

Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department

National Evaluation of Determined to Succeed – Phase 2: Early Impact Across Scotland

John Rodger and Alison Hunter, York Consulting Limited

Determined to Succeed is the Scottish Executive's enterprise in education strategy which aims to make a major contribution to the creation of an enterprise culture and economic growth. Following the recommendations of the Review of Education for Work and Enterprise set up in September 2001 the Scottish Executive set out its Determined to Succeed (DtS): Enterprise in Education (EinE) strategy. The results reported here are key findings from research carried out by York Consulting Limited (YCL) between January 2005 and October 2005. This Phase 2 study follows a Phase 1 study, which was commissioned and reported separately and which examined the views of key stakeholders on initial planning and early implementation of DtS, in Scotland. The Phase 2 analysis contains both quantitative and qualitative elements, to examine and measure the effectiveness of DtS in bringing about attitudinal and cultural changes and to evaluate its success in delivering national recommendations. An important dimension of the study involved the development of a quantitative tool that could be used to measure DtS impact over time. Ultimately, the evaluation is designed to inform policy, delivery and future commitment to the DtS strategy.

Main Findings

- 88% of headteachers believe DtS is an excellent initiative and 78% believe that DtS provides a strong focus for the school. 86% of teachers were confident that DtS is having a positive impact on pupils. 79% of headteachers have DtS plans and targets detailed in their school development plans.
- The majority of schools have experienced positive development in the way they are embracing DtS. This included an increase in activity, as well as teaching and learning which could be classified as DtS-oriented.
- Headteachers – as strong 'networkers' – expose the school and its pupils to a wider range of experiences and insights than might otherwise be evident in school life. This fits well with the ethos behind DtS.
- There was general agreement across schools that DtS had contributed to a changing school environment, with some showing that DtS can act as a vehicle to address and facilitate the wider education policy agenda (such as A Curriculum for Excellence).
- Developments in teaching and learning styles – influenced by DtS – are impacting upon pupils' understanding of building competences and transferring strengths across different types of learning experiences.
- Incentives for schools to engage with DtS were more obvious in primary, special and lower-attaining secondary schools.
- Of the 7 DtS-related themes explored in the study, pupil confidence and communication were most readily identified by staff and pupils, as areas of learning focus. Personal effectiveness and approach to learning were least obvious. Problem solving appeared to have a stronger focus in primary schools and life beyond school was a particular focus for special schools.
- Local authorities (LAs) and schools felt that it was too early to directly attribute outcomes or impacts to the influence of DtS due to other related ongoing strategies/ initiatives in schools.
- A quantitative technique – the Index of Enterprising Attitudes and Behaviour (IOEAB) – has been developed to set a baseline for the enterprise and behaviour of young people.

Background

A key aspect of the Scottish Executive's enterprise policy agenda – characterised by the vision set out in 'Ambitious, Excellent Schools' – has been the Determined to Succeed (DtS): enterprise in education strategy. The strategy aims to instil a 'can-do, will-do' attitude in school pupils, to support achievement and attainment in school and in preparation for life beyond school. The DtS strategy is based on a £86 million investment programme over five years (2003-2008) and comprises of four key themes: enterprising teaching and learning, entrepreneurial learning, work-based vocational learning and appropriately focused career education.

About the Study

The research and consultation exercise was based on a programme of surveys involving pupils, teachers, parents and headteachers, plus a series of qualitative case study visits to schools. In order to structure the study's quantitative dimension, DtS was broken down into 7 broad components, or themes – working with others; personal effectiveness; problem solving and creativity; communication; approach to learning; confidence; life beyond school. A new technique – the Index of Enterprising Attitudes and Behaviour (IOEAB) was developed to generate a relative measure or score of determination across the individual 7 themes and at an aggregated level.

Key Findings of the Research

Local Authority Progress in Planning and Delivering DtS

Enterprise Development Officers (EDOs) indicated that the majority of their schools had experienced positive development in the way they embrace DtS.

This was mainly related to an increase in activity, as well as teaching and learning which could be classified as DtS-oriented.

The EDO function is showing clear signs of development, through a range of different styles and processes being implemented at LA level, and with the aim of providing support and direction to schools. At this stage, EDOs were unable to conclude that this was having a direct impact upon pupil skills, attitudes and behaviours, although there was general confidence that this would be realised in the future.

School Perspectives of DtS

School management and staff views of DtS were overwhelmingly positive – it was referred to as 'placing the pupil at the heart of the curriculum and not the subject'. DtS was felt to promote teaching and learning, which focuses on building competencies and transferring strengths.

Headteachers noted positive developments in the following areas:

- strong school awareness of DtS and significant school activity
- an increase in CPD activity related to DtS
- evidence of heightened stakeholder engagement
- a shared staff understanding of what DtS is about (with an emphasis on pupil-centred approaches to education)

- a strong 'leap of faith' mentality concerning the relationship between DtS and pupil achievement and attainment
- impacts on pupil enthusiasm, confidence and engagement with school

Partner Perspectives

The term 'Determined to Succeed' was not well-known among school partners and stakeholders (including parents and members of the local community). While 'enterprise education' was more familiar, this tended to be restricted to the 'make and sell' aspects and learning about business. DtS has opened up avenues for schools to engage with partners more frequently and across a wide range of areas (e.g. partners providing direct support to schools through facilitating lessons and working with groups of pupils).

Pupil Perspectives

Pupils in primary school settings – especially those schools with a strong DtS ethos – tended to be most enthusiastic about their learning in the themes associated with DtS. They were also more articulate and insightful in their recognition of how these types of learning can be transferred from one curricular area to another.

Index of Enterprising Attitudes and Behaviour (IOEAB)

The IOEAB technique assumes the enterprising attitudes and behaviour of young people to be a function of seven behavioural traits which the study linked to the DtS overall strategy:

- working with others
- personal effectiveness
- problem solving/creativity
- communication
- approach to learning
- confidence
- life beyond school.

The Index is a weighted average of the responses to survey questionnaires, which creates a score on a scale from -100 (not very enterprising) to +100 (very enterprising).

The analysis shows that the overall IOEAB is positive for all three groups surveyed – parents, pupils and teachers. While all the scores are positive, there is still significant scope for improvement and it will be important to monitor this over time.

It is important to note, that there are differences in the ways in which the information relating to the three groups was collected; pupils complete the assessment in relation to themselves, teachers in relation to the average young person they teach (in a specified year group) and parents in relation to their son/daughter (in a specified year group).

The biggest single area of disparity across the groups is in relation to problem solving, where parents and pupils score significantly higher than teachers. This was the only theme where one group (teachers) came close to a negative score.

While improvement can be achieved across all of the behavioural themes, the priorities for future attention appear to be 'Communication', 'Approach to Learning' and 'Personal Effectiveness'.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Conclusions

Further embedding of the EDO role is necessary in order that DtS becomes an integrated component of the wider 'education package' for schools. Where EDOs are strongly 'networked' into the wider work of the LA education department, this impacts positively upon how DtS 'messages' are communicated and received in the LA and in schools.

The School Environment

There are clear signs within schools of new and increased activity which has a strong DtS orientation. Headteachers have strong faith in the DtS concept and expect that the strategy will support pupils to achieve success in school and beyond.

This has impacted upon the way in which pupils are learning and in their attitudes and motivations towards school. Schools feel that it is too early to be able to demonstrate how positive changes in attitudes and motivations might translate to impacts on pupil attainment.

Headteachers believe that progress has been made in the skills, attitudes and behaviours related to the 7 enterprise themes. In primary schools, this was especially the case for 'working with others' and 'problem solving / creativity'. Special schools placed emphasis on the concept and ethos of DtS, as the key catalyst for change in their school, and the need for continued focus on the 'life beyond school' theme. Secondary schools have perhaps made the most recent progress in working with DtS.

The study demonstrated that 3 'models' of DtS application are evident across schools. These could be described as a fully embedded model, a partially embedded one and an 'activity only' model. The last of these is the most vulnerable to a diminishing 'presence' of DtS, due to lack of priority within the school, and little or no connection to the wider school curriculum.

School management has a clear role to play in providing direction, commitment and support for DtS. This seems especially important in secondary schools which have tended to engage with DtS later than primary and special schools, and where barriers such as a 'subject silo' make DtS prioritisation and commitment challenging.

There is evidence that headteachers as strong 'networkers' within their local communities are forging new and innovative partnerships with organisations and other local stakeholders. DtS has encouraged the development of this networking role.

There was evidence that some schools are approaching DtS with a view to laying the 'groundwork' for A Curriculum for Excellence (ACfE). This offers a strong signal of the compatibility of the DtS ethos, positive school culture and a strong focus on delivering pupil-centred approaches to teaching and learning.

The Index of Enterprising Attitudes and Behaviour

The Index of Enterprising Attitudes and Behaviour (IOEAB) appears to offer a route to quantify the previously elusive 'enterprising attitudes and behaviour' trait within young

people, which is central to DtS. The IOEAB should not be regarded as a measure of DtS impact. While it can be used in this way, with several caveats, the Index is probably best used in a wider context as a barometer of behavioural and attitudinal change in young people over time.

The IOEAB is 'indicative' of performance, rather than necessarily 'performance' itself. It can, however, help identify patterns of performance that were previously obscure. It can help test hypotheses and explore conventional wisdoms.

In this study, the Index has been used primarily to establish a behavioural baseline and to contrast relative 'enterprising attitudes and behaviour' across young people with different characteristics. Findings indicate an observable decline in enterprising attitudes and behaviour in the transition from primary to secondary education. There is also correlation between enterprising attitudes and behaviour and educational achievement, although not as strong as the latter.

Recommendations

Positioning DtS as a lever for Scotland's education policy agenda – there is scope for DtS to act as a conduit in supporting schools to 'gear up' for the wider national policy agenda, particularly ACfE.

Improve school staff awareness of DtS within the wider education policy agenda – school staff need a better understanding of the relative 'positioning' of DtS within the wider agenda for 'Ambitious, Excellent Schools'. In the absence of this, staff are unlikely to understand the relative importance and longevity of DtS.

National level support in the development of monitoring and evaluation mechanisms – this is necessary to provide LAs and their EDOs with the guidance and direction to devise tools, for school use. The role of the existing HMle enterprise in education performance indicators should be considered within this context

DtS and pupil accessibility – further emphasis is required of the 'appeal' of DtS to all pupil groups, regardless of academic ability, interest or disability.

Further examine the effectiveness of different styles and approaches adopted by EDOs – there is a need for a 'watching brief' on how the EDO role evolves. This would include: factors which influence the role; relative 'positioning' within LA departmental structures; and the effectiveness of different techniques which have been applied across LA sectors.

Continued support for EDO networking - continued national support is necessary to facilitate and enhance good practice sharing and different models of school support.

Further support for embedding DtS across schools – those schools that are 'ready' to embed DtS require guidance beyond implementing DtS through isolated lessons and topic work.

Further promotion of the school cluster model - more mileage could be gained in promoting DtS through this medium and across different school settings.

Reviewing secondary school support for vocational education / work placements, in line with DtS – further

support is necessary for secondary schools, in ensuring that this aspect of education is valued as much as the non-vocational curriculum.

Facilitating the transfer and development of DtS practice from the primary to secondary setting - more emphasis is needed on how EDOs support schools to ensure that early gains and benefits are not 'lost' once pupils transfer to secondary schools.

Review purpose and effectiveness of mechanisms for local authority 'challenge funding' to schools - transparency of objectives and criteria for LA funding are required in order to ensure that a 'level playing field' is created across schools.

School-level self-evaluation of DtS progress – the 7 enterprise-related themes could be adapted and applied in school settings to encourage discussions with individuals and groups of pupils about the types of learning they engage in and the transferability of such learning. **Promoting more examples of school practice which show how to overcome potential disincentives to engage with DtS** – there is a need to appeal to those schools (mainly secondary schools) who perceive that DtS presents a risk to their

academic attainment focus. Higher attaining schools that are actively committed to DtS are likely to act as powerful advocates for this.

Enhanced efforts to promote DtS to parents – this will be required to ensure that parents view DtS as being more than 'enterprise education' and 'make and sell' projects in school.

Identifying and promoting the work of special schools - secondary and primary sectors would benefit from a stronger awareness of the special school sector's approach to education and linkages with the DtS ethos.

The IOEAB tool and concept – further work is required to develop the IOEAB tool and also to engage policy makers in the debate on how it might best be used to inform DtS development.

Additional application of IOEAB methodology – at present, the IOEAB technique has been used essentially at macro, i.e. all-Scotland, level. There is, however, scope for considering application at a more micro or individual school level. In this context, there is potential for developing an IOEAB toolkit for use by schools.

If you wish further copies of this Research Findings or have any enquiries about social research, please contact us at:

Scottish Executive Social Research
Enterprise, Transport and Lifelong Learning
Department
3rd Floor
Meridian Court
3 Cadogan Street
GLASGOW G2 6AT
Tel: 0141 2420262
Fax: 0141 242-5455
Email: socialresearch@scotland.gsi.gov.uk
Website: www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch

If you wish a copy of "Determined to Succeed – Phase 2: Early Impact Across Scotland June 2005 – October 2005" the research report which is summarised in this research findings, please send a cheque for £5.00 made payable to:

Blackwell's Bookshop
53 South Bridge
Edinburgh
EH1 1YS
Tel: 0131 622 8283 / 0131 622 8258
Fax: 0131 622 8258
Email: business.edinburgh@blackwell.co.uk

This document (and other Research Findings and Reports) and information about social research in the Scottish Executive may be viewed on the Internet at: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch>

The site carries up-to-date information about social and policy research commissioned and published on behalf of the Scottish Executive. Subjects covered include transport, housing, social inclusion, rural affairs, children and young people, education, social work, community care, local government, civil justice, crime and criminal justice, regeneration, planning and equalities issues. The site also allows access to information about the Scottish Household Survey.



ISBN 978-0-7559-6425-3

