

Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic Communities, Contributions and Cynefin in the New Curriculum Working Group

Interim report

Contents

Ministerial foreword	2
Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic Communities, Contributions and Cynefin in the New Curriculum Working Group – Interim Report	3
1. Background	3
2. Scope of initial report	3
3. Introduction	4
4. Methodology	6
5. Initial findings of review of current resources	8
6. Barriers and levers	12
7. Summary and conclusions	16
Recommendations	17
Annex A	19
Annex B	20

Ministerial foreword

My sincere thanks to Professor Charlotte Williams OBE for chairing the Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic Communities, Contributions and Cynefin in the New Curriculum Working Group and to all its members for their hard work and dedication to this important area of work.

Our new curriculum is a significant opportunity to enhance and improve the teaching of the history and histories of our nation, so that young people are engaged in rich learning experiences about our shared histories, geography and cultures. Learners of all ages will be exposed to a range of historical periods on a local and national level.

It's very important that our new curriculum reflects the true diversity of our population and that learners understand how this diversity has shaped contemporary society. When the new curriculum goes live in 2022 I want to ensure that there will be a wide range of resources for teachers to use covering these important areas of our history in Wales and beyond. The Working Group has provided invaluable advice on how resources, materials and professional learning can be identified, developed and categorised. This work will help Government, pupils, teachers and the sector as a whole, right across the new curriculum.

This interim report calls on schools to engage more with their local communities. Schools will be supported to engage with heritage professionals, museums and galleries, as well as community and cultural leaders when designing their curriculum, in order to enrich the learning and experiences for all learners. So within the parameters set out in the guidance, teachers will have the flexibility to tailor the content of lessons to allow learners to explore *their* Cynefin.

We believe that this is the best way for them to understand how their local identities, landscapes and histories connect with those on the national and international stage.

I look forward to Estyn's report on their review of the teaching of Welsh history and diversity in schools next year. Its findings will further help us to commission resources to ensure that teachers have the support they need to deliver the curriculum successfully.

I also look forward to receiving the final report from the Working Group in spring 2021, which will cover professional learning and development and will help us to build upon our strong professional learning foundations as we move closer towards 2022 when the new curriculum is in place.

Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic Communities, Contributions and Cynefin in the New Curriculum Working Group – Interim Report

1. Background

In July 2020 the Minister for Education appointed a Working Group to advise on and improve the teaching of themes relating to Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities and experiences across all parts of the school curriculum.

The main objectives of the Working Group are to complete a review of the learning resources currently available to support the teaching of themes relating to Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities, their contributions and experiences, across all Areas of Learning and Experience (AoLE), and to advise on the commission of new learning resources in these areas, drawing on the advice of existing experts and groups. The group will also review associated professional learning opportunities and resources.

The Working Group comprises independent members, who are experienced practitioners and contributors to Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic and Welsh history, led by Professor Charlotte Williams OBE and supported by Welsh Government officials. Full membership is annexed to the [Terms of Reference](#).

The work of the Group should be placed within the context of a number of initiatives instituted by the Welsh Government, including the Task and Finish Group appointed by the First Minister in July 2020 and chaired by Gaynor Legall, to carry out an audit of public monuments, street and building names associated with aspects of Wales' Black history, particularly the slave trade and the British Empire but also touching on the historical contributions to Welsh life of people of Black heritage.

The Working Group has contributed to the Wales Centre for Public Policy's Education evidence review, underpinning the development of the Race Equality Action Plan. A member of the Group has volunteered to represent the Working Group on the Race Equality Action Plan Steering Group.

The Group also includes two Estyn Inspectors as observers to ensure it is closely aligned to the current Estyn review of Welsh and international Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history. This ongoing review, due to report in October 2021, will assess how diversity is currently being taught in schools in Wales.

2. Scope of initial report

This report contains the group's initial conclusions and recommendations concerning learning resources currently available to support the teaching of

themes relating to Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities, contributions and experiences, across all Areas of Learning and Experience.

It is recognised that there is more work to be done to equip and support teachers to meet expectations as they design their curriculum and in their pedagogical practice. This will be the subject of the Working Group's second phase of work and next report.

3. Introduction

Wales is a multicultural, multiethnic society. Pupil Level Annual School Census¹ data states that in 2019, 12% of all pupils aged five and over came from minority ethnic backgrounds. There is considerable regional variation in the percentage of Welsh pupils identifying as being from minority ethnic backgrounds, ranging from 34.4% in Cardiff schools to just 4.1% in Anglesey but despite this regional variation, ethnic diversity can be seen in all areas of Wales.

The Group's objectives are to contribute towards the key purpose of the Curriculum for Wales to promote *'ethical and informed citizens of Wales and the world'* through ensuring the availability of meaningful resources to support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes in schools, and to encourage teachers and schools to engage with the multiethnic nature of Wales in all pedagogical practice, thereby reflecting the ambition of the Curriculum for Wales for *'practitioners to think afresh about what they teach, how they teach and about what we want young people to be as well as to learn'*.

There are a number of compelling reasons to engage with this objective. Every learner, irrespective of their background, should have the opportunity to explore the diverse experiences and contributions of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic peoples in Wales, past and present. Learners from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic backgrounds should also expect a positive and enriched learning experience.

The Equality Act establishes the Public Sector Equality Duty (PSED). Compliance with the Public Sector Equality Duty (PSED) is a legal requirement for local authority maintained schools in Wales, but meeting it also makes good educational sense. Schools are required to publish and review Strategic Equality Plans (SEPs) to set out how they will act on this duty. The Equality duty requires schools to *promote* equality not merely

¹ The following caveat is given by the Welsh Government for Pupil Level Annual School Census data in October 2020: "Whilst most of the usual data validation processes on the 2020 school census data have taken place, due to the coronavirus pandemic, the data did not undergo the usual final validation process. As part of the Welsh Local Government Finance Settlement, the data is usually returned to local authorities for final validation. Typically, overall numbers of pupils and teachers will not change significantly during this period, with the most likely change being in the characteristics of the pupils themselves. Users should therefore be more cautious when comparing data on characteristics of pupils of pupils and staff over time, in particular where small cohorts are involved." <https://statswales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Education-and-Skills/Schools-and-Teachers/Schools-Census/Pupil-Level-Annual-School-Census/Ethnicity-National-Identity-and-Language/pupilsaged5andover-by-localauthorityregion-ethnicity>

mitigate racisms and discrimination. As such, this statutory duty underpins all teaching and learning that is provided in the school, as well as the school ethos and culture.

Estyn are the education and training inspectorate for Wales. They provide public accountability to service users on the quality and standards of education and training in Wales, they inform the development of national policy by the Welsh Government and build capacity for improvement of the education and training system in Wales. As well as inspecting, Estyn advise and guide the Welsh Government on quality and standards. Their thematic reports are commissioned by the Minister for Education.

Legislation sets out the powers of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales. This includes what Estyn may or must inspect and report on.

When Estyn inspect a provider's teaching and learning experiences, inspectors consider 'the ways in which the school develops a curriculum that fully reflects the nature of the school's context, including designing learning activities that reflect the cultural, linguistic and ethnic diversity of Wales and the school's local area.'

From 2022, there will be a new [Curriculum for Wales](#). At the heart of the Curriculum for Wales are the four purposes, which include that learners should develop as "*ethical, informed citizens of Wales and the World*", who are knowledgeable about their culture, community, society and the world now and in the past, and respect the needs and rights of others, as a member of a diverse society.

A defining feature of the Framework is that it requires *schools* to design their own curriculum² and assessment arrangements. By itself, it is not an 'off the shelf' programme for delivery. This new approach recognises that within the national framework, schools and practitioners are best placed to make decisions about the needs of their specific learners, including choosing topics and activities which will best support their learning. As part of this national framework, the cross-cutting themes guidance³ explains that Wales, like any other society, is not a uniform entity, but encompasses a range of values, perspectives, cultures and histories that are inclusive of everyone who lives in Wales. It goes on to state that in designing a curriculum, practitioners should incorporate opportunities for learners to celebrate diverse backgrounds and values and promote an understanding of the ethnic and cultural diversity within Wales. In reference to the What Matters Statements for Humanities⁴: "*Societies are characterised by a range of cultural, linguistic, economic, legal and political norms and values. They are also dynamic, both driving and*

² Curriculum for Wales: Designing your curriculum <https://hwb.gov.wales/curriculum-for-wales/designing-your-curriculum/>

³ Curriculum for Wales: Cross-cutting themes for designing your curriculum <https://hwb.gov.wales/curriculum-for-wales/designing-your-curriculum/cross-cutting-themes-for-designing-your-curriculum/>

⁴ Curriculum for Wales: Humanities Statements of What Matters <https://hwb.gov.wales/curriculum-for-wales/humanities/statements-of-what-matters/>

reacting to changes on a local, national and global scale. Learners can explore the connections and interdependence between such societies in the past and present, in the context of a globalised world. Further engagement will also encourage them to explore – and develop a tolerant and empathetic understanding of – the varied beliefs, values, traditions and ethics that underpin and shape human society.”

The Curriculum for Wales therefore offers significant opportunities for schools to explore different aspects of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic experiences and contributions throughout the curriculum. Co-production and collaboration between schools, parents, public and relevant Non Governmental Organisations should be the main focus of this.

At the same time, without a full list of prescribed topics in the new Curriculum for Wales and the autonomy of schools in designing their own curricula within a national framework, there is a risk these themes continue to be ignored or marginalised. While learning about diversity, identity and belonging, justice and equality, rights and social action will be mandatory in schools’ curricula, there is no statutory requirement to teach specific topics of central understanding to the histories of racism and diversity, for example, the histories of slavery or the Holocaust. This is of concern. The Working group have grounded this report within the parameters of the new curriculum, acknowledging that it is not content driven, but advancing the case that good quality curricula should necessarily and substantively reflect these themes. The report thus looks at how this can be achieved without the content-specific prescription that the Curriculum for Wales does not allow. The statutory, ethical, demographic and disciplinary mandate is clear, good quality educational provision will include attention to these perspectives, experiences and contributions. Teaching practitioners will need to be upskilled to deliver on this commitment and provided with the necessary support and guidance to ensure these opportunities are grasped.

4. Methodology

The Group has sought information from numerous areas to enable them to carry out their initial review of resources. Working within the limitations of the timescale, the groups methodology is as follows;

- Learning materials currently available to support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes on Hwb, the Welsh Government’s Resource repository, were reviewed, both in terms of content and their accessibility to teachers;
- The Learned Society of Wales’ audit of learning resources available to support the teaching of Welsh and international dimensions within the Curriculum for Wales were reviewed;
- The Group called for exemplars of materials in use, and have reviewed numerous resources currently unavailable on Hwb, such as web links, vlogs, articles, books, films, video clips and research projects;

- The Group considered major UK wide reports into the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes, such as those produced by the Runnymede Trust, Historical Society and Black Curriculum UK;
- Examples of work carried out by bodies such as the Royal Society to improve diversity within STEM in the UK were considered by the Group;
- The Chair has held useful and informative meetings with numerous stakeholders and interested parties. A full list of organisations with whom the Chair has met is included at Annex A;
- The Group decided that focus groups should be held with young people and teachers from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic backgrounds to draw on their experiences and ask what changes they would like to see;
- The group received and contributed to detailed documents underpinning a Race Equality Rapid Evidence Review in relation to Education, collated by the Welsh Centre for Public Policy.

A focus group was held with young people from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic backgrounds and of various ages on 15 October, arranged by a Group member and hosted by the Ethnic Minorities and Youth Support Team⁵. The young people shared open and honest accounts of their experiences and, in some instances, the impact those experiences had later on in their school lives and after finishing school. Key themes included a lack of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic role models presented as part of teaching, a feeling that elements of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history were taught as a ‘tickbox’ exercise and were not always understood by their teachers, and a general sense that there was a lack of overall representation of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic presence in schools and in teaching. In some situations this had led to a negative experience in school and in others it hadn’t been recognised as an issue. Being taught solely about negative events in history can lead to learners having a negative sense of themselves. The focus group outcomes point to the marginal nature of these themes in the current curriculum and to the impact of this deficit on all learners. Educating all young people on the diverse histories and cultures will have a positive impact for all and not just the BAME pupils. It will work towards eradicating racism and ignorance and educate all in the rich diversity of Wales creating an informed more respectful future generation.

Estyn are currently undertaking a thematic report on Welsh and Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history in schools. The review will assess how diversity is taught in schools and consider if the history taught in schools is representative of all of Wales’ communities and their international connections. The review will also take account of Welsh and wider BAME history, identity and culture.

⁵ Ethnic Minorities & Youth Support Team was set up in 2005 by a group of ethnic minority young people in Swansea. It aimed to fill a gap in provision for young BME people aged 11-25 by providing a targeted, culturally sensitive and holistic support service to meet their needs. Since then, EYST has expanded its mission and vision to also meet the needs of BME young people, families and individuals including refugees and asylum-seekers living in Wales. <http://eyst.org.uk/>

As part of their evidence gathering, inspectors will be engaging with pupils from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic backgrounds in a range of schools across Wales. The views of these pupils will form part of the report's evidence base.

To mark the start of Black History Month on 1 October 2020 (now known as Black History 365), the Group published a [Vision Statement](#) and a [Teachers Prompt Sheet](#):

- The Vision Statement sets out the aims of the group's work for learners, as 'ethical and informed citizens of Wales and the world', and for teachers, as designers of their curriculum.
- The Teachers Prompt Sheet is intended to encourage teachers to consider questions such as what examples of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic individuals and groups are currently a part of their curriculum offer, and how they can stimulate pupils to represent and explore their own heritage and bring this material to bear on their learning.
- The Group is currently developing an infographic to represent the diversity in Wales' education workforce, based on statistics contained within Education Workforce Council 2020 report.

5. Initial findings of review of current resources

Current Curriculum

Although the National Curriculum in Wales has a degree of prescription, schools have considerable freedom to select the precise content they teach. The group has seen no clear evidence on the extent to which existing school curricula address issues of race and diversity (or indeed any other specific issue or theme) within history or any other subject. The group has seen no evidence of cross cutting or interdisciplinary work as yet.

Current resources

In this phase of work, the Group focused on the resources available on Hwb, the Welsh Government's database of teaching resources. There are major gaps in the available resources which support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes across the curriculum. A review of Hwb identified only eleven resources with a black history focus, and the majority of these are considered by the Group to be outdated, lacking in supporting material for teachers, and of little relevance to Wales (of especial importance with the new curriculum's emphasis on *cynefin*⁶). The Group finds particularly concerning

⁶ Definition of 'cynefin' as it appears on the Welsh Government website: The place where we feel we belong, where the people and landscape around us are familiar, and the sights and sounds are reassuringly recognisable. Though often translated as 'habitat', cynefin is not just a place in a

the lack of resources in the areas of Health and Wellbeing, Mathematics and Numeracy, and Science and Technology.

The Group is also concerned about the quality of the translations of resources into Welsh. Anecdotal evidence suggests that resources are sometimes translated poorly and are difficult to use with pupils. Not enough attention is given to ensuring that the materials, once translated, are suitable for the reading ages of pupils. Too often teachers need to further simplify and adapt materials. Although, teachers sometimes use primary source materials in the original language for example primary accounts, supporting materials, resources and tasks are presented in Welsh. Translated materials should be checked by practitioners to ensure that they are useful and worthwhile.

It is clear from the initial review of resources that there is a need to change the narrative around the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes. Existing resources are disproportionately focused on slavery, colonialism and Empire. This needs to be balanced with resources focusing on the wider histories of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities in Wales and on the contributions of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities in contemporary society.

As research in England has demonstrated, teaching black history only as the history of racism can lead to Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic pupils developing a negative sense of themselves.⁷ Histories of migration might encourage a view of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic people as outsiders who have moved to Wales from elsewhere rather than as a long-established part of Welsh society.

Whilst Hwb is the primary repository for teaching and learning resources for schools in Wales, it is not the only available source. Teachers in Wales search for resources in depositories such as [Tes.com](https://www.tes.com) and have access to Regional hubs that provide resource materials⁸⁹¹⁰¹¹. However, as there is no systematic or coherent approach to the plethora of resources available on Hwb and elsewhere it can be very difficult for teachers to negotiate the resources and identify those which would be of use to them. The Working Group was also disappointed with the lack of materials that had been produced by schools in conjunction with ethnic organisations, on a local or national level, and felt more could be done.

The Group recognises the difficulties faced by teaching practitioners in locating and identifying good quality resources to support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes across the curriculum. Given the

physiological or geographical sense: it is the historic, cultural and social place which has shaped and continues to shape the community which inhabits it.

⁷ K. Traille, 'You should be proud about your history. They made me feel ashamed': teaching history hurts', *Teaching History*, 127 (2007), 31-37.

⁸ Education through Regional Working: <https://porth.erw-rhwyd.cymru/repository>

⁹ Education Achievement Service for South East Wales: [Supporting Our Schools Playlist](https://supporting-our-schools-playlist) and <https://thingi.easmysid.co.uk/>

¹⁰ GwE - Towards Excellence: <https://www.gwegogledd.cymru>

¹¹ Central South Consortium: <https://www.cscjes.org.uk/repository>

amount of resources and material available, the Group propose working with Welsh Government to develop a preliminary resource guide for teaching practitioners that lists and evaluates the available resources to support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes across the curriculum. The resource guide should include material available on Hwb and beyond, and should signpost resources from key national institutions, education groups, and other sources in Wales and the wider world.

Many of these resources, especially primary resources and those developed outside Wales, will only be available through the medium of English, and the Group understands that this is not ideal. However, one effective way of increasing the availability of good quality bilingual resources in a short period of time would be to identify suitable and text-based monolingual resources, and then work with their authors to have the material translated. It should then be possible for the resources to be hosted on Hwb.

Learning Society Review of Resources

The Group carried out a review of the mapping exercise undertaken by The Learned Society of Wales to identify resources available to support the Welsh and International dimensions of the new Curriculum for Wales. These resources did not include those hosted on Hwb.

The Learned Society's report concluded that history is better resourced than other areas of the humanities Area of Learning and Experience. However, it demonstrated that many of resources are local in nature and have not been uploaded to Hwb. The report does note that there is a need for resources to be reconsidered and re-tailored for the new curriculum. Thus the existence of resources alone is not always a solution to promoting different kinds of history.

However, the report goes on to note that "there is little by way of specific educational material to support women's history, LGBTQIA history, or the history of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities" and that Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities are underrepresented in resources for each Area of Learning and Experience.

Within the timeframes for this initial report, the Group have been unable to investigate each resource mapped by the Learned Society, and it is therefore impossible to be precise about how Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities and individuals are represented in the resources. It may be that some of the resources have considerable material on Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities but that this is not obvious from their title and description. Nonetheless, of 363 history resources mapped, only two appear to be explicitly about Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities and individuals, although both were available bilingually taking the total to four.¹²

¹² The number 363 does not truly reflect the extent of history resources since it double counts many resources available in both Welsh and English.

Hwb

Hwb is the Welsh Government sponsored repository for school resources and as such is one of the primary sources of teaching materials in Wales. All resources hosted on Hwb are bilingual.

As Hwb is dependent on what schools, teachers and others submit to it, the content is somewhat eclectic, and there is no systematic or coherent approach to the resources, particularly in relation to the humanities and the arts. Resources hosted on Hwb include academic research papers, local history resources, literature, teaching and training materials. Not all the resources include guidance for teachers about how they could be used in the classroom, and indeed some are essentially historical documents rather than teaching resources.

The majority of resources to support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes relate to the Humanities and Language, Literature and Communications. The Group's initial search of Hwb identified eleven resources which are directly relevant to the teaching of themes relating to Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history. These resources are listed at Annex B.

The Group has identified a particular concern about the lack of available resources to support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes in the subject areas of Health and Wellbeing, Mathematics and Numeracy and Science and Technology. It is very important that Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic contributions are not reflected solely in the Humanities and Arts but throughout the curriculum. There is a danger that Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes may become marginalised if they are not engaged with across the wider curriculum.

No systematic or coherent approach has been taken to the organising the resources hosted on Hwb. The Group found the site to be incoherent and difficult to navigate, with not all resources tagged in a way that ensures they can be easily identified through searching for black history or similar terms. However it could be that this issue can be resolved by simply improving the classification and categorisation of resources hosted on Hwb.

It was felt that more could be done to monitor the resource content hosted on Hwb, which has resulted in Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic resources that are out of date, of various quality, and not appropriately contextualised within the history and development of Wales. For example, items on the civil rights movement in the USA and on key figures such as Martin Luther King are not connected to developments in Wales. There is nothing that offers an overall framework or chronology of the history and development of diversity and race

in Wales, acknowledging Welsh migration history, industrial development and involvement in colonisation and imperialism. Nor does there appear to be a wide range of resources focusing on contemporary Wales.

The issues raised by the limited number of resources to support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic experiences is exacerbated by their focus. The resources hosted on Hwb tend to be about Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic individuals as migrants or victims of racism. As discussed above, teaching Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history only as the history of racism can lead to learners developing a negative sense of themselves. The Group considers that it would be useful for a guide to be developed, detailing how to build resources and materials for inclusion on Hwb.

Material beyond Hwb

The group has reviewed wider resources to support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic Themes that are not currently available on Hwb.

A number of non-Wales specific resources have been identified as potentially being of use in supporting the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic Themes. Whilst these resources would link with the Curriculum for Wales' aspirations of connecting Wales to the world, learners may struggle to connect resources focussing on British, English or international material to Wales or their local community, both in the current curriculum and going forward in the Curriculum for Wales.

Beyond the Humanities, the Group have noted the quality material produced Diversity and Science by the [Royal Society](#). The [Royal Academy of Engineering](#) have produced videos of real people doing fantastic jobs in STEM which are very relatable and inspirational. Several of the people featured in the videos are from Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic backgrounds.

The [Black Curriculum UK](#) is a Non Governmental Organisation with an active and sophisticated online presence aimed at supporting the work of teachers across the UK. Their work includes four carefully resourced areas of focus: Arts and History; Migration; Politics and Legal; Land and Environment. This could provide a model for the organisation and development of resources in Wales.

The Group was also pleased to see that the UK Parliament had made available its new illustrated book about [Influential Black Britons in both English and Welsh](#). **The book is a** primary resource, sharing short stories of inspirational black men and women from UK Parliament's history for Black History Month 2020.

6. Barriers and levers

The challenge in securing the inclusion of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes and experiences across the curriculum is not just a matter of creating

and improving the content of teaching and learning resource, but enabling access to resources, changing mindsets and practices and providing support via exemplars, prompts and guidance. It will also be necessary to establish methods of mandating this effort and ensuring sustainable outcomes. Teachers are not always adequately equipped to address questions of race and racism in their teaching and their wider classroom and pastoral duties. This requires training and a cultural change. A problem cannot be solved until the problem is understood and acknowledged.

The Learned Society of Wales (LSW) report notes that it is accepted that the required emphasis on Wales in the current curriculum has not been achieved despite the wide availability of Welsh history resources. The LSW thus argues:

This highlights that there is insufficient flow-through of existing resources to schools themselves, and thus these resources are under-utilised. Teachers require more guidance about exploring the multiple narratives of Wales and its diverse contexts, and existing resources require appropriate curation. It is vital that teachers are provided with access to a directory of available resources, so that they develop their own engagement with the WDIP [Welsh Dimension and International Perspective] aspect of the new curriculum.

This suggests that the creation of new resources will not be enough to promote Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history. Teachers will need to know that they are there and have guidance about using them. The Group will consider professional learning and development in this area, including initial teacher education and training for newly qualified and established teaching practitioners in the final report.

School governors and Inspectors may also require some relevant prompts and guidance material in order to ensure that professional learning and development is delivered effectively and on a sustainable basis.

However, the issue may go deeper than the question of professional development and training. The availability of a wealth of Welsh history resources has not created an emphasis on Welsh history within the existing curriculum. A 2013 report for Welsh Government about why Welsh history was not taught more identified the importance of teachers and pupils feeling a topic matters and that it is of interest.¹³ Research in England has shown how teachers can shy away from teaching what they perceive as difficult topics.¹⁴

It could be that the emphasis on Cynefin in the new Curriculum for Wales may not be helpful here. Cynefin encourages a view of history that begins at the local. It may mean that in parts of Wales where Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic numbers are very small, Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history is not regarded as part of the local environment.

¹³ The Cwricwlwm Cymreig, History and the Story of Wales: Final report (2013).

¹⁴ Richard Harris, 'Purpose as a way of helping white trainee history teachers engage with diversity issues', Education Sciences, 2 (2012), 218-41.

It is thus important that at least some new resources address Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history at a Welsh level and think about the position of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history and individuals as part of the Welsh nation. In doing this, they should not just address the histories of migration and racism but also the positive contributions individuals and communities have made to the Welsh nation and Welsh society. This means stepping beyond centring the locality and its wider connections to centring Wales. This will help ensure all pupils in Wales feel Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic history is part of their own collective history.

Practitioners should be supported and encouraged to develop curricula that reflect attention to Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes and perspectives across all Areas of Learning and Experience. Only in this way will we achieve an integrated curriculum that substantially addresses the needs of learners and represents a breadth and depth of knowledge of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic contributions. It is not simply the remit of the Humanities and Arts to reflect Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic contributions, past and present, and the focus on history alone, although important, will not result in an adequate integration of these perspectives and will leave them marginalised within the new curriculum. In addition, attention to these themes across the range of Areas of Learning and Experience opens up opportunities for innovative and imaginative inter-disciplinary projects.

As discussed above, the Group have noted the current lack of resources to teach Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes in the areas of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths; Health and Wellbeing; and Maths and Numeracy. However, the Group understand that the Welsh Government will be working with partners to focus on the creation of new resources in these important areas, and we welcome this development.

The Group has noted with interest ongoing work to ensure more diversity within the STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics) workforce.

In the new curriculum, the Science and Technology AoLE draws on the disciplines of biology, chemistry, computer science, design and technology and physics. Developments in these areas have always been drivers of change in society, underpinning innovation and impacting on everyone's lives, materially, economically and culturally. Likewise the Mathematics and Numeracy AoLE is essential to developing mathematical resilience in learners. It's a cross cutting theme which is key to the development of ambitious and capable learners.

Studying STEM subjects can lead to exciting STEM careers in industries which are important to the vitality and success of a nation. However there are skill shortages in the STEM sector. It is projected that by 2021 there will be significant growth in the proportion of professional STEM jobs in the UK economy (UK Commission for Employment and Skills, 2016, p 73). Traditionally there has been underrepresentation from sections of society, such as females and Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities. A diverse workforce is not just desirable in terms of equality,

but essential to maximising opportunities for all learners and meeting Wales' economic needs.

The Women in Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (WiSTEM) Board is a forum for STEM ambassadors to come together to discuss issues and progress. The Board also leads to improve gender equality across the Welsh STEM community. Two sub-groups have been formed to drive forward direct activity in their respective areas:

- WiSTEM Industry Sub-Group chaired by Susan Jones – Tata Steel
- WiSTEM Education Sub-Group chaired by Dr Anita Shaw – Director of STEMpowered Learning

Professor Charlotte Williams has met Dr Shaw to explore opportunities for crossover and shared goals between the Working Group and the WISTEM Education Sub-Group.

In June 2020 Dr Anita Shaw wrote to Jane Hutt, MS to highlight the fact that the WiSTEM Board and its subgroups provide a perfect platform from which to identify and embrace the changes needed to support better educational outcomes for Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic girls in school and better representation of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic women in STEM industry, academia and in decision-making positions. The Education Sub-Group sat on 18 September 2020. The membership agreed to change the Terms of Reference to:

'Enabling Wales to be a nation where there are no barriers to accessing STEM opportunities at all levels of education. In its consideration of equality and diversity it will focus on underrepresented groups in STEM initially focussing on females *and those from the Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities*'.

The Minister of Education is keen, going forward, for the Education sub group to look more specifically at Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic issues with Women in STEM, both in terms of education and the link with industry and has asked officials to consider these issues and the links between these pieces of work.

Encouragement culture will also be an essential lever and it will be important to champion pioneers. The [Professional Teaching Awards Cymru](#) were acknowledged by the Group as a significant event and the Group agreed that they would like to see an additional award to champion pioneers in the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes and experiences in their curriculum, ideally taking a whole school approach.

The Group is also looking at how they could use the work and research carried out by innovation schools for this academic year. This will also help

the Group to consider how they could make use of pilots to garner and share good practice.

7. Summary and conclusions

Good quality educational provision requires curricula that reflect the integration of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic experiences and contributions, past and present. Strong curricula will reflect attention to these issues and adopt innovative and imaginative ways of embedding and making sustainable these concerns both within and across the AoLEs.

The initial review of resources makes clear the lack of a systematic and coherent approach to the provision of good quality bilingual resources to support integration of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes and contributions across all AoLEs. It has also identified significant gaps in available and accessible resources to support some areas of the curriculum. Resources alone will not be enough to address the current deficit. Much will rely on the capacity, commitment and competence of the education workforce to implement and sustain this initiative in the spirit of the new curriculum.

The challenge in securing the inclusion of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes and experiences across the curriculum is not just a matter of creating and improving the content of teaching and learning resource, but enabling access to resources, changing mindsets and practices and providing support via exemplars, prompts and guidance. In phase two the Working Group will turn their attention to this capacity building and will report before the end of 2020 on professional development requirements.

The initial recommendations that follow relate to the resource review.

Recommendations

We recommend:

Recommendation 1: The development of **an online preliminary resource guide** that lists and evaluates the available resources for Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic contributions and experiences past and present for each Area of Learning and Experience. This should include material on Hwb and beyond. It will signpost resources from key national institutions, education groups, and other sources in Wales and beyond. The guide should be regularly reviewed and updated.

Recommendation 2: The inclusion on Hwb of **guidance on how to build materials**, exemplars and processes, and interdisciplinary resources that will lead to the ongoing extension and development of materials.

Recommendation 3: The **improvement of classification and categorisation of resources** on Hwb to ensure that it is easier for teaching practitioners and other users to navigate and find resources relating to Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes.

Recommendation 4: Welsh Government to work with the authors of suitable English medium Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic resources to provide high quality **Welsh translations**, thereby ensuring greater access resources.

Recommendation 5: The development of a **new suite of bilingual teaching and professional development resources** that provide a detailed exploration of diversity in Wales in the past and present. These **background papers**, servicing all AoLE, should include: a narrative guide to the history of diversity in Wales; a narrative guide to Wales' role in British colonialism; biographies of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic individuals from a variety of

backgrounds that explore their contributions to Welsh, British and international life; literary writings by Welsh Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic individuals; a narrative guide to the history of racism and anti-racism in Wales.

Recommendation 6: Welsh Government to work with partners to focus on the creation of new bilingual resources in Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths; Health and Wellbeing; and Maths and Numeracy. Each of the new resources should be accompanied by **flexible and high-quality teaching and learning materials** that could be used by teachers as part of their curriculum offer at a range of points throughout the 3-16 learning continuum. This suite of resources could be produced through a process of co-construction with practitioners.

Recommendation 7: **Estyn to review and report** on how well schools deliver a broad and balanced curriculum that addresses diversity across all Areas of Learning and Experience, and to promote the sharing of best practice through case studies and thematic reports.

Recommendation 8: The **creation of a new award category for schools in Future Wales Teaching Awards** to promote the inclusion of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic histories/ contributions/ experiences across all subjects in schools.

Annex A

List of individuals and organisations met by the Chair to date

- Kay Denyer, Director of Race Council Cymru
- Chantelle Haughton, Chair of Black History Wales Committee and lecturer at Cardiff Metropolitan University
- Dr Anita Shaw, Chair of Women in Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (WiSTEM) Education Sub-Group
- Gaynor Legall, Chair of The Slave Trade and the British Empire: An Audit of Commemoration in Wales Task and Finish Group
- Wales Race Forum
- Liz Millman, Founder of Learning Links International
- Diane Hebb, Director of Arts Council for Wales
- Professor Emmanuel Ogbonna, Trustee and Vice-Chair of Race Council Cymru, and Co-Chair of Race Equality Action Plan Steering Group
- Black History Management Committee
- Governors Cymru Services
- Shavanah Taj, General Secretary of the Wales Trades Union Congress (TUC)
- Roger Lewis, President of the National Museum Wales
- Wales Centre for Public Policy

Annex B

Resources to support the teaching of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic themes hosted on Hwb

All descriptions are taken from Hwb.

[Slavery and Wales: Past and Present 2018](#)

This resource gives a contemporary Welsh dimension to learning about both the slave trade and modern slavery. Targeted at upper Key Stage 2 and Key Stage 3, it supports teachers in developing pupils as ethical and informed citizens of Wales and the world, especially engaging with contemporary issues based upon their knowledge and values. Comprising four activities, it includes film clips, a class debate, group activities and case studies.

[Black history month informative PowerPoint](#)

This PowerPoint is aimed at learners aged 5 to 7 years old to help support your teaching about Black History Month and its significance. It contains detailed information on why this month is celebrated and when it is celebrated, and also contains useful information about significant Black people like Nelson Mandela, Mary Seacole, Barack Obama, and others. Learners will begin to recognise other people's feelings and viewpoints about familiar events or experiences

[Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic \(BAME\) History in Wales](#)

This resource contains links to People's Collection Wales content that tells the stories of ethnic minority people and communities in Wales. It is suitable for Foundation Phase (Foundation phase teachers should review content before sharing it with learners) and Key Stage 2 to 4 learners. The content includes images, objects, stories, oral history recordings and film, and can be used by learners to explore issues of identity, equality and discrimination within a Welsh context

[1919 Race Riots \(National Library of Wales\)](#)

This pack, suitable for Key Stage 2 to 4 learners, contains journals, newspaper reports, videos, and other sources documenting and analysing the South Wales Race Riots in 1919.

[1919 Tiger Bay race riots: Migration, crime and British society](#)

History resources, suitable for Key Stage 2 to 4 learners, which look at the causes and effect of Commonwealth migration to Wales in the early twentieth century. The resources focus on the impact of the 1919 Tiger Bay race riots.

[Swansea Windrush Intergenerational Project](#)

A resource suitable for Key Stage 3 to 4 history learners about the Swansea Windrush Intergenerational Project which was developed by the African

Community Centre (ACC). They worked with young people in local schools, to research the lives of the Windrush generation who arrived in Wales from the West Indies between the 1940s and 1970s.

[An Approach to Black History](#)

This resource provides teachers with a range of stimulus for developing lessons for Black History Week (Nick Blackburn - Griffithstown Primary - Torfaen). [Not Wales specific.]

[Black History Month](#)

A set of resources for Key Stage 2 to 4 learners, focusing on bringing awareness to the Black History Month and the important figures in its society. [Not Wales specific.]

[Refugees to Wales](#)

Resources for KS2 & 3 that include information and interactive exercises based on works of art by (historical) refugees that came to Wales. They were produced as part of the AHRC-funded project European Travellers to Wales.

[Stories of sanctuary in Wales](#)

A classroom resource exploring asylum and refuge in Wales which aims to develop learners' understanding of and empathy with those seeking sanctuary. Suitable for Key Stages 3 and 4, it includes a PowerPoint quiz, a refugee role play and five (historical) case studies about asylum and refugees in Wales, each with suggested learning activities that can be used on their own or in combination plus links to additional resources.

[Windrush migration pack \(British Council\)](#)

This teaching pack for 4 to 14-year-olds' contains lesson ideas for discussion around migration. It focuses on the Windrush migration in 1948, celebrating the contribution that Caribbean migrants have made to the prosperity of Britain. [Not Wales specific.]