for the reformation of Ofsted into two separate inspectorates of (1) education and skills and (2) children's services.*
- *That the Department for Education bring forward legislative proposals for Parliament to consider at an early stage of the new Chief Inspector's tenure.*

---

16 Education Committee, Second Report of Session 2010–12, [The Role and Performance of Ofsted](#), HC 570-I

## Appendix 1: Posts which are subject to pre-appointment hearings before the Education Committee

---

HM Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills

Children's Commissioner for England

Chief Regulator for Ofqual

Chair of the Social Mobility Commission

## Appendix 2: Correspondence in advance of the hearing

---

### **Letter dated 22 February 2016 from Nick Gibb MP, Minister for Schools, to the Chair**

The term of the current Chief Inspector for Education, Children's Services and Skills, Sir Michael Wilshaw, comes to an end on 31 December 2016.

I am writing to inform you that we will be undertaking a recruitment process for a new Chief Inspector. As this is a Crown appointment it is being conducted in accordance with the requirements set by the Commissioner for Public Appointments and the guidance issued by the Cabinet Office Public Appointments Unit. We intend to advertise the role in the week commencing 22 February, following the appointment of search consultants. I attach for your information a copy of the applicant information pack, and officials will explore suitable dates for a pre-appointment hearing with the Committee Clerk.

### **Letter dated 10 June 2016 from Rt Hon Nicky Morgan MP, Secretary of State for Education, to the Chair**

#### ***Recruitment of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills***

As you will be aware, we have been undertaking a recruitment process to identify and appoint the next Chief Inspector, ahead of the end of Sir Michael Wilshaw's term in December 2016. I am now pleased to put forward my preferred candidate, Amanda Spielman, for the Committee's consideration.

I have chosen Ms Spielman as my preferred candidate because of her impressive breadth of experience across the education sector and her proven commitment to raising standards for children and young people. She co-founded ARK schools; one of the most successful academy chains in the country, which has transformed some of the most underperforming schools in the country. Since 2011 she has been Chair of the exam board regulator Ofqual overseeing a significant and ambitious reform agenda which sees the introduction of an entirely new, more rigorous suite of A-Levels and GCSEs. She is also a trustee of STEMNET, a network which works with thousands of schools, colleges and employers to inspire young people to study and pursue careers in science, technology, engineering and maths.

I will ask my Parliamentary Clerk to liaise with the Clerk of the Education Committee to arrange a suitable date for the pre-appointment hearing. Relevant information relating to the recruitment process is set out in the attached annex.

## Appendix 3: Correspondence following the hearing

---

### **Letter dated 29 June 2016 from the Chair to Rt Hon Nicky Morgan MP, Secretary of State for Education**

#### ***Appointment of HM Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills***

As you know, we held a pre-appointment today with Amanda Spielman, your preferred candidate to succeed Sir Michael Wilshaw as Her Majesty's Chief Inspector (HMCI). We asked Ms Spielman a number of questions to cover the wide-ranging role of HMCI.

Notwithstanding her broad experience and the contribution she has made to the field of education, we do not consider that Ms Spielman exhibited sufficient understanding of the scope and complexity of the role. She did not demonstrate sufficient vision or show the leadership abilities we feel will be needed. We were concerned by the lack of passion she demonstrated for the job and the important contribution it makes to the lives of children.

We will hold a further private meeting on the morning of 5 July. We would welcome your reconsideration of the nomination before that meeting, and note that there are six months still to go before the end of Sir Michael Wilshaw's term of office.

I am sending a copy of this letter to Amanda Spielman.

### **Letter dated 3 July 2016 from Amanda Spielman, Government's preferred candidate for Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills, to the Chair**

Your committee clerk kindly sent me a copy of the letter you wrote to the Secretary of State on Wednesday, and I felt I should write to you myself about what you said.

As I said to the committee, I came into education fifteen years ago when I realised it was, quite simply, the most important thing in the world. My MA opened my eyes to how much better education in this country could be, and I decided to throw myself into making this happen.

I spent my first six years at Ark Schools working flat out to make top quality schools for the most disadvantaged children. Many of these were existing schools, often dismal and sometimes truly awful: yet everywhere we had to fight to win over hostile heads, staff governing bodies, local authorities and unions, who often could not acknowledge that there was so much more that could be done. It was my passion that pushed me to continue in the face of tough opposition. I spent many hours in many places being told that Ark's motives were venal, our expertise far inferior to those already in charge, and our expectations of achievement hopelessly unrealistic; yet we kept going, year after year, and our work there is transforming many lives already.

That experience of seeing so much poor education strengthened my commitment, and eventually pushed me to take the Ofqual role, even though many people warned me that



it would be a thankless task. I saw clearly that the exam system had evolved in ways that were making it hard for schools to keep sight of education itself: for too many children, education after 14 was about jumping through hoops and collecting points, rather than about learning.

Many of the decisions that are now bringing about exam improvements were entirely Ofqual's, not from ministers. One example was removing controlled assessment: many teachers were nervous about this, but virtually all now welcome the change and the extra time it will give them to teach, which will in turn raise standards. The crucial test we now apply at Ofqual is: will whatever is being considered make for better education on the ground? And as our decisions have consequences for the whole education system, we are always working with system improvement in mind, not just our own processes.

And in my five years at Ofqual, I can say that we have never ducked a difficult decision (and there have been a few); nor ignored a matter of public concern; nor fudged our advice to ministers, even when we have known that what we had to say would not be welcome. I also stood firm under system pressure to water down standards, as when we came under extreme pressure to overrule exam board grades in GCSE English in 2012.

I have also always pushed my team to remember that it is outcomes for children that matter at the end of the day: process is the way in which the right outcomes are achieved, not the end in itself. As a leader it is my job always to keep the ends in view. In this way I have made sure that the most intractable problems get addressed.

Many senior people in education (in FE as well as schools) have said to me and in public over the last few weeks, that they welcome my nomination precisely because they see me as someone with the clarity of understanding, the willingness to act and the persistence and the integrity to tackle the difficulties that Ofsted faces and will always face. It is my work at Ofqual and before that at Ark that has earned me that respect and the credibility for this role, even though I have not been a head. And this is not exceptional: like many inspectorates, CQC and the Prisons Inspectorate are also led by people who did not themselves run hospitals or prisons: leaders must make sure that the right expertise sits in the right places, not necessarily have all of it themselves.

My style is different from Michael Wilshaw's. He has made the role a more personal platform than any other HMCI I know of, apart from Chris Woodhead; and focuses more on criticism than on distilling insights. But Ofsted is only effective in raising standards if its feedback is acted on. So as I said, I see benefits in aiming for public commentary that is uncompromising yet discriminating, as blanket criticism can make people defensive and so be counter-productive. I want to intervene to prompt action, rather than to comment on every issue in education or children's services.

And I was very clear that I understood the breadth and scope of the role. I have already spent time familiarising myself with Ofsted's complex work and developing approach in children's services, and working out how to make sure that side of the organisation is secured for the future. There have been some terrible failings in children's services in recent years, and as I said to the committee, I am very conscious that for many vulnerable children Ofsted is the only protection they have against unsatisfactory care. I could not take this more seriously.

Finally, you question my vision for Ofsted. As I said, I do believe that the vision is fundamentally right at present—"raising standards, improving lives" really does sum it up. Improving the lives of children and young people must be at the heart of what Ofsted aims to do. In my view the inspection frameworks are now generally in good shape, after much adjustment in recent years. I did not want to give Ofsted staff reason to think the organisation would be turned upside down: stability and continuity are important, especially after so much change. Much has been done to build system trust and respect, which is encouraging, but much more needs to be done.

So it is how Ofsted develops its model in a more complex world that I see as the big challenge for the next HMCI. I explained to you much of what I think that means in practice: defining the roles of Ofsted and the Regional Schools Commissioners, and making that model work for teachers, parents, and children; developing a more sophisticated approach to MATs; making sure that expert human judgements about quality of provision, leadership, safety and behaviour carry enough weight in a data-intensive world; looking at the effects of the Outstanding judgement; and building stronger feedback loops that make sure that Ofsted truly understands its effects on the systems it inspects, and reacts when necessary. If I didn't mention improving the reliability of inspection judgements, I should have done. All of this needs the strategic skills and internal leadership that I can bring, not just a strong external voice.

And this adds up to evolution, not revolution, building on recent good work. At the end of the day this is what will make Ofsted effective in making a real and substantial contribution to improving standards for children: helping to ensure that the tremendous efforts that are already made by almost everyone working in education and children's services translate into the best possible outcomes for our children and young people.

This is a long letter, but I hope it fully explains why I am both able and motivated to make the very best of this very important role, working for the benefit of every child in this country.

## **Letter dated 4 July 2016 from Rt Hon Nicky Morgan MP, Secretary of State for Education, to the Chair**

### ***Appointment of HM Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills***

Thank you for your letter of 29 June. I was surprised and disappointed to read of the Committee's concerns about Amanda Spielman, my preferred candidate to succeed Sir Michael Wilshaw as Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills (HMCI).

I have considered the points in your letter carefully, and reviewed the transcript of the hearing on 29 June. Whilst I am grateful for the consideration the Committee has put into the matter and take your views very seriously, I remain wholeheartedly in support of Amanda as the best person for this crucial role. I would be grateful if you would consider looking again at the evidence, including the letter you received from Amanda over the weekend.

Amanda has a real and heart-felt passion for education and the critical importance of this for children's chances in life. Fifteen years ago she changed career and dedicated her

professional life to education: as Amanda told the Committee at the hearing, she had a 'lightbulb' moment when she realised that education was 'the most important thing' she could imagine being part of, that education gave her purpose. As the Committee has recognised, she has followed that through with significant contributions to the field of education—contributions that have substantially improved outcomes for children across the country.

Amanda is calm, measured, analytical and evidence-based. She is not a 'super head' but she is a highly effective leader who will be unafraid to do the right thing and, where necessary, will challenge schools, local authorities and government equally on education and social care standards when the evidence compels her. She is the kind of Chief Inspector I believe we need—Amanda's understanding of the role, her vision, leadership abilities and commitment to raising standards have been tested at each stage of the very rigorous public appointments process overseen by Cabinet Office and the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments. A senior independently-chaired panel assessed Amanda as eminently appointable.

Having considered all the evidence from the recruitment process, I chose Amanda because it is clear to me that the education and social care systems—and the children and young people they provide for—will benefit hugely from her evidence-based approach, her system-level thinking, and her clear commitment to raising standards. I believe that her emphasis on evidence, objectivity and openness, together with her experience of strategic leadership, will make Ofsted an even stronger and more effective organisation.

I am grateful that the Committee is meeting again on 5 July to discuss this important matter further. I would ask them to take these points into account and reconsider their assessment of Amanda. I await the Committee's report following the meeting.

## Appendix 4: Details of the role and recruitment process

---

### Role profile

The Chief Inspector is responsible for the leadership and management of Ofsted, and as its Accounting Officer, is responsible to Parliament for the use of public funds. The role of Chief Inspector also includes:

- Driving Ofsted to be an ever more focused and effective inspectorate – one where the quality and credibility of inspection continues to improve while value for money increases
- Providing outstanding leadership to Ofsted as an organisation, including building and maintaining a high-performing workforce, managing change effectively, and demonstrating commitment to equality and diversity
- Leading and inspiring Her Majesty's Inspectors and Regulatory Inspectors across the country so that Ofsted builds and maintains a committed and high-performing workforce of Inspectors who have credibility with the sectors they inspect
- Ensuring that Ofsted continues to drive improvement and raise standards in an increasingly autonomous school system, making fair and rounded judgements of school performance to promote educational excellence everywhere
- Ensuring that Ofsted continues to improve the quality of Early Years provision through a strong inspection regime
- Ensuring that Ofsted continues to drive quality in apprenticeships and the FE sector
- Ensuring that Ofsted continues to drive quality and raise standards in children's social care
- Ensuring that Ofsted is able to respond to challenges in an appropriate and proportionate way – including, for example, dealing with issues around extremism in schools, colleges and training providers, child sexual exploitation, and increasing efficiency
- Ensuring that Ofsted is able to respond pro-actively to the direction of government policy and strategy, for example the development of more autonomous school and further education systems, innovative delivery models in social care, and the target to grow apprenticeships
- Ensuring that Ofsted continues to meaningfully engage parents, carers, pupils and students, professionals, and employers, and safeguards Ofsted's reputation
- Representing Ofsted to the public, ministers and Parliament

- Working in a highly effective way with key contacts, including ministers, professionals and service users – for example:
- Schools, children's service and early years' settings, professional and sector bodies and parents and others who draw on Ofsted reports
- The Secretary of State for Education, ministers, and MPs across government
- The Chair and Board of Ofsted, and Ofsted's senior management team
- Chair and members of the Education Select Committee
- The Permanent Secretary and senior officials of the Department for Education (DfE), Business, Innovation and Skills (BIS), and other departments
- Regional schools commissioners (RSCs)
- Leading public conversation in relation to the implementation of regulation and standards in education, children's services and early years

## Person Specification

Applicants must be able to evidence the following skills and experience:

- Strong personal commitment to the highest standards in education and children's services
- Experience at the highest level in education or children's services, including substantial organisational leadership skills and proven experience in leading and managing change in a complex environment
- Strong communication skills, excellent judgement under pressure and a high degree of personal integrity
- Understanding of and ability to utilise Ofsted's role in using regulation and inspection to drive up standards and improve the lives of children and young people right across England
- Understanding of the current political landscape, and the direction of government policy, including on education, early years and children's services policies and the Better Regulation agenda
- Sound financial judgement, in order to operate effectively as Accounting Officer, managing the Ofsted budget in a way which maximises benefit to the taxpayer

## Recruitment panel

The Secretary of State agreed a selection panel chaired by Sara Nathan OBE, the Public Appointments Assessor (PAA) assigned to the recruitment campaign. Members of the panel were:


- Chris Wormald, then Permanent Secretary of the Department for Education

- David Hoare, Chair of Ofsted
- Ruth Hunt, Chief Executive of Stonewall (the independent member)

## Job advertisement

The advertisement was live from 22 February until 21 March on the websites of the Centre for Public Appointments, the Guardian and the Times, appeared in print in the Guardian Social Care and the Sunday Times, and received attention through social media and in sector-specific publications including the Times Educational Supplement.

The advertisement as it appeared in the Guardian:



**Department  
for Education**

**Make a real difference to England's education and care systems: apply to be the next Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and skills**

**We are seeking to appoint an exceptional individual as the next Chief Inspector.**

The Chief Inspector leads the Office for Standards in Education, Children's Services and Skills (Ofsted), which regulates and inspects to achieve excellence in the care of children and young people, and in education and skills for students of all ages. Ofsted, and therefore the Chief Inspector, has a direct role to play in ensuring the safety and wellbeing of all our children and young people; and in our pursuit of educational excellence everywhere, so that every child and young person can attend a good nursery, school, training provider or college, achieving to the best of his or her ability regardless of location, prior attainment and background.

We are seeking an individual with senior experience in education or children's services, and significant organisational leadership and management skills, who can demonstrate their commitment to the highest standards across Ofsted's remit and their aptitude for such a high profile and public-facing role.

This is a challenging and hugely rewarding role which offers an outstanding candidate a rare opportunity to make a tangible, positive difference to the safety, wellbeing and education of children and young people in England.

For more details and information on how to apply, please visit the Cabinet Office Public Appointments website or email [QBFS@saxbam.com](mailto:QBFS@saxbam.com)

**Closing date: 9am on Friday 18 March 2016**



## Recruitment process

Following approval from the Minister for the Cabinet Office to use headhunters, officials procured Saxton Bampfylde through a fully compliant, open process to assist with promoting the vacancy and securing suitably qualified applicants.

We received 32 applications for the post. 15 of the candidates were male (47%), and 17 female (53%); five candidates declared themselves as from a BAME background (16%), and one declared themselves as LGBT.

The candidates were longlisted and shortlisted in line with OCPA guidance. On 31 March the panel met and longlisted 11 candidates (six male, five female). On 11 April the panel met again. Six candidates were shortlisted, the panel having considered further information on each candidate gathered by Saxton Bampfylde through informal interviews.

Subsequently one shortlisted candidate withdrew ahead of interview. The five remaining shortlisted candidates were interviewed by the panel on 21 April. The panel recommended three appointable candidates (two male, one female). The Secretary of State met each of the appointable candidates before making her choice of preferred candidate.

## Appendix 5: Details of the preferred candidate

---

### 1. CV

#### *Amanda Spielman*

#### *Employment*

#### **2011– Chair, Ofqual (national independent regulator of qualifications and assessments)—(half-time) and Interim Chief Regulator**

- Overseeing major reform programmes in both A level/GCSE and vocational qualifications, which are on track despite significant sector resistance to the underlying policy
- Maintaining independence from government in making key regulatory decisions
- Overseeing strategic shift to make Ofqual an outward-facing organisation with a risk-based regulatory approach built on strong research and evidence
- Sustained Ofqual's position through a critical period when GCSE English was widely believed to have malfunctioned in 2012, defending it in media (and subsequent judicial review outcome vindicated this defence)
- Representing Ofqual externally to many audiences including schools, teachers, media, ministers and select committees and others such as learned societies
- Advising and working with chief executive
- Reshaping and developing the board

#### **2014– Consultancy work**

- Steering group chair for a cross-government review of regulators (in progress)
- Triennial review of three government postgraduate scholarship schemes; secured support for recommendations from Foreign Office, DFID and Cabinet Office ministers
- External reviewer for a strategic review of TeachFirst

#### **2013– Education Adviser, Absolute Return for Kids (ARK) (now 1 day pw)**

- 2012– Member, International Education board
- Advice on development of international education strategy including public-private partnership models in Uganda, India, Pakistan and elsewhere
- 2011– Member, Finance and audit committee: established and handed over to incoming COO.
- 2013– Member, Mathematics Mastery Advisory Board



**2004– Research and Policy Director, ARK Schools**

- Member of founding management team of leading academy operator which now has 30+ schools and £140m revenues: with Lucy Heller built the organisation from scratch, part of senior management team throughout
- Responsibilities included establishing education policy and model, strategy and planning, and all legal and regulatory affairs, including government relationships (jointly with MD) and leading on development of academy policy
- Advised ARK Schools board on development of ARK Schools model
- Member of Sykes Review Group (2008-2009) which reviewed the nature and use of external assessments in schools and their regulation.

**2001–2004 Part-time study, consultancy and voluntary work and maternity leave**

- Completed MA in Comparative Education
- Freelance strategy consultancy to educational organisations
- Voluntary work for Pilotlight, Saving Faces and St Paul's, described below

**1997–2001 Nomura International plc, London**

- Transactor, Principal Finance Group, reporting to group head, making large equity investments (£250-500 million typical size) through corporate acquisitions (effectively a private equity fund but employing Nomura's own capital)
- Strategy/business planning director (on secondment) at a \$2.2 bn portfolio company, AT&T Capital (Morristown NJ, USA), then the second largest commercial finance company in the US (\$30bn of lease assets), reporting to the Chief Executive
- At AT&T Capital, co-ordinated group-wide analysis and strategy project, identified principal reasons for business under-performance, developed and began implementation of turn-around plan until business was sold
- Subsequently responsible for acquisition, financing and post-acquisition management and control of acquired companies
- Projects managed included bidding in mobile (3G) licence auction and in the Millennium Dome competition, initial development of the Terra Firma fund structure and marketing plan, and pub-related deals (Nomura owned some 6,000 pubs)

**1995–1997 Mercer Management Consulting, Inc, Boston, Mass., USA**

- Principal (partner), Communications, Information and Entertainment practice
- Projects mainly involved bringing rigorous financial and market analysis techniques to assist corporate strategy and marketing strategy development: clients included AT&T, Reader's Digest

**1994–1995     Bridgewater Business Analysis Ltd, London**

- Director of a strategy consultancy, specialising in media, telecoms and business services: clients included Reuters, Cable & Wireless, Booker, Tarmac

**1992–1994     Newstead Capital, London**

- Co-founder and director of a financing boutique, advising on asset-backed finance

**1986–1992     Kleinwort Benson Ltd, London (now DKB)**

- Manager, Corporate Finance in top-ranked M&A firm
- Mainstream corporate finance work on all types of M&A transactions, domestic and international
- Seconded to divisional chief executive for a year to develop marketing strategy
- Seconded to group chief executive and finance director for various special assignments
- Established telecoms sector specialisation within corporate finance
- Two years in loan workout and mezzanine investment: restructuring troubled companies and evaluating potential investments

**1986–1986     Lloyds Bank plc**

- Corporate strategy work in head office

**1982–1986     Thomson McLintock, Bristol (now KPMG)**

- Assistant to corporate finance partners and senior partner working on acquisitions/disposals, valuations, corporate investigations, share option schemes and other non-standard assignments
- Qualified as chartered accountant 1985 (all first-time passes)

**Directorships and voluntary work**

- 2016– Council and audit committee member, Brunel University
- 2015– Director, Floreat Education, a multi-academy trust
- 2014– Trustee, STEMNET, a charity working to encourage participation in science, technology, engineering and mathematics in schools
- 2011–2015, Council member, Institute of Education, University of London (now merged with UCL); member of Finance and General Purposes Committee; chaired Investment Committee, advised Director on aspects of merger.
- 2004–2011, trustee/director of Wales Millennium Centre, a new opera house, theatre and arts centre in Cardiff, completed on time and on budget (£107m); member of Finance and General Purposes Committee; chair of Remuneration and Appointments Committee.

- 2001–2004, trustee and operating committee member of Pilotlight, a charity promoting and managing active philanthropy among senior executives and successful entrepreneurs.

**2001–2002     Institute of Education, London University**

- MA with distinction in Comparative Education

**1979–1982     Clare College, Cambridge University**

- MA Class II.i (Part I Mathematics, Part II Law)
- Entrance Exhibition in Mathematics

**Professional membership**

Member of Institute of Chartered Accountants

## **2. Conflicts of Interest and previous conduct**

Ms Spielman declares that she has no personal conflicts of interest. She recognises potential conflicts of interest presented by her non-executive roles at Ofqual, Floreat, Brunel University, and STEMNET, her consultancy work, and adviser role with ARK. If confirmed as HMCI she will step down from these positions.

## Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 5 July 2016**

Members present:

Neil Carmichael in the Chair

|                     |               |
|---------------------|---------------|
| Lucy Allan          | Ian Mearns    |
| Ian Austin          | Stephen Timms |
| Marion Fellows      | William Wragg |
| Catherine McKinnell |               |

Draft Report (*Appointment of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills*) proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

*Ordered*, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

Paragraphs 1 to 13 read and agreed to.

Five Papers were appended to the Report.

*Resolved*, That the Report be the Second Report of the Committee to the House.

*Ordered*, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

*Ordered*, That embargoed copies of the Report be made available (Standing Order No. 134).

[Adjourned till Wednesday 6 July at 9.00 am]

## Witness

---

The following witness gave evidence. Transcripts can be viewed on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

**Wednesday 29 June 2016**

*Question number*

**Amanda Spielman**, Government's preferred candidate for the post of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education, Children's Services and Skills

[Q1-97](#)

## List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

---

All publications from the Committee are available on the [publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

The reference number of the Government's response to each Report is printed in brackets after the HC printing number.

### Session 2015–16

|                            |   |                    |
|----------------------------|---|--------------------|
| First Report               | The role of Regional Schools Commissioners  | HC 401<br>(HC 975) |
| Second Report              | Holocaust Education   | HC 480<br>(HC 974) |
| Third Report               | Appointment of the Chief Regulator of Ofqual  | HC 822             |
| Fourth Report              | Mental health and well-being of looked-after children   | HC 481             |
| First Joint Special Report | Education, skills and productivity: commissioned research   | HC 565             |
| First Special Report       | Apprenticeships and traineeships for 16 to 19 year olds: Government Response to the Committee's Sixth Report of Session 2014–15 | HC 317             |
| Second Special Report      | Extremism in schools: the Trojan Horse affair: Ofsted Response to the Committee's Seventh Report of Session 2014–15             | HC 324             |
| Fourth Special Report      | Holocaust Education: Government Response to the Committee's Second Report of Session 2015–16                                    | HC 974             |
| Fifth Special Report       | The role of Regional Schools Commissioners: Government Response to the Committee's First Report of Session 2015–16              | HC 975             |

### Session 2016–17

|              |   |        |
|--------------|---|--------|
| First Report | Careers education, information, advice and guidance | HC 205 |
|--------------|---|--------|